



CITY OF NORMAN, OK STAFF REPORT

MEETING DATE: 05/06/2024

REQUESTER: JT MURRELL

PRESENTER: ANAIS STARR, PLANNER II

ITEM TITLE: (HD 24-05) CONSIDERATION OF APPROVAL, REJECTION, AMENDMENT, AND/OR POSTPONEMENT OF THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS REQUEST FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 221 E ALAMEDA STREET FOR THE FOLLOWING MODIFICATIONS: A) REPLACEMENT OF REAR METAL WINDOW WITH WOOD WINDOW; AND B) INSTALLATION OF FRONT PORCH RAILINGS (POSTPONED FROM THE APRIL 8, 2024 MEETING).

Property Location **221 E Alameda Street
Miller Historic District**

Owner **JT Murrell**

Request **(HD 24-05) Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of the Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 221 E Alameda Street for the following modifications:**

- a) replacement of rear metal window with wood window;**
- b) installation of front porch railings (postponed from the April 8, 2024 Meeting).**

Property History **Historical Information**

This property was not included in the historic surveys conducted for the Miller Historic District in 1988 and 2004. As a result, there is not a survey sheet from which to provide historical/architectural descriptions of this property. However, the Miller District map adopted by the City Council in 1997 indicates that the house on this property is a contributing structure to the Miller Historic District. Additionally, the 1944 Sanborn Map shows the house in its current location without the west wing of the structure, indicating that the addition is post-1944 construction. Staff has visited the property and the house appears consistent with pre-1944 construction. Therefore, due to its designation on the adopted map of the Miller Historic District and its consistency with the 1920-1940s construction, this property should be treated as a contributing structure to the Miller Historic District.

Sanborn Insurance Maps

The principal structure is indicated in its present location on the 1925 and 1944 Sanborn Maps without the west wing of the house, indicating this addition was constructed after 1944.

Previous Actions

April 8, 2024 – A COA was approved for removal of French doors on front façade and replacement with windows; removal of window on the front façade and replacement with siding; modification of the rear door entry, as submitted; replacement of metal porch columns with smooth painted wood columns not to exceed 6” x 6”, and trim around top and bottom. The COA request for shutters and a metal roof cap was denied.

Overall Project Description

The applicant has recently purchased this property and sought exterior modifications at the April 8, 2024, Historic District Commission meeting. At that meeting, the Commission requested the applicant postpone the porch railing request and return with revisions based on the feedback received regarding the railing design. The applicant has now revised the porch railing drawings and is returning with the new version for approval. The applicant is also requesting to replace the small metal window on the rear of the structure with a wood window.

a) Replace metal window on the rear of the structure with a wood window;

Project Description

The applicant proposes to replace a small metal window located on the rear of the structure with a custom built or salvaged wood window as illustrated on the submitted rendering.

Reference - *Preservation Guidelines*

The Historic District Commission will utilize the following *Preservation Guidelines* for review of the proposed work for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA).

3.12 *Guidelines for Windows*

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

- .1 *Retain Original Windows.*** *Retain and preserve original windows, including glass, frames, sash, muntins, sills, heads, moldings, surrounds, and hardware.*
- .2 *Retain Historic Glass.*** *Retain original glass in historic windows if at all possible. Leaded glass windows shall be preserved. Bubbles and waves give old glass its distinctive look and add to the historic character of the house.*
- .3 *Glass Replacement.*** *Individual panes of historic glass that have been broken or cracked, may be replaced with modern-day clear glass. Salvaged historic glass or reproduction historic “wavy” glass is also acceptable replacement where historic glass was present.*
- .5 *Replace Only Deteriorated Features.*** *If replacement of a deteriorated window or door feature or details is necessary, replace only the deteriorated feature in-kind rather than the entire unit. Broken sash cords, for example, can be repaired and do not necessitate replacing an entire window. Match the original in design, dimension, placement, and material.*
- .6 *Sash Replacement.*** *Replacement sash, often referred to as sash replacement kits, are acceptable for use in historic structures. However, replacement window sash shall be unclad*

wood, with single-pane thickness, true divided light patterns that match the historic muntin pattern and profile of the house.

.7 Window Replacement. An original window that is deteriorated more than 50% and is not repairable may be replaced in-kind if it meets the following:

a. Shall have a wood exterior, unless replacing a metal casement window.

b. Light patterns same as the original.

c. Size and dimension the same as the original.

d. Double-pane simulated divided lights with wood muntins on the exterior and interior and a shadow bar between the panes may be allowed for windows on the side or rear that are not visible from the street.

