



CITY OF NORMAN, OK STAFF REPORT

MEETING DATE: July 7, 2025

REQUESTER: Tyler Burns, Power Oklahoma

PRESENTER: Anais Starr, Planner II/Historic Preservation Officer

ITEM TITLE: (HD 25-24) CONSIDERATION OF APPROVAL, REJECTION, AMENDMENT, AND/OR POSTPONEMENT OF THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS REQUEST FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 467 COLLEGE AVENUE FOR THE FOLLOWING MODIFICATIONS: A) REPLACEMENT OF THE ENTRY DOORS ON THE PRINCIPAL STRUCTURE; B) INSTALLATION OF DOORS ON THE ACCESSORY DWELLING UNIT; C) INSTALLATION OF THE WINDOWS ON THE ACCESSORY DWELLING UNIT.

Background

Historical Information

1988 Chautauqua Historic District Nomination Survey Information:

467 College Ave., Ca 1916. Bungalow/Craftsman. This contributing, one-story, wood-sided single dwelling has an asphalt-covered, gabled roof and a poured concrete foundation. The wood windows are nine-over-one hung. The wrap-around entry porch has a side-gable roof supported by a wood column on brick piers. Decorative details include bracketed eaves and wood and brick piers. The garage behind and to the north side of the house has been converted into an apartment. (Staff notes this last sentence may not be accurate. The section of the house does not currently show evidence of a separate apartment.)

Sanborn Insurance Map Information

The principal structure appears on the 1918, 1925, and 1944 Sanborn Insurance Maps without an addition. A garage structure along the north property line at the rear of the house is shown on the 1925 and 1944 Sanborn Insurance Maps. This indicates the garage's attachment to the principal structure occurred after 1944. The subsequent addition to the rear garage area also occurred after 1944.

Previous Actions

This property was designated as part of the Chautauqua Historic District on August 14, 2018. There have been no Certificates of Appropriateness requests for this property.

July 7, 2025 – A Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) request for the removal of a non-original addition and the installation of a covered rear patio. The requested accessory dwelling unit (ADU) was approved as submitted, except for the proposed windows and doors.

Overall Project Description

As noted previously in this report, the request to build an ADU was approved as submitted, except for the windows and doors. The Commission found the windows and doors needed to match the principal structure's design and configuration. The applicant is now returning to the Commission with a COA request for the ADU's windows and doors. The applicant also proposes to replace the two entry doors on the principal structure.

REQUESTS

a) Replacement of doors on the principal structure.

Project Description:

The applicant proposes to replace the two 1980s entry doors with wood doors of an appropriate style for this historic structure. An illustration of the proposed door design is submitted for review by the Commission.

Historic District Ordinance

36-535.a.2.g: *To safeguard the heritage of the City by preserving and regulating historic district structures in such a way that maintains or restores their historic integrity while allowing modern-day uses and conveniences for their residents.*

Preservation Guidelines

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

3.14 Guidelines

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

.1 Retain and Preserve Original Doors. *Retain and preserve the original doors and door surrounds, including frames, glazing, panels, sidelights, fanlights, surrounds, thresholds, and hardware, on front doors and side doors visible from the street.*

.2 Replace Only Deteriorated Features. *If replacement of a deteriorated door feature or details is necessary, replace only the deteriorated feature in-kind rather than the entire unit.*

.6 Wood Doors. *Wood doors are required unless there is documentation that other materials were historically used on a particular structure. Keep wood doors appropriately stained or painted to protect them from the weather.*

.7 Replacement Doors. *Replacement doors on a historic structure are to be wood and in appropriate design, size, and details in keeping with the style of the house. Installation of steel doors on the front of a historic structure is prohibited. Aluminum-clad doors are permissible on the rear of the structure, upon review on a case-by-case basis.*

Considerations/Issues

The *Preservation Guidelines for Doors* require the preservation of original wood doors. Both entry doors appear to be from the 1980s and are not original to this 1916 Bungalow Craftsman structure. The *Guidelines* further state that replacement doors are to be made of wood and have a design appropriate to the style of the historic structure. The proposed replacement door will be wood and will feature Craftsman design elements. The proposed entry door meets the *Guidelines* for design and material.

The Commission would need to determine if the proposed replacement entry doors meet the *Guidelines* and are appropriate for this structure.

