



CITY OF NORMAN, OK STAFF REPORT

MEETING DATE: October 6, 2025

REQUESTER: Stan Berry, Architect on behalf of Brock & Kenita Gibbins

PRESENTER: Anais Starr, Planner II/Historic Preservation Officer

ITEM TITLE: (HD 25-30) CONSIDERATION OF APPROVAL, REJECTION, AMENDMENT, AND/OR POSTPONEMENT OF THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS REQUEST FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 502 MACY STREET FOR THE FOLLOWING MODIFICATIONS: A) DEMOLITION OF THE EXISTING GARAGE; B) DEMOLITION OF THE EXISTING STORM SHELTER; C) INSTALLATION OF A GARAGE WITH AN ATTACHED CABANA.

Background

Historical Information

2015 Southridge Historic District Nomination Survey Information:

502 Macy Street. Ca. 1940. Minimal Traditional. This contributing two-story, brick and vinyl sided; single dwelling has moderately pitched, asphalt covered, cross gabled roof and a brick foundation. The vinyl windows are six-over-six hung. The entry porch has concrete steps, brick walls, wrought iron railings and a flared shed roof supported by square Doric columns. The brick, exterior, gable wall chimney is on the east elevation. Decorative details include double windows, brick sills, decorative wood shutters, and minimal eave overhang.

Sanborn Insurance Map Information

The 1944 Sanborn Insurance Map shows a portion of this lot. The map shows a garage in the current location of the existing garage, indicating it is the original garage structure for the lot.

Previous Actions

June 5, 2017 – A Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) was granted for the installation of a screened porch on the rear of the house.

OVERALL PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The applicant proposes several alterations to the property, including the demolition of the existing garage, the demolition of the underground storm shelter, the construction of a new garage, and the extension of the side yard fence. The garage demolition is requested due to the poor condition of the garage and will provide a more functional space for modern-day vehicles. The removal of the garage will also enable the property owner to address the drainage issue found along the existing driveway and garage. The proposed garage will have an attached cabana on the north side for backyard events.

The existing storm shelter is proposed to be replaced with a more modern underground storm shelter that can be accessed from inside the proposed garage.

The applicant proposes extending the existing six-foot wood side yard fence to the existing driveway to provide privacy for the rear yard. This request can be approved through the Administrative Bypass process and does not require Commission review. Additionally, the property owner intends to replace the existing concrete driveway without changes to its design or size. Driveway replacement is considered maintenance and is allowed without Commission review but does require a paving permit.

REQUEST

A) Demolition of the existing garage.

Project Description:

The existing 400-square-foot contributing garage is located adjacent to the alleyway. Access to the garage is provided by a driveway from Ponca Avenue that runs parallel along the alleyway. The original garage was constructed without a proper foundation and additionally has suffered water damage due to a drainage issue along the rear property line.

Reference – Historic District Ordinance

36-535.a.2.g: *To safeguard the heritage of the City by preserving and regulating historic district structures in such a way that maintains or restores their historic integrity while allowing modern-day uses and conveniences for their residents.*

Preservation Guidelines

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

2.4 Guidelines for Garages

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

.1 Preserve Historic Garage Structures. *Retain and preserve garages in their original locations and configurations. Even if the function changes, the exterior appearance shall remain the same.*

.4 Request for Garage Demolitions. *A request for demolition of a historic garage will utilize the following in determining the eligibility for demolition:*

- a. An existing structure of architectural or historical significance shall be retained if repairs are reasonably possible.*
- b. An existing structure is dilapidated, leaning, lacking a solid foundation, or of substandard construction, it may be eligible for demolition*
- c. An existing structure is 240 square feet or less, it may be eligible for demolition.*
- d. An existing structure was built after the period of significance; it may be eligible for demolition.*
- e. The removal of existing historic structure will enable access to the rear yard, where no access currently exists; it may be eligible for demolition.*

Considerations/Issues:

The *Guidelines for Garages* encourage the preservation and repair of significant historic contributing garages. This requirement was developed to preserve historic accessory structures that are a companion to a historic house. In this case, while this is the original garage, due to

the poor construction and drainage issues, the repair of the garage cannot be reasonably performed. The *Guidelines* have five criteria for the Commission to consider when determining if a contributing historic garage is eligible for demolition, as listed in the above *Guidelines for Demolition of Garages*. This structure meets criteria b of *Section 2.4.4, Request for Garage Demolitions*.

