Rio Dell City Hall 675 Wildwood Avenue Rio Dell, CA 95562 (707) 764-3532 cityofriodell.ca.gov



October 21, 2025

TO:

Rio Dell City Council

FROM:

Kyle Knopp, City Manager

SUBJECT:

Discussion and Possible Action on Solid Waste Franchise Agreement and Related

Topics Including But Not Limited to Universal Collection and SB 1383

Compliance.

## IT IS RECOMMENDED THAT THE CITY COUNCIL:

1. Receive this informational report regarding development of a new solid waste, recycling, and organics franchise agreement for the City.

2. Review and provide feedback and direction to staff and consultant regarding program service options to be included in the new draft franchise agreement.

### **BACKGROUND AND DISCUSSION**

The City of Rio Dell currently has a franchise agreement with Recology Eel River for the collection of solid waste, recycling, and yard waste services, which expires December 31, 2026. The City first entered into a franchise agreement with Eel River Disposal (ERD) in 2017, which was subsequently transferred to Recology following the company's acquisition of ERD, approved by Council via Resolution No. 1341-2017 and amended on August 28, 2018. The City's current agreement predates many of California's recent solid waste and recycling regulations. It does not include provisions for SB 1383 compliance, updated performance standards, or current industry standards for the annual rate adjustment. To prepare for the next franchise term, Rio Dell joined a regional collaborative effort with the Cities of Fortuna, Arcata, and Eureka, and the County of Humboldt. These jurisdictions are working collaboratively with the technical contracted support of CSG to provide a franchise agreement with current industry standards and do the following:

- Improve recycling, organics, outreach/education programs' consistency for Rio Dell and neighboring jurisdictions:
- Meet SB 1383 and other new state mandates:
- Provide clear and transparent rate setting procedures; and
- Provide performance standards and accountability for the hauler and convenient services for residents and businesses.
- Provide the benefit of economies of scale and shared expertise while maintaining flexibility to tailor Rio Dell specific program options cost-effectively.

Senate Bill (SB) 1383 requires all jurisdictions in California to implement programs that divert organic waste (food, yard waste, and paper) from landfills. The regulation mandates:

- Universal organics collection for all residents and businesses;
- Color-compliant containers (gray/black for trash, blue for recycling, green for organics);
- Contamination monitoring, inspections, and enforcement;
- Recordkeeping, outreach, and education programs; and
- Procurement of recycled organics and recovered paper products.

SB 1383 requires jurisdictions to comply with the following requirements



Rio Dell and the cities of Fortuna, Arcata, Eureka, and the County of Humboldt have been working collaboratively to negotiate an improved franchise agreement with Recology. A significant goal of this collaborative effort is to provide cost effective and improved recycling, organics and solid waste collection programs along with upgraded outreach/education programs for residents and businesses. Rio Dell's current agreement is outdated without provisions to meet current mandates and contracted with CSG to develop a new SB 1383 compliant franchise agreement and provide technical assistance for negotiations with Recology.

SB 1383 placed a significant unfunded mandate on jurisdictions to provide mandatory organic waste collection to all residents and businesses, requires color compliant collection containers, etc. Over 50% of what we dump in landfills is organic material; SB 1383's primary purpose is to reduce organic waste to landfill. Since organics in landfills generate methane, a climate super pollutant (methane is 84 times more potent than carbon dioxide) SB 1383 aims to mitigate climate change, improve public health and the environment.

Rio Dell currently holds a Low Population Waiver from CalRecycle, effective January 1, 2022 – December 31, 2026. This waiver currently exempts the City from certain SB 1383 collection and processing requirements for the duration of the waiver. However, the waiver must be renewed prior to expiration (application due mid-2026), if not renewed or revoked, the City will be required to implement full organics collection starting January 1, 2027. Also, CalRecycle has indicated that renewal criteria are likely to become stricter, particularly if statewide organics diversion targets are not met.

Once City Council provides feedback to staff, the provisions we received feedback on would be included in the new draft franchise agreement. Staff and consultant would meet with Recology to further discuss the provisions and request a cost proposal from Recology for the new franchise agreement. Staff and consultant will return to City Council for their review of the new

franchise agreement, cost proposal and new rates and request City Council consideration of approval in the coming months.

#### Discussion

Staff and CSG prepared the following program options for City Council review. These options can help guide the discussion and assist staff and consultant to include the appropriate provisions for the new franchise agreement.

## 1. Universal Collection of Garbage, Recycling, and Organics

#### Purpose:

Implement consistent, weekly collection services for garbage, recyclables, and organic materials for all residents and businesses with some exceptions to meet SB 1383 standards.

### Regional Consistency:

All neighboring jurisdictions (Fortuna, Arcata, Eureka, and Humboldt County unincorporated areas) are transitioning to **universal three-container service**. This consistency helps avoid customer confusion and supports regional outreach and education campaigns.

### Option A – Full Implementation:

Require Recology to provide weekly garbage, recycling, and organics collection beginning **January 1, 2027**.

*Pros:* Meets SB 1383 compliance; aligns with neighboring cities; predictable service model.

Cons: Can increases costs for collection, processing, and customer rates.

Option B – Deferred Implementation During Waiver Period:

Include language allowing deferral of organics collection while the CalRecycle waiver remains active.

Sample Provision:

"While the City's SB 1383 Low Population Waiver remains in effect, Contractor shall not be required to provide organic waste collection services but shall continue weekly garbage and recycling collection. Upon expiration, revocation, or non-renewal of the waiver, Contractor shall implement full SB 1383-compliant organics collection within ninety (90) days following written notice from the City or as otherwise mutually agreed."

*Pros:* Provides flexibility and cost control during waiver period; allows phased approach. *Cons:* Deferral could create rate increases later when organics collection must begin:

### 2. Residential Bulky Item Collection/Frequency

### Purpose:

Provide a convenient, at-the-curb service for residents to dispose of large items such as furniture, appliances, and mattresses. Resident chooses date for bulky item collection.

- Option A: One (1) free annual bulky item pickup per household (up to 2 cubic yards).
- Option B: Two (2) annual pickups (increased convenience, higher cost).
- Option C: No curbside program; continue current annual community cleanup day only.

Bulky collection improves accessibility for elderly and low-income residents who cannot transport materials to cleanup sites. It can also reduce illegal dumping.

### 3. Low-Income Discount Program

#### Purpose:

Provide rate relief for income-qualified residents.

