CONVENE: 6:00 p.m.

PRESENT: Mayor Debbie Sullivan and Councilmembers Peter Agabi, Michael

Althauser, Joan Cathey, Leatta Dahlhoff, Angela Jefferson, Eileen

Swarthout, and Kelly Von Holtz.

Staff: City Administrator Lisa Parks, City Attorney Karen Kirkpatrick, Finance Director Troy Niemeyer, Parks and Recreation Department Director Chuck Denney, Police Commander Jay Mason, Sustainability Coordinator Alyssa Jones Wood, and Deputy City Clerk Tracie Core.

Others: Tom Crawford and Stephen Bernath, Climate Advisory Workgroup, and Tony Usibelli, South Sound Washington State Sierra Club.

2023 SUSTAINABILITY REPORT: Coordinator Jones Wood presented the Green Team Annual Report for 2023 focusing on internal City operations, and Thurston Climate Mitigation Collaborative (TCMC) Annual Report focusing on community-wide emission reductions.

Reduction targets for greenhouse gas emissions were established by resolution approved by the Council as part of shared greenhouse gas emission reduction targets representing a 45% reduction in emissions by 2030 and an 85% reduction by 2050 utilizing 2015 as the baseline. The targets are being updated for the new Climate Element of the Comprehensive Plan to align with state reduction goals of net-zero emissions by 2050.

Coordinator Jones Wood shared a bar chart of City operations greenhouse gas emissions. Blues lines represent total emissions while the orange lines represent net emissions. Net emissions are actual emissions released into the atmosphere minus any offsets to reduce emissions. The City's record is consistent for total emissions but beginning in 2021, the City experienced net emissions through the purchase of green energy from Puget Sound Energy (PSE) through energy renewable certifications for all City electricity use.

Total emissions were represented in a pie chart with the largest source from water infrastructure for pumping, treating, and distributing water to City customers. The second largest user is the vehicle fleet with 18% from buildings and facilities followed by street lighting and outdoor lighting.

Coordinator Jones Wood reviewed net greenhouse gas emissions reduced by the purchase of renewable energy. The figures include City vehicle fleet, natural gas consumption, and waste.

The City tracks fuel consumption annually. For fuel consumption, a 2019 baseline is used. Fuel consumption can be gasoline, diesel, or renewable diesel (effective in 2023). Renewable diesel was a pilot program as it emits 60% less greenhouse gas emissions from the tailpipe than fossil fuels. The pilot program includes the use of the City's street sweepers. Based on no issues with the use, the City replaced diesel in the City's underground storage tanks with renewable diesel and no longer uses fossil diesel to power the City's fleet.

Coordinator Jones Wood reviewed the breakdown of different vehicles in the City's fleet with 7% electric vehicles (EV) and 9% hybrids. Approximately 84% of the fleet is comprised of internal combustion engine vehicles. In 2023, an in-house EV fleet assessment was completed of police vehicles and non-police vehicles because of differences in use and different cycles of vehicle replacements. Based on the assessment, 51% of the existing fleet could be converted to electric vehicles. By 2030, 18% could be converted to electric vehicles with additional grant support with 31% remaining internal combustion engine vehicles due to the type of vehicles. Electrifying the police fleet is entirely dependent upon on the release of a pursuit-rated police EV. The EV Chevy Blazer is scheduled for release with the City planning to pilot one vehicle through a state contract to assess how the vehicle meets police needs. Based on that scenario, 48% of the police fleet could be electrified with 30% hybrid vehicles and 22% internal combustion engine vehicles.

Coordinator Jones Wood reviewed buildings and facilities emissions. Emissions are from natural gas and electricity usage. Usage of natural gas increased last year because of the inclusion of natural gas usage by the golf course and the restaurant. The golf course restaurant consumes most of the natural gas by the City. Many City facilities are heated by natural gas with the golf course as the largest user followed by City Hall and the fire stations.

