



Community Development
Department

STAFF REPORT

Meeting Date:	May 23, 2024
Agenda Title:	COA 24-30 – 40 Main Street
Requested Action:	Review request to replace the existing second floor wood windows, which are heavily deteriorated and at the end of their useful life, with appropriate modern wood windows to match the previous in size, shape, profile, depth of sash, and lite configuration. The Applicant is also proposing to replace the front wooden door at the secondary front entrance in-kind.
Department / Agency Lead:	Community Development
Staff Lead:	Casey Squyres, Historic Preservation Planner

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Applicant is requesting to replace the existing second floor wood windows, which are heavily deteriorated and at the end of their useful life, with appropriate modern wood windows to match the previous in size, shape, profile, depth of sash, and lite configuration. The Applicant is also proposing to replace the front wooden door at the secondary front entrance in-kind.

- 1) A total of eight (8) windows will be replaced with either Marvin or Kolbe True Divided Lite Wood Windows.
- 2) The existing deteriorated screens over the windows will be removed and the new windows will possess appropriate glazing that will alleviate all energy-efficiency concerns, as well as allow the elevations of the building to retain their historic appearance.
- 3) The secondary door at the front elevation will be replaced in-kind with appropriate paneling to match the existing. The fanlight will remain.
- 4) The two windows at the rear elevation are already inappropriate vinyl windows that were installed at an unknown date. These will also be removed and replaced with the abovementioned replacement wood windows.
- 5) No changes to the original window or door fenestration patterns are being proposed. No new window or door openings are being proposed.

BACKGROUND

This building was constructed c1870. The building is an example of a Colonial Revival style commercial building and represents the late-nineteenth-century commercial resources within the district. The building retains integrity of location, design, setting, feeling, and association. This resource falls within the district's period of significance and contributes to the character of the district. Although the building does not possess sufficient architectural or historical significance to qualify for individual listing in the National Register, it is a contributing resource to the Warrenton Historic District under Criterion C for architecture.

This 2-story, 3-bay brick stuccoed building has a storefront and secondary entry on the ground level. The storefront has a recessed entrance that has 1 step up and a large display window. The secondary entry provides access to the upper floor and has two steps up from the sidewalk grade. There is a wood cornice that spans the full facade visually dividing the upper and lower floors. The windows sashes are obscured by screens, but appear to be 6/6, double hung wood sash with stone sills and wood shutters. The side gable roof is covered with metal standing seam and has a wide cornice. There is a shed addition on the south elevation with a small parking lot. This building contributes to the architectural character of Main Street through its scale, materials, and architectural details.





DESIGN GUIDELINE CONSIDERATIONS

Historic District Guideline	Page No.	Analysis
B. WINDOWS AND DOORS		
1. Preserve and retain historic window and door openings, including window frame, sash, muntins, mullions, glazing, lintels, sills, architraves, shutters, doors, pediments, hoods, transoms, sidelights, steps, and all hardware. Retain fenestration patterning, size, shape, and operation. Owners of buildings with windows and doors that have been altered in the past are encouraged to restore these elements to their original appearance based on site evidence and appropriate historic research.	3.21	The Applicant has demonstrated through photographic documentation and in-person site visits with members of the Architectural Review Board and the Historic Preservation Planner that multiple elements of the original wood windows are deteriorated beyond repair and have been patch-repaired throughout multiple decades of their lifetime. The Applicant intends to remove these windows and replace them in full with appropriate replacements that match the existing in all aspects as listed.
3. Replace in kind an entire window or door that is too deteriorated to repair. If the overall form and detailing are still evident, use physical evidence to guide the new work. Recreate doors and windows to match the appearance of the original window or door design. While modern window materials such as extruded composites will be considered on a case-by-case basis, the new window must match the original in terms of size, shape, profile, depth of sash, width, and setback. Wood doors on primary façades should be replaced with replica wood doors and only if the original is damaged beyond repair. These guidelines encourage the use of substantial and durable materials.	3.21	<p>The Applicant has demonstrated through photographic documentation and in-person site visits with members of the Architectural Review Board and the Historic Preservation Planner that multiple elements of the original wood windows are deteriorated beyond repair and have been patch-repaired throughout multiple decades of their lifetime. The Applicant intends to remove these windows and replace them in full with appropriate replacements that match the existing in all aspects as listed. The Applicant intends to use either Marvin or Kolbe True Divided Lite Wood Windows.</p> <p>The door will also be replaced in-kind, utilizing the same paneled appearance and material.</p>

