

MINUTES
CITY OF STEVENSON COUNCIL MEETING
August 22, 2019
6:00 PM, City Hall

1. CALL TO ORDER/PRESENTATION TO THE FLAG: Mayor Anderson called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. and led the Council and audience in the flag salute.

PRESENT

Councilmember Robert Muth
Councilmember Paul Hendricks
Councilmember Amy Weissfeld
Councilmember Matthew Knudsen

ABSENT

Councilmember Jenny Taylor

Others present:

Ken Woodrich, City Attorney
Leana Kinley, City Administrator
Eric Hansen, Public Works Director
Ben Shumaker, Stevenson Community Development Director
Karl Russell, Building Inspector/Water System Manager

2. CHANGES TO THE AGENDA: Minor document additions were included in the current packet.

3. CONSENT AGENDA: The following items were presented for Council approval:

a) Special Occasion Liquor License Application - Friends of Stevenson Library at the Library on October 5 from 6-9pm.

b) Approve Lodging for Permit Training - Mary Corey will be attending the Washington Association of Permit Technician's Conference in Chelan on Sept. 30th and staying two nights. The negotiated rate for the conference is \$140 per night, higher than the \$94 per diem rate. Council approval would be for the higher rate of \$140 per night for her to attend the conference.

c) Liquor License Renewal - El Rio Texicana

d) Water Adjustment - Top Gear Driving School (Meter No. 201200) requested a water adjustment of \$19.60 for a leaky toilet which they have since repaired.

e) Approve Resolution 2019-344 Authorizing New Post Office Box Custodians - Former Deputy Clerk/Treasurer Carla Cosentino retired in February and was the last remaining custodian for the city's Post Office Box. This Resolution updates the custodians to Mary Corey and Leana Kinley.

f) Approve Ratification of Resolution 2019-336 for a Scrivener's Change - City Administrator Leana Kinley presented a scrivener's change to resolution 2019-336 regarding an affordable housing sales tax ballot measure for council approval. The

change is on page 4 of the document regarding how the question to the voters is asked.

g) Minutes of July 18, 2019 City Council Meeting.

MOTION: Councilmember Muth motioned to approve consent agenda items a-g as presented, followed by a second from Councilmember Hendricks. The motion passed unanimously.

4. PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Hannah Joy from Carson asked if the City Council was planning to subsidize the Skamania County pool even if the proposed levy passes. Historically the council has been OK with supporting pool.

Ken Woodrich, Attorney for the City advised the public comment period was just that, not for questions. Mayor Anderson stated there was no commitment from the City Council on the issue.

Mayor Anderson stated there would be no public comment tonight regarding Initiative 1639. He said enough people had stated their beliefs and it was time to let the matter rest.

Cliff Nutting from the west end of the county referred to a number of laws he felt were possibly being compromised regarding data bases of gun owners. He declared the Department of Licensing was the only department with the authority to compile names, and that was for pistols only. He said the State of Washington needed to issue additional guidelines regarding enforcement of I-1639.

Mary Repar of Home Valley spoke against the City of Stevenson issuing homeowners permits for septic systems when the city is looking to fund and build a new \$10M waste water treatment plant. She said she felt the city should put a moratorium on septic fields within city limits.

5. OLD BUSINESS:

a) Discuss Letter Supporting Title 23 Waiver - Olga Kaganova, Deputy General Manager with the Port of Cascade Locks spoke to City Council regarding a request the POCL was making to request a waiver from Title 23 requirements regarding the use of toll revenues on projects that receive federal funding. The Pacific Crest Trail crosses the bridge and she spoke about the need for safe crossings for pedestrians and bicyclists. The POCL is planning to install a pathway across the bridge to accommodate those users. A Federal Lands Access Program grant has been applied for but if accepted it means the 100% of the toll revenue would have to be devoted to the bridge. The Oregon Legislature did not provide any funds to pay for the project.

Stevenson City Council members pointed out the Port of Cascade Locks receives all the tolls generated with the vast majority coming from the Stevenson community and does not use the funds to fully maintain the bridge as intended. Kaganova

acknowledged 80% of the toll revenue is spent on the bridge maintenance, with the rest used for POCL projects. She went on to stress the regional economic benefits of the bridge.

