



Community Development
Department

STAFF REPORT

Meeting Date:	February 22, 2024
Agenda Title:	COA 23-91 – 206 Culpeper Street
Requested Action:	Review of proposal to remove the garage/basement level of the previously approved addition to the main house; to install a gable roof with no dormer for the previously approved addition; removing a portion of the previously approved breezeway; to replace wall face of existing retaining wall with brick; and to install new fencing on the southwest side of the property to match existing scalloped fencing at side porch.
Department / Agency Lead:	Community Development
Staff Lead:	Casey Squyres

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The applicant is proposing the following modifications to previously conditionally approved COA 23-45 at the ca. 1950s main house at 206 Culpeper Street:

- **Remove Garage/basement level of addition.**
- **Exercise room and Laundry area reworked with gable roof and no dormer and white washed brick façade.**
- **Breezeway on rear elevation reworked.**
 - The breezeway that was proposed in the original application has been reworked and a portion has been removed.
 - None of the existing structure is being altered.
 - The new breezeway materials will be wood windows, wood trim to appear as columns and whitewashed brick water table to match the existing adjacent sitting room exterior.
- **The existing retaining wall will be replaced with a new wall faced with brick.**
 - The retaining wall at the front of the addition will be replaced with a new wall (same height around 4.6 ft)
 - The green scalloped railing will be replaced with a 3 ft railing to match existing white railing on the porch.
- **Fence/railing on wall to match existing rail at side porch.**

- New fence on southwest side to match existing scalloped fence. Currently three different styles of fencing exist on the property. The Applicant will be removing a wrought iron fence that was used for the pool access where the addition will be located and will be replacing the wood scalloped fence on the three sides of the backyard – this fence is currently deteriorating, and the Applicant would like more privacy with the pool by installing the new fence.
- These fences will be replaced to all match the wooden fence on the northwest (front) side of the property. The scalloped fence is painted wood with alternating vertical slats on front and back. It will match the existing height of around 6 ft at the highest point of the post scalloped down to the center at about 5 ft.
- In addition, the retaining wall at the front of the addition will be replaced with a new wall (same height around 4.6 ft) and the green scalloped railing will be replaced with a 3 ft railing to match existing white railing on the porch.
- **Roof material and all other details to remain as proposed in original application.**
 - Same as originally proposed to match the existing house. Architectural shingles on the gable roofs and metal on the low breezeway and master porch roofs.

What was previously reviewed and conditionally approved at the June 15, 2023 ARB Meeting (COA 23-45):

- 1) Garage to appear as detached with a breezeway filled with windows and hidden behind the existing pergola.
- 2) Garage is proposed to be side-gabled, one-and-a-half stories in height and two-bays in width with a central, projecting shed-roof dormer filled with three, six-over-six, double-hung windows.
- 3) The garage setback is behind the main house and 2' forward from where the existing wall is located. The roof pitch will be kept low so as to minimize any visual impacts.
- 4) A commercial property borders the left side of the property and there is currently a thick screen of evergreen trees between the two properties. Sections of this screen may be impacted as a result of the new construction. New plantings are proposed where any existing trees may need to be removed.
- 5) The master bedroom suite will be located on the center axis of the existing in-ground pool and will be designed to appear as a pool house.
- 6) The left side of the addition is not visible to other properties.
- 7) Siding material will be appropriate but not identical to main house in order to differentiate old from new. Any brickwork used on the new addition will be whitewashed to blend in with the existing painted white brick on the main house.
- 8) No historic fabric on the main house will be impacted as a result of the new addition.

BACKGROUND

This house was constructed in 1953 and is in excellent condition. As a Colonial Revival house, it represents a typical midtwentieth-century building within the residential areas of the district. It retains integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association. This resource falls within the district’s period of significance and contributes to the residential character of the district. Although the dwelling does not possess sufficient architectural or historical significance to qualify for individual listing in the National Register, it is a contributing resource to the Warrenton Historic District under Criterion C, for architecture.



