



Community Development
Department

STAFF REPORT

Meeting Date:	June 26, 2025
Agenda Title:	COA 25-39 68-72 S. Fifth Street
Requested Action:	Review proposal for the request to conduct multiple exterior renovations, repairs, and replacements. Please see full list of work items under the "Executive Summary."
Department / Agency Lead:	Community Development
Staff Lead:	Casey Squyres, Historic Preservation Planner

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The applicant is proposing to conduct the following exterior renovations:

- 1) 72, 70 and 68 South 5th Street:
 - a. Remove awnings over two top floor windows (68).
 - b. Replace all windows
 - c. Replace doors for 72
 - d. Reinstall sheet metal sliding doors on either side of new doors of 72.
 - e. Repair brick and repaint.
- 2) Replace Back Porch & Stairs:
 - a. Salvage what is in good condition. Demo and replace the back porch; exact same size.
 - b. Goal is to leave it rustic and industrial in look and feel, but functional and safe.
 - c. Level, pour footings for deck supports and stair landing.
 - d. Key requirements include a minimum stair width of 36 inches, handrails between 36 and 38 inches high, and a minimum load strength of 50 pounds per square foot.
The stairs that are there now are not original; the building's use has evolved.

BACKGROUND

This resource was part of the Warrenton Planing and Grist Mill complex. The attached building to the south first appears on the 1891 map. Construction on this complex began between 1891 and 1903 and is in fair condition. While this once industrial complex has been converted into an art studio, it retains integrity of location, design, setting, feeling, and association. This resource falls within the district's period of significance and contributes to the industrial character of the district. Although the complex does not possess sufficient architectural or historical significance to qualify for individual listing in the National Register, it is a contributing resource to the Warrenton Historic District under Criterion C for architecture.











DESIGN GUIDELINE CONSIDERATIONS

Historic District Guideline	Page No.	Historic District Guideline
B. WINDOWS AND DOORS		
1. Preserve and retain historic window and door openings, including window frame, sash, muntins, mullions, glazing, lintels, sills, architraves, shutters, doors, pediments, hoods, transoms, sidelights, steps, and all hardware. Retain fenestration patterning, size, shape, and operation. Owners of buildings with windows and doors that have been altered in the past are encouraged to restore these elements to their original appearance based on site evidence and appropriate historic research.	3.21	3. Replace in kind an entire window or door that is too deteriorated to repair. If the overall form and detailing are still evident, use physical evidence to guide the new work. Recreate doors and windows to match the appearance of the original window or door design. While modern window materials such as extruded composites will be considered on a case-by-case basis, the new window must match the original in terms of size, shape, profile, depth of sash, width, and setback. Wood doors on primary façades should be replaced with replica wood doors and only if the original is damaged beyond repair. These guidelines encourage the use of substantial and durable materials.
4. Recreate door and window glazing to match the appearance of the original glazing patterns as closely as possible. Maintain the original size, shape, muntin configuration, and number of lights. Do not substantially alter the profile of the frames, sashes, or muntins to accommodate thick (double or triple) replacement glazing. Use clear window glass that conveys the visual appearance of historic glass (transparent low-e glass is preferred).	3.21	5. If using the same kind of material is not technically feasible, then a compatible substitute material may be considered, especially on the side or rear façades when minimally visible from the street. All replacement materials must fit the original opening without alteration. Replacement doors on the side or rear façade, when minimally visible from a public right-of-way, may be wood or paneled steel. Substitute materials will be reviewed on a case-by-case basis.