Councilmember Hendricks noted his wife is the local representative for the Pacific Crest Trail Association and, speaking for himself, he was in support of the project but would like to see some revenue sharing. He noted among his constituents the perception is the lion's share of the tolls are paid by Stevenson residents without a lot of benefits seen by them. He shared the Bridge is the only interstate bridge that mandates it be open to pedestrians.

Councilmember Knudsen followed up with comments stating he felt there were also perceptions the POCL needs to make sure the developments and projects they invest in need to be more stable and profitable, rather than subsidizing them with BOTG toll revenue. Councilmember Weissfeld stated she did not feel it was appropriate for toll revenues to pay for green grass at the POCL Marine Business Park. She said she understood the current passage may be unsafe and was in support of the project but to ask for a waiver and then not comply with maintenance funded from tolls is not fair.

Councilmember Muth reviewed the legal language regarding the waiver and asked questions regarding where the actual request was going to-Oregon legislators or Washington?

Mary Repar asked about public comments and was this topic something she could talk on. She spoke, saying, "Hell, no" against supporting the waiver. She declared the POCL makes plenty of money from the bridge tolls and federal money received. She stated the Washington side has terrible access to the bridge and needs to be made safer. She said the POCL should give money back to Skamania County.

Cliff Nutting complained about the bicyclists and pedestrians not paying tolls or tire taxes or other means of revenue. He believed they should pay something for usage. He also opposed the waiver.

MOTION Made by Councilmember Hendricks: To authorize the Mayor to sign on the OneGorge letter of support for the Title 23 waiver as presented.

MOTION died for lack of a second.

b) Discuss I-1639 - Council discussed whether or not to take further action regarding the enforcement of I-1639 within the City of Stevenson. Attached was a letter from the Sheriff regarding the matter.

Mayor Anderson noted a meeting regarding I-1639 meeting was held with Sheriff Brown, Pat Bond, Ken Woodrich, Adam Kick and City Administrator Leana Kinley. At the meeting Sheriff Brown stated he would continue controlling enhanced background checks but that other checks required by next summer may be hard. Proper training is upon seller, safe storage upon purchaser. Sheriff Brown

will continue to control what he can. He is doing his part as required in letter and will enforce law as drawn up-no changes anticipated.

Councilmember Knudsen shared Sheriff Brown was invited to attend the City Council meeting. He reiterated there was concern about liability, and referred to minutes from the July 2019 City Council meeting in which City Attorney Woodrich noted liability falls on enforcement. He said he had a concern with city money already being wasted without accountability and didn't want to misuse city funds on issues with enforcement. Councilmember Weissfeld took exception on Councilmember's Knudsen statement regarding poor accountability of city money. She stated she felt the letter from Sheriff Brown served the purpose.

Caleb Wold from Carson asked if the law would be enforced as Sheriff outlined? Councilmember Muth stated the Council is a legislative body, not an enforcement agency, so we can't take a position. The chief law enforcement officer has discretion on enforcement. City of Stevenson has contract with Sheriff's Office to provide Law Enforcement. Councilmember Knudsen stated he felt the liability issue has been addressed.

c) Fire Hall Update - Staff proposes holding a joint meeting with Fire District 2 and the Fire Chief to agree on a vision and goal for the new fire hall project. One proposal is the next Fire District 2 Commissioners meeting on Monday, September 9th at 6pm. Other availability can be discussed if a quorum of council will not be available. The latest renderings from the Needs Committee are attached.

Updated designs for the proposed firehall were presented in councilmember packets. City Administrator Kinley stated that before the project moves forward, it would help to have the City Council and Fire District 2 Commissioners agree on what the firehall should look like. Councilmembers and City Administrator Kinley discussed the ongoing issues and frustrations regarding the building of a new firehall. There were concerns over the delay in coming to a decision and all the back and forth in determining a design that meets the fire department needs but stays within city budget parameters.

Councilmember Knudsen asked for a clear agenda and direction during any additional meetings to avoid going around and round again. Councilmember Weissfeld agreed. She believed a consensus was arrived at during the last needs committee meeting. She questioned the need for another meeting if it meant going over the same topics.

Councilmember Weissfeld serves on the needs committee. She reported she urged it not to focus on design, that the needs were a priority.

All agreed there had been a proposal costing \$6.3M put before the council and the council had determined that was unaffordable. The question remains as to what could be built that is functional and meets the needs of the fire department. Councilmember Weissfeld does not want to build something drawn on the back of a napkin.

