



CITY OF NORMAN, OK STAFF REPORT

MEETING DATE: 08/07/2023

REQUESTER: CARTER MERKLE, OWNER

PRESENTER: ANAIS STARR, PLANNER II

ITEM TITLE: HD (23-24) CONSIDERATION OF APPROVAL, REJECTION, AMENDMENT, AND/OR POSTPONEMENT OF THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS REQUEST FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 518 SHAWNEE STREET FOR THE REPLACEMENT OF NON-ORIGINAL WOOD WINDOWS WITH WOOD COMPOSITE WINDOWS ON THE REAR OF THE NON-CONTRIBUTING PRINCIPAL STRUCTURE.

Property History

Historical Information

2014 Southridge Historic District Nomination Survey Information:

518 Shawnee. Ca 1939. Modern Movement: Minimal Traditional. This non-contributing, one-story, vinyl sided structure one-story, single dwelling has a moderate pitched, asphalt covered, cross gabled roof and a concrete foundation. The wood windows are six-over-six and eight-over-eight hung with storms. The entry porch is uncovered and has concrete steps. The non-original attached single car garage is on the east side of the façade and has a single paneled overhead door. The porte cochere on east side infilled and converted to single- car garage after 2001.

Sanborn Insurance Maps

This section of Southridge Addition does not appear on the Sanborn Insurance Maps.

Previous Actions

July 17, 2022 - A COA by Administrative Bypass was granted for the replacement of wood windows with wood composite windows on the rear of the structure.

Request: COA for the replacement of non-original wood windows with wood-composite windows on the rear of the non-contributing principal structure.

Project Description

The applicant is seeking to improve the exterior of the house by replacing rotting wood windows with a more durable wood composite windows. He wishes to replace the windows on a rear addition in the house with wood composite windows that have the same pane configuration as the existing windows. The windows and the addition are not original to the house.

Reference - Historic District Ordinance

36-535.c.2.g.3. Reviewing non-contributing structures. Non-contributing structures should be controlled only to the degree necessary to make them compatible with the general atmosphere of any district with regard to exterior alteration, additions, signs, site work and related activities.

Reference - Preservation Guidelines

Windows

3.11 Standards for Administrative Bypass

The following items can receive a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) through the Administrative Bypass process if they meet the criteria listed below. If they do not meet the criteria, the application will be forwarded to the Historic District Commission for a full review.

.1 Window Replacement. An historic window that is deteriorated more than 50% and is not repairable may be replaced in-kind if it meets the following:

- a. Replace original windows in-kind, meaning match the original in material and finish.
- b. Muntin width and profile are same as the original in width and profile.
- c. Light pattern is the same as the original.
- d. True divided lights (panes) are the same as the original glass thickness.
- e. Size and dimension of all window components are the same as the original.
- f. Replacement of less than 50% of the windows on a given elevation.

3.12 Guidelines for Windows

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

.1 Retain Original Windows. Retain and preserve original windows, including glass, frames, sash, muntins, sills, heads, moldings, surrounds, and hardware.

.2 Retain Historic Glass. Retain original glass in historic windows if at all possible. Leaded glass windows shall be preserved. Bubbles and waves give old glass its distinctive look and add to the historic character of the house.

.3 Glass Replacement. Individual panes of historic glass that have been broken or cracked, may be replaced with modern-day clear glass. Salvaged historic glass or reproduction historic "wavy" glass is also acceptable replacement where historic glass was present.

.4 Glass Variations.

- a. Privacy glass may only be located in the rear or on the side of the structure, where not visible from the front. Smoked or tinted glass is not appropriate for use in historic structures.
- b. Beveled glass in doors and windows is allowed as long as it is compatible with style of the historic building and the original configuration of window panes remains.
- c. Colored glass may be used in transoms and sidelights if supported by historical documentation or compatible with the architectural style.

.5 Replace Only Deteriorated Features. If replacement of a deteriorated window or door feature or details is necessary, replace only the deteriorated feature in-kind rather than the entire unit. Broken sash cords, for example, can be repaired and do not necessitate replacing an entire window. Match the original in design, dimension, placement, and material.

.6 Sash Replacement. Replacement sash, often referred to as sash replacement kits, are acceptable for use in historic structures. However, replacement window sash shall be unclad wood, with single-pane thickness, true divided light patterns that match the historic muntin pattern and profile of the house.

- .7 Window Replacement.** *An original window that is deteriorated more than 50% and is not repairable may be replaced in-kind if it meets the following:*
- a. Shall have a wood exterior, unless replacing a metal casement window.*
 - b. Light patterns same as the original.*
 - c. Size and dimension the same as the original.*
 - d. Double-pane simulated divided lights with wood muntins on the exterior and interior and a shadow bar between the panes may be allowed for windows on the side or rear that are not visible from the street.*
- .8 Retain Original Metal Windows.** *Replace original metal casement windows only as a last resort after weatherization measures have proven unsuccessful.*
- .9 Preserve Original Openings.** *Do not create new openings in the front or side façades of historic structures. Do not enlarge or diminish existing openings to fit stock window sizes. If new openings are necessary to meet code requirements, they shall be compatible with historic windows for that structure in proportion, shape, location, pattern, size, materials, and details.*
- .10 Materials.** *Wood is allowable for in-kind replacement of windows. Aluminum-clad and metal windows can be considered for the replacement of metal casement windows that are deteriorated on a case-by-case basis. Fiberglass and aluminum-clad windows can be considered on non-contributing resources and on rear elevations not visible from the front right-of-way. Vinyl-clad windows are prohibited for both contributing and non-contributing structures in the historic districts.*

Staff Comments

The *Historic Preservation Guidelines* allow the Historic Preservation Officer to approve window replacement in-kind with the same material, size, and window pane configuration. In this case, the existing windows to be replaced are non-original wood windows, therefore, staff is was unable to approve the replacement.

The applicant would like to replace the existing wood windows on the rear of the house in a non-original addition on this non-contributing house. He is proposing wood composite due to the significant exposure to the elements that this side of the house receives. It should be noted that this house, while built in the period of significance for the Southridge Historic District, has little historic integrity left due to exterior alterations as indicated in the historic survey above.

The *Historic Preservation Guidelines* encourage the retention of wood windows. However, the *Guidelines* also allow for alternative replacement windows on the rear of structures and for non-contributing structures on a case-by-case basis. It seems reasonable to allow the applicant to replace the modern-day wood windows with wood composite windows on the rear and side of this non-contributing house.

The Commission would need to determine if wood composite window replacements on this non-contributing structure is compatible alteration for this property and the District as a whole.

Commission Action: Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of (HD 23-24) for the property located at 518 Shawnee Street for the replacement of all non-original wood windows with wood composite windows on the rear of the non-contributing principal structure.