DESIGN GUIDELINE CONSIDERATIONS

Historic District Guideline	Page No.	Analysis
<p>7. NEW CONSTRUCTION A. Context</p>		
<p>The Architectural Review Board will not specify a particular architectural style or design for new construction projects. The context of new construction or infill is more important than the decorative details applied, though detailing is important.</p>	<p>3.63</p>	<p>N/A</p>

Historic District Guideline	Page No.	Analysis
New construction will be evaluated based on the project's relationship to its surroundings (context) and to the details of its site (materials, cornices, trim, porches, landscaping, rhythm).	3.63	N/A
A1. Setback		
1. Relate the setback of any new construction and additions to the setback of the existing historic buildings in the immediate surroundings of the proposed new construction. Generally speaking, setback should be within 10% of adjacent setbacks.	3.64	Applicant states that all new construction and additions will meet proper setbacks.
A2. Spacing		
1. Space new construction according to the historic precedence in the immediate surroundings of the proposed new construction. This includes sites adjacent to as well as across the street from the proposed new construction.	3.65	Applicant intends to appropriately space all new construction to comply with the general setting and historic precedence of immediately surrounding houses and buildings.
A4. Massing		
2. Use forms for new construction that relate to the forms of the majority of surrounding buildings. For instance, if the form of adjacent buildings has a variety of projecting bays, dormers, etc., employ some of these elements in the new building.	3.67	Applicant intends to appropriately space all new construction to comply with the general setting and historic precedence of immediately surrounding houses and buildings.
A5. Height and Width		
1. The height and width of a new building must be compatible with historic buildings within a 360-degree range of visibility of the new building.	3.68	The applicant states height and width of the new construction will be compatible with the historic buildings within a 360-degree range of visibility.

Historic District Guideline	Page No.	Analysis
<p>2. The height of a proposed building should be no taller than the tallest historic building on the block within a 360-degree range of visibility of the same type (e.g. single family to single family, multifamily to multi-family). The height of the historic structure should be calculated from the original historic ridge line (not any later additions that may be taller).</p>	<p>3.68</p>	<p>The applicant states height and width of the new construction will be compatible with the historic buildings within a 360-degree range of visibility.</p>
<p>3. Design new buildings to respect the existing width of original structures in the district. The space should be no more than ten percent of the average spacing of other historic buildings within the subject block. Larger apartment buildings or newer dwellings that do not contribute to the existing historic character should not be included within this calculation.</p>		<p>The applicant states height and width of the new construction will be compatible with the historic buildings within a 360-degree range of visibility.</p>
<p>A6. Scale</p>		
<p>1. Create human scale by including functional elements typical to the historic context, such as porches and porticoes.</p>	<p>3.69</p>	<p>Applicant has provided detailed plans and drawings for appropriate scale and massing of new construction.</p>
<p>B. NEW BUILDING</p>		
<p>1. New construction shall respect the established architectural character of the historic district.</p>	<p>3.70</p>	<p>Applicant has demonstrated that all new construction will respect the established character of the historic district.</p>

Historic District Guideline	Page No.	Analysis
<p>2. The new building should be recognized as a product of its period of construction, design, materials, and craftsmanship and consistent with the architecture of the Historic District. Avoid an exact imitation of a historic style that would blur the distinction between old and new buildings and make it more difficult to understand the architectural evolution of the district. In this way, an interpretation of a historic style that is authentic to the district will be considered if it is subtly distinguishable as being new. Allow for the contemporary design of new buildings, when such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material, and character of the neighborhood, or environment.</p>	<p>3.70</p>	<p>Applicant has demonstrated that all new construction will respect the established character of the historic district. The materials and style/design proposed appropriately avoid exact imitation of the historic main house.</p>
<p>4. RHYTHM: Incorporate traditional façade rhythm and articulation techniques in a new design. Design a new building to replicate the rhythm of fenestration patterning found in the historic district. Arrange windows to reflect the traditional rhythm and general alignment of others in the area. Incorporate windows, doors, and other openings at a consistent ratio to those found on nearby historic buildings. Use durable window materials. Appropriate window materials include metal, wood, and various composites, as deemed appropriate by the preservation industry standards and the Architectural Review Board. Inappropriate window materials include aluminum and vinyl with plastic snap-in muntins. Use detailing to articulate a façade including window and door framing, sills, water tables and belt courses, canopies, moldings, cornices, columns, and pilasters</p>	<p>3.70</p>	<p>Applicant has provided detailed plans and drawings that demonstrate the fenestration patterns of the new construction and its relationship to the main house. The materials and style/design proposed appropriately avoid exact imitation of the historic main house.</p>

