



CITY OF NORMAN, OK STAFF REPORT

MEETING DATE: June 2, 2025

REQUESTER: Caleb Finch/Nolan Kelly

PRESENTER: Anais Starr, Planner II/Historic Preservation Officer

ITEM TITLE: (HD 25-13) CONSIDERATION OF APPROVAL, REJECTION, AMENDMENT, AND/OR POSTPONEMENT OF THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 538 CHAUTAUQUA AVENUE FOR THE FOLLOWING MODIFICATIONS: A) REPLACEMENT OF EXTERIOR WOOD SHINGLES WITH HARDIE LAP SIDING; B) REPLACEMENT OF OVERHEAD GARAGE DOORS.

Background

Historical Information

2004 Chautauqua Historic District Nomination Survey Information:

538 Chautauqua Ave. Ca. 1915. Bungalow/Craftsman. This contributing, two-story, aluminum-sided single dwelling has an asphalt-covered, cross-gabled roof and a concrete foundation. The wood windows are one-over-one hung with metal storms. The wood door is slab. The partial porch has a one-story, front-gabled roof supported by short wood columns on tall painted brick piers. There is a red brick exterior chimney on the north side. Decorative details include exposed rafters, exposed roof beams, open woodwork on the gable end, double windows, and decorative wood shutters. To the rear is a single car, wood shingle garage with a front-gabled, asphalt-covered roof and an overhead garage door.

Sanborn Insurance Map Information

The 1944 Sanborn Insurance Map shows the principal structure in its current location. The 1944 Sanborn Insurance Map does not show the garage, indicating that it was constructed post-1944.

Previous Actions

There have been no Certificate of Appropriateness requests for this property.

Overall Project Description

The garage suffered damage from a fire, which occurred after a power line fell during a windstorm this spring. Both the exterior wood shingles on the garage and the fiberglass garage doors received damage. The applicant proposes to replace the wood shingles with Hardie lap siding, and to replace both the rear-facing and front-facing overhead garage doors with a raised metal panel overhead garage doors.

REQUEST

a) Replacement of exterior wood shingles with Hardie lap siding.

Project Description:

The applicant proposes to remove the wood shingles and install Hardie lap siding to reduce the fire hazard associated with wood shingles and to match the exterior appearance of the principal structure on the property. The applicant submitted photos showing the damage to the wood shingles and information regarding the proposed Hardie lap siding.

Reference - Historic District Ordinance

36-535.a.2.g: Purpose. *To safeguard the heritage of the City by preserving and regulating historic district structures in such a way that maintains or restores their historic integrity while allowing modern-day uses and conveniences for their residents. (0-0910-12).*

36.535.c.3: Reviewing non-contributing structures. *Non-contributing structures should be controlled only to the degree necessary to make them compatible with the general atmosphere of any district with regard to exterior alteration, additions, signs, site work, and related activities.*

Preservation Guidelines

3.2 Guidelines for Exterior Walls

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

.1 Preserve Original Walls. *Retain and preserve exterior walls that contribute to the overall historic form and character of a building, including functional and decorative features and details.*

.2 Retain Original Building Materials. *Retain and preserve exterior wall materials that contribute to the overall historic character of a building.*

.3 Replace Only Deteriorated Portions. *If replacement of a deteriorated wall or feature is necessary, replace only the deteriorated portion in-kind rather than the entire feature. Match the original in material, design, dimension, detail, texture, and pattern. Compatible substitute materials can be considered if in-kind replacement material are not available or feasible.*

.7 Substitute Materials. *Cement fiberboard (e.g. Hardiplank® siding) will be considered on a case-by-case basis. Exterior insulating and finish systems (EIFS) will not be considered for use in historic structures.*

Considerations/Issues:

The *Preservation Guidelines for Exterior Walls* require retaining the original historic exterior wall material. However, this structure is non-contributing to the Chautauqua Historic District due to its insufficient age, thus it is not considered historic. The applicant proposes to replace the wood shingle exterior with Hardie lap siding as he desires to match the principal structure's exterior walls with a similar look. The *Guidelines* allow the substitution of cement fiberboard siding, such as Hardie siding, on non-contributing structures on a case-by-case review. The replacement of the shingles with lap siding would provide a compatible look to the principal structure and is a common exterior wall finish found in the Chautauqua Historic District.

The Commission would need to determine whether the replacement of wood shingles with Hardie lap siding meets the *Preservation Guidelines* and is compatible with the principal structure on the property and the Chautauqua Historic District.

Commission Action: (HD 25-13) Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of a Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 538 Chautauqua Avenue for the following modification: a) replacement of exterior wood shingles with Hardie lap siding.

REQUEST

b) Replacement of overhead garage doors.

Project Description:

The applicant determined the existing overhead fiberglass doors were manufactured in the 1970s and are no longer available. The applicant proposes to replace the fire-damaged overhead garage doors with raised metal panel overhead garage doors. The applicant has submitted photos of the fire-damaged doors and a specification sheet on the proposed raised metal door.

Reference - Historic District Ordinance

36-535.a.2.g: Purpose. *To safeguard the heritage of the City by preserving and regulating historic district structures in such a way that maintains or restores their historic integrity while allowing modern-day uses and conveniences for their residents. (0-0910-12).*

36.535.c.3: Reviewing non-contributing structures. *Non-contributing structures should be controlled only to the degree necessary to make them compatible with the general atmosphere of any district with regard to exterior alteration, additions, signs, site work, and related activities.*

Preservation Guidelines

Guidelines for Garages

2.3 Standards for Administrative Bypass

The following items can receive a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) through the Administrative Bypass process if they meet the criteria listed. If they do not meet the criteria, the application will be forwarded to the Historic District Commission for a full review.

.1 Garage Door Replacement.

For non-historic garages that face the alleyway or that are not visible from the right-of-way, the following is allowed:

- a. Wood, wood composite, or a raised metal panel garage door.*
- b. The original size, height, and width of doors must be maintained.*
- c. Designs must match the style of the original garage door and/or garage.*

2.4 Guidelines for Garages

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

.11 Replacement Garage Doors. *Retain and preserve wood overhead garage doors on historic garages. Retain double doors if possible. Replacement overhead garage doors with the appearance of double doors will be considered on a case-by-case basis. For historic garages, and garages that face the front or are visible from the right-of-way the following replacement door is allowed:*

- a. Wood is preferred. However, wood composite or metal with composite trim can be considered on a case-by-case basis. Vinyl is prohibited.*
- b. The original size, height and width of doors must be maintained.*

c. *Designs must match the style of the original historic garage door.*

Considerations/Issues:

The *Preservation Guidelines for Garages* state that rear-facing garage doors with no visibility to the right-of-way are allowed to be replaced with raised metal panel garage doors, as submitted. The *Guidelines* allow the Commission to consider wood doors or metal doors with composite trim on garages for a front-facing door with visibility from the right-of-way. Since this is a non-historic structure, and the garage door is not clearly visible from the front right-of-way due to the existing fence, the request for a raised metal panel garage door may meet the *Guidelines*.

The Commission would need to determine whether the replacement of the existing fiberglass garage doors with raised metal panel garage doors meets the *Preservation Guidelines* and is compatible with the principal structure and the Chautauqua Historic District.

Commission Action: (HD 25-13) Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of a Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 538 Chautauqua Avenue for the following modification: b) replacement of overhead garage doors.