#### Consider:

Offer a **10% discount** for qualifying single-family customers enrolled in the **PG&E CARE Program**, subject to City approval.

Program cost is spread across total rate base; The City can choose any discount percentage during rate setting.

## 4. Annual Community Clean-Up Day

## **Current Program:**

The City hosts an annual cleanup day for residents to drop off bulky waste, appliances, and other large items. Participation varies each year, and the event requires Recology staff time, containers, logistics, City coordination.

- Option A: Continue the annual cleanup day as currently structured.
- Option B: Replace with one or two bulky item curbside pickups per year.
- Option C: Hybrid approach—retain one cleanup event plus one bulky pickup.

Curbside bulky collection offers greater resident convenience and reduces Recology and City staff time; however, the community cleanup event provides community engagement.

### 5. 20-Gallon Garbage Container Option

### Purpose:

Offer a smaller garbage cart option for residents who generate minimal waste.

#### Benefits:

- Encourages waste reduction;
- Provides lower-cost service tier:
- Supports SB 1383 waste minimization goals.

#### 6. Franchise Fee Modification

#### Purpose:

Franchise fees provide revenue to offset administrative and oversight costs for solid waste management and support general fund activities related to waste programs.

### **Current Fee:**

Rio Dell's existing franchise fee is lower than neighboring jurisdictions.

### Regional Comparison (Estimated):

Eureka: 10%Arcata: 10%Fortuna: 8%

• Humboldt County: 5%

Adjusting the franchise fee to a level consistent with regional averages (e.g., 8–10%) could increase City revenue modestly with minimal ratepayer impact when phased in with new service improvements.

### **Next Steps**

- 1. Incorporate Council feedback into the draft franchise agreement framework.
- 2. Conduct follow-up discussions with Recology to refine program design, cost impacts, and rates.
- 3. Return to Council with:
  - Full draft franchise agreement;
  - Recology cost proposal;
  - o Draft rate schedule; and
  - Recommendation for final approval.

The proposed action (receiving a report and providing direction) is not a project under the **California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA)** (Guidelines §15378). Future implementation of the new franchise agreement will likely qualify for a **Categorical Exemption** under §15308 (Actions by Regulatory Agencies for Protection of the Environment).

#### Conclusion

The upcoming expiration on 12/31/26 of the City's solid waste franchise agreement provides an important opportunity to update the current franchise agreement, improve programs, meet new state requirements, and align with neighboring jurisdictions to provide consistent quality recycling, organics and garbage collection for Rio Dell residents and businesses.

### Attachments:

Universal Collection Timeline and Background
Minutes from the February 16, 2021 meeting on Universal Collection
Minutes from the March 2, 2021 meeting on Universal Collection
Minutes from the March 16, 2021 workshop on Universal Collection.
Minutes from the April 20, 2021 workshop on Universal Collection.
Written public comment received during 2021 outreach and workshops

\* It is important to note that the figures reflected in the attached minutes only represent estimates at that point in time and will not be the figures that will be presented for a new franchise agreement.

and Sewer were reported at \$68,000 (3%) higher than the previous year as a result of the pandemic and the City's inability to shut off water.

She continued with the budget outlook going into the next year and reported beginning fund balances for FY 2020-21 higher than estimated for most funds. She commented that the economic outlook is difficult to determine although the current economic outlook for Rio Dell looks good. She added that staff would be keeping an eye on revenue growth in the City to make sure the Gann limit calculations don't change.

Councilmember Woodall said that she was impressed to see that cannabis revenue exceeded property tax revenues. She noted that the annual CPI adjustment for sewer rates ends this year and asked if staff would be looking into the rates.

City Manager Knopp indicated that staff would be proposing a rate analysis for both water and sewer.

Councilmember Wilson asked if ratepayers were behind significantly on payments due to COVID-19.

Finance Director Dillingham explained that accounts receivable represented \$68,000 or 3% of the annual revenue for water and sewer. The accounts receivable for utility bills the same time last year was \$251,000 versus \$319,000 this year which is an increase of \$68,000, due to the inability for the City to shut off water. She said that the revenues are on target but wanted the Council to be aware that there are some utility accounts with some fairly significant numbers owed on individual accounts. Her hope was that the City would not have to write off those accounts and should COVID relief become available, staff would direct customers to those potential sources for funding.

# Discussion on Solid Waste Franchise Agreement and Opportunity for Universal Collection

City Manager Knopp provided a brief update on the City's opportunity for Universal Collection and reviewed the correspondence included with the staff report. He said that Linda Wise from Recology Eel River was on the line to further explain the program and answer any questions the Council may have.

He noted that in September, 2019 the Nuisance Advisory Committee received a presentation from Recology Eel River on the concept of Universal Collection. In December, 2019 the City Council received correspondence from the City's Nuisance Advisory Committee endorsing the concept of Universal Garbage and Recycling Services. In November, 2020, the Nuisance Advisory Committee followed up with correspondence to the City of Fortuna encouraging their adoption of universal collection.

He explained the concept of mandatory universal collection and commented that universal collection would aid the community in meeting and exceeding State recycling/waste diversion

mandates in addition to reducing illegal disposal, nuisance conditions and public health concerns in the City. Currently voluntary subscription levels are at approximately 50% of residences and commercial properties and if adopted, universal collection would extend services to approximately 100% of the community. In discussing the concept with Recology Eel River representatives, the biggest hurdle in executing the program is related to the cost to Recology to purchase new trucks and new bins.

City Manager Knopp indicated that staff had engaged in several informal discussions with the City Managers of Ferndale and Fortuna since their participation would dramatically increase the subscriber base thereby spreading out the fixed costs and potentially making it a viable option for Rio Dell to consider moving in that direction.

He explained that staff would return to Council at the March 2 meeting with a more formal adoption of the calendar and timeline that would include submission of a rate analysis, public workshops, ordinance drafting and adoption and franchise agreement negotiation occurring now and the end of June 2021. He indicated that City Clerk Dunham would be working on the day to day tasks to help get to process moving forward, along with the City Attorney.

Linda Wise, of Recology Eel River continued the discussion and noted that the program is coming quickly and ultimately hinges on what the City of Fortuna does with regard to universal collection. She said that they were working on nailing down some of the assumptions as far as what the services will entail. She explained that everyone would have a 30-gallon can, recycling can and they would also be offering a voluntary green waste program with pickup every other week as well as a bulky item pickup program.

She explained that the preliminary analysis of rates reflects a small increase in the subscriber's monthly rate estimated between \$2.50-\$2.75. As the details are worked out, those numbers could change slightly.

