

**REGULAR MEETING OF THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF NOVI
MONDAY, JANUARY 23, 2023 AT 7:00 P.M.**

Mayor Gatt called the meeting to order at 7:00 P.M.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

ROLL CALL: Mayor Gatt, Mayor Pro Tem Staudt, Council Members Casey, Crawford, Fischer, Smith, Thomas

ALSO PRESENT: Victor Cardenas, Interim City Manager
Tom Schultz, City Attorney

APPROVAL OF AGENDA:

Mayor Gatt said we have two firms interviewing this evening to be our Executive Search Firm. He mentioned after number two, there may be discussion or may not be discussion of the Council, as to any motions to approve or not approve.

CM 23-01-004 Moved by Fischer, seconded by Casey; CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

To approve the Agenda as presented.

Roll call vote on CM 23-01-004	Yeas: Staudt, Casey, Crawford, Fischer, Smith, Thomas, Gatt
	Nays: None

PUBLIC HEARINGS: None

PRESENTATIONS: None

MANAGER/STAFF REPORT: None

ATTORNEY REPORT: None

AUDIENCE COMMENTS:

Marian Mahoney said she has lived in Novi for 27 years. She said she wanted to comment on the topic of the proposed Public Safety Building Needs Committee. She believed that we could all agree that public safety is the most important responsibility of our local government. She was happy to hear the discussion at the last Council meeting on this topic, and clearly our Mayor and City Council agree that it is of utmost importance that we need to provide the facilities equipment and resources to our Public Safety staff. She was excited to the resolution to move forward on the Public Safety Buildings Needs Committee. However, she said after she read the resolution, she was surprised and quite disappointed to see the list of the committee appointments. She explained the Committee has seven seats or seven appointments, three from the City Council and four from the residents of the City. She said the proposed committee has seven appointments, seven men and zero women. She thought we had two highly capable women on the City Council. She knew Council could not answer her questions during audience

participation, but she wondered why neither of them were on the committee. She stated there are more women than men living in the city of Novi, in fact, over 51% of our residents are women. She wondered why there are no women on those four available seats. She said women care about Public Safety for Novi women. She said they also want our police officers and our firefighters to have the resources needed to keep us safe. She stated that Novi women, by the way, care that their tax dollars are used responsibly. It is clear that there will be a huge price tag at the end of this project. She believed it is a responsibility to the Mayor and the City Council to make sure that no committee member on that committee has any potential conflict of interest. She said the proposed committee does not represent our community, in fact, the proposal leaves important questions unanswered. She asked the Council to hold off on approving the resolution until there is an inclusive and transparent process for selecting the committee members. She thought this would give the community confidence on the committee's work, this project is very important. She said clearly, the Mayor and the Council and she knew that our community cared deeply about making sure that our public safety is ensured. She asked that they take the time and start this project out properly by appointing a solid committee to do the work. Thank you.

CONSENT AGENDA REMOVALS AND APPROVALS:

Member Smith removed Consent Item B for further discussion.

CM 23-01-005 Moved by Fischer, seconded by Casey; CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

To approve the Consent Agenda as amended.

- A. Approve Minutes of:
 January 9, 2023 - Regular Meeting
- B. Approval to award Great Lakes Power and Lighting the Civic Center LED lighting retrofit project in the amount of \$65,594.16. **REMOVED/LATER APPROVED**
- C. Approval to award an Agreement for Geotechnical Engineering Services for Public Projects to G2 Consulting Group, LLC, for a period of five years, with an effective date of January 23, 2023.
- D. Approval of a request to transfer ownership of escrowed 2021 Resort Class C Liquor License & SDM license with Sunday Sales Permit (PM) with New Outdoor Service Area, Sunday Sales Permit (AM) and Sunday Sales Permit (PM) SDM-Mixed Spirit Drink from Sip Bay Harbor LLC., to KHP Novi, LLC., 44375 W. 12 Mile Rd, #G-147, Novi, MI.
- E. Final approval of the request of Leon's of Novi, JZ22-27, with Zoning Map Amendment 18.738, to rezone property from Local Business (B-1) to General Business (B-3). The property is located on the south side of Ten Mile Road, west of Haggerty Road. **SECOND READING**

F. Approval of claims and warrants – Warrant 1124

Roll call vote on CM 23-01-005

**Yeas: Casey, Crawford, Fischer, Smith, Thomas,
Gatt, Staudt**

Nays: None

EXECUTIVE SEARCH FIRM INTERVIEWS

Mayor Gatt announced that they were going to interview two executive search firms that our City staff has brought to us. He stated if Council desires, one of these firms will be awarded the contract to begin the search for our next City Manager. He explained the format for the evening, each presenter will be given five minutes to talk and tell us about why they want to be hired. He said then we will afford each councilmember the opportunity to ask two questions, one at a time. He will start to his right, we will go around the table, and then a second round if a councilmember so desires at the end of two questions. He said the executive who represents the firm will be excused. He said the second firm will be brought in at the end of both presentations as we talked about during the approval of the agenda. If a councilmember wants to make a motion of any sort to approve or not approve, we will entertain that motion at that point.

1. Amy Cell, LLC

Amy Cell said she was thrilled to be there that evening. She wanted to make the case for why she would love to be chosen that evening. She said she had a brief presentation that she prepared to go over a few things. She thought Novi was a stellar community and it was a community she knew very well. She said she was a member of the Southeast Michigan community and has spent a lot of time in that area. She was honored to assist in this very important endeavor. She said she would talk a bit about her firm and their approach and then open it up to questions. She said they have a large team of 22 people that are based in Michigan, in Ypsilanti. She said they are very diverse in terms of age, backgrounds, national origins, perspectives, but they were all passionate about helping Michigan communities. She stated they have a wide range of expertise in organizational behavior, municipalities, recruiting and all areas of human resources. She said they have been very fortunate to be able to serve several fine communities in Michigan through executive recruitment services, as well as training and development compensation. She said they were outsourced HR Department for the City of Fraser. She said she was Interim City Manager for one week when they were in transition, so they love the opportunity to support their local communities. She said they have focused on putting together a solid process that includes making sure that Council is aligned with the vision for the position in terms of must haves and ideals, then they put together a marketing campaign, a thorough assessment process, we facilitate an interview process with a lot of community engagement, because that is a key component, then they will assist with the negotiating and onboarding, including a 360 degree feedback after six months to make sure everything is aligned with the expectations communication style in the life of the new City Manager. She said this is how we focus on that vision alignment, we will put together a custom list of criteria or rubric, identifying the attributes, those must have

experiences, and that ideal qualities and how we will do the assessment. She stated this is custom made based on their intake meetings that they would have with all of you, department leaders and a survey that they can do broadly throughout the organization and involve other community stakeholders as well. She said then they will aggressively market the opportunity, it will be easy to see Novi with the jewels that you have in terms of the library, the school district, the ambitious capital programs that Novi has, it will be enticing for a new City Manager to come in, as well as work with the Council that worked so well together is spent most of the weekend looking at and reviewing some of Novi's recent meetings, and they are very impressive how aligned you are and proactive and professional you are, which is going to be another big selling point. She said they will make sure that potential candidates know about this through our 1000 person database that they have put together that they regularly email out to people to network, the opportunity, we will definitely be using the typical job search boards, including the International Accounting and City Managers Association, strategic government resources, which has an excellent job board, the Michigan Municipal League, which has a very popular job board, as well as LinkedIn. She stated they have four recruiter licenses for LinkedIn on their team. They can aggressively go out to find people as well, not just wait for people to come in, because finding people that are not out there, passive candidates, is a key component to making sure you have the very best candidate pool. She said they will thoroughly assess our candidates and provide you with a very detailed amount of information including videos, interview summaries, resume, the phone interview, kind of transcript, reference checks and background checks. She said a cyber review that they do before they present those candidates to make sure that there will not be an issue. After that it becomes public in that process. She said they will support a zoom interview and or in person interviews if you want to do different rounds. She said now, people are getting back to in person interviews, but sometimes there is a desire to do a zoom interview. She stated they will put together the interview packets assessment information, feedback from staff and community members as well so and will gather this body of knowledge provided to you to help assist in making this very important decision. She said they can provide on negotiation support, that role is guidelines are aligned before they bring candidates to as well. She said it will provide relocation guidance as needed. She said they feel like they want to make sure that the position, the person is successful in that role and so doing a 360 degree feedback. She said after they have been on board, they can work out any tweaks that need to happen in terms of communication or leadership style. She mentioned the pricing information is included in the proposal, but they can be flexible and provide a variety of different options. The timeline, she has already sketched out what it would specifically be, so if they got the word out, should they be selected that evening, they would be able to come back and hit by April 3, have completed the assessment, recruiting and interview process so that you would be able to extend an offer that was desirable. She said they try to be thorough and transparent. She said they have a proven process that they have used repeatedly, we have no surprises, pricing, and video interviews are included to use the technology. She stated they have a large Michigan team. She said there are a lot of duplication of efforts, so they can be efficient and thorough when they are assessing and marketing. She stated they have a lot of municipal experience, and they are excited and for passionate for Michigan communities.