Historic District Guideline	Page No.	Historic District Guideline
<p>6. If a new use requires that an exterior opening be closed, leave the architrave, window sash, or door in place and frame the new wall over it or to it. Depending upon the exterior plan, a new shutter may cover the opening or the window could remain exposed. This approach leaves the sill, lintel, casing, window sash, or door details unharmed and later owners can more easily restore the feature. Other exterior solutions to save the feature in situ for later use is to consider carrying the wall material across the opening which will cause the removal of the sill but leaves the lintel intact. Do not cover the opening with an entirely different material, such as cinder block, which will draw greater attention to the alteration. The best preservation principle here is to retain the ability to reverse the alteration with the least harm to the historic resource. If the architrave and window sash or door must be removed, the elements should remain in safe storage on the property for potential re-use.</p>	3.21	<p>7. Design new windows, doors, and other elements to be compatible with the original building.</p>
<p>9. Install additional windows or doors on façades of limited historic interest, usually only in minimally visible rear or side walls. Their design should be compatible with the overall design of the building. Locate new doors and windows to be consistent with the historic architectural style and rhythm of the building. Be careful not to significantly increase the amount of glazing as it will negatively affect the historic integrity of the building by changing the overall design of the building.</p>	3.22	<p>NOT historically appropriate: a. Removing a character-defining window, dormer, door, or details such as brackets, quoins, arches, keystones, lentils, sills, hoods, hood molds, paneled or decorated jambs, pilasters, entablature, cornices, pediments, or other related embellishments. b. Changing the size, number, and location of doors and windows, which affects the original design and style of the building.</p>
C. AWNINGS	3.25	

Historic District Guideline	Page No.	Historic District Guideline
1. Preserve and retain awnings that are in good condition and that contribute to the overall significance of the building and/or its historic integrity. It is not necessary to preserve and retain historic-age awnings that are not in good condition, that are not original to the building, or that do not contribute to the building's significance.	3.25	2. Design new awnings to be compatible with the historic building.
3. Awnings should generally be located directly below the storefront cornice or sign panel and extend over the transom and display windows. They should correspond to the opening's size and shape. If the display windows are very tall, or if a sign is present on the transom panel, an awning may be mounted directly below the transom provided that all portions clear the sidewalk by a required eight- (8-) foot minimum.	3.25	4. The awning should be slightly wider than the width of the display windows but should not obscure the piers or other significant features of the facade. Projection over the sidewalk should range from four (4) to seven (7) feet and be proportioned so that the slope of the awning is between fifteen (15) and (45) degrees. Valances on the front and sides are usually eight (8) to twelve (12) inches high and may serve as a sign panel.
5. Sloped shed-type fabric awnings are most appropriate for commercial and most residential buildings and cover fewer building elements. Retractable awnings are preferred. The design of the awning and color of the cloth should complement the building.	3.25	6. Scallops, notches or other decorative edge treatments may reinforce the pattern of awning fabrics or relate to details of the facade. Edge banding, which is added to all exposed seams of the awning fabric is available in many colors and may enhance the valance profile
7. Awning frames must be fastened to the building in the least harmful manner and into the mortar joints or existing holes of former awnings or attachments.	3.25	
E. ENTRANCES AND PORCHES	3.28	
1. Preserve and retain entrances and porches and their functional and decorative features that are important in defining the overall historic character of the building such as doors, transoms, fanlights, sidelights, pilasters, entablatures, columns, balustrades, stairs, flooring, columns, railing, brackets, modillions, dentils, cornice, and pediments.	3.28	2. Repair entrances and porches by patching, splicing, consolidating, or otherwise reinforcing the historic materials. Such repair also can include the limited replacement in kind—or with compatible substitute material—of those extensively deteriorated or missing parts of repeated features where there are surviving prototypes such as balustrades, cornices, entablatures, columns, sidelights, friezes, brackets, and stairs.

