



CITY OF NORMAN, OK STAFF REPORT

MEETING DATE: 02/03/2025

REQUESTER: Brent Maze

PRESENTER: Anais Starr, Planner II/Historic District Preservation Officer

ITEM TITLE: (HD 24-03) CONSIDERATION OF APPROVAL, REJECTION, AMENDMENT, AND/OR POSTPONEMENT OF THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS REQUEST FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 627 OKMULGEE STREET FOR THE FOLLOWING MODIFICATIONS: A) REPLACEMENT OF WINDOWS; AND B) REPLACEMENT OF FRONT DOOR.

Property History

Historical Survey Information

2014 Southridge Historic District Nomination Survey Information:

643 Okmulgee Street. 1949. Minimal Traditional. This contributing one-story, brick, single dwelling has a moderate pitched, asphalt covered, hipped roof and a brick foundation. The metal windows are casement. The partial porch is inset under the main roof and has wood square supports. The integral single car garage has a paneled overhead door. There is a brick chimney towards the rear of the house.

Sanborn Map Information

This portion of the Southridge Historic District is not on the Sanborn Maps.

Previous Actions

There have not been any COA requests for this property since the establishment of the Southridge Historic District in 2016.

Overall Project Description

The proposal is to replace the metal casement windows and the front door.

The applicant also proposed to replace the existing wood stockade fence with a fence of the same material, height, and location. Per the Historic District Ordinance and *Guidelines*, the repair of existing fences does not require a Certificate of Appropriateness.

REQUESTS

Project Description

a) Replacement of windows;

The property owner is interested in improving the appearance and energy efficiency of the house. To help meet these goals, the applicant proposes to replace the deteriorated casement windows with custom aluminum windows. The custom windows will match the existing size and window pane configuration. The house had metal storm windows installed over the windows, however, the owner intends to remove these and not replace them.

Reference - Historic District Ordinance

429.3.1(g): *To safeguard the heritage of the City by preserving and regulating historic district structures in such a way that maintains or restores their historic integrity while allowing modern day uses and conveniences for their residents. (0-0910-12).*

429.3.3(c): *Changes to rear elevations do require a COA; however the rear elevation of a historic structure is considered a secondary elevation and is therefore regulated to a lower standard to allow flexibility for additions or other modern day appurtenances. (0-0910-12).*

Reference - Preservation Guidelines

3.12 Guidelines for Windows

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

- .1 Retain Original Windows.** *Retain and preserve original windows, including glass, frames, sash, muntins, sills, heads, moldings, surrounds, and hardware.*
- .2 Retain Historic Glass.** *Retain original glass in historic windows if at all possible. Leaded glass windows shall be preserved. Bubbles and waves give old glass its distinctive look and add to the historic character of the house.*
- .5 Replace Only Deteriorated Features.** *If replacement of a deteriorated window or door feature or details is necessary, replace only the deteriorated feature in-kind rather than the entire unit. Broken sash cords, for example, can be repaired and do not necessitate replacing an entire window. Match the original in design, dimension, placement, and material.*
- .7 Window Replacement.** *An original window that is deteriorated more than 50% and is not repairable may be replaced in-kind if it meets the following:*
 - a. Shall have a wood exterior, unless replacing a metal casement window.*
 - b. Light patterns same as the original.*
 - c. Size and dimension the same as the original.*
 - d. Double-pane simulated divided lights with wood muntins on the exterior and interior and a shadow bar between the panes may be allowed for windows on the side or rear that are not visible from the street.*
- .10 Materials.** *Wood is allowable for in-kind replacement of windows. Aluminum-clad and metal windows can be considered for the replacement of metal casement windows that are deteriorated on a case-by-case basis. Fiberglass and aluminum-clad windows can be considered on non-contributing resources and on rear elevations not visible from the front right-of-way. Vinyl-clad windows are prohibited for both contributing and non-contributing structures in the historic districts.*

Issues and Considerations

This structure was built post-1944 but within the period of significance for the Southridge Historic District and therefore is designated a contributing structure to the District. The existing windows are original to this historic structure.

