

CITY OF NORMAN, OK STAFF REPORT

MEETING DATE: October 6, 2025

REQUESTER: Scissortail Roofing and Construction on behalf of Michael Powers

PRESENTER: Anais Starr, Planner II/Historic Preservation Officer

ITEM TITLE: (HD 25-29) CONSIDERATION OF APPROVAL, REJECTION,

AMENDMENT, AND/OR POSTPONEMENT OF THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 630 OKMULGEE STREET FOR THE FOLLOWING MODIFICATIONS: A) REPLACEMENT OF EXTERIOR METAL SIDING WITH HARDIE LAP

SIDING; B) REPLACEMENT OF OVERHEAD GARAGE DOOR.

Background

Historical Information

2015 Southridge Historic District Nomination Survey Information:

630 Okmulgee Street. Ca. 1939. Modern Movement Minimal Tradition. This noncontributing two-story, distressed brick, single dwelling has a moderate pitched, asphalt covered, cross gabled roof. The vinyl windows are a combination of one-over-one and six-over-six hung. The partial porch is inset under the main roof. The brick, interior, ridge chimney is centrally located. The double-car garage now has double wood swinging doors. Decorative details include wood shutters and minimal eave overhang. This structure is noncontributing to the Southridge Historic District due to a lack of historic integrity. Since 2001, the brick has been distressed, and garage doors have been replaced. The craftsman-style garage doors dramatically changed the appearance of the house.

Staff note: The statement above regarding the garage having swinging doors at the time of the Historic Survey in 2015 is inaccurate. The existing door is a metal/composite overhead garage door.

Sanborn Insurance Map Information

The Sanborn Insurance Maps do not include this portion of the Southridge Historic District.

Previous Actions

There have been no Certificate of Appropriateness requests for this property.

OVERALL PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The applicant proposes several alterations to the property, including the replacement of the existing metal siding with Hardie siding, the replacement of the existing overhead garage door with an identical one, the replacement of the roof, and the replacement of the gutters.

The replacement of the roof and the gutters do not require review by the Historic District Commission, and these maintenance repairs may proceed without the issuance of a COA.

REQUEST

A) Replacement of exterior metal siding with Hardie lap siding. *Project Description:*

The metal siding on the principal structure has suffered hail damage over the last several years. Since metal siding is not readily available material in the marketplace, the applicant is proposing to replace it with smooth Hardie lap siding. The original wood siding underneath is to remain.

Reference:

Historic District Ordinance

36-535.a.2.g: To safeguard the heritage of the City by preserving and regulating historic district structures in such a way that maintains or restores their historic integrity while allowing modern-day uses and conveniences for their residents.

36.535.c.3: Reviewing non-contributing structures. Non-contributing structures should be controlled only to the degree necessary to make them compatible with the general atmosphere of any district with regard to exterior alteration, additions, signs, site work, and related activities.

Preservation Guidelines

3.2 Guidelines for Exterior Walls

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

- .1 Preserve Original Walls. Retain and preserve exterior walls that contribute to the overall historic form and character of a building, including functional and decorative features and details.
- **.2 Retain Original Building Materials**. Retain and preserve exterior wall materials that contribute to the overall historic character of a building.
- .3 Replace Only Deteriorated Portions. If replacement of a deteriorated wall or feature is necessary, replace only the deteriorated portion in-kind rather than the entire feature. Match the original in material, design, dimension, detail, texture, and pattern. Compatible substitute materials can be considered if in-kind replacement materials are not available or feasible.
- .4 Avoid Covering Original Materials. Building materials and decorative elements are important character-defining components of historic buildings. It is not appropriate to remove or cover any wall material or detail with coatings or contemporary substitute materials. Vinyl and aluminum siding is not appropriate for use in historic districts.
- .5 Replace Missing Features. When replacing an exterior wall or feature, replace it with a new wall or feature based on accurate documentation of the original or a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Compatible substitute materials can be considered if in-kind replacement material are not available or feasible.
- **.6 Avoid False Historical Appearances**. Features or details of walls and fences that are introduced to a property shall reflect its style, period, and design. Fences and walls features shall not create a false historical appearance by reflecting other time periods, styles, or geographic regions of the country.

.7 Substitute Materials. Cement fiberboard (e.g. Hardiplank® siding) will be considered on a case-by-case basis. Exterior insulating and finish systems (EIFS) will not be considered for use in historic structures.

Considerations/Issues:

This structure is noncontributing to the Southridge Historic District. The *Preservation Guidelines* require alterations to noncontributing structures to be compatible with the surrounding district. The *Guidelines* also allow for the repair of non-original materials. In this case, the non-original metal siding is not readily available and since metal siding is not a historic material, it seems reasonable to allow the property owner to replace it with a durable alternative material that emulates the look of wood siding. The replacement of one type of alternative siding with another type of alternative siding will not further impact this noncontributing structure. Staff would note that the Hardie lap siding could be removed in the future and the underlying wood siding repaired and repainted.

The Commission will need to determine if this request meets the *Preservation Guidelines* and if it is compatible with the surrounding Southridge District.

Commission Action:

(HD 25-29) Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of a Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 630 Okmulgee Street for the replacement of the metal siding with Hardie lap siding.

REQUEST

B) Replacement of overhead garage door.

Project Description:

The existing metal with composite overlay garage door has been damaged by several hailstorms in recent years. The applicant proposes to replace the overhead garage door with a door of the same design and materials. Since this garage door faces the street, it requires review by the Historic District Commission.

Reference:

Historic District Ordinance

36-535.a.2.g: Purpose. To safeguard the heritage of the City by preserving and regulating historic district structures in such a way that maintains or restores their historic integrity while allowing modern-day uses and conveniences for their residents.

36.535.c.3: Reviewing non-contributing structures. Non-contributing structures should be controlled only to the degree necessary to make them compatible with the general atmosphere of any district with regard to exterior alteration, additions, signs, site work, and related activities.

Preservation Guidelines

2.4 Guidelines for Garages

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

.11 Replacement Garage Doors. Retain and preserve wood overhead garage doors on historic garages. Retain double doors if possible. Replacement overhead garage doors with

the appearance of double doors will be considered on a case-by-case basis. For historic garages and garages that face the front or are visible from the right-of-way, the following replacement door is allowed:

- a. Wood is preferred. However, wood composite or metal with composite trim can be considered on a case-by-case basis. Vinyl is prohibited.
- b. The original size, height, and width of doors must be maintained.
- c. Designs must match the style of the original historic garage door.

Considerations/Issues:

This structure is noncontributing to the Southridge Historic District. The *Guidelines* permit the Commission to consider wood or metal doors with composite trim for a front-facing garage door that has visibility from the right-of-way. Since this is a non-historic structure, and the applicant proposes to match the existing door in design and materials, it is reasonable to allow the requested replacement.

The Commission would need to determine whether the replacement of the existing metal and composite overlay garage door with the same type of door meets the *Preservation Guidelines* and is compatible with the principal structure and the Southridge Historic District.

Commission Action:

(HD 25-29) Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of a Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 630 Okmulgee Street for the following modification: B) replacement of overhead garage door.