Member Casey thanked Amy Cell for coming out that evening to meet with Council. She asked her to tell them about a time or times when a search did not go in the way that their process is outlined. Perhaps it took longer to find candidates, something took us or took the search a little bit off track, so the timeline was extended. She asked what the situation was, and what actions did she take. She wondered what the results were. Ms. Cell said on a situation that came to mind would be with Redford Township, they were bringing on a Township Manager, Superintendent to be exact. She said the first round of candidates that they presented and interviewed, the Board did not want to extend an offer to any of those candidates. She stated they redid the search and it reached out to new people remarketed the program and had an outstanding candidate arise, and the Board extended an offer to that candidate.

Member Fischer thanked her for being there that evening. He said this is a second process that he has been going through with the City Manager position. He said the last time that they went through this he was rather unimpressed with the team that was put forward. He asked her if she could specifically tell them who will be working on their account. He wondered how many searches they will be running. He asked if she would be involved. He wondered what their expertise was, he wanted to be convinced that the day-to-day person that Tia or Council will be working with will live up to the expectations. Ms. Cell stated she will be personally involved with all aspects of the search and oversee it. She said she would be involving very few seekers on her team, so she might do some of the intake interviews, then Rebecca Roberts on their team would be a lead on interfacing with the candidates. She said they will try to make it a seamless process in terms of being that point of contact. She said you would be getting the weekly emails from her once they get into the assessment process, you will be getting weekly updates of how many candidates have applied, that they are considering, how many once candidates we're seriously considering, etc. She said she will be attending all the meetings and she would be coming back and presenting the job posting the rubric, the assessment questions to you, she would be here for that also. She explained they would send you the information for the shortlist of candidates for you to review. She said we would come back and presenting the job posting the rubric, the assessment questions to you, she would be here for that. Then we would send you the information for the shortlist of candidates for you to review. She would come back and then in closed session facilitate that meeting, she would be participating as well on the on site meetings depending on when they are, she might have another person on her team with her, and she would be there to facilitate that meeting as well. She said there would be a team if she was sick or something unforeseen happened, she would have other people on her team that have presented at Councils and facilitate those meetings, but her intention is to be at all of those meetings and to be your point of contact.

Member Smith thanked her for coming out that evening and for her presentation. He wondered considering just the way employment is right now if the 13-week timeline solid. He knew it was hard to find people now for everyone. Ms. Cell agreed that it was a challenging market, but they are very process focused. She believed that setting a timeline and then being able to communicate that effectively with candidates is the best

way to be efficient, so they do not lose anyone. She said that occasionally does happen in this talent market. She stated oftentimes, City Manager candidates will be exploring opportunities with multiple communities. She said it was her belief is being as efficient and as aggressive on the timeline helps to prevent that from happening. She stated if we get everything agreed upon with your schedules, and let the candidates know what the interview dates are, they try to be able to meet so that they can get the candidates that are in the pool through the process without losing them. She said in terms of finding candidates in this market they are aggressive on that. She reiterated that they have a rich database, they email people, they have a monthly newsletter that goes out promoting opportunities. She stated they have many experts on the team that are good at sourcing candidates, as well in some communities, and we do regularly are doing a couple of searches a year that are going on. They have a pretty good sense of the market. She said we know that sometimes they have worked with communities that have had different challenges and have not had all the assets that Novi does. She was fairly certain that the opportunity will be quite attractive, especially if we have a market rate salary. She said that has been agreed upon to move forward.

Member Thomas asked if she could tell her if there was any chance that she would be doing a search for another community for the same position as they would be for Novi and how is that was managed. Ms. Cell responded that they are currently doing a search for Scio Township right now for their Administrator or Township Manager role. She said they have done searches before that have potentially overlap. Oftentimes, it doesn't work. She said they did Eastpointe and Sterling Heights, those were overlapping at the timeframe, and those two communities are right near each other. She said they did not have any overlapping candidates, both communities were very different. She said the aspects that they were looking for in the candidates was different, again, by focusing on a customized rubric and criteria. She said they were able to find people that with their skills and attributes, and also communities have different assets which are going to appeal to different people. She said all the assets that the city of Novi has, you are going to do extremely well. She loved all her clients, but there is a very different situation with other communities that she is working with and she did not expect it to be problematic for Novi.

Member Crawford thanked her and said at this time he did not have any questions. He said they have either been answered by her presentation or by his colleague's questions.

Mayor Pro Tem Staudt said he looked at her resume and you list five cities that you were using as examples of what you have done. He said a couple are Holland and Eastpointe, you have had 40, 50, 60 or 80 qualified applicants. He asked what she thought was a qualified applicant compared to a city of 67,000, that has a tax base of \$4.5 billion. He thought that a qualified applicant in a city of 30,000 is very different than a qualified applicant in the City of Novi. He wondered if she saw the same number of people applying for a position here as you would there that you would consider qualified. Ms. Cell replied that it might have been total applicants, not qualified applicants and maybe that was a mistake. She there is a difference between total applicants and highly qualified applicants. Mayor Pro Tem Staudt said for the City of Holland, it says the search

attracted over 60 qualified candidates. Ms. Cell stated that may have been a mistake, she did not think they had that many completely qualified candidates. She said if she recalled they seriously considered about 30 of those. She said from that, we usually will bring in seven to 10 candidates. She said their goal is to bring in about seven to 10 highly qualified candidates that meet your definition of highly qualified, based on the rubric that she had put together. She said oftentimes it might be base and we will look at total budget and number of people that have been managed in an organization to make sure that it is a comparable sized city, we will look at experiences with capital planning, with budgeting, depending on what the needs are. She said sometimes communities are focused on community development, so they want to find somebody that has a demonstrated track record of being able to implement new community development initiatives for instance.

Mayor Gatt asked Ms. Cell if what she wrote in the resume regarding 60 qualified applicants was not correct. She believed it was not correct. Mayor Gatt asked what her what she considered to be a qualified applicant for the City of Novi, what traits are you looking for. She replied that the traits that usually come up after the process to get feedback is around communication style, leadership qualities, demonstrated track record of managing an organization. She said sometimes, a community wants to have somebody that has prior city manager experience, and then becomes very clear, or because of the work that needs to be done, they need prior city manager experience, especially for a city the size of Novi, that might be more of a requirement. She said smaller communities that is less complex is comfortable hiring a department head to make a promotional opportunity move. He guess is that a qualified applicant might include someone that has been a city manager of a smaller city, or community, it could have been somebody that is a department head of a larger city or community that might have worked, that is moved around, and that is often a career path where people will make a lateral move to a larger community to get a broader scope and then be able to move to a community where they would have the overall role. She said it depends on and varies. She said she has seen some communities that are sometimes even in the Charter, it requires there are requirements. She said fortunately, the City of Novi Charter, you do not have that level of a requirement. She said sometimes there are specific requirements in terms of the number of years of experience. She thought it was Harper Woods, maybe they had a requirement that they had to be a city manager of the community, the same size and that can make some challenges, but they do try to customize the criteria based on the community.

Member Casey said she wanted to understand how her firm or how any firm would react to challenges, so that is the direction she toot in her first question. She said she was going to ask her something similar. She asked her to tell Council about a time or times where she had to manage significant differences of opinion among her clients. She wondered what the situation was and what action they took and what the results were. She repeated the questions. Ms. Cell thought of a scenario would be in Scio Township. She said she did the search for a township administrator for them about a year and a half ago. She said that person that came into that role did not stay and resigned after about four or five months. She had a commitment to redo the search. She knew that there were

underlying issues that contributed to that resignation, that if we just put another person in that role, they were not going to be successful either. She said there were significant issues in the finance area, as well as the structure. She said there was a board that there was conflict with and there was an agreement about the Administrator's role for the Township. She explained that Township structures are different than Council structures. She stated for someone to succeed as Township Administrator that should become a manager role so that they could hire and fire, so it would be more like a Council/Manager role. She said she worked closely with the Interim Township Administrator to try to address the finance issues, including facilitating workshops around finance making recommendations on staffing precede proposals, there was extreme disagreement between some of the members on the board about the right approach with finance. She assisted the Township in bringing in a different Interim Township Administrator to try to address the finance issues, including facilitating workshops around finance making recommendations on staffing precede proposals, there was extreme disagreement between some of the members on the board about the right approach. She said with finance, she was assisting the Township in bringing in a different Interim Administrator who was currently working there. Someone she knew from working at Fraser. She said they have now aligned the board, the right approach to take with the Finance staff, they are now searching for a Finance Director. She said at the last Township meeting, they decided to make the administrator position into a manager position and adjusted other responsibilities on the board, so they would be set up for success.

