



## CITY OF NORMAN, OK STAFF REPORT

---

**MEETING DATE:** 04/08/2024

**REQUESTER:** JT Murrell

**PRESENTER:** Anais Starr, Planner II

**ITEM TITLE:** (HD 24-05) CONSIDERATION OF APPROVAL, REJECTION, AMENDMENT, AND/OR POSTPONEMENT OF THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS REQUEST FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 221 E ALAMEDA STREET FOR THE FOLLOWING MODIFICATION: A) REMOVAL OF FRENCH DOORS ON FRONT FAÇADE AND REPLACEMENT WITH WINDOWS; B) REMOVAL OF WINDOWS ON THE FRONT FAÇADE AND REPLACEMENT WITH SIDING; C) MODIFICATION OF REAR DOOR ENTRY; D) REPLACEMENT OF METAL PROCH COLUMNS WITH WOOD COLUMNS; E) INSTALLATION OF FRONT PORCH STAIRS AND RAILINGS; F) INSTALLATION OF A ROOF RIDGE CAP; AND G) INSTALLATION OF SHUTTERS ON FRONT FAÇADE.

---

### **Property History**

#### **Historical Information**

The historic surveys conducted in 1988 and 2004 for the Miller Historic District did not survey this property. Therefore, there is not a survey sheet from which to provide historical/architectural descriptions of this property. However, the 1997 Miller District map adopted by City Council indicates that the house on this property is a contributing structure to the Miller Historic District. Also, a house appears on the 1925 and 1944 Sanborn Maps in the same location, however, it does not show a west wing on structure. Staff has viewed the property and the house is of 1944 construction. This property should be treated as contributing to the Miller Historic District.

#### **Sanborn Insurance Maps**

The principal structure is indicated in its present location on the 1925 and 1944 Sanborn map. The west wing of the house is not present on the Sanborn Maps indicating this addition was constructed after 1944.

#### **Previous Actions**

There have been no Certificates of Appropriateness requested for this property.

#### **Overall Project Description**

The applicant has recently purchased this property and is seeking to improve the exterior appearance with several proposed exterior alterations to the house as listed above. The

applicant is also requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to install wood storm windows which can be reviewed by staff through the Administrative Bypass process.

### **a) Remove french doors on front façade and replace with windows**

#### **Project Description**

The applicant proposes to remove the french doors on the front façade and replace with wood windows to match the existing house as shown in the submitted elevations drawings and specifications sheets.

#### **Reference - Preservation Guidelines**

The Historic District Commission will utilize the following *Preservation Guidelines* for review of the proposed work for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA).

#### **Exterior Walls**

##### **3.1 Standards for Administrative Bypass**

*The following items can receive a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) through the Administrative Bypass process if they meet the criteria listed. If they do not meet the criteria, the application will be forwarded to the Historic District Commission for a full review.*

**.1 Removal of wall materials.** *Removal of non-original or contemporary synthetic materials to reveal existing historic materials is permitted. If existing historic siding material underneath the non-original or contemporary synthetic materials has been removed, the reinstallation of appropriate/compatible material requires review by the Historic District Commission.*

##### **3.2 Guidelines**

*A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):*

**.1 Preserve Original Walls.** *Retain and preserve exterior walls that contribute to the overall historic form and character of a building, including functional and decorative features and details.*

**.2 Retain Original Building Materials.** *Retain and preserve exterior wall materials that contribute to the overall historic character of a building.*

**.3 Replace Only Deteriorated Portions.** *If replacement of a deteriorated wall or feature is necessary, replace only the deteriorated portion in-kind rather than the entire feature. Match the original in material, design, dimension, detail, texture, and pattern. Compatible substitute materials can be considered if in-kind replacement material are not available or feasible.*

**.4 Avoid Covering Original Materials.** *Building materials and decorative elements are important character-defining components of historic buildings. It is not appropriate to remove or cover any wall material or detail with coatings or contemporary substitute materials. Vinyl and aluminum siding is not appropriate for use in historic districts.*

**.5 Replace Missing Features.** *When replacing an exterior wall or feature, replace it with a new wall or feature based on accurate documentation of the original or a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Compatible substitute materials can be considered if in-kind replacement material are not available or feasible.*

**.6 Avoid False Historical Appearances.** *Features or details of walls and fences that are introduced to a property shall reflect its style, period, and design. Fences and walls features shall not create a false historical appearance by reflecting other time periods, styles, or geographic regions of the country.*

**.7 Substitute Materials.** Cement fiberboard (e.g. Hardiplank® siding) will be considered on a case-by-case basis. Exterior insulating and finish systems (EIFS) will not be considered for use in historic structures.

