



## TOWN OF WARRENTON

Department of Community Development

PO BOX 341  
WARRENTON, VIRGINIA 20188  
<http://www.warrentonva.gov>  
TELEPHONE (540) 347-1101  
FAX (540) 349-2414

### ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD

Staff Report COA 2022-152 (22-28)

October 27, 2022

**Owner/Applicant:** Barrie Newman / Wesley Ross

**Property:** 11 South Second Street

**GPIN:** 6984-43-1454-800

**Request:** Replacement awning, fence, addition, & cellar door; new sign, patio, & partial fencing

**Present Use:** Restaurant

**Zoning:** CBD – Central Business District

**Adjacent Property  
Zoning and Land Use:**

Direction	Zoning	Use
North:	CBD	Commercial Retail
South:	PSP	Parking Lot
East:	CBD	Parking Lot
West:	CBD	Restaurant

### Proposal:

The applicant is proposing the following exterior improvements:

1. Replacement Awning:
  - a. EXISTING- Wood frame quarter round shape with fabric covering
  - b. PROPOSED- 29' long by 5' deep wood frame traditional shape awning with 24 gauge Western Lock Standing Seam matte black metal panels with 1 $\frac{3}{4}$ " standing seams
2. Replacement Cellar Door:
  - a. EXISTING- wood pallet
  - b. PROPOSED- two panel wood cellar door stained with dark hardware
3. Replacement Stairs:
  - a. EXISTING- wooden stairs to second level door
  - b. PROPOSED- replace stairs with black aluminum steps and a canopy (full or partial) if required by code
4. Replacement Addition:
  - a. EXISTING- 113 SF addition with wood siding, a flat roof, with one metal door

- b. PROPOSED- demolish and replace 113 SF addition in-kind with painted white **Hardi Plank paneling**, asphalt shingle roofing, and two metal doors
- 5. Replacement & New Partial Fence:
  - a. EXISTING- 102 LF of 6' shadow box natural wood privacy fence
  - b. PROPOSED- 130 LF of 6' shadow box sealed natural wood privacy fence
- 6. New Wall Sign:
  - a. 8' by 10' (80 SF) cut metal sign
  - b. Installed directly on the wall with standoffs and LED backlighting
  - c. Located on the south side of the structure
- 7. New Patio:
  - a. 55' long by 13' and 23' wide wood patio; 24" maximum height
  - b. Free-standing on existing ground/driveway
  - c. Matte black metal handrail only at the front of the deck facing Second Street
  - d. Wood lattice to shield below the patio decking.
  - e. 16' long wood ADA accessibility ramp with a 24" platform to run parallel with Second Street and an 8' ramp (from the platform) to run perpendicular to Second Street.

#### **Historic and Architectural Significance:**

This institutional/commercial building was constructed in 1912 and is in fair condition. Historically, it served as the African-American View Tree Lodge Masonic Hall. It retains integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, and association. As an African American resource, this resource retains a high degree of integrity and local historic significance. This resource falls within the district's period of significance and contributes to the commercial and institutional character of the district. Although it does not possess sufficient architectural or historical significance to qualify for individual listing in the National Register, it is a contributing resource to the Warrenton Historic District under Criterion C, for architecture and Criterion A, for African-American and social history.

## Historic District Guidelines Description:

### EXISTING WINDOWS, DORMER WINDOWS, DOORS, SHUTTERS, AWNINGS & DETAILS

Although cloth awnings have ancient precedence, and the College of William and Mary had them in the mid-eighteenth century, the popular use of awnings was delayed largely until the late nineteenth century, except on storefronts. However, the August 1862 Timothy Sullivan Warrenton Main Street photograph shows both wooden and cloth, shed-roofed, lean-to awnings on the storefronts. The upper residential stories have shutters but no awnings. Signs were painted directly onto the canvas cloth. As awnings became more popular, they were designed elliptically or rectangular to fit the opening shape.

*Section VI Design Guidelines: Windows, Doors, Shutters, Awnings, pg 52.*

### SIGNS & AWNINGS w/SIGNS FOR COMMERCIAL BUILDINGS

Properties within the historic district require a Certificate of Appropriateness for all signs listed in Article 6, “General Provisions for Signs,” of the zoning ordinance that need a sign permit. Signs which are a replacement of an existing sign and signs less than two (2) square feet do not generally require ARB review unless they represent a significant departure from the existing sign design or architecture of the building. These signs would be reviewed administratively. ARB review and approval of a sign precedes issuance of the sign permit by the Zoning Administrator. Sign requests will be considered relative to the individual characteristics, size and scale of the building, existing signage and site conditions. Although sign regulations in Article 6, represent maximum permitted signage, the size may be reduced for the size and scale of the building as deemed appropriate by the Architectural Review Board to meet the provisions of Article 3 HD-Historic District. Signs of a temporary nature of up to six months do not require a Certificate of Appropriateness.