The *Guidelines for Windows* encourage the preservation and retention of original windows. The *Guidelines* allow original windows to be replaced if the Commission determines the windows have deteriorated more than 50% and are not repairable. The applicant has submitted pictures of the existing windows to illustrate their deteriorated state. The applicant has also sought contractors to repair the windows, but as of the writing of this staff report, the applicant had not successfully obtained such a contractor. If the applicant can find a contractor, he plans to restore the front façade windows while replacing the remaining windows in the structure.

The *Guidelines* allow aluminum or metal windows to be considered for the replacement of metal casement windows on a case-by-case basis review. In recent years, the Commission has approved metal and aluminum replacement windows on non-contributing structures, it has not reviewed and/or approved the replacement of metal casement windows in a contributing historic structure.

The Commission has reviewed five previous requests to replace metal casement windows on non-contributing structures. The Commission approved the replacement of casement windows with aluminum or metal windows in non-contributing structures at 415 S Lahoma, 720 S Lahoma, 1320 Oklahoma Avenue, and 727 Chautauqua. For the property at 713 Cruce, the Commission required the retention of the original casement windows on the front of the structure, while allowing the replacement of side and rear windows. In the past, the Commission has not approved the replacement of original wood windows in historic structures unless the windows are deteriorated beyond repair.

The Commission would need to determine whether the proposed replacement of the original casement windows in this contributing structure meets the *Preservation Guidelines* and whether such work is compatible with this historic structure and the District as a whole.

Commission Action: (HD 24-03) Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of the Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 627 Okmulgee Street for the following modification: a) replacement of windows.

b) Replacement of front door.

The applicant proposes to replace the existing hollow-core wood door with a custom wood door that matches the current design. Since the existing front door is hollow-core material, it may not be original to the house.

Reference - Historic District Ordinance

429.3.1(g): *To safeguard the heritage of the City by preserving and regulating historic district structures in such a way that maintains or restores their historic integrity while allowing modern day uses and conveniences for their residents. (0-0910-12).*

Reference - Preservation Guidelines

3.14 Guidelines for Doors

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

- .1 Retain and Preserve Original Doors.** Retain and preserve original doors and door surrounds including frames, glazing, panels, sidelights, fanlights, surrounds, thresholds, and hardware on front doors and side doors visible from the street.
- .2 Replace Only Deteriorated Features.** If replacement of a deteriorated door feature or details is necessary, replace only the deteriorated feature in-kind rather than the entire unit.
- .3 Retain and Preserve Transoms and Sidelights.** Transoms and sidelights should be retained and preserved. Avoid altering transoms and sidelights as it distorts the strong vertical proportions of the windows and doors and changes the character of the residence.
- .6 Wood Doors.** Wood doors are required unless there is documentation that other materials were historically used on a particular structure. Keep wood doors appropriately stained or painted to protect from weather.
- .7 Replacement Doors.** Replacement doors on a historic structure are to be wood and in an appropriate design, size, and details in keeping with the style of the house. Installation of steel doors on the front of a historic structure is prohibited. Aluminum-clad doors are permissible on the rear of the structure upon review on a case-by-case basis.
- .9 Materials.** Wood is allowable for in-kind replacement of doors. Fiberglass and aluminum-clad doors can be considered on non-contributing resources and on rear elevations of historic structures when not visible from the front right-of-way. Vinyl is prohibited for historic and non-contributing structures.

Issues and Considerations

The *Guidelines for Doors* state that original doors in historic houses are to be retained. In this case, it appears that the existing hollow-core door is not original to the house, therefore replacement is allowed. The request to replace the existing door with a custom wood door that matches the current design meets the *Guidelines* for design and material.

The Commission would need to determine whether the proposed replacement of the front door on this contributing structure meets the *Preservation Guidelines* and whether such work is compatible with this historic structure and the District as a whole.

Commission Action: (HD 24-03) Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of the Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 627 Okmulgee Street for the following modification: b) replacement of the front door.