The Green Team established a goal for electricity usage and discussed options for tracking usage by employee to document efficiency as opposed to tracking total usage. Water infrastructure consumes the most electricity to pump, treat, and distribute potable water followed by buildings and facilities, streetlights, sewer infrastructure, traffic signals, and EV charging (less than 1%).

The City purchases renewable energy certificates from PSE for 100% of the City's electricity consumption. The credits are from the Skookumchuck Wind Farm in Lewis County and Lund Hill Solar Farm in Klickitat County. The investment grade audit of City Facilities in 2023 identified several cost-effective projects to reduce emissions. The audit identified \$4.6 million in total projects. Two of the projects are included in the City's 2025-2026 biennial budget for Public Works Building #2

HVAC replacement and City parks irrigation controls. The remaining projects are deferred until funding becomes available. Staff actively seeks grant funding for projects. The overall goal is improving energy efficiency and de-carbonizing buildings.

Solid waste is small sector included in the Green Team Report. The City achieved its goal in 2023 while acknowledging the difficulty of measuring waste of City operations. A formal waste audit was too expensive and a potential alternative of using laser sensors in dumpsters was not approved by the waste service provider. Staff obtains estimates based on weight and frequency of pickup, as well as the unit size of containers. Estimates reflect the City is diverting approximately 25% of waste and sending the remaining 75% to the landfill.

Coordinator Jones Wood responded to questions about the goals for waste and acknowledged the possibility of establishing different goals for different kinds of waste streams, such as plastic, paper, and aluminum. The difficulty is because of the inability to measure the waste stream for any type of waste. A bid received in response to the request for a quote for a waste audit for City operations was more than the available funding.

The City used 15.25% more potable water in 2023 than the baseline year. The largest users of water are parks and rights-of-way.

Councilmember Swarthout inquired about the availability of recycling companies to handle recyclable waste. Councilmember Cathey said the City's recyclables are processed by a variety of different companies.

Coordinator Jones Wood added that certain types of plastics are stored until a reasonable market price is attained because recycling is market-based. Solid waste in Thurston County is managed by Thurston County. The county has updated information on the location of sources processing different streams of waste.

Councilmember Swarthout asked whether the City has developed a plan to address the heating issue at the golf course restaurant. Coordinator Jones Wood advised that the investment grade audit identified the need to reconnect the kitchen outdoor air reheat to heat kitchen space without using kitchen stoves. The cost to resolve the issue would be approximately \$60,000. The investment grade audit includes a recommendation to add a gas sub-meter for the restaurant. Any action is deferred because of the lack of funding.

Councilmember Cathey recommended the City schedule a presentation by staff on the waste and recycle services offered in the City as different areas of the state have different types of services and requirements, such as either retaining or removing plastic bottle caps and recycling of glass

containers. Thurston County requires removal of caps while Seattle service providers do not require removal of bottle caps.

Councilmember Dahlhoff advised that the Department of Enterprise Services (DES) is seeking a statewide contract for recycling in multiple categories. Current waste trends in the waste stream are clothing and furniture. DES is seeking a vendor to conduct a pilot to address that waste stream. DES could be a source of potential funding in the future.

Councilmember Jefferson asked about potential actions by the Council to increase baseline percentages of different recyclable materials. Coordinator Jones Wood advised that in addition to funding, the City could explore opportunities with the Department of Ecology for recycling grants. After the City hires an urban forester, she would have more capacity to focus on solid waste and seeking other funding opportunities.

Coordinator Jones Wood reported the City utilizes reclaimed water from LOTT at the golf course for irrigation. Potable water is not necessary for irrigation and requires a lot of energy to produce.

Another metric tracked for the Green Team Report is employee participation in the Commute Trip Reduction program. Six employees are signed up and commute to work by using alternative means of transportation (biking, walking, bus, carpooling, or vanpooling). The City offers an incentive program for employees to purchase electric vehicles or plug-in hybrid vehicles. Three employees took advantage of the incentive last year with more than three employees using the program in 2024.

