



Community Development  
Department

## **STAFF REPORT**

<b>Meeting Date:</b>	July 25, 2024
<b>Agenda Title:</b>	COA 24-49   28-32 Ashby Street
<b>Requested Action:</b>	Review request to replace the existing wood windows with wood, aluminum-clad Harvey windows on the façade.
<b>Department / Agency Lead:</b>	Community Development
<b>Staff Lead:</b>	Casey Squyres, Historic Preservation Planner

### **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

---

The Applicant is requesting approval to replace the existing wooden windows (which were installed sometime between 1980-early 2000s) due to inefficiency and water infiltration. The Applicant is requesting to replace with wooden, aluminum-clad Harvey windows, to include the alteration of the existing tri-part windows with picture windows, as shown in the ca. 1970 image provided by the Applicant.

## BACKGROUND

---

This building was constructed in c.1920 as a garage on the site of a former livery stable. It is in good condition. A new brick face was added to the building sometime prior to 1983, but the prominent stepped EIFS parapet that is visible today was added sometime after 1983. Although this resource is interesting in unique with its complex detailing and variety of materials, this building does not retain integrity. Due to the presence of the EIFS parapet that was added outside the period of significance, the historic appearance and design of this building is lost. Additionally, the EIFS is attached in a way that would harm the underlying material if removal was attempted. This building is a non-contributing resource within the district.



Circa 1970 image provided by Applicant:



## DESIGN GUIDELINE CONSIDERATIONS

Historic District Guideline	Page No.	Analysis
<b>B. WINDOWS AND DOORS</b>		
1. Preserve and retain historic window and door openings, including window frame, sash, muntins, mullions, glazing, lintels, sills, architraves, shutters, doors, pediments, hoods, transoms, sidelights, steps, and all hardware. Retain fenestration patterning, size, shape, and operation. Owners of buildings with windows and doors that have been altered in the past are encouraged to restore these elements to their original appearance based on site evidence and appropriate historic research.	<b>3.21</b>	<p>The Applicant has demonstrated through photographic documentation that the historic window fenestration pattern will remain the same. The Applicant has also demonstrated through photographic evidence that picture windows once existed on this building in the 1970s.</p> <p>Aside from the proposed picture windows, the Applicant intends to retain the same frame, sash profile, muntins/mullions, etc.</p>
3. Replace in kind an entire window or door that is too deteriorated to repair. If the overall form and detailing are still evident, use physical evidence to guide the new work. Recreate doors and windows to match the appearance of the original window or door design. While modern window materials such as extruded composites will be considered on a case-by-case basis, the new window must match the original in terms of size, shape, profile, depth of sash, width, and setback. Wood doors on primary façades should be replaced with replica wood doors and only if the original is damaged beyond repair. These guidelines encourage the use of substantial and durable materials.	<b>3.21</b>	<p>The Applicant states that the current wood windows are at the end of their useful life and are allowing for water infiltration and poor energy efficiency.</p> <p>The Applicant is proposing to replace the existing windows with wooden, aluminum clad windows by Harvey, as shown in Attachment A. Aside from the proposed picture windows, the Applicant intends to retain the same frame, sash profile, muntins/mullions, etc.</p>

<p>4. Recreate door and window glazing to match the appearance of the original glazing patterns as closely as possible. Maintain the original size, shape, muntin configuration, and number of lights. Do not substantially alter the profile of the frames, sashes, or muntins to accommodate thick (double or triple) replacement glazing. Use clear window glass that conveys the visual appearance of historic glass (transparent low-e glass is preferred).</p>	<p><b>3.21</b></p>	<p>The Applicant will be matching the new windows to the existing as stated above.</p>
<p>5. If using the same kind of material is not technically feasible, then a compatible substitute material may be considered, especially on the side or rear façades when minimally visible from the street. All replacement materials must fit the original opening without alteration. Replacement doors on the side or rear façade, when minimally visible from a public right-of-way, may be wood or paneled steel. Substitute materials will be reviewed on a case-by-case basis.</p>	<p><b>3.21</b></p>	<p>The Applicant is proposing to replace the existing windows with wooden, aluminum clad windows by Harvey, as shown in Attachment A. Aside from the proposed picture windows, the Applicant intends to retain the same frame, sash profile, muntins/mullions, etc.</p>
<p>7. Design new windows, doors, and other elements to be compatible with the original building.</p>	<p><b>3.21</b></p>	<p>The Applicant has confirmed all new windows and will match the original fenestration pattern and will be compatible and consistent with this particular building.</p>
<p>8. Construct a new door or window when the historic feature is completely missing. It may be an accurate restoration using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation, or be a new design that is compatible with the size, scale, material, and color of the historic building. New windows and doors should also be compatible with the historic character and use of the building.</p>	<p><b>3.21</b></p>	<p>The Applicant has confirmed all new windows and will match the original fenestration pattern and will be compatible and consistent with this particular building.</p>

## STAFF RECOMMENDATION

---

Staff recommends approval of the request to replace the existing wooden windows (which were installed sometime between 1980-early 2000s) due to inefficiency and water infiltration, and to replace with wooden, aluminum-clad Harvey windows, as well as the alteration of the existing tri-part windows with picture windows, as shown in the ca. 1970 image provided by the Applicant, provided the following conditions are met:

- 1) All necessary permits are acquired.
- 2) Retain fenestration patterning, size, shape, and operation. Owners of buildings with windows and doors that have been altered in the past are encouraged to restore these elements to their original appearance based on site evidence and appropriate historic research.
- 3) Design new windows, doors, and other elements to be compatible with the original building
- 4) Possible condition of approval to consider: All new windows shall be wood windows to match the existing, and not aluminum-clad wood windows, as proposed.

## ATTACHMENTS

---

1. Attachment 1 – Photos
2. Attachment 2 – Draft Motion Sheet