City Manager Knopp pointed out that this gives the City the opportunity to renegotiate the City's Franchise Agreement with Recology which doesn't expire until 2026. He said that some of the considerations the Council could address would be such things as discounts for seniors/low income subscribers, methods of billing and payments, street sweeping, clean-up events, bulky item services, and elimination or continuation of the recycling bins at City Hall.

Councilmember Wilson asked if this would help to alleviate some of the issues related to AB 1383.

Linda Wise explained that AB 1383 partly relates to curbside collection so this is going to address it further down the road. She noted that because of the size of Rio Dell, the City will be able to apply for a variance. In particular AB 1383 does call for a two or three can system with specific color-coded cans so this will cover that requirement.

Councilmember Wilson questioned the cost to the City to implement the program and asked if the subscribers would be paying for the cost of the new cans.

Linda explained that a capital outlay component would be built into the rates to help cover the cost of equipment with an estimated monthly rate increase of \$2.61 per customer.

Councilmember Wilson mentioned that HWMA had talked about a potential 40% increase.

City Manager Knopp explained that the number of subscribers in the City would essentially double and that Rio Dell's cost share would be relatively small because of the size of the City. Under AB 1383, small cities can apply for a waiver every two years because of the small amount of tonnage generated.

Councilmember Wilson commented that AB 1383 is new to everyone and there are a lot of regulations in the bill that has to with the reduction of organic waste. He said that HWMA provided a power point presentation to the Board members and thought it would be beneficial if it were circulated to Councilmembers. He pointed out that even though the City can apply for a variance, the regulations and compliance portion of the bill would eventually affect staff which is a concern.

City Manager Knopp pointed out that the City would eventually be required to comply with AB 1383 and this provides the City the opportunity to have the infrastructure in place when that time comes. The mission is to move toward zero waste and moving to universal collection puts Rio Dell in position with the regulatory requirements.

Councilmember Wilson stated that the issue of garbage will only become bigger and won't go away. He supported the concept of universal collection since it will bring the City closer to compliance.

Councilmember Carter asked if the City doesn't jump on board with Fortuna in June, if there would be another opportunity to implement universal collection.

City Manager Knopp explained that there could be another opportunity but the cost would be much greater. The more quickly the City moves forward, the easier it will be on the subscribers.

Mayor Pro Tem Johnson referred to the recycling bins behind City Hall and said that his observations are that the large bins are filled with mostly cardboard but the smaller bin seems to have a lot of garbage thrown in. He asked Linda Wise if she knew what the City's percentage rate for contamination was.

Linda noted that there is up to 45% of contamination from those bins. She said that they do characterizations of the items dumped and that she could make it available to the City

Council with the curbside material.

Mayor Pro Tem Johnson said that although implementation of universal collection is interesting, it will be challenging for the Council but he was looking forward to the upcoming discussions.

Councilmember Woodall questioned the timeline for getting the new truck once the franchise agreement is adopted.

Linda estimated it would take up to 18 months to get the trucks and equipment needed to implement the program. She estimated the cost of a new truck to be \$450,000 and said that it is practically impossible to buy a used truck due to California Air Resources Board (CARB) regulations.

Councilmember Woodall commented on the need for public outreach and said that she was glad to hear that the City could apply for a variance under AB 1383. She liked the idea of looking at various options as part of the franchise agreement.

Mayor Garnes asked what happens if people are unable to pay for the service and if fines would be imposed.

Linda explained what normally happens with these programs is that a lien is placed against the property owner if the tenant fails to pay but ultimately, it would depend on how the agreement is structured. She noted that open communication with the subscriber is very important.

## ORDINANCES/SPECIAL RESOLUTIONS

Resolution No. 1481-2021 Designation of Subrecipient's Agent – Hazardous Mitigation Grant Program and Pre-Disaster Mitigation Program

Rebecca Crow from GHD provided a power point presentation related to the Hazard Mitigation Grant application and began by stating that they had installed sewer flow monitoring equipment so they should have some data on flows for the City.

She provided a summary of where the projects are now including the Eel River Crossing Pipeline Retrofit Project, and the Douglas Tank Seismic Retrofit Project. A preliminary cost ratio of plus 1 was given but with a plus 3 the City would be in a better ranking position for funding.

The estimated cost for the Eel River Crossing Pipeline Retrofit Project was \$3,500,000 with the City's grant match of \$875,000, and the Douglas Tank Seismic Retrofit Project \$4,000,00 with a grant match of \$750,000.

a Conditional Use Permit (CUP), to allow Element 7 to have three (3) on-building signs, at their meeting on February 23, 2021. He indicated that they had ordered signs and still had to paint the outside of the building and complete the landscaping.

Mayor Pro Tem Johnson asked staff if there was a 100% guarantee that Tesla would be moving forward with the Energy Saving Battery Backup Project at the Wastewater Treatment Plant.

Wastewater Superintendent Taylor indicated that representatives from Tesla would be here on Thursday for a site visit and estimated with 90% certainty that the project would move forward with battery packs installed within 6 months.

Mayor Pro Tem Johnson asked the City Manager to provide an update on the ongoing Adhoc committees.

City Manager Knopp reported that the Water/Wastewater Rate Study Committee met on February 24<sup>th</sup> and is working on a draft Request for Proposal (RFP) which will be presented to the committee in March then to the City Council for approval in April.

He said that he is working on completing the document regarding the revisions and comments from the last Economic Development Committee meeting and will be scheduling a meeting this month to review the document for submittal to the City Council in April.

Councilmember Woodall asked about the status of the School Property Ad Hoc Committee.

City Manager Knopp indicated that staff still had not received correspondence from the school district. Committee members Johnson and Woodall agreed to meet later this week with the City Manager discuss the issue. He noted that the Garbage Bin Ad Hoc Committee was ready to meet again to discuss replacement of the garbage bins around town.

#### SPECIAL CALL ITEMS/COMMUNITY AFFAIRS

## Approve Calendar Related to Universal Collection

City Clerk Dunham provided a staff report and said that as the Council is aware, there was discussion at the last meeting on the City's Solid Waste Franchise Agreement with Recology Eel River and the opportunity for mandatory universal collection. Linda Wise from Recology Eel River, provided a presentation to the Council on universal collection, including the process and timeline for potential implementation, a preliminary analysis of the rates, and how AB 1383 relates to curbside collection.