Coordinator Jones Wood updated the Council on the status of the TCMC Annual Report. Based on the 2022 greenhouse gas emissions inventory, the region is trending in the wrong direction. Greenhouse gas emissions community-wide increased by 6.6% between the baseline year and 2022. More work is needed to reduce the upward trend. Approximately 54% of community-wide greenhouse gas emissions in Thurston County are from buildings and energy, 36% from transportation, and 36% from water and waste, refrigerants and agriculture. In 2021, the City accepted the Thurston Climate Mitigation Plan (TCMP). The City realized the plan's implementation structure was created with the assumption that staff would not be assigned to work on goals. Time was expended in 2023 to rework the implementation structure to clarify different regional efforts. Subsequently, the Thurston Climate Mitigation Collaborative was formed. At its first annual retreat, the collaborative selected regional initiatives and appointed a Community Advisory Workgroup. Administrative tasks were transitioned to a consultant. The collaborative created a greenhouse gas emissions inventory and created jurisdictional work programs to support actions and strategies in the TCMP.

Progress was achieved on 2024 regional initiatives comprised of the Home Energy Score model ordinance and the electrification campaign pilot. A proposed interlocal agreement will be presented to the Council in January 2025 for the electrification campaign pilot. The model ordinance is being vetted by the Community Advisory Work Group and scheduled for presentation to the Council in April 2025 for potential adoption. Efforts continue on replacement of LED bulbs in City facilities. An all-electric buildings webpage was launched on the City's website and the City participated in the *Switch is On* launch to provide numerous resources to the community to learn how to electrify homes. The region achieved SolSmart Silver designation, a federal program offering assistance to alleviate and reduce barriers for small residential solar. The City completed two solar-plus storage feasibility estimates for City Hall and the Tumwater Library.

For transportation and land use, the City began work on the Comprehensive Plan Periodic Update to update the Transportation Element and create a new Climate Element. The TCMP intersects with other projects, such as actions specific to transportation efficiency that addresses roundabouts. The City's I-5/Trosper Road/Capitol Boulevard Reconfiguration project was a TCMP implementation project. The City completed its Fleet Electrification Plan and added three public EV chargers at City Hall, and designed and secured grant funding for multiple bike and pedestrian improvement projects.

In water and waste, the City completed the Investment Grade Audit of City facilities, continued recycling and composting at City events when volunteers are available, adopted the compost procurement ordinance and implemented by staff, and added rechargeable battery recycling during the Clean Up Drop Off event.

Efforts in agriculture, forest, and prairies included multiple public meetings on Tumwater Municipal Code sections related to trees in 2023. Ongoing efforts were paused during the update of the state's Wildland-Urban Interface code. The City was involved in improving the state code. The City hired a new planner to reinitiate the tree code update. The City completed a public urban forest and inventory and maintenance plan for all City properties, and continued efforts on the Habitat Conservation Plan. The City sponsored its annual Arbor Day tree giveaway.

The City's Sustainability webpage was updated and includes updated resources. Staff continues student internships and guest lectures.

MEETING THURSTON REGION'S City Administrator Parks introduced Tom Crawford and Steven Bernath, members of the Climate Advisory Workgroup for the Collaborative. They met with Mayor Sullivan and staff several weeks ago to review a letter drafted by the workgroup that speaks to concerns about insufficient

GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION GOALS:

capacity and resource allocation for addressing the climate crisis. They requested the City provide an opportunity to address the issues with the Council.

Mr. Bernath shared information on his professional background as a former state forest hydrologist working on climate change since the mid-2000s, water quality, fish habitat, and assisting Thurston County develop its conservation ordinance. The discussion will focus on ways to increase efforts to reduce greenhouse gas emissions and identify climate mitigation.

Mr. Crawford shared information about his professional background involved in climate change since 2008. He was a founder of the Thurston Climate Action Team (TCAT) and currently serves on the Board of the TCAT. He worked with indigenous and tribal communities on educational issues throughout the Pacific Northwest, as well IT projects for state government and organizations in the state, Oregon, and other areas of the country.