There was some confusion over who the meeting would involve. Ben Shumaker, City Planning stated it would be with the Fire Commission. Karl Russell, Fire Commissioner noted that none of the fire commissioners had been included in the current group of committees and wanted more involvement and input.

Councilmember Hendricks asked if there was a dollar amount they council could settle on in order to share at the meeting. No definite number was agreed to. He was concerned the last meeting was too contentious and wanted there to be understanding that everyone was on the same side. Ben Shumaker reminded the Council the Fire District is a taxing agency and will be paying some of the cost.

Councilmember Knudsen also asked if a firm dollar amount number could be determined. The consensus was it was unlikely.

Administrator Kinley asked the Council to consider what the framework for the new Firehouse would look like. Currently the ownership is split 50/50 between the fire department and the city. How should the new one be structured? Keep the same model or look at a larger picture? Councilmember Muth shared that he recalled it would be similar to the current arrangement, with the city owning the property and leasing the building to the fire department.

After further discussion a meeting was scheduled for September 24 at 6 p.m.

d) Sewer Plant Update - City Administrator Leana Kinley provided an update on the Stevenson Wastewater System and the Compliance Schedule. A report was attached for review. Administrator Kinley directed Councilors attention to the graph on page 33-34 that showed the trend lines are going down for BOD-TOS due to sidestreaming of waste. The amounts are still not within permitted levels for BOD, but they are continuing to reduce.

6. NEW BUSINESS:

a) Wastewater Connection Appeal - Ron Richards and Terry Steeves appealed the requirement to connect to city sewer. The appeal procedure in SMC 13.08.070 (attached) allows the matter to come before Council. An email from Public Works Director Eric Hansen was attached with the initial appeal request and his recommendation. Administrator Kinley also included the city code that allows for an appeal.

Administrator Kinley shared recommendations from PWD Eric Hansen, in which he agreed to not connecting, as there are no plans to extend the main sewer line past the property in question. There is sewer but not in that area. It goes up School Street but not Kanaka.

Attorney Woodrich noted this was not a land use matter but just a utility appeal.

MOTION: Councilmember Muth motioned to approve the appeal by Ron Richards and Terry Steeves regarding connection to city sewer at 330 NW Kanaka Creek Rd. Motion was seconded by Councilmember Weissfeld.

Following the motion and second further discussion was held. Councilmember Knudsen shared he understood the situation but was concerned that the City was setting a trend whereby septic installation permits would be routinely issued rather than sewer hookups. It has been a common topic. Councilmember Hendricks agreed, noting he has not seen an appeal denied and asked if it would become common knowledge to apply for septic permits.

Councilmember Knudsen asked if the city needs to come up with a better plan to address this. What can we do as a system to overcome the problems of the hills? We've had this discussion over time. Should a moratorium be put in place?

Councilmember Weissfeld agreed it was a valid point but believed in going with staff advice. Councilmember Knudsen did not dispute Eric's recommendation but felt further discussion was warranted about a better plan to address the problem. He was concerned about allowing additional septic tanks while reducing the number of sewer hookups and accompanying fees the city needs to pay for the new sewage treatment plan.

Voting: Councilmembers Hendricks and Knudsen voted nay, Councilmembers Weissfeld and Muth voted aye. Mayor Anderson was advised he could cast the deciding vote, as it was not an ordinance or expenditure item. Mayor Anderson voted aye. The motion carried 3-2.

Further discussion was held regarding what future possibilities and tools could be used to address the issue. Councilmember Hendricks suggested placing the item as a topic for a future retreat.

b) Park Plaza Design Approval - The Stevenson Downtown Association presented the design for the Park Plaza project for council review and approval according to the stipulations outlined in their Tourism Fund contract. Once the Park Plaza is created there will need to be agreements in place regarding the care and maintenance of the facility. A workshop with the County Commissioners on October 8th or 9th at 5:30pm is proposed to start discussions on the framework for such agreements.

Marie Perez, Brian Adams and Joe Schlick shared information and details on the proposed Park Plaza Project set for the Skamania County Courthouse lawn in downtown Stevenson. They reviewed the history and timeline of the project. Without approval from the City of Stevenson the project cannot access \$147,000 provided by legislature.

