



Community Development
Department

STAFF REPORT

Meeting Date:	September 24, 2026
Agenda Title:	COA 26-47
Requested Action:	Proposed exterior alterations, porch reconstruction, rear addition, and new garage outbuilding
Department / Agency Lead:	Community Development
Staff Lead:	Whitney Burgess, Preservation Planner

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The applicant purchased the deteriorated property with the intent to conduct historically sensitive renovation to the interior, conduct exterior repairs, and extend the living space with a new rear addition. All exterior siding will be replaced in-kind, the porch will be reconstructed with in-kind replacement jig sawn railings and a new stair with a brick foundation. The applicant proposes to add a third dormer to the 1.5-story roofline, and cut a new doorway where the faux-door (decorative) is now. The shutters and windows will be replaced in-kind as necessary. The rear second floor addition will extend from behind the 1.5 story roof ridgeline over the rear 1 story addition, as not to impact the street façade or overall footprint. The historic brick and stone foundations will not be impacted. Adding the dormer and possibly an extra doorway would constitute an impact on the historic fenestration, but not an adverse one. This would maintain the overall symmetry while increasing ease of internal circulation. The construction of a garage outbuilding to the north of the house in the side/rear yard will not be highly impactful, and the simple design should complement the existing house without implying historicism. A balance needs to be struck here between the historic guidelines and functionality for new tenants to bring this resource back into residential use.

A prior COA has already been Admin approved for the temporary removal of the white picket fence out front to allow construction vehicles in and out as contractors take care of interior work. The fence will be replaced in-kind following completion of the overall project. The property owner is also coordinating with the neighbor to the south to remove the large pine tree in the fence line, which has deep roots impacting surrounding foundations. This tree is not part of the Heirtage Trees program.



Existing



Proposed

BACKGROUND

The one-and-a-half story, rectangular frame core of the dwelling on the stone foundation was constructed in the early 1880s. The dwelling later expanded with the two-story northern addition on a brick foundation between 1903 and 1908. The house has a Folk Victorian style with flat-sawn balusters, bargeboard, and gable trim. Mr. and Mrs. Ford G. Anderson purchased the property in 1918, soon after the large addition was constructed, and lived in the home for approximately five years. Mr. Anderson was a wealthy businessman, Free Mason, and member of the local Chamber of Commerce who made his fortune with a clothing and textile factory known as Anderson Clothing Co. Anderson purchased the Mosby-Spillman House on Main Street in 1923, which then became the family's primary residence. Ford died from a bout of illness in 1933 and left the North Sixth Street home and his other properties to his wife Ethel. Ethel maintained the property until her passing in the mid-1970s but likely leased the home to another while maintaining her residence at the old Mosby estate. Aerial photographs indicate two one-story additions were completed on the rear elevation in the 1950s, and the footprint remained consistent to present day.

Most of the façade's two-over-two sash windows were replaced with new wooden sashes circa 2003. Records of building and health code violations at the property reveal the house was subject to a long-term hoarding situation until recently, which resulted in the prior and existing poor conditions. A historic outbuilding sits in the rear yard behind the house

DESIGN GUIDELINE CONSIDERATIONS

Historic District Guideline	Page No.	Analysis
1. Guidelines for Maintenance Activities		
D. Painting and Finishes		
2. Recreate the historic appearance of the building by repainting or refinishing with colors and coatings that are appropriate to the period of historic significance of the building and district and that highlight the building's historic appearance.	3.5	
3a. Painting unpainted masonry and architectural metals, unless it was painted historically, is not appropriate.	3.5	
3. Building Components		
A4. Foundations & Walls : Woodwork Trim, Decoration, & Siding		
1. Identify, preserve, and retain all original wood features, especially those that are important in defining the overall historic character of the building such as cornices, brackets, window and doorway trim, and siding.	3.19	
2. Repair wood features by patching, piecing in, or reinforcing the wood using recognized preservation methods, such as an epoxy consolidant and filler. Repair may also include the limited replacement in kind-or with compatible substitute material-of extensively deteriorated or missing parts of features when there are surviving prototypes or sufficient documentation for an accurate reconstruction of the original.	3.19	
4. Replace and recreate original woodwork in-kind if missing or damaged beyond repair. Use physical evidence to guide the new work if the overall form and detailing are still evident. Only replace the deteriorated or missing parts of the feature.	3.19	
E. Entrances & Porches		

1. Preserve and retain entrances and porches and their functional and decorative features that are important in defining the overall historic character of the building such as doors, transoms, fanlights, sidelights, pilasters, entablatures, columns, balustrades, stairs, flooring, columns, railing, brackets, modillions, dentils, cornice, and pediments.	3.28	
2. Repair entrances and porches by patching, splicing, consolidating, or otherwise reinforcing the historic materials. Such repair also can include the limited replacement in kind—or with compatible substitute material—of those extensively deteriorated or missing parts of repeated features where there are surviving prototypes such as balustrades, cornices, entablatures, columns, sidelights, friezes, brackets, and stairs.	3.28	
3. Replace in kind an entire entrance or porch that is too deteriorated to repair—if the form and detailing are still evident—using the physical evidence to guide the new work. If using the same kind of material is not technically feasible, then compatible substitute materials may be considered. Do not replace an entire entrance or porch when the repair of materials and limited replacement of parts are appropriate.	3.28	

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

The plan set has some errors and typos and design components that could use clarifications. The only matter to waffle over is the addition of the third dormer and the door/window across the original portion of the façade (1.5 story). It would not be an adverse effect and would complement the existing symmetry, but it will alter the fenestration pattern. If those items are not deal breakers for any ARB members, I recommend conditional approval with the following stipulations:

1. All required permits must be acquired; and
2. An updated plan sheet showing accurate depiction of existing architectural details and proposed details across the façade is submitted for final review; and
3. The new second-floor addition must extend southeast from the rear of the existing one-and-a-half story roofline as not to add vertical height to the façade or expand the building footprint; and
4. Any new replacement windows should maintain the same size, scale, profile, depth, sash configuration, and materiality as existing; and
5. Characteristic elements of the Folk Victorian style should be maintained and replaced in-kind where needed, such as the jig sawn porch balustrade and post trim, decorative dormer trim, and gable eave ornamentation; and
6. The existing stone and brick foundations should be maintained and unpainted, and the proposed new brick foundation for the front stairs should be visually distinguishable from the adjacent historic brick foundation; and
7. The proposed new garage building should be constructed with a simple style and massing to distinguish historic from new materials; and
8. Should the scope of exterior alterations expand from that presented in the COA submission and attachments, a new COA and additional review will be required.

ATTACHMENTS

1. Attachment A- Photos and Plans
2. Attachment B- Draft Motion Sheet

3. Attachment C- COA and Addendum Materials