Tony Usibelli reported he serves as the Co-Chair of the South Sound Washington State Sierra Club. The club represents Thurston, Lewis, Grays Harbor, and Mason Counties. He is actively involved in local and state efforts for climate action.

Mr. Crawford acknowledged that the City of Tumwater was one of the first jurisdictions to allocate funds to assist in climate change efforts. He cited the Council's support for climate action and for accepting the TCMP and adopting a resolution declaring a climate crisis. The City also added staff specific to work on the TCMP, as well as increasing funding for the function. He thanked the Council and Mayor for their ongoing commitment to the Climate Mitigation Collaborative and to Councilmember Swarthout for her participation as a member.

As members of the Community Advisory Workgroup, they participated in a retreat in 2024 to discuss the significant discrepancy in achieving the goals identified in the TCMP and the targets established by the jurisdictions. Today, the target is 40% short of the 2030 goal. Much of that 40% could be achieved through progress by PSE to reduce carbon utilization for energy. Reducing carbon emissions by PSE operations will assist the region in achieving its goal while acknowledging that there is still a gap as the region is headed in the wrong direction with increasing emissions rather than a reduction in emissions.

Two actions are necessary. More resources should be devoted to address the challenges and crisis and reconsideration of the focus among policymakers and staff within each jurisdiction to ensure all decisions are helping to achieve the goals. Some policy decisions appear to be at odds with achieving the goals, such as zoning or permitting decisions that are

not consistent with the goal of reducing greenhouse gas emissions. One example is the allowance of warehouse uses in some communities that will directly increase the transportation footprint. Large warehouse developments also require the removal of trees, which serve as a source for carbon sequestration.

Councilmember Cathey said she is concerned about the lack of funding for any environmental attention from the new administration. She inquired as to any available resources for future funding. Mr. Crawford responded that funding has been an ongoing conversation by some members of the workgroup and within TCAT. It is important to consider ideas that are not typically considered and exploring ways to increase local funding sources that are not dependent on changes in the federal administration or in state government.

Councilmember Cathey commented on impacts to the climate by actions disturbing soils and the importance of paying attention to soil and not just greenhouse gas emissions but paying to accommodate development that often disrupts the balance of nature. She engaged in many conversations about the impacts caused by the disruption of soil and reducing the amount of payement. Mr. Crawford agreed as it is becoming more evident that disturbing the soil also has an effect on the climate as it releases greenhouse gases that otherwise would remain within the soil.

Mr. Crawford said the planet's temperature has increased by 1.5°C, which in 2015 was the temperature many believed was beyond what the planet could not exceed. The increase is not good news and it is important to plan carefully moving forward. The message is stressing the importance of thinking globally and acting locally.

Mr. Crawford displayed a photo of Vancouver, Washington in 2021. The photo reflected an individual returning to his apartment building with a sign on top of the building displaying 116°F. The planet is facing a heat dome situation, which was experienced in the Tumwater and Thurston County area. The heat is not stopping and will not decrease until emissions are reduced over a period on a permanent basis. It is only one of many challenges the region is facing in addition to smoke from wildfires, flooding, rainfall runoff, mudslides, and the indirect effects of reducing the ability to grow crops in some areas of the world. Nutritional values of some crops are dropping dramatically across the planet because of effects of heat and climate change.

Mr. Usibelli addressed the letter and other signatories of the letter. Fundamentally, the Sierra Club is concerned about what it perceives as a major environmental challenge in the era of climate change. Nearly most of the work by the organization is focused in one form or another on climate change, which is why the organization signed the letter along with

other organizations. All the organizations are aware that climate change presents major challenges to jurisdictions while also acknowledging that from a policy and program perspective, the City of Tumwater is leading the program by the actions completed and planned in the future.