Member Fischer said he did not have a second round of questions.

Member Smith asked Ms. Cell if we were to bring your firm in what are the first steps that you would take with the Council and the City staff. Ms. Cell replied the first step would be to do one on one interviews with City Council and department heads. She said they need to learn more about what you feel are key qualities and experiences you would want in the City manager, we would ask about short and long term needs and challenges facing the City or opportunities. She understood there is going to be a new taskforce put together for instance, to look at facilities for the police station. So getting a clearer understanding about what the goals are short term and long term for the Council are that will help them put together that customized assessment plan of what qualities are needed to find somebody that can achieve the goals that you have, communication styles can vary. She noted that Councils and department staffs have different needs, so they would want to get as much information as they can, sometimes there are department heads, they are new and need a lot of support and mentoring. She said this is one type of leadership style. She said sometimes there is going to be a lot of department heads that are going to be retiring, so finding somebody that is a proven team builder that can attract and recruit people and bring them into the team can be important. She said sometimes organizations are facing a lot of conflict or morale issues, especially coming out of COVID. So finding somebody that has those right attributes is something that we really hone in on so that we can find people and then assess them and make sure that they have those skills for the team.

Member Thomas wondered what the process was when the applicants are provided and they bring them to Council. She asked if there is any filtering of information, or do we know every bit as much as you do about those applicants. Ms. Cell replied the candidates that we will present to you that they feel are fully qualified to do the role, and we will target about seven to 10 candidates. They do not have too many otherwise you can raise the bar, but also, they want to make sure that there is some opportunity to be more selective, we will give you everything they have about those candidates. She said they will receive the resume, a written survey, they complete the kind of transcript from the video interview, you will see a video interview so you will really get a good sense of their communication skills and presence. She said you will get the reference check background check cyber review. She said everything they have will be presented to you. She did say on occasion, they will come across something on a background check or cyber review that they want additional explanation for, we want to provide candidates an opportunity to share that, you would get that information as well. She stated for the candidates that they do not present, we would not be sharing that information with you typically, but for the ones that they are presenting, we try to give you a lot of information, which is why they try to provide up to a week between when they deliver that information to you to when they have the conversation so that you can look through it and feel comfortable with the candidates that you would bring back in for interviews.

Member Crawford said he did not have any questions at this time.

Mayor Pro Tem Staudt asked Ms. Cell as a the CFO of a company that we have a school that has 600 apprentices, he noticed that you have a job in the state legislature at MATC. He said she talked about in in her resume, something that you did that were related to apprentices, what did you do at the state level, related to apprentices. Ms. Cell said she was the co-developer of a program called the Michigan Advanced Technician Training Program. She explained that this was an initiative that Governor Snyder wanted the state of Michigan to pursue a German model apprenticeship, after he came back from the tour, she believed in 2012. She met with a variety of automotive leaders to help and they brought in a consultant to develop a three year program for mechatronics and then partnered with Oakland Community College and Henry Ford Community College to launch that program. She said then we had 30 people through the first cohort, and she believed it is still going, it is one of the programs she was very proud of. Mayor Pro Tem Staudt said he was with Associated Builders and Contractors. He said they have schools all over the state that do a lot of apprentice work and he always wondered what MATC did in that vein. Thank you.

Mayor Gatt said the last question was in regards to her job that she was applying for that evening, without mentioning any names, of course, tell us your biggest success and your biggest failure. Ms. Cell replied that one of her programs that she was most proud of would be Community Ventures, which was a program that helped provide a pathway out of poverty for about 8000 Michigan residents, that was exciting. She said that was a big one for her to be involved with. She said the biggest failure was when they launched Pure Michigan Talent Connect, the new statewide web portal, they did not do the

appropriate testing. She said she crashed the state website for about two weeks and messed up everybody's unemployment.

2. Slavin Management Consultants

Bob Slavin thanked Mayor and Council and said it was a pleasure and a privilege to be there that evening. He appreciated the opportunity. He was there to represent Slavin Management Consultants. He stated he has been doing this work since the late 1970's and has owned his company since the mid 1990's. He said they do a number of different things but 95% of what they do with local government and nonprofit is executive recruiting. He stated in that field, they placed more than 900 jobs in the years that he has been doing this, and not all city managers and county managers, there are some department heads. He said they focus their efforts on a set of criteria that you folks establish. He said for those of you who might remember working with him previously we spent a lot of time at the beginning of each project, finding out what this community is all about and what this Council is looking for in a manager, that would take several days of on site work on their part. He said they take the information they garner during that period, put it into a draft of a recruitment profiles and bring it back to you folks for approval. He said often, it is not as easy as just an approval, but it needs to be adjusted ad it needs to be right, because that become their roadmap. He said once they have that document approved, they do not change the thing about that we go after folks who meet the criteria that you folks have established. He said if they have any difficulty accomplishing that mission, they will be back to talk with you whether than change it. He said what they end up accomplishing almost all the time, and he could not think of an exception is providing you a set of candidates who meet the criteria, who are not one person in five or six clones, but they all have the common characteristic of meeting the criteria that you folks set. He stated they do thorough background work on our candidates, we guarantee their work. He said if for any reason the candidate that you hired through their process is not on the job for any reason within two years, they will redo the search for no additional fee. He said they have that guarantee and all the work that they have done, they have honored it only three times once because somebody died, another time because it is a good employee quit two weeks before the two years were up, and third, because somebody was not meeting standards that they expected. He said his strong recommendation to that Council, will we ask them to let them go because the performance, the behavior was so bad, that we did not think that we could endorse that person, because we thought if he could do that, behaving like that, that we lost their confidence. He said he was hired for a variety of very specific strengths, which he displayed, and the Council was quite reluctant to let him go because he was doing a great job in terms of economic development, but he did some outrageous things. He said that cause them to go to the Council and say, we think you need to do something about that, so they let him go. He said that was the only time in all the years he has been doing this that anybody has been let go within that wo years for performance. He said that was because he requested it. He said he probably was forgetting important points, but he thought that you have the proposal. He said in their proposal, and he was going to let you folks ask a the questions, because he would rather relate to what you have on your mind than to continue to talk about what he thought you might want to hear.

Mayor Pro Tem Staudt asked Mr. Slavin if he has done business with Novi before. Mr. Slavin replied yes. Mayor Pro Tem Staudt said that was not his question, he just wanted to confirm that. Mr. Slavin said they did the work that brought Clay here, he couldn't remember the exact date. Mayor Pro Tem Staudt said they had an opportunity to look at us 20 some years ago or 18 years ago, he wondered if he followed anything about us since, and have you gotten any ideas about what Novi is looking for in our next city manager. Mr. Slavin thought Novi has had a lot of success. He said you cannot say you were not successful, successful 20 years ago, but a lot of the things that you said you wanted to accomplish, appears to have appeared to have been accomplished a lot of innovative things, you have earned a lot of awards. He said if he remembered driving being guided through the city through the help of one of you, when he was here about 20 years ago, he tried to duplicate that trip today. He said it is incredibly different than it was then in terms of businesses and in quality development. He said a lot of the open space areas has still been preserved, and he thought that you have done a great job of that. He said he could not tell you he spent a lot of time doing that this afternoon doing that, but he spent as much time as he could doing it. He hoped that answered your questions. He said he was intrigued with the City 20 years ago and have followed it from a distance but followed it since then.

Member Crawford asked if he was based out of Georgia. Mr. Slavin said yes. Member Crawford asked if he had anything local here in Michigan. Mr. Slavin replied, Ohio, but not in Michigan. He said their Mid-West offices are in Cincinnati. He said as a matter of fact that they are run by Dave Krings, and he would have been there that evening, but he had a medical issue and he could not be here that evening. He stated he has been president of ICMA, president of the Illinois Managers, he has been county manager in Hamilton County and in Peoria County. He is well known by people in this business. He said you cannot go to ICMA meeting and expected to have much opportunity to talk with him because people, he knows everybody in that place. He is very good, very capable. He said he has worked with him for more than 15 years. Member Crawford asked him if he found it to be a disadvantage not having anyone locally here in Michigan. Mr. Slavin said you would think the answer would be yes, but no, they have done a lot of work in Michigan over the years. He said his dad was born in Pontiac and raised in Howell and educated at the University of Michigan and when we were kids, they spent a lot of time here. He said it did not give him much insight into local government, because he was a child, but he did get a strong base and appreciation for this part of the Country. He said his father was a physician in Toledo and his father still lived in Howell and they spent a lot of time in Ann Arbor. He said one of the things about his early experience as a recruiter is that he worked for a company by the name of Korn Ferry, he worked for cities and counties before that. He said Korn Ferry taught him how to be a recruiter, and he knew how to source once you tell him what you are looking for, we know how to find them. He said it do not make any difference what state they are working in, we worked in 46 or 47 of the 50 states. He said they have done all kinds of things, not just city and county managers, but they do a lot of nonprofits, they place people to run the Music Center in Los Angeles as an example, and somebody to run the Lou Gehrig's Disease Association. He did not know anything about any of that stuff at the time, but he

learned a lot quickly. He stated they have excellent candidates for all those jobs. He commented they know how to do the work. He said if we had somebody in Michigan, we would use them, but they would have to be people who would be willing to dedicate the time, effort, and commitment that he insisted on and that he has.