She commented that staff agreed to return to the Council at this meeting with a more formal adoption of the calendar related to upcoming public hearings, ordinance adoption, franchise

agreement negotiations, and potential implementation of a universal collection program in the City. She said that this also provides the opportunity for the Council or members of the community to ask questions. Linda Wise was available once again to provide any additional updates and to answer any questions the Council or the public may have.

Mayor Pro Tem Johnson called for questions from the Council.

Councilmember Wilson referred to the calendar as presented and questioned the number of scheduled public hearings. He asked if the purpose of the public hearings on the ordinance is to determine such things as who pays for the service if someone fails to pay.

City Manager Knopp explained that the schedule includes two public workshops and two public hearings on the draft ordinance and that the draft ordinance has not been prepared.

City Clerk Dunham pointed out the gap in the meetings between April 20, 2021 and June 1, 2021 and said that she scheduled them that way to allow adequate time for public notifications.

Councilmember Wilson stressed the importance of public outreach.

Councilmember Carter asked what the difference is between a public workshop and public hearing.

City Manager Knopp explained that public workshops are more informal with no required action of the Council whereas, a public hearing is standard procedure for the introduction and adoption of ordinances.

Councilmember Woodall commented that she was approached by a citizen regarding the program and said that she would refer him to the calendar for dates of the public hearings so he can ask questions.

Mayor Pro Tem Johnson suggested one additional public notification perhaps before the March 16, 2021 meeting followed up with a City Newsletter.

Councilmember Wilson agreed with the mailing of Every Door Direct Mailing (EDDM) to allow citizens the opportunity to provide public comment.

<u>Discussion on Placement of Chamber Owned Informational Kiosks on City Property</u>
City Manager Knopp provided a staff report and said that the City was approached by the Chamber of Commerce regarding the placement of kiosks on City property. He presented photos of the kiosks and a map identifying proposed locations for placement of them and said that representatives of the Chamber were on line to present their proposal.

Mayor Garnes asked for an update on replacement of the Gateway Sign.

City Manager Knopp explained that the replacement of the sign started last year but the sign company doing the work had trouble replicating the exact design so staff is now working with the artist that originally designed it and another sign company to do the work.

## SPECIAL PRESENTATIONS/STUDY SESSIONS

Public Workshop – Discussion on Solid Waste and Opportunity for Mandatory Universal Collection - Presentation by Recology Eel River

City Manager Knopp began with an introduction of the proposed program and said that at the March 2, 2021 regular meeting, the Council approved a calendar of meeting dates to move forward with the consideration of Mandatory Universal Collection. As suggested by the Council, staff sent out an Every Door Direct Mailing (EDDM) to all residents notifying them of tonight's public workshop so they could participate in the process. He said that the idea is to gather information and input from the Council and the community and come back at the next public workshop with answers to any questions received.

He pointed out that Universal Collection would aid the community in meeting and exceeding State recycling/waste diversion mandates, reduce illegal dumping, nuisance conditions and public health concerns in the City. He pointed out that the number one complaint in the City is related to nuisance abatement and litter impacting neighborhoods and creating public health and safety concerns.

In 2019, the Rio Dell Nuisance Advisory Committee received a briefing from Recology Eel River on the implementation of Universal Collection and was supportive of the idea. He explained that the major hurdle with Universal Collection is related to cost since significant investment must be made by Recology in order to execute the program including new trucks and standardized garbage and recycling receptacles. He said that with Rio Dell's small subscriber base of approximately 1,400 subscribers, it would not be economically feasible to adopt the program on its own and participation of Ferndale and Fortuna would dramatically increase the subscriber base thereby spreading out fixed costs and creating a potentially viable option for Rio Dell to consider moving in the direction of Universal Collection.

City Manager Knopp noted that Linda Wise, General Manager of Recology Eel River was present to provide a power point presentation on Universal Collection.

He began the presentation with the Overview of Universal Collection and Overview of Services with a comparison between current services and proposed services. The proposed services included the required subscription of Municipal Solid Waste (MSW), every other week (EOW) recycling, two (2) free bulky item pickups, a 96-gallon recycling container, every other week optional green waste pickup, a 20% discount for seniors or low-income subscribers, and clean-up bins for river bar clean-ups.

Linda Wise continued with review of Impact of Proposed Rate Adjustments. She said that the first question usually asked is what the service is going to cost the customer. She explained that certain key customers would actually see a decrease in monthly rates while current self-haul customers would not only save time with weekly collection but would pay \$2.68 less per month on average. Customers moving from a 32-gallon garbage can to a 20-gallon can would save approximately \$4.25 per month. The proposed residential rate for a 32-gallon can went from \$28.59/month to \$30.48/month representing an increase of \$1.89. She noted that rates would not become effective until the service actually begins.

She asked everyone to keep in mind that the current recycling containers are 64-gallon and the new recycling containers would be 96-gallon. The other advantage to subscribers is the two (2) free bulky item pickups.

Linda continued with review of the Humboldt County Rate Comparison of residential and commercial rates and franchise fee percentages between Eureka, Arcata and Rio Dell. She pointed out the difference in franchise fees with Eureka at 9%, Arcata at 10% and Rio Dell at only 5% which is added into the rates. She commented that the proposed rates are based on the assumptions that both Ferndale and Fortuna would be moving forward with universal collection along with Rio Dell.

Mayor Garnes called for questions from the Council on this portion of the presentation.

Councilmember Wilson asked Linda if the discussion would include SB 1383 legislation.

Linda said that SB-1383 would be discussed later on in the presentation along with other regulatory drivers.

Mayor Pro Tem Johnson commented that the estimated rates are based on certain additions in Recology's rolling stock and asked how many new articulating arm trucks are being proposed over the next ten years.

Linda commented that they would eventually purchase four new trucks and that the cost of the truck for Rio Dell alone is \$350,000. She said that the larger fixed costs such as trucks would be spread out over 10 years.

Mayor Garnes asked if the second employee on the route emptying garbage cans into the truck would be out of a job or if he would be trained to drive the truck.

Linda indicated that they would be offering those employees training to obtain a commercial license or placement in other positions if available.

City Manager Knopp continued with review of Drivers Toward Universal Collection and said that Nuisance Abatement is a main driver and one of the City Council's highest priorities and investment in nuisance and code enforcement issues. He said that creating an attractive community leads to more investment, higher community pride, lower crime and a generally safer, cleaner environment. He said that universal mandatory collection also significantly reduces issues with illegal dumping and eliminates the reason to accumulate trash. The City's Community Services Officer's main focus has been on nuisance issues. The public works staff was recently pulled off of their regular duties to clean up a property that was issued an abatement warrant which is not only time consuming but costly.