### FLAT or WALL SIGNS

Wall signs are either painted directly onto the building surface or are on a panel or signboard mounted on the face of the building. Wall signs are frequently used when the storefront does not have a cornice. Although painted over by later shopkeepers, several side elevations of stores including the Warrenton Supply on Ashby Street and Carter’s General Store on Main had artistic wall signs painted on their brick walls. The “Wagons, Harness and Farm Implements” sign remains on the front of the Warrenton Supply Building and should be preserved, restored when it fades and not removed or covered.

*Section VI Design Guidelines: Signs & Awnings with Signs – Commercial Buildings, pg 80.*

**ADDITION(S) TO EXISTING BUILDINGS** An addition to a building of whatever type or use is an alteration that increases the square footage of the structure and may alter substantially its size, height, contour or outline. When proposed addition plans cause consideration of demolition of any part of a contributing building, two items must be considered. The first would be for demolition which must be evaluated and determined prior to study and discussion of the second consideration for the proposed addition.

*Section VI Design Guidelines: Additions to Existing Buildings, pg 68.*

## Historic District Guidelines Considerations:

Historic District Guideline	Analysis
Guidelines for Existing Windows, Dormer Windows, Doors, Shutters, Awnings, & Details	
2. Evaluate the overall condition of windows, dormers, doors, shutters and the drainage system.	CELLAR DOOR- Currently a wood pallet placed over the access opening. Proposed double swing wood cellar door.  AWNING- Current cloth covered wood awning is ripped and deteriorating.
21. Awnings and framework should clear a sidewalk by eight feet. Do not allow existing awnings to deteriorate, fall and swing against the historic building or its features. If an existing cloth awning deteriorates to the point of needed replacement, it should match the original in material. Sloped shed-type fabric awnings are most appropriate for commercial and most residential buildings and obscure fewer building elements. Boxed awnings are discouraged. Awnings may be fixed or retractable, but the latter is preferred. Plastics, synthetics and aluminum are inappropriate materials and are discouraged. Awnings should correspond to the opening size and shape, and frames should always be fastened to the building in the least harmful manner and into the mortar joints or existing holes of former awnings or attachments. Fabric colors should compliment the building colors.	The current awning spans the entire width of the storefront and spans almost the depth of the front patio. Proposed awning will be standing seam metal on the same footprint as the existing awning but depth will cover the entire front patio.
22. Cloth awnings are preferred over interior translucent sunshades in display windows.	
Guidelines for Signs & Awnings with Signs – Commercial Buildings	
1. Wall signs should be scaled and sized according to the building to which they are proposed. They should not cover or obscure important architectural elements.	Proposed sign area is 80 SF. The width and height of the building at three stories plus the elevation change makes the sign size appropriate to the structure.
2. Vinyl, plastic or internally lit signs will not be approved.	Proposed LED backlighting.
4. Applied wall signs should be of painted wood.	Proposed material is metal cutout to reflect the logo installed with standouts.
6. Creative designs are always encouraged.	

Historic District Guideline	Analysis
<p>9. Wall signs should be attached in the least damaging means to the building's materials and other character-defining features. Try to reuse earlier holes for mounting rather than making new ones. When new holes are necessary, always try to fasten into the mortar instead of compromising the strength of a brick.</p>	<p>Sign shall be installed with aluminum standouts into a masonry stucco wall.</p>
Guidelines for Addition(s) to Existing Buildings	
<p>2. Additions will cause the least possible diminution or loss of the historic character of the existing building including its materials, craftsmanship, design, location and setting.</p>	<p>STAIRS- Current wood staircase is deteriorating. Proposed replacement aluminum steps with a standing seam metal canopy that may span the entire stairs or be partially covering the stairs, depending on State code requirements.</p> <p>PATIO- Proposed new wood patio almost the full length of the structure to the existing retaining wall. Maximum height on the patio is 24" with additional height for required handrail. Proposing wood lattice to shield the visible edge facing Second Street. Patio will have an accessible ramp spanning the width of the patio with black cable railing.</p>
<p>4. Additions should be clearly subordinate to the existing building in overall size including height, width, depth and scale.</p>	<p><b>ADDITION-</b> The proposed addition is a replacement in-kind, with the exception of Hardie Plank siding in</p>