.8 Retain Original Metal Windows. Replace original metal casement windows only as a last resort after weatherization measures have proven unsuccessful.

.9 Preserve Original Openings. Do not create new openings in the front or side façades of historic structures. Do not enlarge or diminish existing openings to fit stock window sizes. If new openings are necessary to meet code requirements, they shall be compatible with historic windows for that structure in proportion, shape, location, pattern, size, materials, and details.

.10 Materials. Wood is allowable for in-kind replacement of windows. Aluminum-clad and metal windows can be considered for the replacement of metal casement windows that are deteriorated on a case-by-case basis. Fiberglass and aluminum-clad windows can be considered on non-contributing resources and on rear elevations not visible from the front right-of-way. Vinyl-clad windows are prohibited for both contributing and non-contributing structures in the historic district.

Issues and Considerations

The *Guidelines* state original historic material should not be removed, especially windows. The existing metal window is not original to the house and therefore historic material will not be removed. The applicant proposes to match the existing windows in regards to material and pane configuration which meets the *Guidelines*.

The Commission would need to determine if the proposed replacement of the small metal window on the rear of the house with a wood window meets the *Preservation Guidelines* and whether or not such proposed work is compatible with this historic structure and the District as a whole.

Commission Action:

(HD 24-05) Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of the Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 221 E Alameda Street for the following modifications: a) Replace metal window on the rear of the structure with a wood window;

b) Install front porch railings

Project Description

The applicant wishes to improve the front porch appearance and increase safety by installing wood railings as illustrated on submitted drawings.

Reference – Preservation Guidelines

3.16 Guidelines for Entrances, Porches, and Balconies

The Historic District Commission will use following criteria for review of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

.1 Preserve Original Entrances, Porches, and Balconies. Retain and preserve entrances, porches, and balconies that contribute to the overall historic character of a building, including columns, pilasters, piers, entablatures, balustrades, sidelights, fanlights, transoms, steps, railings, floors, and ceilings.

.2 Replace Only Deteriorated Elements. If replacement of a deteriorated detail or element of an entrance, porch, or balcony feature is necessary, replace only the deteriorated detail or element in-kind rather than the entire feature. Match the original in design, dimension, and material. Compatible substitute materials can be considered only if using the original material is not available.

.3 Match Original. If full replacement of an entrance, porch, or balcony is necessary, replace it in-kind, matching the original in design, dimension, detail, texture, and material. Compatible substitute materials can be considered only if original material is no longer available.

.4 Replace Missing Features. Replace missing entrance, porch, or balcony features with a new feature based on accurate documentation of the missing original or a new design compatible with the historic character of the building and the district.

.7 Avoid Removing Details. It is not appropriate to remove any detail material associated with entrances and porches, such as graining, beveled glass, or bead board, unless an accurate restoration requires it.

.8 Avoid Changes to Primary Façades. It is not appropriate to remove an original entrance or porch or to add a new entrance or porch on a primary façade.

.9 Avoid False Historical Appearances. Features or details that are introduced to a house shall reflect its style, period, and design. Features shall not create a false historical appearance by reflecting other time periods, styles, or geographic regions of the country.

.10 Maintain Porch Elevation. At no time shall the porch elevation be lowered to grade and steps redesigned.

.11 Maintain Wood Elements. Wood porch floors and columns may require an eventual replacement due to moisture penetration; wood floors and columns shall only be replaced with wood of the same profile and dimension.

12. New Balconies and Porches. Balconies and porches built on the rear and not visible from the front right-of-way are to be constructed to be compatible with the principal structure in material, scale, and size. New balconies or porches on the front or side of a historic structure will only be considered if there is historic evidence that one existed. The design and materials are to be based on historic evidence of the design or be a design seen in similar structures in the historic neighborhood.

13. Respect Design. Original design, construction, and materials shall be respected on primary façades. Installation of non-original materials, such as decorative tile, is not appropriate.

Issues and Considerations

The *Preservation Guidelines* indicated the addition of features to an historic front porch is not appropriate. It is unclear if porch railings existed at one point on this structure. In the past, the Commission has allowed installation of simple railings, as proposed here, for safety reasons. Per the *Guidelines*, new features, should reflect the style, period, and design of the historic structure and not create a false sense of history.

The proposed revised railings are similar to those seen on structures in the Miller Historic District. The railings appear to meet the *Guidelines* for materials, location and design.

The Commission would need to determine if installation of railings as submitted meets the *Preservation Guidelines* and whether or not such proposed work is compatible with this historic house and the District as a whole.

Commission Action: (HD 24-05) Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of the Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 221 E Alameda Street for the following modifications: b) install front porch railings.