



CITY OF NORMAN, OK STAFF REPORT

MEETING DATE: 02/05/2024

REQUESTER: PRESTON O'BRIEN

PRESENTER: ANAIS STARR, PLANNER II

ITEM TITLE: (HD 23-46) CONSIDERATION OF APPROVAL, REJECTION, AMENDMENT, AND/OR POSTPONEMENT OF THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS REQUEST FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 1004 MILLER AVENUE FOR 1) THE REMOVAL OF DOOR OPENINGS ON THE NORTH AND SOUTH ELEVATIONS AND REPLACEMENT WITH EITHER WOOD LAP SIDING OR STUCCO; 2) REPLACEMENT OF EXISTING WOOD EXTERIOR WALL MATERIAL ON THE NORTH AND SOUTH SIDE ELEVATIONS WITH EITHER WOOD LAP SIDING OR STUCCO.

<u>Property Location</u>	1004 Miller Avenue Miller Historic District
---------------------------------	--

<u>Owner</u>	Kendall Helm
---------------------	---------------------

<u>Applicant</u>	Preston O'Brien, Point Properties Real Estate LLC
-------------------------	--

<u>Request</u>	(HD 23-46) Consideration of the Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 1004 Miller Avenue for 1) the removal of door openings on the north and south elevations and replacement with either wood lap siding or stucco; 2) replacement of existing wood exterior wall material on the north and south side elevations with either wood lap siding or stucco.
-----------------------	--

Property History

Historical Information

2004 Miller Historic District Nomination Survey Information:

1002-1004 South Miller Avenue. Ca. 1933. Tudor Revival. This contributing, one-story, brick, single dwelling was historically a duplex. The house has a brick foundation and a steeply-pitched, asphalt-covered, cross-gabled roof with a rear hipped. The wood windows are decorative, nine-over-one, hung and the wood doors are glazed paneled. One door is located on the facade and

the other is located on the south side. The full-width porch is uncovered with a concrete floor and short brick piers capped with concrete. There is a front, brick, interior, slope chimney. Decorative details include exposed rafters, double windows, stucco in the gable ends and extended gables. There is a weatherboard, two-car garage with a steeply-pitched, front-gabled roof with exposed rafters to the rear.

Sanborn Insurance Maps

The 1944 Sanborn Insurance Map shows the primary structure in its current location and footprint configuration. The map also shows a garage on the south property line which no longer exists indicating that the current garage was constructed post-1944.

Though the Sanborn Insurance Maps indicate that this structure was built as a duplex, it currently exist as a single-family structure.

Previous Actions

There have not been any Certificate of Appropriateness requests for this property.

Overall Project Description

The applicant is in the process of purchasing this property and would like to repair and improve the structure. As part of the proposed renovations, he would also like to improve the internal programming by removing the doors on the north and south elevations. It appears that the original rear porch areas were enclosed with walls along with doors and windows sometime after 1944. Most likely, these modifications were performed prior to 1997 when this property became part of the Miller Historic District. The applicant proposes to remove the doors in these two areas and replace with either five inch wood lap siding or stucco, both of which are found on the existing house. The remainder of the existing wall material would also be replaced with either five inch wood lap siding or stucco.

Reference - Historic District Ordinance

36-535.a.2 (g): *To safeguard the heritage of the City by preserving and regulating historic district structures in such a way that maintains or restores their historic integrity while allowing modern day uses and conveniences for their residents. (0-0910-12).*

Reference - Preservation Guidelines

Exterior Walls

3.2 Guidelines

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

.1 Preserve Original Walls. *Retain and preserve exterior walls that contribute to the overall historic form and character of a building, including functional and decorative features and details.*

.2 Retain Original Building Materials. *Retain and preserve exterior wall materials that contribute to the overall historic character of a building.*

.3 Replace Only Deteriorated Portions. *If replacement of a deteriorated wall or feature is necessary, replace only the deteriorated portion in-kind rather than the entire feature. Match the original in material, design, dimension, detail, texture, and pattern. Compatible substitute materials can be considered if in-kind replacement material are not available or feasible.*

.4 Avoid Covering Original Materials. Building materials and decorative elements are important character-defining components of historic buildings. It is not appropriate to remove or cover any wall material or detail with coatings or contemporary substitute materials. Vinyl and aluminum siding is not appropriate for use in historic districts.

.5 Replace Missing Features. When replacing an exterior wall or feature, replace it with a new wall or feature based on accurate documentation of the original or a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Compatible substitute materials can be considered if in-kind replacement material are not available or feasible.