City Manager Knopp said that with regard to Regional Efficiencies, Rio Dell has an opportunity to realize cost savings by implementing universal collection in a collaborative effort with Fortuna and Ferndale. Current subscribers pay for the City's public bins and other solid waste programs and universal collection would mean that community related garbage expenses would be paid for by all properties, making the program more equitable.

Discussion continued regarding Regulatory Drivers including AB 341, AB 1826, AB 939 and SB 1383.

City Manager Knopp commented that the goal over the past years has been to get non-trash items out of the landfill. One of the main issues that communities have been grappling over is AB 939 which required that each city or county achieve 50% diversion by 2000. SB 1383 establishes targets to achieve a 75% reduction in landfilled organic waste by 2025.

Under Cal Recycle's numbers, Rio Dell is required to achieve a diversion of 2.1 pounds of waste per day per household and according to the last report in 2019, the average amount diverted was 2.2 which is just under the threshold. If the City goes below that, it risks the chance of being fined which drives the cost up for everyone. The 75% diversion target is a goal now but is expected to become a mandate for all cities and counties in California. He noted that California tends to go over and beyond Federal guidelines so Rio Dell is obligated to develop an efficient strategy to meet that goal/mandate.

Linda continued with review of SB 1383 Key Implementation Dates. She explained that the dates apply to Fortuna and that they have a tighter timeline than Rio Dell or Ferndale due to the size of the city. She said that SB 1383 regulations take effect on January 1, 2022 and the State begins enforcement followed by the requirement for local governments to take enforcement by January 1, 2024. January 1, 2025 was the date set for compliance with 75% reduction in organics disposal and 20% increase in edible food recovery. She said that those compliance dates will eventually trickle down to the smaller jurisdictions.

Next was a 3-minute U-Tube video on SB 1383 followed by an overview of requirements for Organic Waste Collection Services under SB 1383.

The last portion of the presentation included a review of the Universal Collection timeline for Rio Dell with the next public workshop scheduled for April 20, 2021, followed by the first public hearing on the draft ordinance on June 1, 2021, the second public hearing on June 15, 2021 and potential program implementation scheduled for January 1, 2023.

Linda said that once the public hearings are over and amendments to the franchise agreement and rates are approved, they will have the green light to order trucks.

City Manager Knopp said the considerations for Council include the term of the contract (10 years or more), a senior vs. low-income discount (currently at 20% but can go higher), and other considerations such as Street Sweeping Services or possible exclusions. He noted that it may be beneficial for all of the cities to have contracts expire around the same time. He recommended taking a look at Fortuna's timeline and adopt a similar timeline for the City's term of contract.

Mayor Garnes opened the public hearing to receive public comment and asked if there were any hands raised to speak or any public comments received via email.

City Clerk Dunham announced that there were three (3) emails received which she then read.

The first comment was from Ranada Laughlin in support of Universal Collection (included with these minutes as Attachment 1).

The second comment was from Doug Dinsmore expressing his concerns (included with these minutes as Attachment 2).

The third comment was from "A Proud Rio Dell River Rat" also expressing concerns about the program as proposed (included with these minutes as Attachment 3).

Alice Millington said that universal collection was a great idea but was initially concerned about the financial impact to residents during the pandemic. Since it was explained that the program wouldn't start until January 2023, she supported moving forward with implementation of the program.

There being no further public comment, the public hearing closed. Mayor Garnes then called for comments from the Council.

Councilmember Carter thanked everyone who provided public comment and said that this is something that impacts the entire community and that she appreciated the input.

Councilmember Woodall said that she watched a video with Humboldt Waste Management Authority (HWMA) on SB 1383 and noted that the requirements are really overwhelming. She commented that one of the things pointed out in the video what that having universal

collection would check off some of the requirements for Rio Dell. She mentioned the waivers for small cities concerning AB 1383 and mandatory organics recycling and asked at what point those waivers would no longer be granted.

Linda explained that in regard to the smaller populated areas, the State has already identified Fortuna, Ferndale, Rio Dell, Blue Lake and Trinidad as cities qualified for waivers but somebody in the City would need to apply for the waiver. The waivers are for two (2) years and they are looking at allowing two waivers for each of the smaller communities. At the end of that time, the State would put the agencies on a Corrective Action Plan and require compliance over a certain amount of time. The City would basically have six (6) years before being forced to comply, although that is not guaranteed.

Councilmember Woodall then referred to the ordinance and said that she understands that each residence would be billed for service but asked what happens when someone fails to pay and whether they have services discontinued or not, and if the responsibility to collect would be up to the City or Recology.

Linda explained that the way it currently runs with the Cities of Eureka and Arcata is that they bill in 3-month cycles so the subscriber has the entire 3 months to pay. If the bill is not paid, it then becomes delinquent and if a bill is not paid for an entire year, they send a notice (if it applies to a tenant) that they would be notifying the property owner. Their ability to collect delinquent bills is through the lien process. A list of delinquent accounts is then sent to the City Manager and reviewed by the City Council before the list is forwarded to the County Recorder for collection. At this point customers are given the opportunity to dispute the charges. In her experience, they are able to settle approximately 75% of the problems before it gets to that point and the liens are only put on property taxes as a last resort.

She noted that they are not allowed to stop service unless the City directs them to do so. She said that there are instances when a resident move, or is on vacation and fails to notify Recology and is billed for services they did not receive, they will reverse those charges. She clarified that the property owners are ultimately responsible for the charges and they encourage landlords to include those charges in the rent.

Councilmember Woodall said that she had read in one of the other City's ordinances that a customer could notify the garbage company when their house was to be unoccupied for two months or more and they would receive a waiver of fees for those months. She asked if the City would need to verify that the residence was vacant for those months.

Linda said that the driver keeps a log of what cans get picked up and ones that don't and if a property appears to be vacant.

Councilmember Woodall asked if the program would start with all three (3) receptacles or if a customer could choose which service they wanted, and if all cans would be the same size.

Linda explained that each residence would have either a 32-gallon or 20-gallon can for garbage and a 96-gallon recycling receptacle with an option for green waste collection.

Councilmember Woodall then asked a question on behalf of a local resident and asked why rates would increase with a 50% increase in the subscriber base.