The Commission would need to determine if the demolition of the existing garage meets the *Guidelines* and whether it will impact the principal structure or the surrounding district.

Commission Action:

(HD 25-30) Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of a Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 502 Macy Street for the demolition of the existing garage.

REQUEST

B) Demolition of the existing storm shelter.

Project Description:

The applicant proposes the removal of the existing underground storm shelter in the rear yard. A new underground storm shelter will be proposed as part of the new garage installation.

Reference:

Historic District Ordinance

36-535.a.2.g: *To safeguard the heritage of the City by preserving and regulating historic district structures in such a way that maintains or restores their historic integrity while allowing modern-day uses and conveniences for their residents.*

Preservation Guidelines

5.4 Guidelines for Demolition

.1 A Certificate of Appropriateness. *A Certificate of Appropriateness is required to be issued prior to demolition.*

.4 Site Plan Required. *Applicants shall provide the Historic District Commission with detailed site plans for proposed site features of the new parcel, including information on any structures, driveways, site lighting, and parking areas.*

Considerations/Issues:

The *Preservation Guidelines* do not provide direct guidance for storm shelter demolition except to state that a COA is required. However, the purpose of the *Preservation Guidelines* is to protect historic structures, and since this structure is not historic, its removal is allowed. Additionally, it is worth noting that the storm shelter does not meet current building codes for a shelter. The removal of this storm shelter will not impact the historic integrity of this property.

The Commission would need to determine if the demolition of this underground storm shelter meets the *Guidelines* and if its removal will impact this contributing property or the surrounding district.

Commission Action:

(HD 25-30) Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of a Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 502 Macy Street for the demolition of the existing storm shelter.

REQUEST**C) Installation of a garage with an attached cabana.*****Project Description:***

The proposed two-car garage structure will be 21' wide by 30' 6" deep with a footprint of 640 square feet. The proposed garage will be one-story but will have attic space for storage. The structure's wall height will be 13' 5" with a ridge height of 18' 9". The garage is proposed to be located on the east side of the rear yard in a similar location to the existing garage. A new driveway will provide direct access to the alleyway. The existing driveway from Ponca Avenue is to remain with the same size and configuration. As indicated on the site plan, a cabana will be attached to the north side of the structure to provide a small space for backyard use. Also proposed is a small concrete patio off the cabana to be accessed through a pair of aluminum-clad French doors on the rear of the structure. As part of this project, the existing walkway in the rear yard will be reconfigured to provide direct access from the principal structure to the new garage structure. Tree removal is not proposed for any of the proposed construction.

The exterior materials include smooth Hardie siding, aluminum-clad wood windows, a steel entry door, and overhead metal garage doors with a composite overlay creating the recessed panels of the design. The applicants are proposing a faux carriage door design for the overhead garage door.

The garage will be set 15'6" from the east property line, and 20' from the alleyway, meeting the required setbacks of the Zoning Ordinance.

Reference:**Historic District Ordinance**

36-535.a.2.g: *To safeguard the heritage of the City by preserving and regulating historic district structures in such a way that maintains or restores their historic integrity while allowing modern-day uses and conveniences for their residents. (0-0910-12).*

Preservation Guidelines**2.4 Guidelines for Garages**

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

.5 New Garage Construction. *A new garage shall be compatible in form, scale, size, materials, features, and finish with the principal structure. The following criteria will be considered for a new garage constructed where there is currently no historic structure:*

- a. The new structure will utilize alley access if available.*
- b. The new footprint will be 575 square feet or 50% of the footprint of the principal structure, whichever is smaller.*
- c. The cumulative of square footages for all garage structures on the lot, shall be no greater than the footprint of the principal structure.*
- d. New garage are to be subservient to the principal structure and in no case will the garage structure be taller, wider or deeper than the principal structure.*
- e. The proposed construction will preserve existing trees.*

f. Maximum of two garages are allowed per site.