- Concerns and questions from audience and Council included a lack of covered areas as protection against rain, maintenance and cleaning costs and responsibilities, possibility of homeless camping, parking, and entrance

- to courthouse via the ADA pathway as door is now locked. If a geo-tech or archeological study shows problems can changes be made that don't increase costs?
- Positive comments were received about the layout and amphitheater, multi-usage/seasonal use and intent, lighting of bollards, open plan for viewpoints, ADA pathway, possible revenue from outdoor dining areas, etc. Mayor Anderson stated he still preferred placing the amphitheatre in the center to take advantage of the natural slope.

Joe Schlick noted the Stevenson downtown plan has parking as a topic to be addressed. Brian Adams pointed out that approval would also provide opportunities to obtain additional funds. A joint workshop with the County Commissioners is planned in early October to address maintenance, permits, archeological reviews, parking and other items in a long list of details. Councilmember Hendricks asked for construction blueprints to include provisions for a roof that can be retrofitted. Something temporary was also suggested, such as tents or sailcloth.

MOTION: To approve the Park Plaza Project Design as presented was made by Councilmember Knudsen with a second by Councilmember Paul Hendricks. The motion carried unanimously.

Ken Woodrich, City Attorney suggested appointing an ad-hoc committee to avoid holding a special meeting. Councilmembers Hendricks and Knudsen and Mayor Anderson will attend on October 8th at 5:30 at the County Commissioners Chambers.

c) Discuss Ordinances to Address Homeless - Council discussed the two draft ordinances (Sit-Lie and Camping) attached to assist Councilmembers with managing the increased number of homeless persons and camps now appearing throughout the city. The ordinances are independent of each other. They were based on those that City Attorney Woodrich drafted for the City of Washougal. City Administrator Leana Kinley noted the previous ordinances before council resulted in recommendations to direct people to local resources. These ordinances are now intended to legislate responses.

Ken Woodrich, City Attorney provided input regarding the ordinances and how the Sit-Lie language can be vulnerable to legal challenges. Washougal did not adopt the Sit-Lie, just the Camping ordinance.

The Port of Skamania County and Sheriff's Office are facing increased challenges regarding homelessness. They need legal tools to help address the issue. Attorney Woodrich shared some legal findings into ordinances that need to be observed. Ordinances that ban camping can be adopted and enforced if there is adequate shelter available either through NGO's or public entities. If the shelters are provided by churches, the church cannot require attendance at services as a condition for staying.

Attorney Woodrich referred to the City of Vancouver camping ordinance as a model of a reasonable restriction. If no shelter is available, cities cannot prohibit sleeping in public places but can limit stays, for example, to just one night. Definitions of camping need to be clear. RV's are included in the camping ordinance.

Sit-Lie ordinances prohibit people from lying in doorways, alleys, etc. and obstructing access to businesses. They are hard to enforce. No loitering signs are too vague and no longer used.

Ben Shumaker, Community Development Director asked if the Port of Skamania had adopted any ordinances related to homelessness and were they subject to the same provisions regarding shelters available? The response was they have not, they would need to pass a similar ordinance for any property they own within the county and work with the Sheriff's Office.

Following Council discussion, audience comments and further explanations regarding problems and options that occur with ordinances addressing homelessness, the Council asked Administrator Kinley to come to the next meeting with a sample ordinance regarding camping by homeless individuals. Councilmember Weissfeld noted she was OK with a camping ordinance but felt the provisions regarding sleeping in a vehicle on any street during the day needed to be removed or revised. She also felt the Sit-Lie ordinance was too harsh as it seemed directed at just one situation and she it was a sledgehammer approach. Councilmember Muth noted the penalties do not match fines or jail times, and recommended running the sample ordinance past the county prosecuting attorney. Attorney Woodrich suggested this was the first step to avoid the establishment of homeless encampments that have the potential to become health and fire hazards. He advised that even with an ordinance in place it should not be the last time a discussion about homelessness should take place. Councilmember Hendricks noted that addressing homelessness was an item on the goals for City Council.

d) Approve lamResponding Contract - Fire Chief Rob Farris requested approval of the contract with lamResponding for supplemental dispatch services. The department has tried it out over the past year and are so pleased they are expanding use to other agencies in the county. This will be for 3 years, at \$300 each year. The cost is split between Stevenson Fire Department and Fire District 2.