Member Thomas wondered if it was possible that you could be searching for the same position for multiple communities. If so, how is that managed. Mr. Slavin said he would have to be clear about the fact that they garner information from each of those communities. He said if it so happened, that the criteria was the same for each of them, they would be pretty open about that, what they do is in the public domain, and people can apply for those jobs. He explained if somebody is applying and interested in this job, and they were interested in them, and for another job that they might be interested in, and they can find is interested in them, then they are pretty open about it. He said you will know that the candidate will know that and the other client will know that and then they will need to strategize things so that you are not in a situation where you are competing with that other position. He said one of the things that is happening in this business now is competition is greater than I used to be 20 years ago, when we did this workout, we have probably 100 resumes for this job, we will probably get fewer than 50 this time. He said it is not because there is anything wrong with Novi, quite to the contrary, it is because that is the nature of this business. He said people are not moving for a variety of reasons, most of which are obvious that this pandemic is keeping people from being as interested in making a move than might not otherwise be the case. He said the cost of housing, custom moving costs, the problem with moving children from school, spousal employment, all those things have limited the numbers, not the quality, but the numbers. He said he could not tell somebody, there are not qualified to apply for another job, he can guide them, and if he thought they were most attractive to you folks, or to the other folks, he would guide them in that way. He said the reality is both of those organizations would have the right to talk to that person if we were not involved in the other one, and the person applied for it. He said you would be in less control of it, he hoped he made himself clear.

Member Smith said given what you just described is the tighter job market for city managers, what kind of timeframe are we looking for before we start seeing candidates. Mr. Slavin stated his comments a moment ago might suggest to you that it could take longer, it will take longer to do this, but the reality is, it has been their experience that when they go to the market with a quality position like this, they get good response early on. He said rather than set some arbitrary final filing date, 45 days, or two months from now, and run the risk of losing that person to another quality job. He said by making them wait, we would want to arrange the process so that we could maybe have ranges that they apply, and that the position is open until filled. He stated once we get enough quality response but want talk to you about it. He said they will not stop the process necessarily, but we want to talk to you about focusing on the quality and not letting them slip away. Member Smith thanked him for his response.

Member Fischer thanked Mr. Slavin for being there that evening. He said he was around when the last search took place back in 2014. He said he was unimpressed with the firm

that they chose and the person who was running our search. He asked if he could tell him exactly who will be working on this, who will be Councils day to day contact, who will be corresponding with the Council, who will be corresponding with our HR Director, that would make him convinced that the same situation will not happen again. Mr. Slavin said that would be him. He has made some dramatic changes in his life in terms of his profession. He said in order to stay as a recruiter rather than as a person that runs a recruitment company. He said their company is small and lean, and he had the recruitment division, and he runs the recruitment practice, you would be working with him and his co-worker Dave Krings, but you would not see him without seeing me and he would be the contact.

Member Casey thanked Mr. Slavin for coming in front of Council. She said she will ask the question and then repeat it because she tends to ask very long questions. She said she was seeking to understand how your company and how you would react if something went outside of the plan. She asked him to tell Council about a time or times when a search did not fit your process. For instance, maybe it took longer to find a quality candidate, so the timeline got stretched. She wondered what the situation was, and what were the actions they took, and what was the result. She repeated the questions for Mr. Slavin. Mr. Slavin said would not mention the client's name, but they did a search for a rather extremely well know city in Florida not long ago, in which he was insulated from the Mayor and City Council. He believed it may have been the mayor and city council decision for him to work through the city staff, but they felt completely alienated. He said they felt alienated from the process. He said it was so insulated from that when he went there to begin, one just meet with one of his associates went there to begin the search, they had a meeting set up with the mayor and council, the mayor showed up, but none of the council members did, they were to deal with the outgoing city manager that went on for a long period of time until finally council members started criticizing being critical of the process because they did not know what was going on. He said they did not know what was going on because they did not attend meetings. He said he got to one point in that process where he made individual appointments with each of them and went down to that community and sate there for two days, probably saw seven members of that council, maybe it was nine. He recalled he ended up meeting two of them became the process was frustrating. He said he did everything he could to get their attention. He stated on of the things he did which they assigned him to perform that way or behave that way, but then did not want him to talk to the outgoing city manager. He said at one point he did have to call him and say you have got to get your bosses tuned into this because he could not. He said there is no way we are going to finish this process. He said that went on for at least a month beyond what it should have and that was the reason why it ended up having a very happy ending. He said they got somebody that they could not believe they got who met a lot of the criteria they were looking for, and he has been there, and they are very happy with him. He said it had a happy ending. He did not think they would hire him again and he would not blame them, he did not think he would want to work for them again. He gave another example, he said it was not necessarily a bad situation, but they did a search for a city in Michigan not too long ago where they provided a set of finalists, semi-finalists candidates that the Council chose a group of finalists from those they interviewed. He stated they did not see a fit, there was

no question that they were not qualified, but they did not see a fit. They asked him to go back out, he did, but he could not get the quantity that they were looking for. He said they did find somebody who when they introduced to the Council, they unanimously and right away supported that candidate and hired him and he was there for about four years. He understood that there was some criticism of them providing only one candidate, but that was not the whole story.

Mayor Gatt asked Mr. Slavin in his executive opinion, what qualities will make a fine city manager for the City of Novi. Mr. Slavin replied that you are going to want somebody that can keep the City's reputation for innovation and creativity and staying ahead of the growth, rather than trying to keep with it. He suspected that would be something that you would be interested in. He stated city managers have got to be advocates, in his opinion members of the Internal City County Management Association, and very strongly committed to their Code of Ethics and need to have experience running a complex organization as if one is in a sophisticated environment as this one is. He thought they had to be able to be committed to the organization and be willing to stay a while and not use it as a stepping stone to someplace else. He said frankly, where you would go to find a better place than Novi to be a city manager. He said there are larger places, and he guessed in the minds of some managers bigger is better. He thought those were some of the characteristics, but commitment to the profession, technical knowledge and understanding, ability to manage and lead ability to be a leader and inspire staff to work at their highest level and reward that staff.

Mayor Pro Tem Staudt mentioned he has a very impressive list of minority and woman placements. He asked if that was a result of an effort on your behalf of looking for candidates that are minority and women or is this just a result of the applicants and talent pool which we had to work with. Mr. Slavin replied that is one of the questions he will ask each of you when we meet with you as to how or to whether that is something that you want us to pay attention to, they did not discriminate against anybody. He said we will if you have as a council a strong interest in that, then they will make an aggressive effort to make sure to have that diversity in your final groups to choose from earlier. He said earlier in his career, it was difficult because there were not as many people available or trained, since then it is not so difficult. He said there was a time not too many years ago, maybe four or five years ago when the five largest cities in the country with council/manager government, with maybe one exception, was run by women. He stated parenthetically, there was a time when the largest cities in the country, most of them none, council/manager, police chiefs were women. He said things have changed. He did a quick check of their placements over the last three years in terms of women and minorities, placements, and in the last three years, the percentage of minority and women placements in the city manager searches that they conducted was something like 60% and that was not necessarily because we had to make a strong effort to do it. He said it was because people were available and qualified and interested.

Member Crawford said he had no further questions. Thank you.