### **3.12 Guidelines for Windows**

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

**.1 Retain Original Windows.** Retain and preserve original windows, including glass, frames, sash, muntins, sills, heads, moldings, surrounds, and hardware.

**.2 Retain Historic Glass.** Retain original glass in historic windows if at all possible. Leaded glass windows shall be preserved. Bubbles and waves give old glass its distinctive look and add to the historic character of the house.

**.3 Glass Replacement.** Individual panes of historic glass that have been broken or cracked, may be replaced with modern-day clear glass. Salvaged historic glass or reproduction historic “wavy” glass is also acceptable replacement where historic glass was present.

**.5 Replace Only Deteriorated Features.** If replacement of a deteriorated window or door feature or details is necessary, replace only the deteriorated feature in-kind rather than the entire unit. Broken sash cords, for example, can be repaired and do not necessitate replacing an entire window. Match the original in design, dimension, placement, and material.

**.6 Sash Replacement.** Replacement sash, often referred to as sash replacement kits, are acceptable for use in historic structures. However, replacement window sash shall be unclad wood, with single-pane thickness, true divided light patterns that match the historic muntin pattern and profile of the house.

**.7 Window Replacement.** An original window that is deteriorated more than 50% and is not repairable may be replaced in-kind if it meets the following:

a. Shall have a wood exterior, unless replacing a metal casement window.

b. Light patterns same as the original.

c. Size and dimension the same as the original.

d. Double-pane simulated divided lights with wood muntins on the exterior and interior and a shadow bar between the panes may be allowed for windows on the side or rear that are not visible from the street.

**.8 Retain Original Metal Windows.** Replace original metal casement windows only as a last resort after weatherization measures have proven unsuccessful.

**.9 Preserve Original Openings.** Do not create new openings in the front or side façades of historic structures. Do not enlarge or diminish existing openings to fit stock window sizes. If new openings are necessary to meet code requirements, they shall be compatible with historic windows for that structure in proportion, shape, location, pattern, size, materials, and details.

**.10 Materials.** Wood is allowable for in-kind replacement of windows. Aluminum-clad and metal windows can be considered for the replacement of metal casement windows that are deteriorated on a case-by-case basis. Fiberglass and aluminum-clad windows can be considered on non-contributing resources and on rear elevations not visible from the front right-of-way. Vinyl-clad windows are prohibited for both contributing and non-contributing structures in the historic district.

## **Issues and Considerations**

The *Guidelines* state original historic material should not be removed from the front façade. However, as noted above by the Sanborn Map, this wing of the house is not original and was added post-1944 which is after the period of significance for the Miller Historic District. The *Guidelines* also state original openings should not be altered. The existing french doors are of metal construction which indicates this opening is a modern-day addition to the façade. Since the doors are not historic and are not located in the original historic house, the removal of the doors may meet the *Guidelines*. The proposed windows will match in material, location and size to the existing house which meets the *Guidelines for Windows*.

The Commission would need to determine whether the proposed replacement of the french doors with a set of windows meets the *Preservation Guidelines* and whether or not such proposed work is compatible with this historic structure and the District as a whole.

### **Commission Action:**

(HD 24-05) Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of the Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 221 E Alameda Street for the following modifications: a) remove french doors on front façade and replace with window.

### **b) Remove window on front façade and replace with siding**

The applicant proposes to remove a small window located on the non-original addition in order to facilitate internal programming. The applicant proposes to replace the wood window with siding that matches the existing house as shown in the submitted elevations drawings and specifications sheets.

### **Reference - *Preservation Guidelines***

The Historic District Commission will utilize the following *Preservation Guidelines* for review of the proposed work for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA).

## **Exterior Walls**

### **3.1 Standards for Administrative Bypass**

The following items can receive a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) through the Administrative Bypass process if they meet the criteria listed. If they do not meet the criteria, the application will be forwarded to the Historic District Commission for a full review.

