



CITY OF NORMAN, OK STAFF REPORT

MEETING DATE: June 2, 2025

REQUESTER: Scott & Laurie Huskey

PRESENTER: Anais Starr, Planner II/Historic Preservation Officer

ITEM TITLE: (HD 25-14) CONSIDERATION OR APPROVAL, REJECTION, AMENDMENT, AND/OR POSTPONEMENT OF THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS REQUEST FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 800-802 MILLER AVENUE FOR THE FOLLOWING MODIFICATIONS ON THE GARAGE APARTMENT: A) REPLACEMENT OF WINDOWS WITH ALUMINUM-CLAD WOOD WINDOWS; B) REPLACEMENT OF WOOD LAP SIDING WITH HARDIE LAP SIDING; C) REPLACEMENT OF ENTRY DOOR WITH OPTION A OR OPTION B.

Background

Historical Information

2004 Miller Historic District Nomination Survey Information:

800 South Miller Avenue. Ca. 1925. Tudor Revival. This contributing, one-story, brick, single dwelling has a brick foundation and an asphalt covered, cross-gabled roof. The wood windows are nine-over-one hung and the wood door is plank. The partial porch is uncovered with a concrete floor, wrought iron railing and an enclosed, brick, arched entry. Other exterior features include an exterior, brick, gabled wall chimney. Decorative details include exposed rafters tails, false half-timbering and double and triple windows.

802 South Miller Avenue. Ca. 1965. No Distinctive Style. This noncontributing, two-story, weatherboard garage apartment has a concrete foundation and an asphalt-covered, front-gabled roof. The wood windows are one-over-one hung and the wood door is glazed paneled. The first floor features two, wood, glazed, paneled, overhead garage doors. There is also an entry located on the north side, towards the rear, which features a gabled entry porch supported by brackets. The second floor apartment is accessed via a wood staircase on the south side. Decorative details consist of contrasting painted trim. The building is non-contributing due to insufficient age.

Sanborn Insurance Map Information

The principal structure is indicated in its present location on the 1925 and 1944 Sanborn maps. The garage apartment located south of the principal structure is not on the Sanborn maps, indicating it was built after 1944.

Previous Actions

May 1, 2000 - A Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) by Administrative Bypass was granted for the removal of a shared driveway between 800 Miller Avenue and 228 E Duffy Street.

March 7, 2022 – A COA was issued for the replacement of slate roof tiles with composite or laminated shingles.

August 10, 2024 – A COA by Administrative Bypass was issued for the installation of a rear yard fence.

Overall Project Description

The property owner, during the renovation of the garage apartment, discovered the exterior siding, windows, and entry door were deteriorated due to water infiltration and termite damage. The applicant proposes to replace the exterior wood lap siding with Hardie lap siding to prevent future maintenance issues. Also proposed is the replacement of wood windows with aluminum-clad wood windows. Additionally, the applicant has proposed two possible wood door options for the replacement of the existing wood entry door to the garage apartment. On the submitted COA application form, the applicant also requested to replace the driveway leading to the garage. Since this request does not propose to alter the size of the existing driveway, it is considered repair. Repair of existing pavement does not require Historic District Commission review but will require a paving permit.

REQUEST

a) Replacement of wood windows with aluminum-clad wood windows.

Project Description:

During renovation of the garage apartment, the applicant found the existing wood windows to be deteriorated due to water infiltration. Additionally, the windows have been screwed shut, resulting in further damage to the wood sashes. The applicant proposes replacing all wood windows in the structure with aluminum-clad wood windows. The applicant has submitted photos showing the deteriorated windows, along with information on the proposed aluminum-clad wood windows.

