



CITY OF NORMAN, OK STAFF REPORT

MEETING DATE: 06/03/2024

REQUESTER: Mark McGuire

PRESENTER: Anais Starr, Planner II

ITEM TITLE: (HD 24-07) CONSIDERATION OF APPROVAL, REJECTION, AMENDMENT, AND/OR POSTPONEMENT OF THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS REQUEST FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 423 S LAHOMA AVENUE FOR THE INSTALLATION OF A COVERED PERGOLA ON AN EXISTING DECK IN THE REAR YARD.

<u>Property Location</u>	423 S Lahoma Ave Chautauqua Historic District
---------------------------------	----------------------------------------------------------

<u>Applicant/Owner</u>	Mark McGuire
-------------------------------	---------------------

<u>Request</u>	(HD 24-07) Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of the Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 423 S Lahoma Avenue for installation of a covered pergola on an existing deck in the rear yard.
-----------------------	------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Property History

Historical Information

2004 Chautauqua Historic District Nomination Survey Information:

421-423 South Lahoma Avenue. Ca. 1929. Tudor Revival. This contributing, one-story, brick duplex has an asphalt-covered, cross-gabled roof and a brick foundation. The wood windows are six-over-one hung and the door is wood slab with a glazed slab storm door. There is a partial porch located on the southwest corner with multiple brick arches. Another brick arched entry porch is located on the northwest corner. Other exterior features include a brick exterior chimney. Decorative details include minimal eaves, clipped gables and triple windows.

This structure was converted to a single-family house some years ago.

Sanborn Map Information

The primary structure is at its present location on the 1944 Sanborn map. No other structures are shown.

Previous Actions

October 11, 2023 – A COA by Administrative Bypass was approved for 280 square foot deck flush to the ground. The deck was installed.

Description

The property owner installed a 280-square-foot deck last fall and is now interested in covering the deck with a 300-square-foot roofed pergola. As indicated on the submitted drawing and material list, he intends to build the roofed pergola out of cedar wood with roll roofing cover. The existing deck is cedar with a finished floor height of 1'6". The roof will be pitched with the cedar posts at 8'6" on the front edge of the deck and the posts at the rear at 7'6" with an overall height of 10' and 9' respectively. The applicant plans to outfit the deck with furniture and a television to create an outdoor living space.

Reference - Historic District Ordinance

429.3.1(g): *To safeguard the heritage of the City by preserving and regulating historic district structures in such a way that maintains or restores their historic integrity while allowing modern day uses and conveniences for their residents. (0-0910-12).*

429.3.3(c): *Changes to rear elevations do require a COA; however the rear elevation of a historic structure is considered a secondary elevation and is therefore regulated to a lower standard to allow flexibility for additions or other modern day appurtenances. (0-0910-12).*

Reference - Preservation Guidelines

2.0 Standards for Administrative Bypass for Garden Structures

The following items can receive a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) through the Administrative Bypass process if they meet the criteria listed. If they do not meet the criteria, the application will be forwarded to the Historic District Commission for a full review.

.1 Garden Structures. *Garden structures such as a pergola or freestanding trellis, 120 square feet or less, located behind the principal structure with limited or no visibility from the front right-of-way. Wood, metal, wood composite or combination of these materials are acceptable. Vinyl structures are prohibited. Building structures greater than 108 square feet require a building permit.*

2.2 Garden Structures Guidelines

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

.1 Garden Structures. *Garden structures, such as pergolas and trellis, larger than 120 square feet, are to be located behind the principal structure with very limited or no visibility from the front right-of-way. Front or side yard installation can be considered if documentation shows one existed historically. Structures abutting or attached to the principal structure will be reviewed as a building addition. Structures that have a roof and/or sides will be reviewed as accessory structures.*

.2 Materials. *Structures are to be comprised of wood. Metal, composite wood or cement fiberboard will be considered on a case-by-case basis. Vinyl is prohibited.*

.3 Height. *Structure shall be no taller than the height of the principal structure.*

4.0 Decks Guidelines

4.1 Standards for Administrative Bypass:

The following items can receive a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) through the

Administrative Bypass process if they meet the criteria listed. If they do not meet the criteria, the application will be forwarded to the Historic District Commission for a full review.

.1 Decks under 300 Square Fee

- a. Less than 300 square feet in total area. Located behind the structure and not visible from the front right-of-way. Corner lots have two front right-of-ways.*
- b. Constructed in a way that makes no permanent changes to the historic structure. Built of compatible wood, wood composite or smooth cement board with functional elements made of metal elements. Synthetic, materials such as plastic and vinyl are prohibited.*
- c. Decks with roofs or walls will be forwarded as a porch or balcony request for a full review by the Historic District Commission.*

4.2 Guidelines

A full review by the Historic District Commission will take the following criteria into consideration before issuing a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

- .1 Protect Historic Structure.* Locate and construct decks so that the historic fabric of the primary structure and its character-defining features and details are not damaged or obscured. Install decks so that they are structurally self-supporting and may be removed in the future without damage to the historic structure.
- .2 Deck Locations.* Front decks are prohibited. Decks on the rear shall be inset from the rear corners to eliminate visibility from the front right-of-way. Decks on corner properties will be reviewed on a case-by-case basis.
- .3 Deck Design Shall Reflect Building Design.* Design decks and their associated railings and steps to reflect the materials, scale, and proportions of the building.
- .4 Align Deck with First Floor Level.* Decks shall be no higher than the building's first-floor level. Visually tie the deck to the building by screening with compatible foundation materials such as skirt boards, lattice, or dense evergreen foundation plantings.
- .5 Preserve Significant Building Elements.* Preserve significant building and site elements and new deck installations are not to obscure or remove significant building or site elements.
- .6 Decks May Not Detract from Overall Character.* It is not appropriate to introduce a deck if it will detract from the overall historic character of the building or the site.

Staff Comments

The applicant proposes to install a covered pergola over the existing deck, which the *Guidelines for Decks* state that decks with roofs be forwarded to the Commission for review as a porch or balcony. Since the proposed structure will be free-standing and not attached to the main structure, the *Porch Guidelines* would not be applicable.

The Historic District Ordinance allows for modern-day convenience such as decks to be located in the rear of the property.

The *Guidelines for Garden Structures* indicate that pergolas are allowed in the rear yard with limited or no visibility, while *Guidelines for Decks* state that decks are to be inset from the edge of the house to limit their visibility. Staff issued a COA by Administrative Bypass last fall for the existing free-standing deck since it had no visibility from the front streetscape due to its low profile. However, with the addition of this covered pergola to the deck, the roof will have some visibility from the front streetscape.

The applicant chose this location to avoid conflicts with the underground sewer and gas line and the overhead OG&E line. The existing deck is located 5'6" from the south property line and 14' from the back of the house. The house is located 9'6" from the south property line. The 6' stockade fence in the side yard will screen a majority of the view of the roofed pergola from the front streetscape. However, due to the 9-10' height of the proposed covered pergola, it will still have limited visibility.

The proposed covered pergola does meet the *Guidelines* for materials and finished floor elevation of not being higher than the finished floor elevation of the house.

However, the Commission would need to determine if this request to install a covered pergola on top of an existing deck meets the *Guidelines* and whether or not it is compatible with this historic structure and the District as a whole.

Commission Action

Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of the request for HD 24-07 Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at 423 S Lahoma Avenue for an installation of a covered pergola on an existing deck in the rear yard