Member Thomas wondered how many candidates they expect that we would see and what types of information would we be provided with and would we know everything that you know about each candidate. Mr Slavin said everything I have on your behalf is yours. He said you need to be a little careful about premature providing knowledge of who is applying because we will get people to unless we can provide some kind of confidential environment they want and if we betray that then they will quit, they will pull out. He asked her to repeat the first part of her questions again, please. Member Thomas repeated her question regarding how many candidate would he expect then to see, and then what types of information we would get once we had narrowed down your candidates. He suspected that Council would get about 50. He said they would screen them on the first screening and that would be based on the criteria that Council established, which is being that recruitment profile and that would probably get that down to something less than 20. He said they have a progress meeting scheduled in this process. He explained the primary purpose of that meeting is to bring to you those folks who we think are best qualified, who have an interest in the job will want to sit with you and talk about them. He said they would provide their resume and cover letter. He said at that point, they will have had them complete a very detailed supplemental questionnaire, which is a document that they have a written titled exactly or directly to your profile, it is not something they pull off a shelf and give to the candidate, you would see that the background work would not have been done at that point. He said we would have done a Google search or something like that background work we do when after you choose the finalists. He stated then they do detailed work. He said you would see at that meeting, again, cover letters submitted by the candidate, a summary resume that they put together that allow you to see heir background and on one sheet, a full resume that they have provided to them as a supplemental questionnaire that he just described, and there would be what he called a mate qualifications matrix that would have each of those , say there is 122 of them on one sheet of paper. He said it will have the criteria that you set on the one axis and the candidate's qualifications on the other. He said they would see that and it makes it easier to look at it to view them and he guessed at that meeting will asked you to narrow that group to the ones that you are most interested in. He said those are the ones that they go into doing the detail background work on.

Member Smith wondered given that you do not have a presence in Michigan, with the meetings that you have with Council and staff will they be primarily Zoom meetings, or would you have people in person here. Mr. Slavin said he liked Zoom meetings, and they had to use them a lot during the pandemic, he found them very useful. He said they will do a lot of preliminary interviewing of candidates over Zoom. He stated one of the things that they have been doing is recording those and providing those Zoom recordings to you folks at the progress meeting. He said they would be the one here in person for the meetings. There is no way to duplicate that. He said you might have seen in their proposal, we do on site visits with finalist candidates, they go to them. He said nobody knows why there are there, but they are looking for a lot of things. He said they are interviewing them, but they are looking at how they interact with the people that they encounter while we are there, many of them. He said they would like to be in their work environment where we are looking at interaction between the candidate and people

that they work with, people who work for them. He said what is in their mind is not just getting the answers to questions, technical questions, but seeing how they interact with the people they work with. He said they cannot always do that, and COVID put a real crimp in that process, but they get a lot of insight that we would not otherwise have. He said we think one of the reasons that we have been so successful, and placing people in city manager jobs that last more than the average five years and he believed part of the reason we have not had to honor that two-year guarantee is because they are pretty sure by the time they present these people to you that they meet your criteria. Member Smith thanked him for his response.

Member Fischer said he had no further questions.

Member Casey said her last question for the evening she wondered if he could tell them about a time or times where you had to manage significant differences of opinion among your clients. She asked what the situation was and what actions did they take, and what was the result. He replied that it is a very difficult part of their job, and he found that a lot of Council's more frequently now than earlier, have agendas that are a little different from each other, but that does not mean that you cannot find some way to bring collaboration. He said is there is a major difference, if it will keep us from being able to honor the council's goal desire, then we will have to come to you folks as a group and say we have got to vote on this. He said it is very simple, it has happened to him twice. He stated both times he had to deal with part of a council wanting to include a requirement that excluded purposely to somebody they did not want to apply. He said in both cases, it was the same one of them was in Michigan, the other was in Florida. He said he did come back to those, one was a county, and one was a city, and came back to the full board and say, half of you said you want this and the other almost half said you want that, he said he cannot do both. He asked them what do you want, and they talked about it, and decided, then gave him the direction he needed. He said he did not know that they ever agree with each other. He stated in both cases, we were able to come to consensus about a candidate, a finalist candidate and hired them, and that person stayed. He said recently there was division and it was a county division and the board had to do with half the board. He stated more than half of the board, three new members have a five member board resenting the fact that not liking the other two members that no dislike so much of his concern about the political differences, they could not resolve. He said that has still not been resolved and whether or not he will continue to help them is up to them. He said they need to get their act together before they need to. He said they need to come to some kind of way of dealing with each other in a way that would produce a candidate that at least most of them can support right now. He said it was a three, two, and nobody would take the job on a three, two.

Mayor Gatt said we believe that this is the most important job that City Council has, and it doesn't happen very often, thank goodness. He said when it does happen, the Council has an awesome decision to make that will impact not only several hundred employees, but 63,000 residents and you know, half a million or more visitors every month. He asked if he was prepared to give it 100%, all the time, and give us the best candidates that he could find. Mr. Slavin said absolutely, and will not do it otherwise, we will devote our full

effort to doing it. He wished that Dave could have been there that evening, but one of the things that Dave can do is really developed candidates. He said we just did Kettering, Ohio. He said he answered your questions previously that he would be here every time you needed him. He said he would have been there every time with Dave, but they fell in love with him and Dave gave them 100%. He said it was not anything that he did not do, but it was that they had basically done their own search consultant. What they got was exactly somebody who had not applied until we encouraged him more than once they wanted him. He said it was a process that resulted in them hiring a candidate who they wanted all from the beginning and who so far is thriving there. He stated if they run into any problems and our ability to give you what you want, you will hear about it, we will want to talk to you about it. He did not anticipate that if he was alive, and if Dave is alive, and Randi Frank is also in this proposal. He said Randi is one of the most tenacious recruiters he has ever met. He said she spends about 100% of the time, he did not know how anybody has as much times as she must do to devote to this work, but she is tenacious and thorough. He said the answer to your questions would be yes. He said they understood the importance of it, they have been doing this for a long time. He said one of the things they were most proud of is that they do help communities thrive. He said this is not something he could have run a major search practice for a large private sector recruitment firm. He said he did not want to do that he wanted to do this work. He said one of the reasons he wanted to do it was because he was proud of the work the results of the work that they do.

Mayor Gatt thanked him for his candidacy and his answers to Councils questions. They were all very succinct and comprehensive, they appreciated it.

Mayor Gatt said they heard the two firms that our City staff has brought to us for interviews. He said he would open it up now to Council for discussion and or any motions.

Member Smith said just based solely, and he thought both candidates were excellent, but based solely on the locality, he moved that we hire Amy Cell, LLC for the Executive Search Firm consultant.

CM 23-01-006 Moved by Smith, seconded by Thomas; MOTION DENIED: 5-2

Approval of Amy Cell, LLC for the Executive Search Firm consultant.

Mayor Gatt said they had a motion to hire Amy Cell, LLC and they have a second, we have support. He said he would lead in the discussion. He thought both firms presented very well, and they gave us a lot of reasons why they thought they would be good; they would be acceptable. He could not support the motion for one reason. He said maybe this is the cop in him. He said we all got packets of information regarding both candidates, and he knew one fact, her information was not accurate. He said she said there was information that was not accurate and he did not understand that. He said he could not support a candidate who gave them information that when questioned about it admits that it was not accurate. He said it was half, it was not just a little bit of a

discrepancy. He said he could not support the motion just based on their further discussion.

Mayor Pro Tem Staudt said he just happened to see that. He was surprised that there were 60 qualified applicants for any position. He said one of the things that we find it more and more difficult to Michigan is to find somebody here in Michigan, who is qualified to take on a city like Novi, those who are out there in larger cities are not going to move down. He said cities like you know, our previous city manager came from Auburn Hills, very dynamic economic development community, but he came in the second round. He said it was very difficult to find applicants that he thought were qualified in Michigan, then it is going to be even harder now. He said one of the benefits of somebody like Mr. Slavin is that he has staked a national view. He thought Novi deserves to at least cast and net nationally and see if there is somebody out there who is interested in an opportunity to come to a community that can really do something with. He said we are going to have several good Michigan candidates, and probably one from our own ranks here. He said he was not so worried about Michigan, everybody in Michigan knows who Novi is, if they want to come here, they will apply. He thought casting the net nationally, is a big advantage. He also liked the fact that they showed a lot of minority and women placements, which he did not think was really discussed by the previous presenter. He said potentially they did very well, but you know, we are a city that is extremely diverse. He said we heard earlier that evening, we have a large segment of women and we need to cast the net. He said if he remembered correctly, they had maybe one woman applicant interviewed with them in the past. He thought it was important that we look out there, we need to look at all the applicants and really cast a wide net and see what the future of Novi looks like. He said that we can do that by placing that position with somebody who is a minority or a woman. He thought that was a strong qualification of Mr. Slavin and frankly he would support him.

Member Crawford said he thought we would be well served by either of those applicants. He said both impressed him for different reason. He was not hung up on the 60 qualified applicants, he thought it was just a matter of interpretation on how they put it down. He just wanted to put that on the record. He thought both are extremely qualified and would serve the city of Novi well.

Member Thomas echoed the previous speaker, she thought they were both qualified applicants. They came in and they did a good job. She thought Amy Cell presented better. She felt like she had a clearer understanding of her vision of what she would be doing for our city. She felt the qualified applicants was a simple issue, that did not bother her. She said she preferred Amy Cell, but she thought the candidate were qualified.

