



## CITY OF NORMAN, OK STAFF REPORT

---

**MEETING DATE:** 01/08/2024

**REQUESTER:** RYAN FIGHTMASTER

**PRESENTER:** ANAIS STARR, PLANNER I

**ITEM TITLE:** (HD 23-45) CONSIDERATION OF APPROVAL, REJECTION, AMENDMENT, AND/OR POSTPONEMENT OF AN AMENDMENT TO A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS (HD 23-31) FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 606 MILLER AVENUE TO: 1) REPLACE EXTERIOR SIDING ON THE HOUSE AND GARAGE WITH WOOD SHIPLAP SIDING; 2) RECONSTRUCT THE NON-ORIGINAL FRONT PORCH WITH WOOD COLUMNS AND A METAL ROOF AS SHOWN ON SUBMITTED DRAWINGS.

---

<b><u>Property Location</u></b>	<b>606 Miller Avenue</b> <b>Miller Historic District</b>
<b><u>Owner</u></b>	<b>Ryan Fightmaster</b>
<b><u>Request</u></b>	<b>(HD 23-45) Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of an amendment to a Certificate of Appropriateness (HD 23-31) for the property located at 606 Miller Avenue to: 1) replace exterior siding on the house and garage with wood shiplap siding; 2) reconstruct the non-original front porch with wood columns and a metal roof as shown on submitted drawings.</b>

### **Property History**

#### **Historical Information**

##### **2004 Miller Historic District Nomination Survey Information:**

606 South Miller Avenue. Ca. 1909. Bungalow/Craftsman. This noncontributing, two-story, asbestos-sided, single dwelling has a concrete foundation and an asphalt-covered, gabled roof. The replacement metal windows are four-over-four hung and the wood door is paneled. The full-width porch has been altered to a flat, fiber-glass roof supported by wrought iron columns. Other exterior features include a clipped gabled dormer. Decorative details include double windows and art glass in the wing window. There is a garage to the rear. The buildings are noncontributing due to a lack of historic integrity.

## **Sanborn Insurance Maps**

The primary structure is indicated in its present location on the 1925 and 1944 Sanborn map and also show a garage structure on the northwest corner of property. This indicates that the present-day garage structure located on the southwest corner of the property was constructed post-1944.

## **Previous Actions**

**October 2, 2023** - A Certificate of Appropriateness was approved for replacement of exterior siding on the house and garage with alternative material and for the addition of an alternative material soffit to the garage; replacement of a rear window and door with metal windows; and modification of the non-original front porch, all as submitted except the front porch columns are to be composed of smooth painted surface material, either wood or alternative material.

## **Overall Project Description**

As indicated above, the applicant received a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the cement shingles with an alternative material lap siding in an eight (8") inch width. Additionally, the Certificate of Appropriateness approved the encasing of the metal front porch columns with wood and replacement of the fiberglass roof with metal roofing. Staff visited the site on December 13, 2023 and found the front porch completely removed and wood shiplap siding being installed. The Historic Preservation Officer issued a "Stop Work" order on December 14, 2023 as these two work elements did not meet the approved COA issued.

Prior to the commencement of construction at this site, the property owner and the contractor were unable to find the alternative material siding in the smooth finish and substituted the wood shiplap believing it would be acceptable substitute. Additionally, the applicant's contractor removed the entire front porch while removing the cement shingles from the house's exterior walls. The applicant is now requesting to amend their COA for replacement of the cement siding with five (5') inch wood shiplap and to be allowed to reconstruct the porch utilizing solid wood columns instead of re-installing metal columns and then encasing them. The remainder of the porch is to be reconstructed except the metal roofing will replace the fiberglass siding as previously approved and shown in submitted drawings.

## **1) TO REPLACE EXTERIOR SIDING ON THE HOUSE AND GARAGE WITH WOOD SHIPLAP SIDING**

### **Reference - Historic District Ordinance**

**36-535.c.2.g.3.** *Reviewing non-contributing structures. Non-contributing structures should be controlled only to the degree necessary to make them compatible with the general atmosphere of any district with regard to exterior alteration, additions, signs, site work and related activities.*

## **Exterior Walls**

### **3.1 Standards for Administrative Bypass**

*The following items can receive a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) through the Administrative Bypass process if they meet the criteria listed. If they do not meet the criteria, the application will be forwarded to the Historic District Commission for a full review.*

**.1 Removal of wall materials.** *Removal of non-original or contemporary synthetic materials to reveal existing historic materials is permitted. If existing historic siding material underneath the non-original or contemporary synthetic materials has been removed, the reinstallation of appropriate/compatible material requires review by the Historic District Commission.*

### **3.2 Guidelines**

*A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):*

**.1 Preserve Original Walls.** *Retain and preserve exterior walls that contribute to the overall historic form and character of a building, including functional and decorative features and details.*

**.2 Retain Original Building Materials.** *Retain and preserve exterior wall materials that contribute to the overall historic character of a building.*

**.3 Replace Only Deteriorated Portions.** *If replacement of a deteriorated wall or feature is necessary, replace only the deteriorated portion in-kind rather than the entire feature. Match the original in material, design, dimension, detail, texture, and pattern. Compatible substitute materials can be considered if in-kind replacement material are not available or feasible.*

**.4 Avoid Covering Original Materials.** *Building materials and decorative elements are important character-defining components of historic buildings. It is not appropriate to remove or cover any wall material or detail with coatings or contemporary substitute materials. Vinyl and aluminum siding is not appropriate for use in historic districts.*

**.5 Replace Missing Features.** *When replacing an exterior wall or feature, replace it with a new wall or feature based on accurate documentation of the original or a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Compatible substitute materials can be considered if in-kind replacement material are not available or feasible.*

**.6 Avoid False Historical Appearances.** *Features or details of walls and fences that are introduced to a property shall reflect its style, period, and design. Fences and walls features shall not create a false historical appearance by reflecting other time periods, styles, or geographic regions of the country.*

**.7 Substitute Materials.** *Cement fiberboard (e.g. Hardiplank® siding) will be considered on a case-by-case basis. Exterior insulating and finish systems (EIFS) will not be considered for use in historic structures.*

## Staff Comments

This request is an *ex post facto* review of proposed work which requires the Commission to review the case as if the work has not occurred.