**.1 Removal of wall materials.** *Removal of non-original or contemporary synthetic materials to reveal existing historic materials is permitted. If existing historic siding material underneath the non-original or contemporary synthetic materials has been removed, the reinstallation of appropriate/compatible material requires review by the Historic District Commission.*

### **3.2 Guidelines**

*A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):*

- .1 Preserve Original Walls.** Retain and preserve exterior walls that contribute to the overall historic form and character of a building, including functional and decorative features and details.
- .2 Retain Original Building Materials.** Retain and preserve exterior wall materials that contribute to the overall historic character of a building.
- .3 Replace Only Deteriorated Portions.** If replacement of a deteriorated wall or feature is necessary, replace only the deteriorated portion in-kind rather than the entire feature. Match the original in material, design, dimension, detail, texture, and pattern. Compatible substitute materials can be considered if in-kind replacement material are not available or feasible.
- .4 Avoid Covering Original Materials.** Building materials and decorative elements are important character-defining components of historic buildings. It is not appropriate to remove or cover any wall material or detail with coatings or contemporary substitute materials. Vinyl and aluminum siding is not appropriate for use in historic districts.
- .5 Replace Missing Features.** When replacing an exterior wall or feature, replace it with a new wall or feature based on accurate documentation of the original or a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Compatible substitute materials can be considered if in-kind replacement material are not available or feasible.
- .6 Avoid False Historical Appearances.** Features or details of walls and fences that are introduced to a property shall reflect its style, period, and design. Fences and walls features shall not create a false historical appearance by reflecting other time periods, styles, or geographic regions of the country.
- .7 Substitute Materials.** Cement fiberboard (e.g. Hardiplank® siding) will be considered on a case-by-case basis. Exterior insulating and finish systems (EIFS) will not be considered for use in historic structures.

### **3.12 Guidelines for Windows**

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

- .1 Retain Original Windows.** Retain and preserve original windows, including glass, frames, sash, muntins, sills, heads, moldings, surrounds, and hardware.
- .2 Retain Historic Glass.** Retain original glass in historic windows if at all possible. Leaded glass windows shall be preserved. Bubbles and waves give old glass its distinctive look and add to the historic character of the house.
- .5 Replace Only Deteriorated Features.** If replacement of a deteriorated window or door feature or details is necessary, replace only the deteriorated feature in-kind rather than the entire unit. Broken sash cords, for example, can be repaired and do not necessitate replacing an entire window. Match the original in design, dimension, placement, and material.
- .6 Sash Replacement.** Replacement sash, often referred to as sash replacement kits, are acceptable for use in historic structures. However, replacement window sash shall be unclad wood, with single-pane thickness, true divided light patterns that match the historic muntin pattern and profile of the house.
- .7 Window Replacement.** An original window that is deteriorated more than 50% and is not repairable may be replaced in-kind if it meets the following:
  - a. Shall have a wood exterior, unless replacing a metal casement window.
  - b. Light patterns same as the original.



c. Size and dimension the same as the original.

d. Double-pane simulated divided lights with wood muntins on the exterior and interior and a shadow bar between the panes may be allowed for windows on the side or rear that are not visible from the street.

**.8 Retain Original Metal Windows.** Replace original metal casement windows only as a last resort after weatherization measures have proven unsuccessful.

**.9 Preserve Original Openings.** Do not create new openings in the front or side façades of historic structures. Do not enlarge or diminish existing openings to fit stock window sizes. If new openings are necessary to meet code requirements, they shall be compatible with historic windows for that structure in proportion, shape, location, pattern, size, materials, and details.

**.10 Materials.** Wood is allowable for in-kind replacement of windows. Aluminum-clad and metal windows can be considered for the replacement of metal casement windows that are deteriorated on a case-by-case basis. Fiberglass and aluminum-clad windows can be considered on non-contributing resources and on rear elevations not visible from the front right-of-way. Vinyl-clad windows are prohibited for both contributing and non-contributing structures in the historic district.

### **Issues and Considerations**

The *Guidelines* state original historic material should not be removed from the front façade. However, as noted above, this wing of the house is not original so its removal is possible. The request to replace the windows with wood siding which matches the existing siding on the house meets the *Guidelines* for materials and design.

The Commission would need to determine whether the proposed removal of the window and replacement with wood siding meets the *Preservation Guidelines* and whether or not such proposed work is compatible with this historic house and the District as a whole.

### **Commission Action:**

(HD 24-05) Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of the Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 221 E Alameda Street for the following modifications: b) Remove window on front façade and replace with wood siding.

### **c) Modify rear door entry**

#### **Description**

As part of proposed interior renovations the applicant plans to raise the floor level in the west wing of the house. In order for the rear door opening to meet this new finished floor elevation, the applicant proposes to raise the door opening by 17 inches. He proposes to keep the current door but will need to add new wood stairs to meet the new finished floor elevation.