.6 Avoid False Historical Appearances. Features or details of walls and fences that are introduced to a property shall reflect its style, period, and design. Fences and walls features shall not create a false historical appearance by reflecting other time periods, styles, or geographic regions of the country.

.7 Substitute Materials. Cement fiberboard (e.g. Hardiplank® siding) will be considered on a case-by-case basis. Exterior insulating and finish systems (EIFS) will not be considered for use in historic structures.

Wood Features

3.3 Guidelines

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

.1 Preserve Original Features. Retain and preserve wood features that contribute to the overall historic character of a building, including siding, shingles, cornices, brackets, pediments, columns, balustrades, and architectural trim.

.2 Replace Only Deteriorated Elements. If replacement of a deteriorated details or element of a wood feature is necessary, replace only the deteriorated detail or element in-kind rather than the entire feature. Match the original in design, dimension, texture, and material. Compatible substitute materials can be considered if in-kind replacement material are not available or feasible.

.3 Replace Missing Features. Replace missing wooden features based on accurate documentation of the missing original or a new design compatible in scale, size, material, and texture, with the style, period, and design of the historic building and the district as a whole. Compatible substitute materials can be considered if in-kind replacement material are not available or feasible.

.4 Avoid False Historical Appearances. Features or details that are introduced to a house shall reflect its style, period, and design. Features shall not create a false historical appearance by reflecting other time periods, styles, or geographic regions of the country.

Doors

3.14 Guidelines

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

.1 Retain and Preserve Original Doors. Retain and preserve original doors and door surrounds including frames, glazing, panels, sidelights, fanlights, surrounds, thresholds, and hardware on front doors and side doors visible from the street.

.2 Replace Only Deteriorated Features. If replacement of a deteriorated door feature or details is necessary, replace only the deteriorated feature in-kind rather than the entire unit.

.6 Wood Doors. Wood doors are required unless there is documentation that other materials were historically used on a particular structure. Keep wood doors appropriately stained or painted to protect from weather.

.8 Preserve Original Openings. Do not create new openings in the front or side façades of historic structures. Do not enlarge or diminish existing openings to fit stock door sizes. If new openings are necessary to meet code requirements, they shall be compatible with historic doors for that structure in proportion, shape, location, pattern, size, materials, and details.

.9 Materials. Wood is allowable for in-kind replacement of doors. Fiberglass and aluminum-clad doors can be considered on non-contributing resources and on rear elevations of historic structures when not visible from the front right-of-way. Vinyl is prohibited for historic and non-contributing structures.

Staff Comments

Request #1) Removal of door openings on the north and south elevations and replacement with either wood lap siding or stucco.

This property is located on a corner and per *Preservation Guidelines* is considered to have two front facades. The *Guidelines* discourage the alteration to original historic elements on front and side elevations, especially those that are visible from the street right-of-way. However, as indicated previously, these two sections of the house are modern day modifications and are not original to this structure.

The prior modifications to this house provide for awkward internal programming which the applicant is now trying to improve while still abiding by *Preservation Guidelines*. The removal of original openings on historic structures is strongly discouraged by the *Guidelines*. However, as indicated above the original openings have been modified significantly and it is not clear if these current door openings are located where the original openings would have been.

Given that the original exterior for these two sections of this historic structure have previously been modified significantly, and given that the *Guidelines* allow for modern-day conveniences, it may be appropriate to permit the removal of these non-original door openings.

The Commission would need to determine if the removal of these two door openings and replacement with either wood lap siding or stucco is appropriate for this historic structure and compatible with the District as a whole.

Commission Action: Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of the Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 1004 Miller Avenue for 1) the removal of door openings on the north and south elevations and replacement with either wood lap siding or stucco.

Request #2) Replacement of existing wood exterior wall material on the north and south side elevations with either wood lap siding or stucco.

While the *Preservation Guidelines* encourage the retention of original wall material, as indicated above, the existing deteriorated areas are not original to the house. Matching the existing brick

is not possible and the *Guidelines* advise against creating a “false historical” appearance. Staff would note that replacement of the existing wood wall material with identical material is allowable under the “ordinary maintenance and repair” section of the Historic District Ordinance. The proposed wood lap siding or stucco would be an improvement over the existing mix of wood sheeting and wood beadboard that is present currently on the elevations. Both of the proposed wall materials are listed as appropriate materials in the *Guidelines*.

The Commission would need to determine if the replacement of the existing wood wall material with either wood lap siding or stucco would be appropriate for this historic structure and compatible with the District as a whole.

Commission Action: Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of the Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 1004 Miller Avenue for 2) replacement of existing wood exterior wall material on the north and south side elevations with either wood lap siding or stucco.