Reference - Historic District Ordinance

36-535.a.2.g: Purpose. *To safeguard the heritage of the City by preserving and regulating historic district structures in such a way that maintains or restores their historic integrity while allowing modern-day uses and conveniences for their residents.*

36.535.c.3: Reviewing non-contributing structures. *Non-contributing structures should be controlled only to the degree necessary to make them compatible with the general atmosphere of any district with regard to exterior alteration, additions, signs, site work, and related activities.*

Preservation Guidelines

3.12 Guidelines for Windows

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

.1 Retain Original Windows. *Retain and preserve original windows, including glass, frames, sash, muntins, sills, heads, moldings, surrounds, and hardware.*

.7 Window Replacement. *An original window that is deteriorated more than 50% and is not repairable may be replaced in-kind if it meets the following:*

- a. Shall have a wood exterior, unless replacing a metal casement window.*
- b. Light patterns same as the original.*
- c. Size and dimension the same as the original.*
- d. Double-pane simulated divided lights with wood muntins on the exterior and interior and a shadow bar between the panes may be allowed for windows on the side or rear that are not visible from the street.*

.10 Materials. *Wood is allowable for in-kind replacement of windows. Aluminum-clad and metal windows can be considered for the replacement of metal casement windows that are deteriorated on a case-by-case basis. Fiberglass and aluminum-clad windows can be considered on non-contributing resources and on rear elevations not visible from the front right-of-way. Vinyl-clad windows are prohibited for both contributing and non-contributing structures in the historic districts.*

Issues and Considerations

The *Preservation Guidelines for Windows* require the retention of historic windows. This structure is non-contributing to the Miller Historic District and, therefore, is not a historic structure. The *Guidelines* allow windows on non-contributing structures to be replaced with wood, aluminum-clad wood windows, or fiberglass windows. In this case, the applicant proposes to replace wood windows with aluminum-clad wood windows, which meet the *Guidelines* for materials.

The Commission would need to determine whether the proposed replacement of wood windows with aluminum-clad wood windows meets the *Preservation Guidelines* and is compatible with the Miller Historic District.

Commission Action: (HD 25-14) Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of a Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 800-802 Miller Avenue for the following modification on the garage apartment: a) replacement of wood windows with aluminum-clad wood windows.

REQUEST

b) Replacement of exterior wood lap siding with Hardie lap siding.

Project Description:

The existing wood siding has suffered damage from water infiltration and termites. The applicant proposes to remove the deteriorated wood lap siding and replace it with Hardie lap siding of the same width and profile. The applicant submitted photos showing the dilapidated siding and information on the proposed Hardie lap siding in the attached submittal documents.

Reference - Historic District Ordinance

36-535.a.2.g: Purpose. *To safeguard the heritage of the City by preserving and regulating historic district structures in such a way that maintains or restores their historic integrity while allowing modern-day uses and conveniences for their residents. (0-0910-12).*

36.535.c.3: Reviewing non-contributing structures. *Non-contributing structures should be controlled only to the degree necessary to make them compatible with the general atmosphere of any district with regard to exterior alteration, additions, signs, site work, and related activities.*

Preservation Guidelines

3.2 Guidelines for Exterior Walls

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

.1 Preserve Original Walls. *Retain and preserve exterior walls that contribute to the overall historic form and character of a building, including functional and decorative features and details.*

.2 Retain Original Building Materials. *Retain and preserve exterior wall materials that contribute to the building's overall historic character.*

.3 Replace Only Deteriorated Portions. *If replacement of a deteriorated wall or feature is necessary, replace only the deteriorated portion in-kind rather than the entire feature. Match the original in material, design, dimension, detail, texture, and pattern. Compatible substitute materials can be considered if in-kind replacement materials are not available or feasible.*

.7 Substitute Materials. *Cement fiberboard (e.g. Hardie plank® siding) will be considered on a case-by-case basis. Exterior insulating and finish systems (EIFS) will not be considered for use in historic structures.*

Considerations/Issues:

The *Preservation Guidelines for Exterior Walls* require the retention of historic exterior wall material. However, this structure is non-contributing to the Miller Historic District due to its insufficient age and it is not considered a historic structure. The applicant proposes replacing the existing wood lap siding with Hardie lap siding to minimize future maintenance issues. As required by the *Guidelines*, the applicant is proposing Hardie siding with a smooth finish and will match the width and profile of the existing siding. The *Guidelines* allow the substitution of cement fiberboard siding, such as Hardie lap siding, on non-contributing structures on a case-by-case review. The installation of Hardie lap siding will provide a similar look to structures with wood lap siding found in the Miller Historic District.