### **Reference - Historic District Ordinance**

**429.3.1(g):** To safeguard the heritage of the City by preserving and regulating historic district structures in such a way that maintains or restores their historic integrity while allowing modern day uses and conveniences for their residents. (0-0910-12).

**429.3.3(c):** *Changes to rear elevations do require a COA; however the rear elevation of a historic structure is considered a secondary elevation and is therefore regulated to a lower standard to allow flexibility for additions or other modern day appurtenances. (0-0910-12).*

## **Reference – Preservation Guidelines**

### **3.14 Guidelines for Doors**

*A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):*

- .1 Retain and Preserve Original Doors.** *Retain and preserve original doors and door surrounds including frames, glazing, panels, sidelights, fanlights, surrounds, thresholds, and hardware on front doors and side doors visible from the street.*
- .2 Replace Only Deteriorated Features.** *If replacement of a deteriorated door feature or details is necessary, replace only the deteriorated feature in-kind rather than the entire unit.*
- .4 Retain Historic Glass.** *Retain original glass in historic doors. Bubbles and waves give old glass its distinctive look and add to the historic character of the house.*
- .6 Wood Doors.** *Wood doors are required unless there is documentation that other materials were historically used on a particular structure. Keep wood doors appropriately stained or painted to protect from weather.*
- .7 Replacement Doors.** *Replacement doors on a historic structure are to be wood and in appropriate design, size and details in keeping with the style of the house. Installation of steel doors on the front of a historic structure is prohibited. Aluminum clad doors are permissible on rear of the structure upon review on a case-by-case basis.*
- .8 Preserve Original Openings.** *Do not create new openings in the front or side façades of historic structures. Do not enlarge or diminish existing openings to fit stock door sizes. If new openings are necessary to meet code requirements, they shall be compatible with historic doors for that structure in proportion, shape, location, pattern, size, materials, and details.*
- .9 Materials.** *Wood is allowable for in-kind replacement of doors. Fiberglass and aluminum-clad doors can be considered on non-contributing resources and on rear elevations of historic structures when not visible from the front right-of-way. Vinyl is prohibited for historic and non-contributing structures.*

### **Issues and Considerations**

As noted above, this wing of the house is not original allowing for the possibility of modifications. Also, the *Guidelines* allow for alterations on the rear of structures to accommodate modern day conveniences. It seems reasonable to allow for the door opening to be raised 17 inches to help improve the internal programming of the house.

The proposed wood stairs are typical of this style and age of house and meet the *Guidelines* for material and design.

The Commission would need to determine whether the proposed modifications to the rear door entry meet the *Preservation Guidelines* and whether or not such proposed work is compatible with this historic house and the District as a whole.

**Commission Action:** (HD 24-05) Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of the Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 221 E Alameda Street for the following modifications: c) modify rear door entry.

#### **d) Replace metal porch columns with wood columns**

##### **Description**

The applicant wishes to improve the exterior appearance by replacing the non-original metal front porch columns with wood columns as shown on submitted drawings.

##### **Reference – Preservation Guidelines**

#### **3.16 Guidelines for Entrances, Porches, and Balconies**

*The Historic District Commission will use following criteria for review of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):*

**.1 Preserve Original Entrances, Porches, and Balconies.** *Retain and preserve entrances, porches, and balconies that contribute to the overall historic character of a building, including columns, pilasters, piers, entablatures, balustrades, sidelights, fanlights, transoms, steps, railings, floors, and ceilings.*

**.2 Replace Only Deteriorated Elements.** *If replacement of a deteriorated detail or element of an entrance, porch, or balcony feature is necessary, replace only the deteriorated detail or element in-kind rather than the entire feature. Match the original in design, dimension, and material. Compatible substitute materials can be considered only if using the original material is not available.*

**.3 Match Original.** *If full replacement of an entrance, porch, or balcony is necessary, replace it in-kind, matching the original in design, dimension, detail, texture, and material. Compatible substitute materials can be considered only if original material is no longer available.*

**.4 Replace Missing Features.** *Replace missing entrance, porch, or balcony features with a new feature based on accurate documentation of the missing original or a new design compatible with the historic character of the building and the district.*

**.5 Screen Porches Carefully.** *Consider the screening of a historic porch only if the alteration is reversible and can be designed to preserve the historic character of the porch and the building.*

**.6 Avoid Enclosures.** *It is not appropriate to enclose a front porch or a front balcony.*

**.7 Avoid Removing Details.** *It is not appropriate to remove any detail material associated with entrances and porches, such as graining, beveled glass, or bead board, unless an accurate restoration requires it.*

**.8 Avoid Changes to Primary Façades.** *It is not appropriate to remove an original entrance or porch or to add a new entrance or porch on a primary façade.*



**.9 Avoid False Historical Appearances.** Features or details that are introduced to a house shall reflect its style, period, and design. Features shall not create a false historical appearance by reflecting other time periods, styles, or geographic regions of the country.

