



Community Development  
Department

## **STAFF REPORT**

|                                  |   |
|----------------------------------|---|
| <b>Meeting Date:</b>             | February 22, 2024                                       |
| <b>Agenda Title:</b>             | COA 24-6 – 226 E. Lee Street                            |
| <b>Requested Action:</b>         | Review of proposal for existing barn-to-ADU conversion. |
| <b>Department / Agency Lead:</b> | Community Development                                   |
| <b>Staff Lead:</b>               | Casey Squyres   |

### **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

The applicant is proposing to convert the existing frame barn in the rear yard to a new ADU at 226 E. Lee Street.

- 1) The original building form will be retained and converted into a new ADU.
- 2) The existing shed-roof overhang addition will be removed and converted into a new shed-roof style addition with a lower roof attachment.
- 3) A shed-roof addition will be constructed on the opposite side of the main form of the existing building and will include a small side porch.
- 4) The total size of the existing main house on the parcel is 4746 sq. ft.
- 5) The total size of the existing barn on the parcel is 458 sq. ft.

## BACKGROUND

---

This house was constructed in c.1900 and is in good condition. This is a good example of a Federal style house within the district and it represents a early twentieth-century building within the residential areas. The building retains integrity of location, design, setting, feeling, and association. This resource falls within the district's period of significance and contributes to the residential character of the district. Although the building does not possess sufficient architectural or historical significance to qualify for individual listing in the National Register, it is a contributing resource to the Warrenton Historic District under Criterion C for architecture.

Located behind the house is the ca. 1900 board and batten garage/shed. It has a front gabled roof with metal standing seam. Much of the resource is obscured by vegetation and not visible from the street.



**DESIGN GUIDELINE CONSIDERATIONS**

| Historic District Guideline  | Page No. | Analysis   |
|--|----------|--|
| <b>7. NEW CONSTRUCTION</b>   |          |  |
| <b>A. Context</b>  |          |  |
| <p>The Architectural Review Board will not specify a particular architectural style or design for new construction projects. The context of new construction or infill is more important than the decorative details applied, though detailing is important.</p> | 3.63     | <p>The Applicant has demonstrated through plans that the architectural style will be sensitive to the main house and will blend with the overall character of the Historic District.</p> |
| <p>New construction will be evaluated based on the project's relationship to its surroundings (context) and to the details of its site (materials, cornices, trim, porches, landscaping, rhythm).</p>  | 3.63     | N/A  |
| <b>A1. Setback</b>   |          |  |
| <p>1. Relate the setback of any new construction and additions to the setback of the existing historic buildings in the immediate surroundings of the proposed new construction. Generally speaking, setback should be within 10% of adjacent setbacks.</p>      | 3.64     | <p>Applicant states that all new construction and additions will meet proper setbacks.</p>   |
| <b>A2. Spacing</b>   |          |  |
| <p>1. Space new construction according to the historic precedence in the immediate surroundings of the proposed new construction. This includes sites adjacent to as well as across the street from the proposed new construction.</p>                           | 3.65     | <p>Applicant intends to appropriately space all new construction to comply with the general setting and historic precedence of immediately surrounding houses and buildings.</p>         |
| <b>A4. Massing</b>   |          |  |
| <p>2. Use forms for new construction that relate to the forms of the majority of surrounding buildings. For instance, if the form of adjacent buildings has a variety of projecting bays, dormers, etc., employ some of these elements in the new building.</p>  | 3.67     | <p>Applicant intends to appropriately space all new construction to comply with the general setting and historic precedence of immediately surrounding houses and buildings.</p>         |
| <b>A5. Height and Width</b>  |          |  |

| Historic District Guideline   | Page No. | Analysis  |
|---|----------|---|
| 1. The height and width of a new building must be compatible with historic buildings within a 360-degree range of visibility of the new building.   | 3.68     | The applicant states height and width of the new construction will be compatible with the historic buildings within a 360-degree range of visibility. |
| 2. The height of a proposed building should be no taller than the tallest historic building on the block within a 360-degree range of visibility of the same type (e.g. single family to single family, multifamily to multi-family). The height of the historic structure should be calculated from the original historic ridge line (not any later additions that may be taller). | 3.68     | The applicant states height and width of the new construction will be compatible with the historic buildings within a 360-degree range of visibility. |
| 3. Design new buildings to respect the existing width of original structures in the district. The space should be no more than ten percent of the average spacing of other historic buildings within the subject block. Larger apartment buildings or newer dwellings that do not contribute to the existing historic character should not be included within this calculation.     |          | The applicant states height and width of the new construction will be compatible with the historic buildings within a 360-degree range of visibility. |
| <b>A6. Scale</b>  |          |   |
| 1. Create human scale by including functional elements typical to the historic context, such as porches and porticoes.  | 3.69     | Applicant has provided detailed plans and drawings for appropriate scale and massing of new construction.   |
| <b>B. NEW BUILDING</b>  |          |   |
| 1. New construction shall respect the established architectural character of the historic district.   | 3.70     | Applicant has demonstrated that all new construction will respect the established character of the historic district.                                 |