Historic District Guideline	Page No.	Historic District Guideline
4. Design new entrances and porches to be compatible with the historic building.		5. Design the replacement entrance, porch, or stoop to relate to the overall scale of the primary building. Research the history of the building to determine the location, appearance, and materials of the original entrance, porch, or stoop.
D. STOREFRONTS		
1. Preserve and repair historic-age storefronts, including window trim, glass, lintels, sills, architraves, shutters, cornices, pediments, hoods, steps, and all hardware. Owners of buildings with storefronts that have been altered in the past are encouraged to restore these elements to their original appearance based on site evidence and appropriate historic research		2. Repair storefront elements by patching, splicing, consolidating, or otherwise reinforcing the historic materials. Such repair also can include the limited replacement in kind or with compatible substitute material—of those extensively deteriorated or missing parts of features when there are surviving prototypes or sufficient documentation for an accurate reconstruction of the original.
3. Replace in kind an entire storefront element that is too deteriorated to repair. If the overall form and detailing are still evident, use the physical evidence to guide the new work. If using the same kind of material is not technically feasible, then a compatible substitute material may be considered.		5. Recreate storefronts by matching the original proportions, sizes, scale, color, and materials of the original, documented storefront. Do not alter the commercial character of the storefront by substantially reducing or enlarging the area of glass in the storefront.
7. Maintain the alignment and rhythm of the front façade when altering or restoring a previously altered storefront. Use traditional materials such as masonry and wood. If using traditional materials is not feasible, use compatible substitute materials that are similar in scale, finish, and character to the original material and have proven durability in the local climate. Expose original storefront elements that have been obscured by modern siding or other materials.		11. Design operable storefronts with appropriate proportions. The number of vertical divisions in the storefront and the proportions of frame to glass in each bay should be consistent with the existing rhythm of the building façade, so that when closed, the storefront reads as a typical fixed storefront.
A. FOUNDATIONS & WALLS	3.15	
Best Practice: Evaluate the overall condition of the masonry, mortar, and drainage system. Determine the source of moisture in the foundation (if any) and repair improper drainage systems and disintegrating mortar with similar consistency and color first.		1. Retain, preserve, and repair the historic masonry including foundations, walls, and masonry details or features of the building.

Historic District Guideline	Page No.	Historic District Guideline
2. Restore and repair masonry features by patching, piecing in, or consolidating the masonry using recognized preservation methods. Repair also may include the limited replacement in kind—or with compatible substitute material—of those extensively deteriorated or missing parts of masonry features when there are surviving prototypes or sufficient historical documentation for an accurate reconstruction of the original. Do not remove or rebuild a major portion of a masonry feature that can be repaired.		3. Replace and recreate original masonry in kind if missing or damaged beyond repair. When damaged or missing masonry must be replaced, use materials of the same size, color, and hardness. When appropriate, alternative materials may be used for masonry that convey the visual appearance of the surviving parts of the masonry feature and that are physically and chemically compatible with the historic fabric.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends approval of the following requests:

- 1) For 72, 70 and 68 South 5th Street:
 - a. Remove awnings over two top floor windows (68).
 - b. Replace all windows
 - c. Replace doors for 72
 - d. Reinstall sheet metal sliding doors on either side of new doors of 72.
 - e. Repair brick and repaint.
- 2) Replace Back Porch & Stairs:
 - a. Salvage what is in good condition. Demo and replace the back porch; exact same size.
 - b. Goal is to leave it rustic and industrial in look and feel, but functional and safe.
 - c. Level, pour footings for deck supports and stair landing.

All as described and depicted within the application for COA 25-39 at 68-72 S. Fifth Street, provided the following conditions are met:

- a) All necessary permits are acquired.
- b) Preserve and retain historic window and door openings, including window frame, sash, muntins, mullions, glazing, lintels, sills, architraves, shutters, doors, pediments, hoods, transoms, sidelights, steps, and all hardware. Retain fenestration patterning, size, shape, and operation.
- c) For all windows, maintain the original size, shape, muntin configuration, and number of lights.

- d) Awnings shall generally be located directly below the storefront cornice or sign panel and extend over the transom and display windows. They should correspond to the opening's size and shape.
- e) The Applicant shall design improvements to follow the requirements of ADA/Building & Fire Code and to respect the historic character of the building.
- f) Any paint removal over masonry shall not be completed with any abrasive methods, such as sandblasting or power blasting (over 300 psi) wet or dry gritty substances of any kind and shall be removed using the gentlest means possible.

g) Additional conditions as needed.

ATTACHMENTS

- 1. Attachment 1 – Photos & Plans
- 2. Attachment 2 – Draft Motion Sheet