Historic District Guideline	Analysis
<p>8. Design and construct additions in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form, character and integrity of the historic property remains intact. For example, a small connector passage or hyphen to join a side or rear addition to the original building is less invasive and destroys less fabric than a full elevation connection.</p>	<p>lieu of wood paneling siding. It is located at the rear of the property with the addition of one metal door located on the rear of the addition.</p> <p>PATIO- Will be highly visible from second street but obscured from all other angles by existing fencing. It will be freestanding with minimal impact on the physical structure.</p> <p>STAIRS- Currently there is no canopy or overhang with the existing stairs but the proposed stairs will fall within the same footprint.</p>
Guidelines for Existing Roofs	
<p>10. Pre-painted/pre-finished metal roofs may be applied to contributing buildings, consistent with the following criteria:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The material shall be no heavier than 26 gauge, and must be formed from rolled material on site.</li> <li>• Running Seams shall be less than 1 ½ inches high and shall be hand or machine crimped on site. The distance between seams should be no greater than 18 inches. Snap locking seams are not an acceptable method to join pans. Running seams are required to be double locked.</li> <li>• Dull or matte finishes are required. Bright colors are discouraged. The applicant shall supply a sample of the pre-finished metal roofing materials they wish to apply, including at least one (1) crimped seam. Color chips are not acceptable</li> </ul>	<p>AWNING- Proposed material is 24 gauge metal with 1¾" standing seams with a matte black finish</p> <p>STAIR CANOPY- Proposed material is Lawrence LFS-SLP aluminum standing seam sloped canopy in matte black.</p>

## Staff Review:

**AWNING-** The existing awning is deteriorating and likely not shedding water appropriately away from the patio. The proposed metal awning would help protect the building from further deterioration at the front entrances. Metal awnings are not typical in the historic district though metal roofing is common. Though uncommon, the awning would not detract from the structure and can be removed without disrupting the architectural detailing. Supports for the awning, if wider than proposed, should be considered as they may alter the visual impact on the stormfront.

**CELLER DOOR-** The proposed wood cellar door utilizes materials compatible with the building and the historic district. This would be an improvement from the existing wood pallet covering.

**STAIRS-** The current stairs are deteriorating and in need of replacement. The guidelines always suggest replacing with in-kind materials therefore metal does not align with this guidance. Metal stairs are seen in the historic district at the rear of structures or in obstructed locations. The proposed stairs will be highly visible from the public right-of-way in multiple locations, though not on the primary façade. The metal stairs will have minimal impact on the structure itself and minor visual impact of the historic district. The canopy, that may or may not be required by state code, would have a larger visual impact than the stairs with physical impact on the structure having new attachment points, but may not be able to be avoided for safety. Both elements would not alter the architectural details of the building. The canopy would tie in the metal awning at the front of the structure offering continuity.

**ADDITION-** The proposed addition is replacement in-kind, with the exception of the siding, utilizing the existing concrete pad. The applicant is proposing Hardie Plank siding to replace the existing wood panel siding. There will be zero impact on the core structure nor on the historic district being a duplication of the existing deteriorated addition. The proposed new door at the rear of the addition will not be seen from the public right-of-way.

**FENCE-** The proposed fencing is a majority in-kind replacement with 14 of the proposed 28 LF of additional fencing may be visible from the municipal parking lot, but the elevation of the lot mitigates any visual impact. This is especially so with the additional fencing being located behind the structure. Natural shadow box wood fencing is very typical for the historic district making it compatible to the structure.

**WALL SIGN-** The proposed metal signage is the dimensional, creative material shape asked for within Old Town. The standouts add further dimension to the sign rather than a flat square common in the historic district. LED lighting should be assured minimal to not have a negative cast of light beyond the sign. The proposed attachment points will have an impact on the exterior integrity of the stucco, if removed, but this is a common impact of all exterior signage. Assurance of proper installation will prevent any substantial damage.

**PATIO-** The material proposed for the patio is seen throughout Old Town and the historic district as a whole. The work area is currently unused and therefore would finish the look of the parcel creating a more pleasing visual impact on the public right-of-way. The handrails are modern but seen in both residential and commercial areas of the historic district, very near this structure. The

physical impact of the patio on the building will be minimal as it is freestanding. A 16' ramp will run along the front width of the patio with the same materials blending with the patio as opposed to running into or near the structure. Lattice cover, common in the historic district, will finish the patio obscuring any harsh structural elements that may have been visible from the street.

Staff recommends the following conditions for consideration:

1. All necessary permits are acquired.
2. All elements shall be installed with the least damaging methods.
3. Property lines shall be vacated before installation of the patio.
4. Metal for awning and canopy on stairs shall be no thicker than 24 gauge with 1½" tall standing seams.
5. Cellar door shall be wood with dark hardware, as proposed.
6. All metal roofing, handrails, and treads shall be black with a matte finish.
7. Fence shall be sealed natural wood with the shadowbox design.
8. LED lighting shall be minimal to prevent the casting of excessive light.
9. All elements of the addition shall be in-kind replacements, as proposed, with additional door being metal to match the original west-facing door.
10. Patio accessibility shall be as proposed in the May 16, 2022 amended application.
11. Patio materials shall be wood with black cable railing, as proposed.
12. Wood lattice shall be installed to shield any visibility below the patio.
13. Shrubs or planters shall be placed in front of any lattice to soften.
14. Metal cable railing shall be installed in the front, patio, and side stairwell.
15. Canopy shall be designed as proposed, in conformance with code requirements.
16. West patio end from deck to ground shall be finished with lattice or wood equivalent.
17. The addition siding shall be vertical Hardie Plank siding, as amended.