Member Fischer said he was very impressed with both candidates. He said not often does he sit there and say he would take either, usually, he felt like he was the person who says we need to go back out and try again. He was impressed with both. He thought for many of the reasons that Mayor Pro Tem listed, his referred candidate would be Mr. Slavin and his firm to meet the geographic reach that he thought he had coming from outside of

Michigan is a large benefit. He said for that reason he would not support this motion, but he would be apt to approve Mr. Slavin as the candidate that evening.

Member Casey said she was very impressed with both candidates, it is a luxury for us to have she thought as Member Fischer was alluding to, to have two solid candidates in front of us. She thought the challenge for her is that she thought they both did a fantastic job. She thought for her is just the depth and breadth of experience in doing municipal searches, this is not an easy job to hire for. She thought the amount of experience in doing searches like this for cities of our size with our assets, as was mentioned earlier, she thought it was something that Mr. Slavin and his team have that depth of experience she thought was critical to us for our success. She thanked both candidates, but again, she did not think she could support the motion on the table as it stood right now.

Roll call vote on CM 23-01-006

Yeas: Smith, Thomas

Nays: Crawford, Fischer, Gatt, Staudt, Casey

Member Fischer moved to direct City staff to go ahead and retain Slavin Management Consultants for the City Manager search support.

CM 23-01-007

Moved by Fischer, seconded by Staudt; CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Approval of Slavin Management Consultants for the Executive Search Firm consultant.

Roll call vote on CM 23-01-007

**Yeas: Fischer, Smith, Thomas, Gatt, Staudt,
Casey, Crawford**

Nays: None

Mayor Gatt congratulated Mr. Slavin. He said everyone was impressed with Amy Cell's presentation and that they wished her the very best.

MATTERS FOR COUNCIL ACTION:

1. Approval of resolution to authorize Budget Amendment #2023-3.

CM 23-01-008

Moved by Thomas, seconded by Smith; CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Approval of Resolution to Authorize Budget Amendment #2023-3.

Roll call vote on CM 23-01-008

**Yeas: Smith, Thomas, Gatt, Staudt, Casey,
Crawford, Fischer**

Nays: None

2. Consideration of approval to award the Janitorial Services contract to RNA Facilities Management in the amount of \$182,743.64 for a one (1) year contract with the option of two (2) one-year renewals.

Interim City Manager Cardenas said this is the same company we have had for the last few years.

CM 23-01-009 Moved by Smith, seconded by Casey; CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Approval to award the Janitorial Services contract to RNA Facilities Management in the amount of \$182,743.64 for a one (1) year contract with the option for two (2) one-year renewals.

Roll call vote on CM 23-01-009

**Yeas: Thomas, Gatt, Staudt, Casey,
Crawford, Fischer, Smith
Nays: None**

- 3. Consideration of approval to award the construction contract to Fonson Company, Inc., the low bidder, for the Lakeshore Park Tunnel Replacement project, in the amount of \$601,961 and amend the budget.**

Interim City Manager Cardenas stated that we will keep you up to speed on this whole process as we are replacing a very important spot and infrastructure of our community. He said they hope to have this done by the time the beach opens, they are keeping their fingers crossed.

Member Smith said he would like to enthusiastically move to approve this. He thought Lake Shore Park is a gem, and that tunnel needs replacement. Hopefully it will be completed for the beach opening.

CM 23-01-010 Moved by Smith, seconded by Thomas; CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Approval to award the construction contract to Fonson Company, Inc., the low bidder, for the Lakeshore Park Tunnel Replacement project, in the amount of \$601,961, and amend the budget.

Mayor Pro Tem Staudt asked PRCS Director Muck to come down to the podium, he said he had a few questions to ask him. He asked if we are going to replace the wash station that was not ADA compliant when we put it in originally. PRCS Director Muck replied yes, that is part of the scope, including fixing the drainage and expand that footprint to make. He said we were going to have something there that somebody in a wheelchair could use.

Member Fischer directed this question to PRCS Director Muck. He said it was his understanding that the road will be closed in that area for the duration of this construction project which is basically March, April and May is that correct. He wondered if we're reaching out to the residents in advance. He wondered what the plan is there. PRCS Director Muck said yes, he believed we are going to be having all of the normal communication efforts that we do for all of our road projects, that is creating a Facebook

page just for the residents affected by that. He said we will be getting information out there to all the residents and you know, he is just letting everyone know, not just through Facebook and through mailers, but also set up a text system over there as well through reverse 911. He said all our channels will be open for this project.

Roll call vote on CM 23-01-010

**Yeas: Gatt, Staudt, Casey, Crawford, Fischer,
Smith, Thomas**

Nays: None

4. Consideration of a resolution to create a Public Safety Building Needs Committee.

Mayor Gatt said before he opened up the Council, there was a couple things he wanted to talk about. He said this is a committee that we talked about a couple of meetings ago. He stated it was approved then to do the resolution to have a committee and the City Charter says that the Mayor appoints to these standing committees. He noted that there were some comments made in audience comment and he usually does not address those, but he said he was going to here, because frankly, he was taken aback by it. He commented that he did not realize that they were all men on this committee. He wanted to point that out, he could justify every member of this committee as being experts in their field. He stated that is what he looks at, not gender, race, color, politics, he looks at what can the member of the committee do to add to the committee. He added that there is going to be several female members that Mr. Cardenas will bring with them as advisors to the committee, staff members. He said last, but not least, is that the committee is just an advisory committee, they do not make any decisions. He said the decisions are brought back to the City Council table for any move forward or halting in what they do. He apologized if he stepped on any toes, it certainly was not his intention, he did not even think about it. He said if you stick around for the next time on the agenda, you will see that he asked to form yet another committee and is just as important as our building safety needs, which is woefully lacking, but that is our older adult needs in the community. He said he already appointed to that if the Council approves, and you will find that there are five women out of seven on that one. He reiterated that he did not look at race, color, or creed, or gender when he appointed, he was only looking at the experts in the field of what we are studying that he knew of, and he certainly is no engineer, lawyer, or doctor. He said Council did approve the nature of this committee a couple of meetings ago. He said tonight, he would ask for your support in the people that we put on the committee is myself, Mayor Pro Tem Staudt, and Member Fischer. He said Dave Landry needed no introduction. He said Dave Landry is probably a 30-to-40-year resident of Novi, he is an esteemed attorney, he was mayor for three terms, was on city council for a couple of terms before that, well known and will be able to give us much advice. He said Dave Molloy does not need any introduction or explanation. He was as you know, a 30 year veteran police officer, he still works for a police type agency. He was the police chief, director of public safety here for many years, and will add much needed expertise. Ted Zuchlewski is a 40- or 45-year resident of Novi, his specialty in his working career, was building buildings, not actual builder, but designing and studying and he built probably every 7-11 store in the United States as of 13 years ago. Mr. Scott Olson is a former law

enforcement person, a long-term Novi resident, a very big proponent of both our police and fire community here and he will add much to the committee.

CM 23-01-011 Moved by Staudt, seconded by Crawford; CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Approval to adopt the attached resolution and Mayoral appointments to the resulting Committee or task force.

Member Casey said when she was looking at the words of the resolution, when she read paragraph four, section four, it describes a process that our Council does not typically follow when appointing advisory committees and the way that the process is written in the document it talks about the fact that the committee shall elect a chairperson or shall choose a chairperson and secretary from among its members. She said generally when we have committees that contain councilmembers that are advisory committees to council. She said the Mayor appoints not just the members, but he also appoints the chair of the committee. She asked City Attorney Schultz if they could remove that language in section four and leave it up to our normal process, or does she have to have language to replace this process in section four that documents that the Mayor does the appointments with the approval of Council and that appointment includes the appointment of a chair. City Attorney Schultz stated that is the pleasure of Council, after discussion of your point, you could approve this resolution with that amendment and we would take care of that administratively. Member Casey had a quick follow up on that. She wondered if they can't just agree to strike the language we need to replace it. City Attorney Schultz thought that as long as the motion makes clear what the tension is with the language, we can figure out what to do with it. Member Casey thanked him for his response. She suggested to the Mayor, she would seek to get feedback from her colleagues and then look to have hopefully the maker of the motion, accept that amendment.

Mayor Pro Tem Staudt asked if he could speak. He mentioned that he was on a lot of committees that the chair was not designated by the mayor. He said a perfect example was Consultant Review Committee. He did not remember ever being appointed by the mayor as the chair of that committee, and he has been on it for about 14 years. He understood his intent here is that there may be somebody on the committee that has more time to dedicate to being in a leadership role, and that committee should make that decision. He did not believe that we have a solid precedent that the mayor has to appoint a chair to a committee. He said we may have done that in the past in some committees, but that was at our discretion. He said most of our committees, he did not remember him designating anybody as the chair. He doesn't, he said maybe he was wrong, but he thought that was something that we would want to leave up to the committee. He said this is a high-powered group of people. He meant, with ex-mayors, ex-police chiefs. He said if it was up to him, he would appoint the Mayor as the chairman of the committee, but he did not know if that is necessary at this point.