Linda explained that the economy of scale was factored into the proposed rates and that they would be really transparent on how they arrive at the rate and would line out what the costs are in providing the program which the City Manager and City Council will be able to look at. The proposed rates are based on the assumptions outlined earlier and they would line out the costs to show exactly how much margin Recology would be making. She explained that approximately 40% of the garbage bill goes toward disposal and that's just how much they have to pay to take it to the landfill outside the county. They are suggesting about a 10% margin for Recology on collection but they are not charging that on disposal or on the recycling processing fee. As it turns out, they are only making about 6% return. She wanted to make that clear for the residents of Rio Dell so they can see where the costs are derived from.

Councilmember Woodall asked for confirmation that residents are required to dispose of their trash every 7 days.

Linda responded that State law requires removal of trash every 7 days.

Mayor Garnes asked for clarification that if a tenant moves out and a residence is vacant for 3 months or so, the fees can be waived for that time.

Linda said that the service could be put on hold and again, they fall back on the driver to verify that no cans were picked up during that time in the event the customer forgets to notify them.

Councilmember Wilson asked if organic food waste (under SB 1383) would be put in the same receptacle as garbage.

Linda explained that once organic food waste collections begin, all food waste would be included as green waste.

Councilmember Wilson commented that the ordinance needs to include adequate language to allow for legitimate exemptions for properties that are hard to access by Recology vehicles or where customers would have to cart trash receptacles long distances to a collection point.

With regard to discount rates for seniors or low-income residents, he suggested waiting to see what the other cities do to see how it weighs in with the overall costs.

Mayor Pro Tem Johnson commented that he has lived in Rio Dell for 42 years and has always had garbage service. He also has a rental unit next to his residence and they combine their garbage and recycling and pays for one service. He asked if that would change with the Universal Collection Program.

Linda explained that this is not uncommon and that they would typically look at whether the residence is on the same parcel or a separate parcel and bill by parcel. Issues with regard to services would likely be straightened out during the first year of the program.

Mayor Pro Tem Johnson noted that the City would enter into a new franchise agreement for a minimum of 10 years and that he looked forward to working out the financial inequities so that the City does not create hardships on seniors or low-income residents.

Mayor Garnes asked for clarification on discounts related to seniors and/or low-income residents.

Linda explained that some seniors are well-off financially so low-income is not necessarily related to age.

Mayor Garnes asked if there were any additional public comments.

Patrick Knight addressed the Council in support of Mandatory Universal Collection. He said he believes it would help to clean up some of the nuisance properties in town and had the experience of living next to a nuisance property himself. He said that they burned trash and had multiple abandoned vehicles on the property and he ended up with a rodent problem and got headaches from breathing the toxic fumes from burning trash. Anything the City can do to minimize blight will encourage new businesses and home buyers in the community.

Michelle, a Rio Dell homeowner said that she currently rents out her home and asked if someone requests the recycling bin, whether the tenant or the property would be billed for that service, assuming that the recycling bin was optional.

Linda explained that garbage collection and recycling is a bundled service and green waste is optional.

Mayor Woodall noted that the City's franchise agreement is due to expire in 2026 and asked at what point would renegotiation of the contract begin.

City Manager Knopp referred to the timeline as presented which reflected contract

negotiations to begin prior to July 1, 2021.

Councilmember Woodall commented that with regard to senior discounts, thought it would be better to only allow discounts for low-income seniors or other low-income residents to avoid it being a gift of public funds.

Mayor Garnes thanked Linda for providing the presentation and being available to answer questions.

City Manager Knopp announced that the PowerPoint presentation and other information on Universal Collection was available on the City's website for any interested viewers.

There being no further public comments from the community or the Council, the public hearing was closed at 8:32 p.m. followed by a 5-minute recess.

The meeting reconvened at 8:38 p.m.

# Presentation/Update on the Eel River Sustainable Groundwater Management Plan

City Manager Knopp provided a staff report and said that staff has been monitoring the situation since 2015 and has participated in a series of meetings with Humboldt County Public Works and various stakeholders to discuss compliance with the new laws related to the Sustainable Groundwater Management Act (SGMA). He stated that Summer Daugherty from Humboldt County Public Works along with Jack Rice, the County's consultant with Western Resources Strategies were on the line to provide a presentation on the Eel River Valley Groundwater Sustainability Plan and to answer questions.

Summer Daugherty began by providing an outline of the presentation which included Background, Current, and Next Steps for completing the Eel River Valley Groundwater Sustainability Plan.

She said that as the City Manager stated, the City has been engaged in this process for several years and more recently Randy Jensen, the City's Water Superintendent has been working with them to provide information on groundwater pumping and data collection to support the project.

Jack Rice provided a brief update on the geography of the Eel River Valley Groundwater Basin and background on the law. He said that the law was passed by the legislature in 2014 and the purpose is to make sure than groundwater maintains sustainable and groundwater pumping is not causing unreasonable results. The goal is to implement it locally but there is a State backstop if the local efforts are not sufficient.

He reviewed the process and said that step 1 is to form a Groundwater Sustainability Agency; Step 2 is to develop a Groundwater Sustainability Plan; and Step 3 is to implement a

# APRIL 20, 2021 MINUTES Page 6

City Manager Knopp said that one of the biggest challenges for the City is the use of natural gas for the belt press dryer at the wastewater treatment plant and noted that the City is the largest consumer of greenhouse gasses in the City. He said that staff would be keeping their eyes open in terms of feasibility studies for alternative belt press systems that rely less on natural gas resources.

Presentation/Workshop Discussion on Solid Waste Agreement and Opportunity for Universal Collection

City Manager Knopp began by providing a brief recap of the events leading up to tonight's workshop and said that included with the staff report is a copy of the "Questions and Answers" from the March 16, 2021 workshop on Universal Collection. He reviewed the adopted meeting calendar and noted that the first public hearing on the draft ordinance was scheduled for June 1, 2021, with the potential adoption of the ordinance on June 15, 2021. He then turned it over to Linda Wise, Executive Director of Recology Eel River to provide a PowerPoint presentation on the *City of Rio Dell Solid Waste Regulations and Universal Collection Service Discussion*.

Linda Wise provided an overview of what Universal Collection is and said that it requires that all households and businesses have garbage service.

City Manager Knopp stated for clarification that the first slide of the presentation identifies December 2021 as the expiration date for the City's Franchise Agreement with Recology Eel River but that date refers to other regional partners. The expiration date on the City's contract is not until 2026.