.6 New Garage Height. *New garage structures shall be the traditional height and proportion of garages in the district. New garages in blocks that contain only one-story garages shall be one-story. One and a half-story and two-story garages may be built if located on a block where one and a half-story and two-story garages are dominant or if adjacent properties contain similar height garages. The wall height and height of the roof ridge are to be no greater than the principal structure.*

.7 New Garage Location. *New garage structures that are not replacing a historic garage are to be located behind the principal structure in the rear yard with limited or no visibility from the front right-of-way. Garages replacing historic garages shall maintain the location and configuration of a historic garage, typically at the end of a front driveway. Such garages shall be located behind the back elevation of the principal structure.*

.8 New Garage Materials. *The following may be considered on a case-by-case basis for new garages:*

a. Acceptable materials include wood, brick and stone masonry, and stucco. Fiber cement products for new garage construction located off an alleyway or if setback behind the rear of the house will be considered on a case-by-case basis. It should be noted that wood siding does not have "wood grain." Only smooth cement board is permitted. The use of vinyl, Masonite, aluminum or other metal sidings is prohibited.

b. Aluminum clad doors and windows are allowed for garages located off an alleyway or behind the rear elevation of the house, with no or limited visibility from the front right-of-way.

c. Wood, wood composite or metal overhead garage doors with wood/wood composite trim are allowed.

d. Garage doors shall be a single width. Double width garage doors will be considered on a case-by-case basis.

Considerations/Issue:

The proposed garage is a modern-day structure with a simple design. As encouraged by the *Guidelines for Garages*, the proposed garage will be located off the alleyway. The garage will have no visibility from Macy Street but will have some visibility from Ponca Avenue.

The proposed aluminum-clad windows and doors, as well as steel overhead garage doors with a composite overlay, are permitted by the *Guidelines for Garages*. The Commission can consider the proposed smooth Hardie siding for a garage located off an alleyway on a case-by-case basis. The applicant is requesting a steel entry door, which is not expressly allowed by the *Guidelines*. However, the Commission has approved steel entry doors for requests with no visibility or limited visibility from the right-of-way, as seen with this request.

The proposed 640-square-foot footprint for the garage structure exceeds the maximum allowable size of 575 square feet listed in the *Guidelines for Garages*. The applicant has proposed a structure divided into two spaces: a vehicle storage area and a cabana space. This will effectively reduce the garage size to 453.6 square feet. The garage portion will be 21' wide by 21'5" in depth. The cabana space will be 21' wide by 8'7" in depth, for a total approximate square footage of 142 square feet. The applicant's proposal for one structure instead of two separate structures will provide both space and cost efficiencies and will reduce the visual clutter of multiple structures in the rear yard.

The *Guidelines* state that new garages are to be of a traditional height found in the blocks of the neighborhood where the subject property is located. Catty-corner to the subject property is a two-story structure garage/studio which received a COA and was constructed at 535 E Boyd Street. The garage and accessory structures located east of this parcel are one-story. The *Guidelines* further state that the wall height and roof ridge height of a new garage shall not exceed those of the principal structure. The proposed garage meets this requirement as it has a height of 13 feet, while the principal structure is two stories.

The Guidelines state “*new structures are to be of their own time and differentiated from the historic structure while maintaining compatibility with the principal structure and the character of the neighborhood*”. The garage features a simple, modern design with proposed gabled dormers, small canopies over the entry door, and French doors leading to the backyard. The proposed faux carriage overhead doors are a modern-day design that references historic garages found in the Southridge District. The use of modern materials such as composite overlay and Hardie siding will further differentiate this structure from the historic principal structure and ensure that the garage does not create a false sense of history.

The Commission needs to determine if the proposed garage, as submitted, meets the *Preservation Guidelines* for design, size, location, placement, materials, and whether it is compatible with the historic principal structure and the Southridge Historic District.

Commission Action:

Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of the certificate of appropriateness request (HD 25-30) for the property located at 502 Macy Street for the construction of a garage with a cabana.