



## CITY OF NORMAN, OK STAFF REPORT

---

**MEETING DATE:** 03/03/2025

**REQUESTER:** Brent Maze

**PRESENTER:** Anais Starr, Planner II/Historic District Preservation Officer

**ITEM TITLE:** (HD 24-03) CONSIDERATION OF APPROVAL, REJECTION, AMENDMENT, AND/OR POSTPONEMENT OF THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS REQUEST FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 627 OKMULGEE STREET FOR THE FOLLOWING MODIFICATIONS: A) REPLACEMENT OF WINDOW. (POSTPONED FROM THE FEBRUARY 3, 2024 MEETING)

---

### **Property History**

#### **Historical Survey Information**

##### **2014 Southridge Historic District Nomination Survey Information:**

**643 Okmulgee Street.** 1949. Modern Movement, Ranch Style. This contributing one-story, brick, single dwelling has a moderate pitched, asphalt covered, hipped roof and a brick foundation. The metal windows are casement. The partial porch is inset under the main roof and has wood square supports. The integral single car garage has a paneled overhead door. There is a brick chimney towards the rear of the house.

#### **Sanborn Map Information**

This portion of the Southridge Historic District is not on the Sanborn Maps.

#### **Previous Actions**

There have not been any COA requests for this property since the establishment of the Southridge Historic District in 2016.

**February 3, 2025** – A COA request for replacement of windows was postponed to allow the applicant time to research and revise proposed replacement windows for the structure. The COA request to replace the door with a custom wood door was approved.

#### **Overall Project Description**

The applicant requested replacement of the casement windows at the February 3, 2025 Historic District Meeting. The Commission indicated that the replacement windows submitted for the request did not meet the Guidelines and requested the applicant research window replacement with simulated-divided panes and exterior mullions. The applicant has submitted a new presentation with metal windows which meet these specifications.

## **REQUESTS**

### **Project Description**

#### **a) Replacement of windows**

The property owner is interested in improving the appearance and energy efficiency of the house. To help meet these goals, the applicant proposes to replace the deteriorated casement windows with custom aluminum windows. The custom metal windows will match the existing size and window pane configuration. As noted earlier, the applicant is proposing simulated-divided metal windows with exterior mullions. The house has metal storm windows installed over the windows. The owner intends to remove the storm windows.

### **Reference - Historic District Ordinance**

**429.3.1(g):** *To safeguard the heritage of the City by preserving and regulating historic district structures in such a way that maintains or restores their historic integrity while allowing modern day uses and conveniences for their residents. (0-0910-12).*

**429.3.3(c):** *Changes to rear elevations do require a COA; however the rear elevation of a historic structure is considered a secondary elevation and is therefore regulated to a lower standard to allow flexibility for additions or other modern day appurtenances. (0-0910-12).*

### **Reference - Preservation Guidelines**

#### **3.12 Guidelines for Windows**

*A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):*

- .1 Retain Original Windows.** *Retain and preserve original windows, including glass, frames, sash, muntins, sills, heads, moldings, surrounds, and hardware.*
- .2 Retain Historic Glass.** *Retain original glass in historic windows if at all possible. Leaded glass windows shall be preserved. Bubbles and waves give old glass its distinctive look and add to the historic character of the house.*
- .5 Replace Only Deteriorated Features.** *If replacement of a deteriorated window or door feature or details is necessary, replace only the deteriorated feature in-kind rather than the entire unit. Broken sash cords, for example, can be repaired and do not necessitate replacing an entire window. Match the original in design, dimension, placement, and material.*
- .7 Window Replacement.** *An original window that is deteriorated more than 50% and is not repairable may be replaced in-kind if it meets the following:*
  - a. Shall have a wood exterior, unless replacing a metal casement window.*
  - b. Light patterns same as the original.*
  - c. Size and dimension the same as the original.*
  - d. Double-pane simulated divided lights with wood muntins on the exterior and interior and a shadow bar between the panes may be allowed for windows on the side or rear that are not visible from the street.*
- .10 Materials.** *Wood is allowable for in-kind replacement of windows. Aluminum-clad and metal windows can be considered for the replacement of metal casement windows that are deteriorated on a case-by-case basis. Fiberglass and aluminum-clad windows can be considered on non-contributing resources and on rear elevations not visible from the front right-*

*of-way. Vinyl-clad windows are prohibited for both contributing and non-contributing structures in the historic districts.*

### **Issues and Considerations**

This structure was built post-1944 within the period of significance for the Southridge Historic District, and is designated as a contributing structure to the District. The existing windows are original to this contributing historic structure.

The *Guidelines for Windows* encourage the preservation and retention of original windows. The *Guidelines* allow original windows to be replaced if the Commission determines the windows have deteriorated more than 50% and are not repairable. The applicant has submitted pictures showing the deteriorated state of the existing windows. The applicant has sought contractors to repair the windows, and as of the writing of this staff report, the applicant had not successfully obtained such a contractor. If the applicant can find a contractor, he plans to restore the front façade windows while replacing the remaining windows in the structure.

The *Guidelines* allow aluminum or metal windows to be considered for the replacement of metal casement windows on a case-by-case review. The Commission has reviewed five previous requests to replace metal casement windows on non-contributing structures. The Commission approved the replacement of casement windows with aluminum or metal windows in non-contributing structures at 415 S Lahoma, 720 S Lahoma, 1320 Oklahoma Avenue, and 727 Chautauqua. For the property at 713 Cruce, the Commission required the retention of the original casement windows on the front of the structure, while allowing the replacement of side and rear windows.

As stated earlier in this report, the Commission requested the applicant research more suitable window replacements. The applicant is now proposing simulated-divided metal windows with exterior mullions. This meets the *Guidelines for Windows* for replacement material for metal casement windows.

The Commission would need to determine whether replacement of the original casement windows with the proposed metal windows in this contributing structure will meet the *Preservation Guidelines* and whether such work is compatible with the historic structure and the District as a whole.

**Commission Action:** (HD 24-03) Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of the Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 627 Okmulgee Street for the following modification: a) replacement of windows.