The Commission would need to determine whether the replacement of wood lap siding with Hardie lap siding meets the *Preservation Guidelines* and is compatible with the principal structure on the property and the Miller Historic District.

Commission Action: (HD 25-14) Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of a Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 800-802 Miller Avenue for the following modification on the garage apartment: a) Replacement of exterior wood lap siding with Hardie lap siding.

REQUEST

c) Replacement of entry door with Option A or Option B.

Project Description:

The applicant proposes to replace the existing wood door to improve the appearance and security of the apartment. The applicant proposes two possible wood door options. The first option is a Craftsman bungalow style with lites at the top of the door. The second option is a

simple modern-day wood door without any lites. The applicant has submitted a photo of the existing entry door and illustrations of the two proposed door options.

Reference - Historic District Ordinance

36-535.a.2.g: Purpose. *To safeguard the heritage of the City by preserving and regulating historic district structures in such a way that maintains or restores their historic integrity while allowing modern-day uses and conveniences for their residents. (0-0910-12).*

36.535.c.3: Reviewing non-contributing structures. *Non-contributing structures should be controlled only to the degree necessary to make them compatible with the general atmosphere of any district with regard to exterior alteration, additions, signs, site work, and related activities.*

Preservation Guidelines

3.13 Standards for Administrative Bypass

The following items can receive a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) through the Administrative Bypass process if they meet the criteria listed below. If they do not meet the criteria, the application will be forwarded to the Historic District Commission for a full review.

.1 Door Replacement. *A deteriorated door that is not repairable may be replaced in-kind, meaning a door that matches the original in materials and design. A non-original door may be replaced with a wood door that is appropriately designed for the house and the historic district.*

3.14 Guidelines

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

.1 Retain and Preserve Original Doors. *Retain and preserve the original doors and door surrounds, including frames, glazing, panels, sidelights, fanlights, surrounds, thresholds, and hardware, on front doors and side doors visible from the street.*

.7 Replacement Doors. *Replacement doors on a historic structure are to be wood and in appropriate design, size and details in keeping with the style of the house. Installation of steel doors on the front of a historic structure is prohibited. Aluminum-clad doors are permissible on rear of the structure upon review on a case-by-case basis.*

.9 Materials. *Wood is allowable for in-kind replacement of doors. Fiberglass and aluminum-clad doors can be considered on non-contributing resources and on rear elevations of historic structures when not visible from the front right-of-way. Vinyl is prohibited for historic and non-contributing structures.*

Considerations/Issues:

The *Preservation Guidelines for Doors* require the retention of historic doors. However, this structure is non-contributing to the Miller Historic District due to its insufficient age, and it is not considered historic. The applicant proposes to replace the existing wood door with one of the two proposed wood doors. The *Guidelines* allow in-kind replacement of wood doors on non-contributing structures. The proposed wood door options meet the *Guidelines* for materials. The Commission would need to determine which wood door option is appropriate for this structure. It should be noted that the *Guidelines* discourage the addition of elements to a structure that create a false sense of history.

The Commission would need to determine whether replacement of the entry door is appropriate. If the replacement of the entry door is appropriate, the Commission would need to determine

whether Option A or Option B meets the *Preservation Guidelines* and is compatible with this property and the Miller Historic District.

Commission Action: (HD 25-14) Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of a Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 800-802 Miller Avenue for the following modification on the garage apartment: c) replacement of entry door with Option A or Option B.