



Historic Review Commission

AGENDA REPORT

Department: Planning
Prepared By: Renae' Ollie

Item: 2

Subject

Consider and act upon a recommendation to the City Council regarding a request for demolition of a residential structure in accordance with Ordinance No. 2022-34. Property located at 100 S. Cottonbelt St. within the Downtown Historic District.

Recommendation

Motion to recommend approval as presented

Discussion

Owner: Rick and Helen Pearce

Applicant: Arnulfo Perez

The property owner proposes to demolish an existing residential dwelling that has undergone significant modifications from its original construction. Section 6.3.E.3. of the City's Zoning Ordinance outlines the criteria for demolition as follows:

Demolition of a structure will NOT be allowed if any of the items below are met:

1. A structure is of architectural or historical interest and/or value or its removal would be detrimental to the public interest, or
2. The building contributes significantly to the character of the historic district and demolition would create a detrimental view or adversely affect the existing buildings on the block, or
3. A structure is contributing or unusual or uncommon design and materials and it could not be reproduced without great difficulty and/or expense, or
4. If its proposed replacement would not make a positive visual contribution, would disrupt the character or be visually incompatible within the historic district.

Demolition of a structure MAY be allowed if any of the following criteria is met:

1. The building has lost its architectural and historical integrity and importance and its removal will not result in a negative, less appropriate visual effect on the historic district, or
2. The structure does not contribute to the historical or architectural character and importance of the historic district (e.g. a non contributing structure), and its removal will result in a positive, appropriate visual effect in the district.

The Engineer's report gives a lot of technical and structural detail of its findings. The home was a stick built, pier and beam foundation, one story, single-family residence with vinyl siding. The foundation piers were a mix of concrete masonry unit pads and blocks and wooden posts. The entire subfloor has been removed. The house is leaning to the north and supported with 4x4 posts staked to the ground. Several interior and exterior walls are not square or plumb and are not fully resting on the foundation.

The existing framing members appear to be from the original construction of the home according to the report. However, the roof structure was missing a ridge board, purlin bracing and collar ties. A room has been added in the

attic area. It was the opinion of the engineer that the wall and ceiling framing is not adequate to support the room addition.

The Foundation report provided the following:

Drywall cracks, window separations, frieze board separations, damaged joist, damaged beam, ponding, and a wet understructure were observed. It was determined that the structure has experienced seasonal foundation movement over the life of the structure, resulting in differential movement of the block and base foundation.

Per Collin County Appraisal District records, the house was built in 1960. The houses immediately to the south along Cottonbelt all the way to Elliot are newer brick construction homes. Although the Engineer's report states that considering the age and condition of the structure, the house could be remodeled/restored. It is staff's opinion that it would come at a significant cost to the property owner.

As stated in the criteria, ***The structure does not contribute to the historical or architectural character and importance of the historic district (e.g. a non contributing structure), and its removal will result in a positive, appropriate visual effect in the district*** staff believes that its removal would not be detrimental to the public interest.

If approved for demolition, the applicant will submit new plans for HRC review to rebuild from ground up a new residential dwelling that meets the current design standards of the Downtown Historic District.