MOTION: To approve the contract with lamResponding for three years at \$300 each year was made by Paul Hendricks with a second provided by Amy Weissfeld. The motion passed unanimously.

e) Discuss 2020 Goals - City Administrator Leana Kinley presented a memo and current strategic plan status for aiding the discussion of goals for the 2020 budget cycle.

City Administrator Leana Kinley demonstrated a Gant chart that showed priorities based on original goals. Some additions from the recent staff and board survey were included at the bottom.

City Administrator Kinley wanted to know what items on or off the timeline could be taken off or exchanged. The chart showed the work planned through the years 2020-2021 as well as long-term projects. The Council discussed what progress was being made with goals and what still needed to be done.

Councilmember Knudsen stated he was concerned about how the City was spending on loans. He asked what could be removed. Administrator Kinley explained the loans were all for capital projects and the capital improvement program will merge those programs together as project fund planning. Councilmember Knudsen asked for more information on the one-off's that appear frequently. It was pointed out that the items usually are within the budget. The budget approved by the Council may require budget amendments and contract approval with specific dollar amounts, and any amounts that exceed need to be adjusted accordingly or authorized through a budget amendment. Councilmember Muth asked if the city budget and allocations were built on council priorities. Councilmember Hendricks asked if staff had any needs they would like to see included.

Broadband expansion was noted not to be on the list. Administrator Kinley suggested internships may be one way to leverage staffing for that project. Mayor Anderson stated broadband was not possible due to time limits of staff.

Ben Shumaker, Community Development Director said the biggest needs to address were a deliberate growth strategy determined in large part by the buildable lands and housing needs assessment currently taking place which in conjunction with the county could help coordinate growth. Capital improvement plan could help fill the gap between the budget and long-term planning to help find and prioritize funds. Mayor Anderson pointed out the chart was a good visual to help coordinate projects and combine resources especially when it came to projecting road and utility work.

Shumaker also noted the road diet was accomplished for local streets, but this plan would help land use policies match the city's ability to provide utilities and eventually make it a condition of approval to extend utilities beyond city limits if annexation is approved. Attorney Woodrich suggested making it a matter of policy.

Karl stated the water system goals were attainable and he felt not much needed to be changed.

Councilmember Weissfeld asked where the communication plan was as it was not on the chart. Councilmember Knudsen noted it was ever changing and there was always room for communication improvement. Administrator Kinley pointed out the recent outreach via the fair booth and newspaper articles and letters to the editor

as good examples. Councilmember Weissfeld asked that for any large projects communication with residents be maintained.

Mayor Anderson noted there had been a lot accomplished and to stay the course. Councilmember Weissfeld asked what do we plan for next? Is there another retreat planned? Administrator Kinley stated she envisioned one for early 2020. A consensus was for water needs and critical infrastructure. Councilmember Knudsen suggested to look at what is not here, particularly affordable housing.

An audience member asked if affordable housing meant building homes for people on welfare or for middle income. She requested some way to help builders put up houses less expensively. Councilmember Hendricks said they were exploring various options including tiered permitting fees to lower the costs of development.

Mayor Anderson stated finding altruistic people such as the MOSS group willing to help others was important when it came to helping solve the housing situation. Mayor Anderson stated it was expensive, people working multiple jobs still could not afford housing in the area. Councilmember Knudsen shared he was President of the MOSS group. Councilmember Weissfeld stated she agreed but referred to individuals connected with the MOSS group had spoken rudely to her. She requested respectful dialogue in the future.

City Administrator Kinley reiterated if the proposed .1% sales tax levy passes in November, it would allow the city to access a sales tax credit to gain approximately \$53,000 to help support rental assistance or low-income housing.

7. INFORMATION ITEMS:

a) Sheriff's Report - A copy of the Skamania County Sheriff's report for July 2019 was attached for council review.

b) Chamber of Commerce Activities - A copy of the Chamber of Commerce Activities report for July 2019 was attached for council review.

c) Planning Commission Minutes - Minutes were attached from the 7/8/19 Planning Commission meeting.

d) Lakeview Street History - Attached was an email and associated documents describing the history of Lakeview Street.

e) Fire Department Report - A copy of the Fire Department's report for July 2019 was attached for council review.

f) Municipal Court Cases Filed - A summary of Stevenson Municipal Court cases recently filed was attached for council's review.

g) Affordable Housing Sales Tax Measure - The information sheet regarding the November 2019 ballot measure for a .1% sales tax for affordable housing was attached for review.