Member Fischer said he wanted some clarification on the process there. He asked City Attorney Schultz or City Clerk Hanson one of them could remind him what the process

was on two recent committees they created, the Recreation Committee, which is was not part of, and the Roads Committee. He said in his opinion those would be the closest to this committee. Mayor Gatt asked if he could interject. He said he could remember because he appointed himself as the chair of the Recreation Committee, and he appointed Laura Casey as the chair of the Roads Committee. Member Fischer guessed out of precedent, he would prefer to see the Mayor go ahead and make these kind of ad hoc standard committees that he has requested, to see him go ahead and make those chair appointments. He thought when it comes to our council committees, CIP all that is fine. He said we do not do that, we kind of go on whoever has been there the longest and that is in our rules. He said these kinds of committees that he would prefer to see the Mayor go ahead and do that. He would ask for the maker of the motion to go ahead and change the motion.

Mayor Pro Tem Staudt said he would leave it up to the Mayor, because he did not have any preference one way or the other. He has been here longest other than the Mayor and we have done it both ways for many years. He said it would be up to the Mayor, but frankly, he would ask him to be the chairman of that committee, if he was on that committee. He said if you are asking him to appoint himself as the committee chair, he thought that was kind of unusual, but he was willing to make the motion change only if the Mayor agreed to it.

Mayor Gatt said he was going to agree to it only because he will not be the Mayor forever. He thought that the Mayor when making these kinds of appointments, would always appoint a councilmember to be a chair of that committee because as he said earlier, this is just an advisory committee and the four members of the public that are selected for this committee or any other committee, they are there to help, to loan their expertise. He said if somebody from City Council should chair the committee, because that committee is coming back to City Council eventually with a recommendation one way or the other. He agreed with Member Fischer completely these kinds of committees that we appoint on the go. He believed that whoever the mayor is should have the ability to appoint a chair of the committee. He stated everybody has one vote on that committee, it is not like the chair has three votes, it is somebody to organize, and direct somebody to call the time limit when the time has come. He believed that it should be a councilmember or the mayor, whoever sits in that chair.

Mayor Pro Tem Staudt said he was the motion maker. He stated he would be willing to change the motion to make the Mayor, the chair of the committee.

Member Fischer asked that the staff change the resolution and reflect that, he would just put that in the resolution, that the Mayor is the chair of the committee.

City Attorney Schultz assumed this was going to come up at the second resolution as well, which has the same language. He noted the motion maker could amend the original motion to ask the Clerk's office to revise the resolution to state that the Mayor will appoint the chair. He said the group will elect the secretary as the language says and leave the rest the same. He said it would be a minor amendment to the first part of that sentence

identified by Member Casey, that the Mayor will appoint the chair. He said when you are done with this motion, if it passes, the Mayor will do the appointment, presumably, of the Mayor.

Mayor Pro Tem Staudt asked City Attorney Schultz if that is agreeable. City Attorney Schultz replied yes. Mayor Pro Tem Staudt said he would support that motion.

AMENDED MOTION A

CM 23-01-011 Moved by Staudt, seconded by Crawford; CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Approval to adopt the attached resolution and Mayoral appointments to the resulting Committee or task force and that the Mayor will appoint the Chair and Mayoral appointments to the resulting Committee or task force.

Member Crawford said he seconded the motion, and that he would support the amendment. He pointed out that somebody hit on it previously that there is a difference in a City Council standing committee, and these other ad hoc committees by City Council, he explained City Council standing committees will usually select the chairperson at a committee meeting. He said the ad hoc he believed was totally proper for the Mayor to appoint a chair. He said that was the difference.

Member Smith wanted to confirm they were still discussing the original matter, the original motion. Mayor Gatt confirmed this was discussion on the original motion. Member Smith said he fully supported this committee, he thought we owe the Fire Department and Police Department as much support as we can give them. He thought we also are at some point going to be asking the City for a fairly significant buy in. He believed we need to go above and beyond to make sure that the City is involved and the residents are involved. He understood that finding police and fire officers is getting more difficult every year, and retention is getting difficult. He said he has had members and residents ask him what is going on with Fire Station 4 and he knew it was beyond the scope of this proposed committee. He said he would like at some point, have a committee that looks at police and fire compensation retention. He said his second point here is and this is kind of proofreading I point for the resolution, it states this committee shall meet regularly as necessary to complete its tasks within the timeframe established. He did not see a timeframe established anywhere in the resolution. He thought we should either strike that language or add the timeframe. Thirdly, and he said this goes by getting the vein of the residents, he would like to have regular reports from this committee, to City Council, to keep them informed. He wanted to keep the people that are out there watching and attending here informed to what is going on with this process. He believed that will be critical for getting the City to eventually buy into any building that we propose. Lastly, he said this goes towards getting residents buying as well.

CM 23-01-012 Moved by Smith, seconded by Thomas; MOTION WITHDRAWN

Approval to postpone until the February 27, 2023 City Council meeting to be able to meet the two residents for the committee.

Member Smith said it is nothing against Mr. Olson and Mr. Zuchlewski, but he would like to make a motion to table this item until we can hear from the residents that are being proposed as members of this committee, he said the Mayor knows them. He said he has not heard anything from them, and he assumed a lot of people in the audience probably haven't either. He said again, this is nothing against those two gentlemen, but he would like to follow our normal procedure of having public interviews of people that are coming before us to be appointed to commission. Mayor Gatt asked Member Smith is he was making a motion to delay. Member Smith said he was making a motion to delay until our February 27 meeting and hopefully be able to bring those two gentlemen in and hear what they have to say and then either approve or deny.

Mayor Gatt said we had a motion and support. Mayor Gatt said if he understood it correctly, Member Smith made a motion to delay this first motion and bring the members that the Mayor appoints to the podium, is that correct. Member Smith said yes. City Attorney Schultz said he wanted to make one point that, and he understood Member Smith's comment, but sometimes when the Mayor makes appointments, it is with the approval of City Council. He stated the resolution that you are proposing to vote on, does not have the approval of City Council language. He said it is simply a Mayoral appointment, so there would not be the typical interview process.

Member Smith said he would withdraw his motion then because it was out of order. There were no objections.

Member Thomas commented that she approved of what they were trying to do, everyone has the utmost respect, and we want to make sure that our Fire and Police Departments have everything that they need. She knew that the Council has a great deal of support and respect for those people. She was concerned when she looked at this and there were no women on it. She said when it was initially discussed, they had talked about the lack of resources for women in the current Fire Stations that are available. She said she felt like not having voting members of the committee who are women was problematic. She said it appears that there is a lack of diversity and she felt like we are going to have to get a great deal of the community buy in. She believed it was important that we allow the community to participate in this process. She said we have a lot of highly educated, well qualified people and she thought that it was a problem to not give them the opportunity to apply for these positions and to contribute. She wanted her concerns on the record. She said she was also sure it is not the case, but the original proposal had a very specific plan, and she thought some people might perceive that this is the committee is being built as a stamp to let that plan move forward rather than making sure that we are doing the homework and making sure whatever decision it comes to is the right decision. She said she is not saying that it is the case, but she believed even the appearance of possible impropriety or not doing our homework or rubber stamping is also problematic. She thought this very much needed to be done. She said she would not say that she will not support it, but most certainly would like to see

the community members to be able to have that ability to apply to be part of the process. She believed if we were going to ask the community for a lot of money to support it, then we should definitely have that buy in from the beginning. She said she wanted to make a motion; she have never done this before so she said please help her for any issues that might arise. She made a motion that we change the resolution so that the Council appointments go through the normal process, Mayoral appointment with City Council approval.

AMENDED MOTION B

CM 23-01-011 Moved by Thomas, seconded by Smith; MOTION DENIED: 5-2

Approval to amend the original amended motion to change the resolution from a Mayoral appointment to a Council appointment.

Member Fischer pointed out that they already had a motion on the floor. City Attorney Schultz said this would be considered a motion to amend the formally amended original motion to change the resolution from a Mayoral appointment to a Council appointment.

Mayor Pro Tem Staudt said he would not support that as a motion maker.

Mayor Gatt said they had a motion and support to amend the original motion, the original discussion on the amendment.

Roll call vote on CM 23-01-011
AMENDED MOTION B

Yeas: Smith, Thomas
Nays: Casey, Crawford, Fischer, Gatt, Staudt

Mayor Gatt said we go back to the original motion. He said before he asked you to call the roll he wanted to say something. He commented this has been an eye-opening experience that evening. He stated there was no ill intention on anybody's part. He said we have dramatic public safety building needs in this community. He stated we are going to study the issue. He mentioned all the meetings will be published and any member of the public will be invited to be part of the meeting. He noted there will be audience participation just like we have at these meetings.