**.10 Maintain Porch Elevation.** At no time shall the porch elevation be lowered to grade and steps redesigned.

**.11 Maintain Wood Elements.** Wood porch floors and columns may require an eventual replacement due to moisture penetration; wood floors and columns shall only be replaced with wood of the same profile and dimension.

**12. New Balconies and Porches.** Balconies and porches built on the rear and not visible from the front right-of-way are to be constructed to be compatible with the principal structure in material, scale, and size. New balconies or porches on the front or side of a historic structure will only be considered if there is historic evidence that one existed. The design and materials are to be based on historic evidence of the design or be a design seen in similar structures in the historic neighborhood.

**13. Respect Design.** Original design, construction, and materials shall be respected on primary façades. Installation of non-original materials, such as decorative tile, is not appropriate.

### **Issues and Considerations**

The *Preservation Guidelines* state that it is not appropriate to remove features from a porch on the front façade. In the past, the Commission has approved the re-installation of a missing porch based upon documentation of the historic porch. In this case, the applicant does not have documentation of the original design. Per the *Guidelines*, new features, should reflect the style, period, and design of the historic structure and not create a false sense of history. The proposed simple wood columns are similar to those seen on other structures in the Miller Historic District.

The Commission would need to determine if replacement of metal columns with wood columns as submitted meets the *Preservation Guidelines* and whether or not such proposed work is compatible with this historic house and the District as a whole.

### **Commission Action:**

(HD 24-05) Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of the Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 221 E Alameda Street for the following modifications: d) replace metal porch columns with wood columns.

### **e) Install front porch stairs and railings**

#### **Description**

The applicant wishes to improve the front porch appearance by adding new stairs and increase safety by installing wood railings as illustrated on submitted drawings.

### **Issues and Considerations**

The *Preservation Guidelines* state that it is not appropriate to add features to an historic front porch. It is unclear as to whether porch railings existed at one point for this structure. In the past,

the Commission has allowed installation of simple railings, as proposed here, for safety reasons. Per the *Guidelines*, new features, should reflect the style, period, and design of the historic structure and not create a false sense of history.

The proposed railings are similar to those seen on structures in the Miller Historic District. The proposed wood stairs meet the *Guidelines* for materials, location and design.

The Commission would need to determine if installation of railings as submitted meets the *Preservation Guidelines* and whether or not such proposed work is compatible with this historic house and the District as a whole.

**Commission Action:** (HD 24-05) Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of the Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 221 E Alameda Street for the following modifications: e) install front porch stairs and railings.

#### **f) Install a roof ridge cap**

##### **Description**

The applicant wishes to improve the appearance of house by adding a metal cap to the roof ridges.

#### **Exterior Walls**

##### **3.1 Standards for Administrative Bypass**

*The following items can receive a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) through the Administrative Bypass process if they meet the criteria listed. If they do not meet the criteria, the application will be forwarded to the Historic District Commission for a full review.*

**.1 Removal of wall materials.** *Removal of non-original or contemporary synthetic materials to reveal existing historic materials is permitted. If existing historic siding material underneath the non-original or contemporary synthetic materials has been removed, the reinstallation of appropriate/compatible material requires review by the Historic District Commission.*

##### **3.2 Guidelines**

*A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):*

**.1 Preserve Original Walls.** *Retain and preserve exterior walls that contribute to the overall historic form and character of a building, including functional and decorative features and details.*

**.2 Retain Original Building Materials.** *Retain and preserve exterior wall materials that contribute to the overall historic character of a building.*

**.3 Replace Only Deteriorated Portions.** *If replacement of a deteriorated wall or feature is necessary, replace only the deteriorated portion in-kind rather than the entire feature. Match the original in material, design, dimension, detail, texture, and pattern. Compatible substitute materials can be considered if in-kind replacement material are not available or feasible.*

**.4 Avoid Covering Original Materials.** *Building materials and decorative elements are important character-defining components of historic buildings. It is not appropriate to remove or*

cover any wall material or detail with coatings or contemporary substitute materials. Vinyl and aluminum siding is not appropriate for use in historic districts.

