

### STAFF REPORT

MEETING DATE:	August 27, 2020
AGENDA ITEM TITLE:	Argys Brothers Garage – 223 E. First Street - Major Certificate of Approval
AGENDA SECTION:	Application Public Hearing

**REQUEST:** The purpose of the request is to receive approval for exterior alterations to the back wall of the structure at 223 E. First Street. The applicant is requesting to increase the 8'x8' garage door opening to allow for a 12'x12' garage door opening on the rear (south) wall of the building.

### **APPLICANT:**

The applicant is Sam Mick, PO Box 1008, Salida, CO 81201.

#### LOCATION:

The property is described as Lots 8-10, Block No. 23, to the Town (now City) of Salida, Chaffee County, Colorado and is addressed as 223 E. First Street. The historic building name is Argys Brothers Garage.

#### **PROCESS:**

A major certificate of approval (CA) shall be reviewed and ruled upon by the Historic Preservation Commission at a regular or special meeting to be conducted within thirty-one days from the date the application was determined complete, or within a longer time period as necessary to reasonably accommodate the application on an HPC agenda.

The Commission shall approve, approve with conditions, or deny the application, or remand it back to the applicant with instructions for modification or additional information or action.

#### **OBSERVATIONS:**

- 1. The subject property is located within the Central Business (C-2) zone district and is located within the Downtown Historic District. This property is considered <u>contributing</u> to the downtown historic district.
- 2. According to the Architectural Inventory Form statement of significance for this property: "This building is associated with the development of automobile-related service buildings in downtown Salida, having been erected in the 1920s to house the Argys Brothers Garage, an automobile sales and service firm. The Argys Brothers' automobile business continued in this building for more than half a century. The building is an extremely well preserved example of an automobile dealership, and is notable for its stepped parapet, decorative brickwork, large display windows with clerestories, and intact entrances. The building is potentially eligible to the National Register."



3. The applicant is requesting to enlarge the existing garage door opening on the rear (south) wall adjacent to the alley. The current opening is 8'x8' and the applicant is requesting to increase the opening to 12'x12'.



4. The applicant has provided specifications on the proposed 12'x12' door which will be a metal faux wood grain insulated door with two rows of windows toward the top of the door.

## **REVIEW STANDARDS:**

- 1. Conformance with Certificate of Approval Review Standards for a contributing property (Section 16-12-90) using the Design Guidelines in the review:
  - A. Architectural Character. Whether and/or to what extent the proposed work will preserve, protect, change, diminish, disguise, obscure, detract from or destroy the appearance or structural integrity of the historic features, design, materials, character or value of the structure or site.
    - The Secretary of Interior Standards for rehabilitation recommends identifying, retaining, and preserving masonry features that are important in defining the overall historic character of the building such as walls, brackets, railings, cornices, window



architraves, door pediments, steps, and columns; and details such as tooling and bonding patterns, coatings, and color.

- The applicant will not be destroying the appearance or the integrity of the building. The request is to enlarge an existing opening on the south wall which is in the rear of the property along the alley. According to the Architectural Inventory form, the rear wall (south) is the only part of the building that has been altered by the addition of stucco and windows.
- The Secretary of Interior Standards for Alterations/Additions for new Use: Some exterior and interior alterations to a historic building are generally needed to assure its continued use, but it is most important that such alterations do not radically change, obscure, or destroy character-defining spaces, materials, features or finishes.
  - The applicant is requesting to increase the opening on the south wall in order to get his equipment in the building. The applicant has not stated his intentions for the use of the building.
  - The south wall is adjacent the alley and not visible to First Street or E Street. Enlarging the door opening on the South wall should not detract from the appearance of the structure and should not destroy any character defining features of the structure.
- **B.** Original Materials. Whether original designs, materials, finishes and construction techniques that characterize the historic value and appearance of a structure or site can be retained, restored or repaired as opposed to replaced, and whether replacement designs, materials or finishes can match and/or accurately replicate the originals.
  - According to the Downtown Design Guidelines, Part III, Section C- Doors, Policy: The character-defining features of a historic door and its distinct materials and placement should be preserved. In addition, a new door should be in character with the historic building. This is especially important on primary façades.
    - The applicant is proposing a metal faux wood grain insulated door in the enlarged opening. The existing door is not on the primary façade and it has no characterdefining features.
- C. Minimum Change. Whether and/or to what extent the proposed work will require more than a minimal change to the historic appearance, materials or integrity of the structure or site.
  - Enlarging the door opening on the rear wall will not be highly visible and will have minimal change to the historic appearance of the structure. The change to the overall historic appearance of the building should not have a negative effect to the historic appearance of the structure or site.
- D. New Construction. New additions, exterior alterations and related work shall not destroy or detract from the existing historic structure and materials to the maximum extent feasible, and such new work or alterations shall be differentiated from, but compatible with, the existing size, scale and exterior architectural features of the structure or site so as to protect its historic identity and integrity.

- The alterations should not detract from the existing structure since the work will be to the rear (south) wall. The proposed work will be compatible with the existing features of the building.
- E. Historic Appearance. Work that will protect or return the original historic appearance of a structure or site, especially where documented by photographs, historic research or other credible evidence, shall be encouraged and favored.
  - There are no historic photos of the south wall of the building. Enlargement of the door on the south wall and installation of the new door will not destroy or detract from the historic structure or site.
- F. Work Necessary. Whether the proposed work is required or necessary to comply with a building, fire or other health/safety code.
  - The proposed work will comply with all existing building, fire and other health/safety codes, however, it is not necessary that this work be performed in order to comply with those codes.

# **RECOMMENDED FINDINGS:**

1. That the application for the proposed exterior alterations are in compliance with the review standards for contributing structures in the historic district, with recommended conditions, because the changes to the rear door opening will not destroy or detract from the historic building or site.

# **RECOMMENDED ACTION:**

Based upon the observations and review standards outlined above, staff recommends the following:

Approve the Major Certificate of Approval application for the proposed exterior alterations to the south wall of the building at 223 East First Street subject to the following condition(s):

- 1. That the applicant applies for a building permit as required by the Chaffee County Building Department.
- 2. Upon completion of the project the applicant contact staff to schedule an inspection of the approved work with a member of the Historic Preservation Commission.

## **RECOMMENDED MOTION:**

That the recommended findings be made and the recommended action be taken.

Attachment: Application Site plan Architectural Inventory Form for 223 E. First Street