Linda continued with a review of current and proposed services, and regulatory drivers including an overview of SB 1383 and key implementation dates with regard to compliance, organic waste collection services, jurisdiction responsibilities and requirements, next steps toward collection compliance, and the proposed timeline for implementation of universal collection.

Next was a review of the Questions and Answers from the March 16, 2021 meeting followed by questions from the Council.

Councilmember Wilson said that the proposed changes included a 20% discount for seniors or low-income subscribers and asked if the cost for those discounts would be borne by the City or other ratepayers.

Linda explained that the 20% discount is just an example and it would be up to the City Council to make the determination on the percentage and qualifying factors. Essentially the other ratepayers would absorb that cost.

# APRIL 20, 2021 MINUTES Page 7

Councilmember Wilson commented that language could be included in the ordinance that spells out the responsibility of the ratepayers if discounts are allowed.

Linda said that normally the franchise agreement spells out how the rates are distributed and one way to do it would be to start at a base amount and build from that.

Councilmember Wilson pointed out that in order to give one group of ratepayers a discount, the other ratepayers would have to pick up that cost. He then commented on a remark made in the Questions and Answers about rates possibly doubling.

Linda explained that the remark was in reference to a question from a citizen who asked why there would be a proposed increase in rates when the subscriber base for Rio Dell would double. She explained that there is not a 1-to-1 ratio in that regard.

Mayor Pro Tem Johnson said that currently seniors and low trash users have the option of purchasing prepaid bags in lieu of subscribing for garbage service and asked if that option would still be available.

Linda said that the bags would no longer be available since it would be difficult for the new type of trucks to pick up the bags.

Mayor Pro Tem Johnson asked about the availability of a smaller size can.

Linda indicated that there would be the option for a smaller can at a lower rate.

Mayor Pro Tem Johnson commented that he would like to have a level playing field for seniors and those people that don't generate a large amount of garbage.

Councilmember Carter asked if there were any updates from Fortuna or Ferndale on the subject.

Linda noted that Ferndale's first Public Workshop was scheduled for the next day and that Fortuna had held one Public Workshop with another one scheduled for next week so they are taking the idea of Universal Collection seriously. She said that the idea is to implement universal collection in tandem to lower the costs.

Mayor Garnes said that she had a citizen call her with concerns about noise pollution with the trucks and asked if there would only be one weekly pickup.

Linda indicated that there would be one weekly pickup day for the City with the exception of commercial businesses that may have the need for an additional pickup.

Mayor Garnes asked if there were any public comments received.

# APRIL 20, 2021 MINUTES Page 8

City Clerk Dunham said that there were five public comments received via email which she then read (included as Attachments 1-5 to these minutes).

Rosa Maciel commented that she understands the regulations that are being imposed by the State down the road and suggested the City Council look into implementing universal collection now rather than later to be more cost efficient.

Mayor Garnes said that she received a comment regarding the requirement that cans/bins must be kept out of sight and asked how to handle situations where customers don't have the ability to do that. She said this is a regulation in the City's ordinance and perhaps that question could be answered in a public meeting.

Mayor Garnes called for a 5-minute recess at 8:04 p.m.

The meeting reconvened at 8:10 p.m.

<u>Presentation and Discussion on Draft Economic Development Goals and Actions to Achieve Economic Development in Rio Dell</u>

City Manager Knopp provided an update on the Economic Development Ad Hoc Draft Goals and Actions to Achieve Economic Development.

He began by reviewing the five (5) preliminary goals and steps, followed by the Mission Statement which read:

"We will be successful when business space vacancy rates decline, more outsiders visit and city revenues increase. We will become the town that businesses and individuals want to invest in."

He said that this is the initial briefing of the report and that staff would return at the next meeting with the final report for adoption by the Council.

City Manager Knopp explained that the plan includes specific directives such as reducing downtown vacancy rates. There are a number of ways to achieve that including implementing a city-funded Façade Improvement Program with grants/loans for façade renovation, developing a Phantom Gallery concept for artists to rent unused commercial space, creating a Walkability Enhancement & Beautification Plan, creating more off-street parking, consider purchase of 255 Wildwood Ave. for pollution remediation and redevelopment, research and develop an advocacy plan for the future of the Eagle Prairie Bridge, and develop and implement a Mural Program.

He provided an overview of recent success in the city including street and sidewalk work, increased staffing in the Police Department, business investment related to cannabis and

From:

Ranada Laughlin <ranadariodell@att.net>

Sent:

Friday, March 12, 2021 5:29 PM

To:

**Public Comment** 

Subject:

In Favor of Mandatory/Universal Collection

I support Mandatory Universal Garbage and Recycling for the City of Rio Dell.

Illegal Dumping plagues the local river bar and rural roads around Rio Dell. Rodents are attracted to improperly secured waste; this proposal could help to alleviate both problems. It will benefit the health and safety of this community and beyond.

There may need to be exemptions for property that cannot be serviced/reached by Recology vehicles and for those vacant homes undergoing remodeling.

Thank you for asking for input, this proposal benefits the community, in my view.

Ranada Laughlin, Home/Property Owner Rio Dell, CA March 12, 2021

To:

The City of Rio Dell 675 Wildwood Ave Rio Dell, CA 95562

Re:

Mandatory Universal Garbage & Recycling Collection Program

Dear City of Rio Dell and City Council Members,

I am reaching out to you to express my concerns regarding the probable implementation of a mandatory across the board garbage and recycling program. I know there are problems at certain properties within the city where owners/tenants allow garbage and other debris to accumulate in mass. Not only does this take away from the aesthetic value of the city, it can also lead to health and environmental issues and public safety concerns. Many municipalities throughout the county and other areas of the country are trying to find solutions to this ongoing problem. I do not have a solution and commend you on your efforts to try and correct this problem.

That said I would like to remind you that this problem only occurs with a small percentage of the properties in the city, whereas many residents/property owners already have solid waste pickup or have found alternative means of managing their garbage. What concerns me is the financial hardship or other hardships this program is likely to put on a portion of the residents/property owners who already have another program in place. To illustrate, I am referring to those already on a tight budget, or those who are in a low income bracket, or those who live alone and may only generate a small amount of trash per week. Another potential problem pertains to those living in the most remote, rural areas of the city (i.e., Monument Rd, Blue Slide Rd and similar neighborhoods). There are many cases where such households will have to cart trash receptacles long distances to pickup points and run the risk of having them knocked over and contents strewn around by scavenging dogs, bear, and other opportunistic wildlife.