| Historic District Guideline  | Page No.           | Analysis   |
|--|--------------------|--|
| <p>2. The new building should be recognized as a product of its period of construction, design, materials and craftsmanship and consistent with the architecture of the Historic District. Avoid an exact imitation of a historic style that would blur the distinction between old and new buildings and make it more difficult to understand the architectural evolution of the district. In this way, an interpretation of a historic style that is authentic to the district will be considered if it is subtly distinguishable as being new. Allow for the contemporary design of new buildings, when such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material, and character of the neighborhood, or environment.</p>   | <p><b>3.70</b></p> | <p>Applicant has demonstrated that all new construction will respect the established character of the historic district. The materials and style/design proposed appropriately avoid exact imitation of the historic main house.</p>   |
| <p>4. RHYTHM: Incorporate traditional façade rhythm and articulation techniques in a new design. Design a new building to replicate the rhythm of fenestration patterning found in the historic district. Arrange windows to reflect the traditional rhythm and general alignment of others in the area. Incorporate windows, doors, and other openings at a consistent ratio to those found on nearby historic buildings. Use durable window materials. Appropriate window materials include metal, wood, and various composites, as deemed appropriate by the preservation industry standards and the Architectural Review Board. Inappropriate window materials include aluminum and vinyl with plastic snap-in muntins. Use detailing to articulate a façade including window and door framing, sills, water tables and belt courses, canopies, moldings, cornices, columns, and pilasters</p> | <p><b>3.70</b></p> | <p>Applicant has provided detailed plans and drawings that demonstrate the fenestration patterns of the new construction and its relationship to the main house. The materials and style/design proposed appropriately avoid exact imitation of the historic main house.</p> |

| Historic District Guideline  | Page No.           | Analysis   |
|--|--------------------|--|
| <p>5. MATERIALS: Use building materials that appear similar in scale, color, texture, and finish to those seen historically in the context of the district. Use materials that are proven to be durable in the local climate. Use materials that will maintain an intended finish over time or acquire a patina. Use high-quality, durable, materials. Use new siding that is similar to the lap exposure, texture, and finish of traditional wood siding. Use trim boards that show depth and typify high-quality traditional construction.</p> | <p><b>3.70</b></p> | <p>The materials and style/design proposed appropriately avoid exact imitation of the historic main house. The materials to be utilized will be high-quality and durable in nature.</p>  |
| <p>6. DOORS AND WINDOWS: Respect the size, proportion, spacing and rhythm of door and window openings on all stories of contributing buildings in the subject block or neighborhood when designing and constructing new commercial or residential buildings. Avoid horizontal strip windows or square openings and doors wider than double leaf.</p>   | <p><b>3.71</b></p> | <p>Applicant has provided detailed plans and drawings that demonstrate the fenestration patterns of the new construction and its relationship to the main house.</p>   |
| <p>7. STYLE: Style cannot be guided inasmuch as they emerge with good design by architects, art, implementation by builders, lifestyles, function, fashion, the economy and industrial evolution. Contemporary expression with respect of historic precedence, context, significance and architectural heritage is encouraged.</p>   | <p><b>3.71</b></p> | <p>Applicant has demonstrated that all new construction will respect the established character of the historic district. The materials and style/design proposed appropriately avoid exact imitation of the historic main house.</p> |
| <p>8. OUTBUILDINGS: Outbuildings shall remain secondary to main buildings</p>  | <p><b>3.71</b></p> | <p>Applicant has demonstrated through detailed drawings and plans that all new outbuilding construction will remain secondary to the main house.</p>   |
| <p><b>C. ADDITIONS TO EXISTING BUILDINGS</b></p>   |                    |  |

| Historic District Guideline  | Page No. | Analysis  |
|--|----------|---|
| 1. Recognize all buildings as products of their own time; design the new addition so that it can be distinguished from the original, yet be compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features.   | 3.72     | Applicant has demonstrated that all new construction will respect the established character of the historic district. The materials and style/design proposed appropriately avoid exact imitation of the historic main house. |
| 2. Additions will cause the least possible diminution or loss of the historic character of the existing building including its materials, craftsmanship, design, location and setting.   | 3.72     | Applicant has demonstrated that there will be no loss of historic fabric or integrity as a result of the new construction.  |
| 3. Locate additions that increase the interior footprint as inconspicuously as possible by setting them back from the front and side of the building.  | 3.72     | Applicant has confirmed that the new construction will not increase or impact the interior footprint of the main house.   |
| 4. Additions should be clearly subordinate to the existing building in overall size including height, width, depth and scale.  | 3.72     | Applicant has demonstrated through detailed drawings and plans that all new outbuilding construction will remain secondary to the main house.   |
| 7. Design and construct additions in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form, character and integrity of the historic property remains intact. For example, a small connector passage or hyphen to join a side or rear addition to the original building is less invasive and destroys less fabric than a full elevation connection. | 3.72     | Applicant has demonstrated that there will be minimal loss of historic fabric or integrity as a result of the new construction.   |
| 8. The style of the addition should not replicate the original but might respectfully, modestly reflect design elements.   | 3.72     | Applicant has demonstrated that all new construction will respect the established character of the historic district. The materials and style/design proposed appropriately avoid exact imitation of the historic main house. |
| 10. Respect the size, proportion, spacing and rhythm of existing door and window openings on the existing building. Respect the spatial relationship between the wall surface and window opening of the existing building  | 3.72     | Applicant has provided detailed plans and drawings that demonstrate the fenestration patterns of the new construction and its relationship to the main house.   |

## **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

---

Staff recommends approval of COA 24-6 for 226 E. Lee Street for the request to convert the existing frame barn in the rear yard into an Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU), as described and depicted in the application and plans, provided the following conditions are met:

- 1) All necessary permits are acquired.
- 2) Relate the setback of any new construction and additions to the setback of the existing historic buildings in the immediate surroundings of the proposed new construction. Generally speaking, setback should be within 10% of adjacent setbacks.
- 3) New construction shall respect the established architectural character of the historic district.
- 4) The new building should be recognized as a product of its period of construction, design, materials and craftsmanship and consistent with the architecture of the Historic District.
- 5) Incorporate an appropriate amount of detail and decoration in new construction to avoid blandness and establish a compatible relationship with contributing buildings.

## **ATTACHMENTS**

---

1. Attachment 1 – Photos and Plans