Commission Action: (HD 25-24) Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of the Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 467 College Avenue for the following modifications: a) replacement of the entry doors on the principal structure.

b) Installation of a door in the accessory dwelling unit.

Project Description:

The applicant proposes the same wood entry door to match the principal structure. There is a rear door on the ADU that provides access to a utility maintenance room for the structure. The applicant proposes to install a fiberglass door for security and ease of maintenance. An illustration of the proposed doors is attached for review.

Historic District Ordinance

36-535.a.2.g: *To safeguard the heritage of the City by preserving and regulating historic district structures in such a way that maintains or restores their historic integrity while allowing modern-day uses and conveniences for their residents.*

36-535.c: *Changes to rear elevations do require a COA; however, the rear elevation of a historic structure is considered a secondary elevation and is therefore regulated to a lower standard to allow flexibility for additions or other modern-day appurtenances.*

Preservation Guidelines

2.7 Guidelines for Secondary Structures

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

.9 Windows and Doors for Secondary Accessory Structures. *Select doors and windows for new secondary accessory buildings that are compatible in material, proportion, pattern, and detail with the doors and windows of historic buildings in the district. See Windows and Door Guidelines.*

3.14 Guidelines for Doors

.10 New Primary and Secondary Accessory Structures. *Doors in new construction shall be similar to those in adjacent historic structures in terms of size, profile, design, proportions, and material. Aluminum-clad and fiberglass doors with limited or no visibility from the front façade can be considered on a case-by-case basis.*

Considerations/Issues

The *Preservation Guidelines* state that new doors on secondary structures are to match the historic structure in design. The proposed wood entry door will match the new entry doors proposed for the principal structure. *Preservation Guidelines* allow fiberglass or aluminum-clad on non-contributing structures that have no visibility from front right-of-way. The applicant proposes to utilize a fiberglass door for the rear access door into the utility maintenance room. The *Preservation Guidelines* allow fiberglass doors for secondary structures upon review by the Commission. This rear door is five feet from the rear property line and is not visible from the front right-of-way.

The Commission needs to determine if the proposed door design meets the *Guidelines* and whether it is appropriate for this structure.

Commission Action:

(HD 25-24) Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of the Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 467 College Avenue for the following modifications: b) installation of a door in the accessory dwelling unit.

c) Installation of windows in the accessory dwelling unit.

Project Description:

The applicant proposes using aluminum-clad wood windows with a nine-over-one windowpane configuration for this accessory dwelling unit to match the principal structure. An illustration of the proposed design for the windows is submitted for review by the Commission.

Historic District Ordinance

36-535.a.2(g): *To safeguard the heritage of the City by preserving and regulating historic district structures in such a way that maintains or restores their historic integrity while allowing modern-day uses and conveniences for their residents.*

36-535.c: *Changes to rear elevations do require a COA; however, the rear elevation of a historic structure is considered a secondary elevation and is therefore regulated to a lower standard to allow flexibility for additions or other modern-day appurtenances.*

Preservation Guidelines

2.7 Guidelines for Secondary Structures

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

.9 Windows and Doors for Secondary Accessory Structures. *Select doors and windows for new secondary accessory buildings that are compatible in material, proportion, pattern, and detail with the doors and windows of historic buildings in the district. See Windows and Door Guidelines.*

.11 Avoid False Historical Appearance. *New secondary accessory structures are to be compatible with the style, age and character of the principal structure and district without creating a false historical appearance. New structures are to be of their own time and differentiated from the historic structure while maintaining compatibility with the principal structure and the character of the neighborhood.*

3.12 Guidelines for Windows

.11 New Primary and Secondary Accessory Structures. *Windows in new construction are to be compatible with in adjacent historic structures in terms of size, profile, design, proportions, and material. Wood and aluminum-clad windows are acceptable for use in new construction.*

Considerations/Issues

The *Preservation Guidelines* state that windows should match the historic structure in terms of windowpane configuration. The applicant proposes a nine-over-one windowpane configuration to match the principal structure. The *Preservation Guidelines* permit aluminum-clad windows for secondary structures, such as accessory dwelling units.

The Commission needs to determine if the proposed windows meet the *Guidelines* and whether it is appropriate for this structure.

Commission Action:

(HD 25-24) Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of the Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 467 College Avenue for the following modifications: c) installation of windows in the accessory dwelling unit.