

DATE: March 9, 2023

TO: Mayor McFarland and the Finance Committee

FROM: Dana Davis, District 1 Alderperson

RE: Riverside Restroom – Discussion Regarding the Scope of the Project

BACKGROUND INFORMATION

In the Finance Committee meeting on January 23, 2023, the committee was presented with a \$1.1 million construction bid that would bring the projected Riverside Restroom total to \$1.2 million – about \$500,000 over budget. To address the \$500,000 shortfall, the staff proposed using the \$500,000 surplus available in Streets (Fund 05). The Finance Committee did not approve the bid and requested Kristine Butteris, Director of Park and Rec, to investigate other options, including prefabricated public restroom options.

On Monday, February 27, Kristine presented her findings regarding the prefabricated options. Then, she and other staff members requested that the Finance Committee allow the project to be put out to bid again in hopes of securing a bid that would fall within the \$720,000 budgeted amount of the project. No adjustments to the scope or size of the project were recommended. The Finance Committee approved the request to put the project out to bid again.

RIVERSIDE RESTROOM – PROJECT SIZE

- Currently the Riverside Restroom architect plans call for 12 toilets/urinals for Men + 12 toilets for Women + Family Room + Mother's Room. A total of 25 toilets.
- In an email exchange with the Mayor and Kristine, I asked if the architects used a formula to calculate the size of the proposed Riverside Restroom and it was shared with me that the architects did not use a formula, but instead decided to reduce the number of fixtures from 16-18 (in each of the original buildings) to 12 each (men and women).

RIVERSIDE RESTROOM – PROBLEM

If the architect did not use a formula to calculate the necessary fixtures for the proposed restroom, the plans were designed without the assistance of the following:

1. Current park usage data (park rental agreements, park field scheduling, hourly park users, daily park users)
2. Input from public restroom companies and other credible sources specializing in designing, building and installing public restrooms for municipalities.
3. Input from calculators that are used by some companies to determine the number of fixtures necessary.
4. Data from comparable parks in cities our size.

1. CURRENT USAGE DATA

The number of fixtures needed in a public restroom is determined by analyzing the park usage data. We have to know the following

- Typical peak usage: hourly and daily.
- Both can be helpful in calculating the total number of fixtures needed.

Determining the number of hourly and daily users can be difficult to ascertain in a public park. An accepted strategy is to examine the available park data. ([Denver Park and Rec: Restroom Technical Analysis](#), page 23)

- Park shelter rental agreements.
- Sports/games scheduling
- Bandshell scheduling
- # of children enrolled in the summer daycare program.

A sampling of data on several days throughout the summer can be gathered to determine high, mid and low numbers.

Park data is needed to make wise decisions.

2. INPUT FROM PUBLIC RESTROOM COMPANIES AND CREDIBLE RESOURCES

There is always a tension between providing public restrooms and managing the costs. (Source: [Denver Park and Rec: Restroom Technical Analysis](#), page 7 and 8)

- People need easy access to public restrooms to participate in healthy activities at parks and within their communities. Public restrooms are important!
- But, it is also true that public restrooms invite vandalism, transients, illicit activities, and misuse (intentional clogging of toilets, etc.). Maintenance costs are high. Keeping bathrooms clean and in good order is costly and time consuming for staff.
- Striking a balance that provides a restroom that meets the actual needs of the park visitors without burdening the city/taxpayer with unnecessary maintenance and repair costs is the goal.

None of the prefabricated public restroom companies contacted sells a 12/12. (Source: *See list of prefabricated bathroom companies at the end of this memo*)

- The biggest prefab restrooms available were generally 6/6 or 8/8. One company (Corworth) said they could provide a 9 women/6 men/family room.
- The companies have the capability to design and construct whatever size the city needs (modular units), but the companies do not advertise anything as big as a 12/12 because the demand for a restroom that size is very limited.
- I specifically asked 5 of the prefab companies what their opinion was of a 12/12 park restroom.
 - All found that restroom size to be unusually large.
 - One company rep said that a 12/12 bathroom at a park in a city our size is unbelievable and “ludicrous”.
 - One company representative said that he remembers the company making one restroom about that size. It was for a fairground.

- One company rep literally gasped aloud when I told her that our city was planning a 12/12. She said they never put bathrooms that size into parks - only stadiums.

3. INPUT FROM ACCEPTED CALCULATION FORMULAS

Method #1: [Corworth Restroom Facilities](#) (Source: Conversation with Representative)

- 1 toilet can accommodate 45 users/hour
- 20% of park visitors will use the bathroom.
- Determine the typical peak daily usage. (In the summer, what is the typical peak daily usage?)

FORMULA: (Typical peak daily visitors * .20) / 45 = # of required toilets

Using this formula, Riverside Park would regularly need to have 5600 daily park users to justify 25 toilets.

(5600 daily park users * .20) / 45 = about 25 toilets

Method #2: [Public Restroom Company](#)

- 1 toilet can accommodate 45 users/hour.
- ½ of hourly park users will use the bathroom.

FORMULA: Hourly Users/ 2 / 45 = # of required toilets.

Using this formula, Riverside Park would need to regularly have 2250 hourly users to justify 25 toilets.