**.5 Replace Missing Features.** When replacing an exterior wall or feature, replace it with a new wall or feature based on accurate documentation of the original or a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Compatible substitute materials can be considered if in-kind replacement material are not available or feasible.

**.6 Avoid False Historical Appearances.** Features or details of walls and fences that are introduced to a property shall reflect its style, period, and design. Fences and walls features shall not create a false historical appearance by reflecting other time periods, styles, or geographic regions of the country.

**.7 Substitute Materials.** Cement fiberboard (e.g. Hardiplank® siding) will be considered on a case-by-case basis. Exterior insulating and finish systems (EIFS) will not be considered for use in historic structures.

## **Issues and Considerations**

While the *Preservation Guidelines* do not specifically discuss ridge caps, the *Guidelines* provide guidance that features introduced shall reflect its style, period, and design. The *Guidelines* also state that exterior features shall not create a false historical appearance by reflecting other time periods, styles, or geographic regions of the country.

It is unclear as to whether this house had a metal ridge cap originally and the applicant does not have any documentation that a metal cap once existed. Staff would note that this is not a permanent fixture and could be easily removed in the future.

The Commission would need to determine if installation of metal ridge cap as submitted meets the *Preservation Guidelines* and whether or not such proposed work is compatible with this historic house and the District as a whole.

### **Commission Action:**

(HD 24-05) Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of the Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 221 E Alameda Street to: f) install a roof ridge cap.

### **g) Install shutters on front façade.**

The applicant wishes to improve the appearance of house by adding a shutters to the front façade.

## **Exterior Walls**

### **3.1 Standards for Administrative Bypass**

*The following items can receive a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) through the Administrative Bypass process if they meet the criteria listed. If they do not meet the criteria, the application will be forwarded to the Historic District Commission for a full review.*

**.1 Removal of wall materials.** Removal of non-original or contemporary synthetic materials to reveal existing historic materials is permitted. If existing historic siding material underneath the non-original or contemporary synthetic materials has been removed, the reinstallation of appropriate/compatible material requires review by the Historic District Commission.

### **3.2 Guidelines**

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

**.1 Preserve Original Walls.** Retain and preserve exterior walls that contribute to the overall historic form and character of a building, including functional and decorative features and details.

**.2 Retain Original Building Materials.** Retain and preserve exterior wall materials that contribute to the overall historic character of a building.

**.3 Replace Only Deteriorated Portions.** If replacement of a deteriorated wall or feature is necessary, replace only the deteriorated portion in-kind rather than the entire feature. Match the original in material, design, dimension, detail, texture, and pattern. Compatible substitute materials can be considered if in-kind replacement material are not available or feasible.

**.4 Avoid Covering Original Materials.** Building materials and decorative elements are important character-defining components of historic buildings. It is not appropriate to remove or cover any wall material or detail with coatings or contemporary substitute materials. Vinyl and aluminum siding is not appropriate for use in historic districts.

**.5 Replace Missing Features.** When replacing an exterior wall or feature, replace it with a new wall or feature based on accurate documentation of the original or a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Compatible substitute materials can be considered if in-kind replacement material are not available or feasible.

**.6 Avoid False Historical Appearances.** Features or details of walls and fences that are introduced to a property shall reflect its style, period, and design. Fences and walls features shall not create a false historical appearance by reflecting other time periods, styles, or geographic regions of the country.

**.7 Substitute Materials.** Cement fiberboard (e.g. Hardiplank® siding) will be considered on a case-by-case basis. Exterior insulating and finish systems (EIFS) will not be considered for use in historic structures.

### **Issues and Considerations**

While the *Preservation Guidelines* do not specifically discuss shutters, the *Guidelines* provide guidance that features introduced to an historic house shall reflect its style, period, and design. The *Guidelines* also state that exterior features shall not create a false historical appearance by reflecting other time periods, styles, or geographic regions of the country.

It is unclear as to whether this house had shutters originally and the applicant does not have any documentation that shutters once existed. Staff would note that this is not a permanent fixture and could be easily removed in the future. On past requests for shutters, the Commission has approved shutters which were sized as to be able to be operational even if the shutters are to be fixed.

The Commission would need to determine if installation of shutters as submitted meets the *Preservation Guidelines* and whether or not such proposed work is compatible with this historic house and the District as a whole.

**Commission Action:**

(HD 24-05) Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of the Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 221 E Alameda Street for the following modifications: g) install shutters on front façade.