Historic District Guideline	Page No.	Analysis
4. Recreate door and window glazing to match the appearance of the original glazing patterns as closely as possible. Maintain the original size, shape, muntin configuration, and number of lights. Do not substantially alter the profile of the frames, sashes, or muntins to accommodate thick (double or triple) replacement glazing. Use clear window glass that conveys the visual appearance of historic glass (transparent low-e glass is preferred).	3.21	The Applicant will be matching the new windows and door to the existing in all aspects as listed.
5. If using the same kind of material is not technically feasible, then a compatible substitute material may be considered, especially on the side or rear façades when minimally visible from the street. All replacement materials must fit the original opening without alteration. Replacement doors on the side or rear façade, when minimally visible from a public right-of-way, may be wood or paneled steel. Substitute materials will be reviewed on a case-by-case basis.	3.21	The Applicant has demonstrated through photographic documentation and in-person site visits with members of the Architectural Review Board and the Historic Preservation Planner that multiple elements of the original wood windows are deteriorated beyond repair and have been patch-repaired throughout multiple decades of their lifetime. The Applicant intends to remove these windows and replace them in full with appropriate replacements that match the existing in all aspects as listed. The Applicant intends to use either Marvin or Kolbe True Divided Lite Wood Windows.
7. Design new windows, doors, and other elements to be compatible with the original building.	3.21	The Applicant has confirmed all new windows and door will match the originals. This includes the replacement of the two non-historic vinyl windows at the rear elevation that were replaced years ago. All new windows will be wood.
8. Construct a new door or window when the historic feature is completely missing. It may be an accurate restoration using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation, or be a new design that is compatible with the size, scale, material, and color of the historic building. New windows and doors should also be compatible with the historic character and use of the building.	3.21	The Applicant has confirmed all new windows and door will match the originals. This includes the replacement of the two non-historic vinyl windows at the rear elevation that were replaced years ago. All new windows will be wood.

Historic District Guideline	Page No.	Analysis
10. Design insect screens and storm windows to minimize visual impacts. When replacement windows are installed, double or triple glazing is appropriate as energy-saving elements. Storm windows can be added, either on the outside or the inside, to help insulate and protect existing windows. A storm window should correspond in size, shape, major divisions, and color with the window it covers. New storm windows should not alter the basic shape of the opening. All meeting rails and mullions must align with the original sash and should be painted to match the window frame color. Exterior vinyl or aluminum storm windows are not permissible. Use storm window inserts designed to match the original window frame if placed externally	3.21	Existing screen storms will be removed as they detract from the historic character of the building. The new windows will provide appropriate glazing for energy-saving purposes and will be more visually appropriate and compatible with the building's historic character.
12. Install operable window shutters, if proper to the style of the building. They should be operable or mounted to look as if they are operable (with all hardware) and of appropriate size.	3.22	The Applicant shall install appropriate shutters, to be louvered shutters to match what currently exists, and shutter hardware to bring a more cohesive and visually appropriate character to the various elevations of the building.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of the request to replace the existing second floor wood windows, which are heavily deteriorated and at the end of their useful life, with appropriate modern wood windows to match the previous in size, shape, profile, depth of sash, and lite configuration and to replace the front wooden door at the secondary front entrance in-kind, as described and depicted within the application, at 40 Main Street, provided the following conditions are met:

- 1) All necessary permits are acquired.
- 2) The Applicant shall install the proposed Marvin or Kolbe True Divided Lite Wood Windows, as proposed, that will match the previous windows in size, shape, profile, depth of sash, width, and setback.
- 3) The Applicant shall install appropriate shutters, to be louvered shutters to match what currently exists, and shutter hardware to bring a more cohesive and visually appropriate character to the various elevations of the building.
- 4) Any change in the overall scope of work will require further ARB review and approval.

ATTACHMENTS

1. Attachment A – Photos, Plans
2. Attachment B – Draft Motion Sheet