Voters supported the Climate Commitment Act representing more than 60% of the statewide electoral. Projected revenue from cap and investment mechanisms of the Act estimate that over the next five years, funding will be generated of approximately \$3.8 to \$4.1 billion to fund environmental activities benefitting the climate. All signatories to the letter are interested in exploring ways to utilize some of those funds locally. One example of some actions by Sierra Club was encouraging members to become involved with Olympia Community Solar by supporting the program through the purchase of shares. It is also recognized that local governments, cities, counties, and the states will move forward to combat the effects of climate change regardless of what occurs at the federal level. The letter speaks to much needed actions while acknowledging the large base of individuals and organizational support to tap into some financial resources to move forward.

Councilmember Jefferson questioned the motivation and decision process for sending the letter. Mr. Crawford responded that some members began discussing the status of efforts within the context of the Community Advisory Workgroup in late 2023. Efforts required several meetings to solicit volunteers, develop the letter, and solicit signatories. Eleven of the 13 members of the Community Advisory Workgroup have signed the letter. The letter was driven by the March 2024 retreat after a review of current regional climate trends. The letter was initially presented to the Executive Committee of the Thurston Climate Mitigation Collaborative in July 2024. Since then, members and staff encouraged presentation of the letter to local city councils. The Olympia City Council and the Lacey City Council also received a presentation. A meeting is scheduled with several Thurston County Board of County Commissioners to discuss scheduling a presentation to the entire Board.

Mr. Bernath reviewed needed local actions:

- Reduce greenhouse gas emissions from buildings through conservations/new construction
- Reduce greenhouse gas emissions from vehicles through planning communities and providing alternative means for transportation to work, school, shopping, and recreation
- Increase absorption of carbon through trees, ag practices
- Ensure actions are addressed to meet social and economic differences throughout the community

Councilmember Dahlhoff asked whether there has been any consideration to explore incentives to promote sustainable development, such as sponsoring a pilot project to explore green options.

Mr. Crawford said the proposal is addressed within the TCMP by acknowledging the need to increase motivation for development to build green, energy efficient projects while acknowledging that such development has also become a community expectation. Building codes should be designed to convey community expectations. Residential development is driven by state building codes and the State Building Code Council. The Building Code Council has discussed various ways to promote green development within the state, such as electrification of appliances in homes. A combination of legislation and incentives are required for community members, designers, and builders.

Mr. Usibelli cited examples of green buildings and embodied energy within the built environment. An extensive analysis was completed on the amount of embodied energy within the built environment in addition to recommendations as to how the energy code could be updated to account for embodied energy.

Mr. Bernath reviewed suggestions for local jurisdictions to consider:

- Engage with other partners, such as Port of Olympia and Intercity Transit
- Seek Climate Commitment Act state grants, IRA grants, and other sources
- Fund a full-time grant manager
- Adopt climate lens policy (see resolution adopted by Olympia)
 - Integrate all decisions (both policy & financial) through a climate lens
 - Integrate and train staff/decision-makers in how to look through a climate lens
- Set-aside matching funds for state/federal grants

If successful accelerating progress on mitigating greenhouse gas emissions will help to:

- Improve health protect and restore clean water and air
- Reduces health risks prevent disease
- Create family-wage jobs
- Create new business opportunities in the clean energy economy
- Improve equity, social justice for all members of the community
- Enhances community showing how all care for each other

Mr. Bernath thanked the Council for its leadership on climate to date. However, the region is not meeting its progress goals. As the Council

reviews its budget and considers policies, the request is to consider ways to increase resources and policies on climate efforts.

Councilmember Cathey requested feedback on the definition of "climate justice" as the terminology is frequently interpreted differently. Mr. Bernath cited an example of developed countries producing a substantial amount of greenhouse gas emissions threatening other developing countries with flooding and sea level rise. Alternatively, policies should be created benefitting all members of the community and not just those who may be able to afford the changes.

Mr. Crawford added that it is important to consider those who already are and will continue to be hurt first and worst. They are typically members of the community without means who have traditionally been underserved and overburdened and who often contribute least to the problem of climate change.

Mr. Bernath noted that at the federal level, the Inflation Reduction Act includes criteria as well as the state's Climate Commitment Act to ensure a percentage of actions are targeted to communities that experience disparate impacts from air pollutants, or percentages of funds to low-income communities, or to other communities adjacent to energy facilities. The Council can consider those resources to turn policies and actions into substantive measures.