8. CITY ADMINISTRATOR AND STAFF REPORTS:

a) Ben Shumaker, Community Development Director

Ben Shumaker noted the downtown planning workshop is scheduled for either September 23rd or 25th at 6 p.m. The concepts developed will be presented for

review. He urged the council to attend if possible. So far over 60 residents have taken part and he is pleased with the engagement and data collection. There are more concepts in the works. The downtown plan will help inform the Capital Improvement Program.

Karen Ashley has retired from the Planning Commission so a seat is vacant. Shumaker is recruiting for a new member and only city residents can serve.

On the Loop Road project, council decided not to run a sewer line. Now two property owners came in to ask about sewer hook-ups. To extend the sewer line and fix other items it would cost \$900K, to just run the additional line would cost \$300K.

Karl Russell, Building Inspector/Water System Manager stated there are 23 houses under new construction, 9 in 2019. All but one of the 9 are single family residences. 70 building permits total for 2019. The McCloskey construction has run into neighbor's sewer lines on the property-the lawyers are talking. Shumaker stated that land use expectations and utilities are mismatched. Karl noted that one-off's, single homes and latecomers make it difficult to coordinate utilities and slow construction considerably. Mayor Anderson asked for a cost on installing sewer mains while the Loop Road construction is taking place. Administrator Kinley said she would work on getting the estimate. She reported that increases to water rates next year will be 5% water and 35% for wastewater. Karl expressed concerns that at the same time the rates are rising the Park Plaza appears to be using excessive amounts of water. He asked for water conservation to be stressed.

Shumaker noted that with the last zoning code update the council created new processes for interpretations of a use table. Prior decisions took much longer. He was able to save time by being able to make interpretations regarding zoning changes and that carving out trade, commercial and industrial districts was helpful.

b) Leana Kinley, City Administrator

Administrator Kinley reported the City received a water discharge permit for the water treatment plant that is good until 2024.

Kinley reported the new phone system went live on August 22nd, with individual voice mail and an incoming phone tree now available.

The IACC conference registration is open. It will be held in Wenatchee. It is a good place to learn about capital and construction project funding info. A number of staff are planning to attend.

Working on creating draft revised agreements and local agreement amendment for Russell Street project. May require a special council meeting. Public Works is waiting for two more temporary construction easements to come in order to finalize the project for construction.

Time sheet process: still on Excel spreadsheets and there are still problems. Nova Time could work for Public Works. It would cost \$4K for timesheet system initially, then \$2K per year. Current costs for staff to spend time moving spreadsheets is \$3,300. Administrator Kinley asked the council if they would approve looking at options. The consensus was yes.

9. VOUCHER APPROVAL AND INVESTMENTS UPDATE:

a) July 2019 payroll & August 2019 A/P checks have been audited and were presented for approval. July payroll checks 13735 thru 13739 total \$99,772.96 which includes twenty-five EFT payments. A/P Checks 13740 thru 13805 total \$199,696.10 which includes three ACH payments. The A/P Check Register was attached for your review. Detailed claims vouchers will be available for review at the Council meeting. No investment activity in July 2019.

MOTION to approve vouchers as presented made by Councilmember Muth with a second by Councilmember Hendricks. The motion passed unanimously.

10. MAYOR AND COUNCIL REPORTS:

Councilmember Knudsen requested that as the next city budget begins to be built could some funds go to homeless shelter and DV shelter. It was suggested to check with WGAP and SCCDVSA regarding their non-profit status.

Mayor Anderson reported the Regional Collaboration meeting between Skamania County cities, school district, Port, PUD, EDC and Commissioners went so well they are suggesting to meet quarterly in order to share info on projects. Councilmember Hendricks asked to be involved.

Skamania County EDC is in the process of hiring a new Executive Director.

11. ISSUES FOR THE NEXT MEETING: None reported.

12. ADJOURNMENT - Mayor Anderson adjourned the meeting at 8:57 p.m.

=====

Approved _____; Approved with revisions _____

Name

Date

Minutes recorded by Johanna Roe