Historic District Guideline	Page No.	Analysis
<p>5. MATERIALS: Use building materials that appear similar in scale, color, texture, and finish to those seen historically in the context of the district. Use materials that are proven to be durable in the local climate. Use materials that will maintain an intended finish over time or acquire a patina. Use high-quality, durable, materials. Use new siding that is similar to the lap exposure, texture, and finish of traditional wood siding. Use trim boards that show depth and typify high-quality traditional construction.</p>	<p>3.70</p>	<p>The materials and style/design proposed appropriately avoid exact imitation of the historic main house. The materials to be utilized will be high-quality and durable in nature.</p>
<p>6. DOORS AND WINDOWS: Respect the size, proportion, spacing and rhythm of door and window openings on all stories of contributing buildings in the subject block or neighborhood when designing and constructing new commercial or residential buildings. Avoid horizontal strip windows or square openings and doors wider than double leaf.</p>	<p>3.71</p>	<p>Applicant has provided detailed plans and drawings that demonstrate the fenestration patterns of the new construction and its relationship to the main house.</p>
<p>7. STYLE: Style cannot be guided inasmuch as they emerge with good design by architects, art, implementation by builders, lifestyles, function, fashion, the economy and industrial evolution. Contemporary expression with respect of historic precedence, context, significance and architectural heritage is encouraged.</p>	<p>3.71</p>	<p>Applicant has demonstrated that all new construction will respect the established character of the historic district. The materials and style/design proposed appropriately avoid exact imitation of the historic main house.</p>
<p>8. OUTBUILDINGS: Outbuildings shall remain secondary to main buildings</p>	<p>3.71</p>	<p>Applicant has demonstrated through detailed drawings and plans that all new outbuilding construction will remain secondary to the main house.</p>
<p>C. ADDITIONS TO EXISTING BUILDINGS</p>		

Historic District Guideline	Page No.	Analysis
1. Recognize all buildings as products of their own time; design the new addition so that it can be distinguished from the original, yet be compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features.	3.72	Applicant has demonstrated that all new construction will respect the established character of the historic district. The materials and style/design proposed appropriately avoid exact imitation of the historic main house.
2. Additions will cause the least possible diminution or loss of the historic character of the existing building including its materials, craftsmanship, design, location and setting.	3.72	Applicant has demonstrated that there will be no loss of historic fabric or integrity as a result of the new construction.
3. Locate additions that increase the interior footprint as inconspicuously as possible by setting them back from the front and side of the building.	3.72	Applicant has confirmed that the new construction will not increase or impact the interior footprint of the main house.
4. Additions should be clearly subordinate to the existing building in overall size including height, width, depth and scale.	3.72	Applicant has demonstrated through detailed drawings and plans that all new outbuilding construction will remain secondary to the main house.
7. Design and construct additions in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form, character and integrity of the historic property remains intact. For example, a small connector passage or hyphen to join a side or rear addition to the original building is less invasive and destroys less fabric than a full elevation connection.	3.72	Applicant has demonstrated that there will be no loss of historic fabric or integrity as a result of the new construction.
8. The style of the addition should not replicate the original but might respectfully, modestly reflect design elements.	3.72	Applicant has demonstrated that all new construction will respect the established character of the historic district. The materials and style/design proposed appropriately avoid exact imitation of the historic main house.
10. Respect the size, proportion, spacing and rhythm of existing door and window openings on the existing building. Respect the spatial relationship between the wall surface and window opening of the existing building	3.72	Applicant has provided detailed plans and drawings that demonstrate the fenestration patterns of the new construction and its relationship to the main house.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of Certificate of Appropriateness 23-91 for the request to modify previously approved COA 23-45 to include the following modifications: 1) to remove the garage/basement level of the previously approved addition to the main house; 2) to install a gable roof with no dormer for the previously approved addition; 3) removing a portion of the previously approved breezeway; 4) to replace wall face of existing retaining wall with brick; and 4) to install new fencing on the southwest side of the property to match existing scalloped fencing at side porch, all as described and depicted within the application, at 206 Culpeper Street with the following conditions:

- 1) All necessary permits are acquired.
- 2) New construction shall respect the established architectural character of the historic district.
- 3) Use building materials that appear similar in scale, color, texture, and finish to those seen historically in the context of the district.
- 4) Design and construct additions in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form, character and integrity of the historic property remains intact.
- 5) New fences and walls should not exceed six feet in height, or the maximum allowed by the zoning district regulations.
- 6) Existing or new brick or stone masonry walls should remain unpainted.

ATTACHMENTS

1. Attachment 1 – Photos and Plans