Councilmember Jefferson thanked the speakers for their leadership on climate change. She asked how the team is working with schools and educators, as climate change is important to youth. Mr. Crawford responded that TCAT has a long history of working with young people in the community and served as a channel for funding from a community member dedicated to support local climate clubs at some high schools. TCAT participated and supported actions by the clubs to include climate strikes at the state capitol. A planning discussion by the TCAT Board is scheduled to discuss engagement with youths and educators.

Mr. Bernath and Mr. Usibelli cited their efforts by their respective organizations with teachers and others in local schools to promote participation and educational efforts to reduce the impacts of climate change.

Councilmember Swarthout cited her membership on the committee and learning and being exposed to so much information. Sharing the information is important. She shared her frustrations of funding availability. The energy audit identified nearly \$5 million necessary to for the City to address actions in the audit. Intercity Transit and the Thurston Regional Planning Council hosted a high capacity transportation meeting. Regional agencies and jurisdictions know the importance of providing

light rail service connecting both Vancouvers. However, sticker shock is a reality because it is not financially possible to provide light rail service in the Thurston region. Dollars and cents necessary for brave decisions to move people off roads make it difficult to accomplish actions to reduce the impacts of climate change. Many community members can take personal action to reduce the impacts of climate change by installing solar panels or buying electric vehicles rather being directed by the government. Many in the community want to take the right steps, but discover it is financially impossible.

Mr. Crawford responded that he believes it is counterproductive to put the responsibility on individuals as it conveys blame. It is also a message that some corporate interests are intentionally portraying as a way to keep the population inactive and believing change is not possible. It is a false narrative and message. The state's tax system is one of the most regressive in the nation presenting another challenge. The state needs to step up and resolve the issue because ultimately it is important to consider the interests driving the use of fossil fuels over the decades. Those interests should be held accountable. Recent actions in other states are holding some fossil fuel companies more accountable for future actions necessary to keep the country safe.

Mr. Bernath commented on recent corporate actions to move employees back to the office as another negative action that will contribute to the climate crisis.

Councilmember Agabi commented on the environmental impacts caused by large oil companies and other polluters on other countries as well as in the United States. He questioned the logic of enabling polluters to police themselves, which appears to occur across the country to include the Pacific Northwest and how that will impact the climate in the next four years. Mr. Crawford acknowledged the challenges nationally as well as affecting the region's ability to pursue actions, which essentially reemphasizes the importance of local actions. He acknowledged the challenges moving forward and the importance of local organizations and jurisdictions to respond by resisting harmful actions and policies by supporting and implementing beneficial actions. The region will be challenged and will need to be active on both fronts requiring attention and many efforts.

Several Councilmembers individually thanked the speakers for presenting and sharing information.

MAYOR/CITY ADMINISTRATOR'S REPORT: City Administrator Parks referred the Council to information forwarded earlier on the Association of Washington Cities (AWC) Action Days during the legislative session scheduled on February 19-20, 2025 at St. Martin's University. The event provides updates on AWC legislative

priorities and information on current legislative issues. Registration to the event is open at this time.

The next City event is the Christmas Lighting event on Saturday, December 7, 2024 from 1 p.m. to 5:30 p.m. at City Hall and the Fire Station.

The last regular City Council meeting for the year is scheduled on December 3, 2024 followed by the Council's last work session on December 10, 2004 as a joint meeting with the Planning Commission. The last Public Works Committee meeting is on December 5, 2024. The Public Health and Safety Committee meeting has been cancelled in December. The General Government Committee is scheduled to meet on December 11, 2024.

Mayor Sullivan conveyed her wishes for everyone to have a good Thanksgiving holiday with family and friends.

ADJOURNMENT: With there being no further business, Mayor Sullivan adjourned the meeting at 7:48 p.m.

Prepared by Valerie L. Gow, Recording Secretary/President Puget Sound Meeting Services, psmsoly@earthlink.net