The applicant was approved to replace the existing cement shingle with either eight (8") inch wood composite or cement fiber lap siding as this material most closely emulated the look of wood lap siding seen in the Miller Historic District. The *Preservation Guidelines* state that non-contributing structures, such as these, should only be controlled to the degree necessary to make them compatible with the general atmosphere of any district with regard to exterior alterations. The proposed five (5") inch wood shiplap siding is not an exterior material seen in the Miller Historic District.

The Commission would need to determine if five (5") inch wood shiplap siding meets the *Preservation Guidelines* and determine if it is compatible with the surrounding neighborhood.

**Commission Action:** Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of an amendment to a Certificate of Appropriateness (HD 23-31) for the property located at 606 Miller Avenue to: 1) replace exterior siding on the house and garage with wood shiplap siding;

## **2) RECONSTRUCT THE NON-ORIGINAL FRONT PORCH WITH WOOD COLUMNS AND A METAL ROOF AS SHOWN ON SUBMITTED DRAWING.**

### Reference - Historic District Ordinance

**36-535.c.2.g.3.** *Reviewing non-contributing structures. Non-contributing structures should be controlled only to the degree necessary to make them compatible with the general atmosphere of any district with regard to exterior alteration, additions, signs, site work and related activities.*

### Reference – Preservation Guidelines

#### **3.16 Guidelines for Entrances, Porches, and Balconies**

*The Historic District Commission will use following criteria for review of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):*

**.1 Preserve Original Entrances, Porches, and Balconies.** *Retain and preserve entrances, porches, and balconies that contribute to the overall historic character of a building, including columns, pilasters, piers, entablatures, balustrades, sidelights, fanlights, transoms, steps, railings, floors, and ceilings.*

**.2 Replace Only Deteriorated Elements.** *If replacement of a deteriorated detail or element of an entrance, porch, or balcony feature is necessary, replace only the deteriorated detail or element in-kind rather than the entire feature. Match the original in design, dimension, and material. Compatible substitute materials can be considered only if using the original material is not available.*

- .3 Match Original.** *If full replacement of an entrance, porch, or balcony is necessary, replace it in-kind, matching the original in design, dimension, detail, texture, and material. Compatible substitute materials can be considered only if original material is no longer available.*
- .4 Replace Missing Features.** *Replace missing entrance, porch, or balcony features with a new feature based on accurate documentation of the missing original or a new design compatible with the historic character of the building and the district.*
- .5 Screen Porches Carefully.** *Consider the screening of a historic porch only if the alteration is reversible and can be designed to preserve the historic character of the porch and the building.*
- .6 Avoid Enclosures.** *It is not appropriate to enclose a front porch or a front balcony.*
- .7 Avoid Removing Details.** *It is not appropriate to remove any detail material associated with entrances and porches, such as graining, beveled glass, or bead board, unless an accurate restoration requires it.*
- .8 Avoid Changes to Primary Façades.** *It is not appropriate to remove an original entrance or porch or to add a new entrance or porch on a primary façade.*
- .9 Avoid False Historical Appearances.** *Features or details that are introduced to a house shall reflect its style, period, and design. Features shall not create a false historical appearance by reflecting other time periods, styles, or geographic regions of the country.*
- .10 Maintain Porch Elevation.** *At no time shall the porch elevation be lowered to grade and steps redesigned.*
- .11 Maintain Wood Elements.** *Wood porch floors and columns may require an eventual replacement due to moisture penetration; wood floors and columns shall only be replaced with wood of the same profile and dimension.*
- 12. New Balconies and Porches.** *Balconies and porches built on the rear and not visible from the front right-of-way are to be constructed to be compatible with the principal structure in material, scale, and size. New balconies or porches on the front or side of a historic structure will only be considered if there is historic evidence that one existed. The design and materials are to be based on historic evidence of the design or be a design seen in similar structures in the historic neighborhood.*
- 13. Respect Design.** *Original design, construction, and materials shall be respected on primary façades. Installation of non-original materials, such as decorative tile, is not appropriate.*

## **Staff Comments**

This request is an *ex post facto* review of proposed work which requires the Commission to review the case as if the work has not occurred.

The applicant is proposing to reconstruct the porch, however, he wishes to use solid wood columns instead of encasing the metal porch columns as previously approved. He will still utilize metal roofing as previously approved and will keep the original design of the porch as shown in his submitted drawings.

As indicated during the original COA approval review in October, the porch is made of metal indicating it is a modern-day addition. The applicant's proposal to add solid wood columns and fascia, would make this front porch more compatible with the neighborhood.

There is no other proposed changes to the porch - the design will remain the same as previously approved.

The Commission would need to determine if the reconstruction of the front porch using solid columns and metal roof as shown on submitted drawings on this non-contributing structure meets the *Preservation Guidelines* and if this is compatible with the surrounding Miller Historic District.

**Commission Action:** (HD 23-45) Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of an amendment to a Certificate of Appropriateness (HD 23-31) for the property located at 606 Miller Avenue to: 2) reconstruct the non-original front porch with wood columns and a metal roof as shown on submitted drawings.