2250/2/45 = 25 toilets

Do we have park usage data to support 25 fixtures in the proposed Riverside Park plans?

4. DATA FROM COMPARABLE PARKS IN CITIES OUR SIZE.

I used the website below to find Wisconsin municipalities that have populations within the 20,000 range. I contacted the Park and Rec departments of 5 cities and the information I gathered from my conversations is in the table below. None of the cities have a park with 25 seasonal toilets available to general park visitors. I did not have time to contact all of the Park and Rec departments for all of the cities with a population within the 20,000 range.

Population Source: [Wisconsin Demographics – based on 2021 American Community Survey](#)

CITY	POPULATION	PARK	ACRES	AMENITIES	TOTAL TOILETS
Watertown	23,030	Riverside Park	29 acres	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2 Ball parks • 1 playground • Horseshoe • Bandshell • 5 Shelters (total capacity – 352) • Riverfest Celebration 	<p><i>Proposed</i></p> <p>TOTAL: 25</p> <p><i>*This total <u>does not</u> include the existing</i></p>

					<i>Volleyball Ct. Restroom.</i>
Neenah	27,194	Memorial Park	105 acres	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2 year-round heated/ac rental shelters • 1 outdoor shelter • Paved Trails/Woods/Nature Areas • Playground • Ball Diamonds • Soccer Fields • Volleyball Court • Basketball Court • Ice Rink • Flatgrass Showdown! Soccer Tournament (5-8000 attendees) 	<p>George Scherck Shelter, Year-Round Rental pavilion – 8 (only available to shelter renters)</p> <p>Tullar Shelter, Year-Round Rental pavilion – 6 (only available to shelter renters)</p> <p>12 seasonal toilets available to general park visitors.</p> <p>(They bring in portable toilets for a big soccer tournament)</p> <p>They have trouble with transients getting into pavilions.</p>
Caledonia	25,288	Franksville Memorial Park (Managed by Racine County)	52- acres	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 3 Baseball diamonds • 6-8 soccer fields • 4 Playgrounds • 3 shelters • Banquet Hall • Home to Franksville Craft Beer Garden 	<p>Banquet Hall (available for rental all year)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 10 <p>Park Restroom</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 8
Stevens Point	25,752	Pfiffner Pioneer Park	5-10 acres	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Boat Ramps • Picnic Area • Playground • Restrooms • 4th of July Celebration • Riverfront Rendezvous 	5

		Iverson Park	27 acres	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Playground • Picnic areas • Beach • Lodges • Picnic Shelters • Baseball diamond • Nature Trails 	Two 3/3 restrooms. 12
De Pere	25,216	Voyager Park	21 acres	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Located on Fox River • Boat Docks • Picnic Area • Playground Area • 4th of July Celebration • Celebrate De Pere (4000 visitors/day attendance for 3 days) • Building a Brand-new shelter and restrooms. It will be a 3 seasons shelter, kitchenette with multi-purpose room and gender neutral restrooms with outside access. (\$1.5 million) 	9 gender neutral rooms.
Middleton	21,634	Lakeview	80 acres	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Playground • Splash Pad • Tennis Courts • Gazebo • Indoor Shelter • 2 Outdoor Shelters 	6

PREFABRICATED RESTROOM INFORMATION

- Prefabricated Restrooms are well-regarded. (Source: [Denver Park and Rec: Restroom Technical Analysis](#), page 28 and 29)
- Prefabricated Restrooms, especially those made of pre-cast concrete, are virtually indestructible and can withstand very cold temperatures. (Source: [Huffcutt Representative](#))
- Prefabricated Restrooms are made under factory-controlled conditions and can be made cost-effectively. Source: [Denver Park and Rec: Restroom Technical Analysis](#), page 28 and 29)
- According to the [Denver Park and Rec: Restroom Technical Analysis](#) (p. 29) “Stick-built restrooms are not recommended, except in rare cases of signature projects that require a signature restroom design.”

WHAT ABOUT RIVERFEST?

- The Public Park Restroom representative said it would be unwise to add permanent toilets to the project that are unnecessary the rest of the year (added maintenance, repair and staff costs). She

suggested portable toilets would be the best option to accommodate Riverfest. The city can save in maintenance fees what it would cost to use portable toilets for Riverfest.

SUGGESTED ACTION STEPS

1. Collect Riverside Park usage data to determine typical hourly and daily park usage.
2. Meet with the Architect, present data and ask for the project to be reduced should the park usage data not support a 12/12 + family restroom plan.
3. Put the reduced project out to bid.

OR –

1. Choose a prefab company that designs, builds and installs public restrooms. (Huffcutt is a Wisconsin company)
2. Work with the company to design a prefab that meets the needs of Riverside Park visitors. Their experts are equipped to walk the city through the process.
3. Order a prefab.
4. Install a prefab.

PREFABRICATED RESTROOM COMPANIES

[Huffcutt – Chippewa Falls, WI](#)

[CorWorth Restroom Facilities: Corworth.com](#)

[Romtec -](#)

[Hunter-Knepshield](#)

[Public Restrooms Company](#)

[Quality PreCast Inc.](#)

[Wieser Concrete](#)

[CXT – Cxtinc.com](#)