Roll call vote on CM 23-01-011
AMENDED MOTION A

Yeas: Staudt, Casey, Crawford, Fischer, Smith, Thomas, Gatt
Nays: None

City Attorney Schultz suggested to the Mayor that it would be a good time to make the appointments that are listed in the staff report and presumably with yourself as the Chair.

Mayor Gatt announced Mayor Gatt will be the chair, Mayor Pro Tem Staudt will be on the committee, Member Fischer will be on the committee, David Landry, David Molloy, Ted Zuchlewski, and Scott Olson will be on the committee.

5. Consideration of a resolution to create an Older Adults Needs Committee.

Mayor Gatt thought that they may have put the cart before the horse on this one. He believed they needed a motion first to create a resolution because we did not talk about this at our meeting two meetings ago if he remembered correctly. He thought we should first determine whether Council wants a resolution to form a committee for this purpose to study the older adult needs in Novi.

Mayor Pro Tem Staudt mentioned they have talked about this for years, not weeks or months, but years. He believed this is an opportunity for us to get a committee of council members and community interested folks, get them focused on this and make a decision once and for all, whether or not we are going to separate Older Adult Services from our Parks and Recreation Department. He moved to approve the resolution establishing a City Council Older Needs Committee that has provided in the packet support.

CM 23-01-014 Moved by Staudt, seconded by Crawford; CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Approval to amend the original resolution to ask the Clerk's office to revise the resolution to state that the Mayor will appoint the Chair and Mayoral appointments to the resulting Committee.

Member Fischer asked the maker of the motion if they could go ahead and amend the resolution similar to the last one to allow for the Mayor to make the chairperson appointments. Mayor Pro Tem Staudt said whatever the last one was, we can incorporate into this one.

Mayor Gatt asked if they had a second. Member Crawford said yes, he seconded the motion. He asked if that would eliminate line five on page two of the resolution. Member Fischer replied we will change line five.

Member Fischer agreed that this has been a long time coming. He spoke with PRCS Director Muck a little bit about it earlier today. He said one thing that he thought was important for this committee, he did not want staff to think that this is anything going kind of a slight towards them or anything. He viewed this committee as Council deciding if you know, the time, the resources, the staff, the money is enough of a priority. He thought that needs to be decided up at the council table. He thought that the staff thus far has done a tremendous job with all the adult services, they have done everything that we have asked, they have stretched every dollar. He said to him this is about seeing if Novi really wants to go to that next level. He thought we do, but he thought that what the committee really needs to search into. He said the key to him was just to make sure that staff, does not see this as a slide or anything like that. He said this is really about City Council prioritizing the next level and the next generation of Older Adult Services. He said it was just a clarification from his perspective. Thank you.

Mayor Gatt wanted to put his two cents on the record. He agreed with everything Member Fischer just said. He said this is certainly not just the opposite of a slate on our staff. He said our former City Manager did a study, he gave us report, he believed at his last meeting and if he heard him correctly, he thought that the Novi older adult

community needs are being met in Novi. He thought in fact, he heard him say that we are ahead of a lot of different cities. He said he did not agree with him, and he thought that he has been part of Novi's history for almost 50 years now and he could tell you that it was a different town. He said it was a different time and it was different population as far as numbers. He thought we have slowed down in our way in the way we service our older adults. He said he would personally would like to see an Older Adult Department, headed by a manager that is his or her only focus. He said what he hoped a committee would come up with. He stated when you see the members of the committee that he has appointed, you will find that there are people that want nothing more than to move Novi forward in this area, our housing is lacking for older adults. He said we have an opportunity maybe to do something in that regard. He remembered before Meadowbrook Commons was here everybody talked about this, and talked about that, and finally we did it He said it is filled, and certainly our population has grown immensely since Meadowbrook Commons has opened up, we have a lot to do. He said our staff today is doing an excellent job with what they have, maybe the answer is they need more staff. Maybe the answer is a whole different department. He said maybe Mr. Auger was right and we don't need anything, he did not know. He said he knew that this committee is going to be charged with really looking into it, and then coming back to Council with their recommendations. He agreed, it is going to cost money. He said this Council will have to wrestle with that dilemma, or the taxpayers will, it will depend on what is requested. He said he looked at this as an opportunity, not as nothing negative about this. He felt that the staff is already doing a great job. His question was, can we do more, and if we can do more, what do we need to do to do more.

Member Thomas asked if this would be replacing the existing Older Adult Services Board, or would it be an addition to it. Mayor Gatt said it was not replacing anything. Member Thomas asked what would delineate the responsibilities of one board versus the committee. Mayor Gatt asked if Interim City Manager Cardenas or City Attorney Shultz could answer her question. Interim City Manager Cardenas explained the current Older Adult Advisory Board is a debt in its name itself. He said it advises the person committee, the Parks Commission, and it's a committee under that body. He stated so by this resolution, be creating your own evaluation or a committee that would just over evaluate the whole services of older adults in the community and he guessed study future expansion or creation of a new department. He thought that is where the delineation lies is when it just simply advises, this will be more of a study and in fact finding.

Member Smith thought it was probably a good time to look at this. He was reluctant to admit this, but he will be 64 this year, and he fell into the older adult category. He said his parents also live in Novi will be 96 and 92, their needs are vastly different than his needs. He said it is not just your stereotypical play bingo kind of thing anymore. He said we need to look at that broad range of people. He said he would support this motion.

Mayor Pro Tem Staudt stated we do not know who your appointments are to this group is yet. He said residents may not realize they all serve on a bunch of different committees. He said one of the responsibilities of the Mayor is to make sure that they do not get overburdened by showing up having committee meetings that are five times a week on

10 different committees. He said it is important that the two committees we are appointing that evening are probably two of the most important during his time on Council. He thought it is important, it is a tough decision. He said he would love to be on this committee, he has a lot of input on it, but in this situation he was going to respect the Mayor's decision because he has a good idea of the bandwidth we have available, and the skill level of the folks he is going to appoint.

Mayor Gatt asked City Attorney Schultz if he should call the names of the committee at this point on vote on this resolution first. City Attorney Schultz said he could inform the council who he intended to appoint, but you could also wait until after. Mayor Gatt said before we vote he would in case this generates discussion. He announced for the Older Adults Needs Committee he appointed Member Laura Casey to chairperson, Member Erica Thomas, Member Brian Smith, and the four residents will be Kathy Crawford, Kim Nice, Debbie Wrobel, and Parks Commission, Mr. Jay Dooley. He said those four members of the public have agreed to sit on this committee, and they will bring much expertise and background to it.

Roll call vote on CM 23-01-014

Yeas: Crawford, Fischer, Smith, Thomas, Gatt, Staudt, Casey

Nays: None

CONSENT AGENDA REMOVALS FOR COUNCIL ACTION:

- B. Approval to award Great Lakes Power and Lighting the Civic Center LED lighting retrofit project in the amount of \$65,594.16.

Member Smith wanted to thank the staff for getting this done, the replacement of the lights in the building here with LEDs. He said it was an example of both how we can be both financially and environmentally sustainable. He said it looked like the payoff is going to be in two to three years. He said we are saving 25% to 35% of energy and the associated CO2 emissions. He said that with that he moved to approve this item.

CM 23-01-015 Moved by Staudt, seconded by Casey; CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Approval to award Great Lakes Power and Lighting the Civic Center LED lighting retrofit project in the amount of \$65,594.16.

Roll call vote on CM 23-01-015

Yeas: Fischer, Smith, Thomas, Gatt, Staudt, Casey, Crawford

Nays: None

AUDIENCE COMMENT:

Dr. Ajay Raman thanked the Mayor and City Council and our wonderful City Administrators. He said he has had the pleasure of meeting and interacting with most of you over the last couple of years. He just wanted to take a quick minute and officially

introduce himself as the new Oakland County Commissioner of the 14th District. He said he represented Wixom, Walled Lake, portions of Novi and a portion of Commerce Township. He looked forward to attending many more meetings, participating in any way that he can and contributing in any way that he can. He asked that they consider him as a resource. He stated he looked forward to working with all of you for the next two years. He said if there was anything he could do to continue assisting, supporting, and representing the residents here in Novi, it would be his honor and pleasure to do so. He just wanted to say thank you.

Mayor Gatt thanked him and said congratulations.

COMMITTEE REPORTS: None

MAYOR AND COUNCIL ISSUES: None

ADJOURNMENT – There being no further business to come before Council, the meeting was adjourned at 8:57 P.M.

Cortney Hanson, City Clerk

Robert J. Gatt, Mayor

Transcribed by Deborah S. Aubry

Date approved: February 6, 2023