Our individual situation is unique in itself. Although my wife and I maintain a home in Rio Dell and have for 38 years, most of our retirement time is spent at our second residence in Southern Trinity County. Trinity County has in place an annual solid waste tax, plus we pay an exorbitant per bag fee when we visit the county transfer site. Why should we be required to participate in the Rio Dell mandatory garbage collection program when the minimal amount of trash we generate in Rio Dell gets disposed of in Trinity County?

In all fairness I hope when the City implements this program and I know that is your intention, that you will take my concerns into consideration and include a mechanism to exempt qualifying homeowners/tenants on a case by case basis.

Thank you and best regards,

Doug Dinemore

Doug Dinsmore 707.499.8485

**P.S.** I have written you today because we have limited internet at our home in Trinity County and will be unable to participate in a virtual meeting from this location.

#### To the Rio Dell City Counsel;

I am a concerned citizen of Rio Dell, I grew up here and came back after going away to school. I do have garbage pickup, but my mother and father, both retired senior citizens, do not. My mother has my brother haul her garbage to the dump every other month, or depending on the season every three months; when she did the math, it turned out she is only paying around \$5 a month for trash disposal.

If I understood last meeting right this is mostly to get a head of California laws down the way. I get that, and am all for this; but not in helping the owners of Eel River become the new Rockefeller, Carnegie, and Vanderbilt, or for Humboldt reference the new Arkley, Pierson or Carson.

There are between 1,200 and 1,600 individual homes and business in the City of Rio Dell and if you charge between \$25 and \$35 a month that's \$30,000 to \$56,000—an average of \$43,000 – in just one month and just in the City of Rio Dell alone. An average of 516 thousand dollars a year for anywhere from 10 to 15 years—if I understand average lengths for these types of contracts— that is 5.16 to 7.74 million dollars made in just Rio Dell over the length of their contract. I did not do the math for overhead costs, due to the fact that there was talk of Fortuna being part of this, if that's the case they are larger and anything that's needed for overhead, payroll or otherwise would be covered there easily.

If they're buying new, more automated, trucks then they'll either keep their employee numbers about the same, or add/subtract a small number of people. I do not find it reasonable for the people of Rio Dell to be paying higher rates then they already due, seeing as how we are guaranteeing them a lot of new customers, nor do I find it reasonable to be paying their startup costs. I understand they might need some help with collecting the money at the very beginning—it is most likely a lot—but if our Council is going to help with that, we citizens should not be paying more and there should be some kind of once a month option for those that cannot come up with, even a small, can of garbage every other week.

I understand that this is something that needs to happen, but Rio Dell already has to pay for an expensive and complicated Water and Sewage system – that the State demanded— we don't need to add even more cost on top of a poor community's shoulders. I am all for going forward, but I beg the Council to not let Eel River Recology walk all over them and to be tough negotiators for the people who have put their trust in you. If anyone thinks that Rio Dell doesn't have options just remember we've been here since Humboldt County was born, sure not as a 'legally' recognized city, but we've been through floods and earthquakes and we'll be here even if California and Eel River Recology don't like us.

River Rats stick together and take care of their own. Keep this town's trust! Don't roll over for some company who thinks they can make a fortune off of bleeding us dry.

Proud Rio Dell River Rat

From:

Kathi Edwards <kathicanfixit@yahoo.com>

Sent:

Monday, April 19, 2021 10:58 AM

To:

**Public Comment** 

Subject:

ABSOLUTELY NO on trash service being required

N

Do NOT vote for this policy.

I am against it.

There are many people who don't have enough money for food and medicine...to add this to their budget is criminal.

You have a person on staff to deal with the VERY FEW residences that have trashy yards.

"Abatement" person, right?

Let the abatements deal with the messes and DO NOT PUNISH the rest of us citizens for the lazy, messy few.

Sincerely, Katherine R. Edwards 540 Edwards Drive Rio Dell

From:

Esther Isaacs <iladybug5@yahoo.com>

Sent:

Monday, April 19, 2021 11:56 AM

To:

**Public Comment** 

Subject:

[SPAM] Mandatory garbage service

## Dear City Council,

I am writing to express my opposition to a mandatory garbage service. I have lived in Rio Dell for seven years and have always taken care of my garbage myself. It is much easier and more cost effective for me to take my own garbage into the dump.

I do not think that the citizens of Rio Dell should be punished for the actions of a few.

Deal with the people that are causing a problem and leave the rest of us alone.

I feel that mandatory garbage service is just one more freedom that is being taken away from us.

Hopefully there is another solution to this problem. I do not support mandatory garbage collection.

Sincerely,

Esther Isaacs

Sent from Yahoo Mail on Android

From:

Robert & Chelsie Orr <chelsandrob@yahoo.com>

Sent:

Monday, April 19, 2021 12:20 PM

To: Subject: Public Comment Fw: Failure Notice

### Mayor Garnes,

I know the Facebook trolls want residents to attack your trash proposal, however, I would like to say thank you. Finally there is someone brave enough to do something that has needed to be done for years. This may not stop those who are illegally dumping around town but it will give them an incentive to decrease or desist. This proposal eliminates a major excuse residents are using to collect trash in their yards versus disposing of it properly. I would gladly pay a little more to see our city raise its standard of living.

Thank you, Concerned Resident

From:

Michael Porter <porterms104@gmail.com>

Sent:

Monday, April 19, 2021 8:02 PM

To: Subject: Public Comment Trash pickup

As I've seen in Rio Dell there are a few people that don't give a hoot about taking their trash to the dump so you want to force everyone to use trash pickup. Those people won't use that either they don't care. I can't see how this is going to benefit the city overall? Now that we have a code enforcement officer that should be up to her to look into those problems not force everyone to have trash pick up. I maybe off base but what happened with fixing the streets with the sales tax money?

From:

City of Rio Dell

Sent:

Tuesday, April 20, 2021 8:06 AM

To:

**Public Comment** 

Subject:

FW: Forced trash

From: Jonathan Weltsch < jonathanweltsch@gmail.com>

Sent: Monday, April 19, 2021 9:54 PM

To: City of Rio Dell <cityhall@cityofriodell.ca.gov>

Subject: Forced trash

Mandatory trash is fraud. I have paid for my trash to be collected curb side my entire life but others can't afford to. Your plans of forcing them to do business with a private corporation is immoral. What's next? Mandatory health insurance? I live in a free country and besides jury duty I'm not required to do anything. You put pressure on the slobs to clean up their own mess and leave the rest be!