

**Property Location**                      716 Chautauqua Ave  
Chautauqua Historic District

**Owner**                                      Ramon Busick  
**Representative**                      Steve Busick (Son)  
CLMSQ2 (Contractor)

**Request**                                      HD    (23-03)    Consideration    of    Certificate    of  
Appropriateness request at 716 Chautauqua Avenue for  
the following proposed work:

a. Removal of original wood siding.

**Property History**

**Historical Information**

**2004 Chautauqua Historic District Survey**

*716 South Chautauqua Avenue. Ca. 1927. Tudor Revival. This contributing, two-story, composition board single dwelling has an asphalt-covered, cross-gabled roof and a concrete foundation. The wood windows are six-over-one hung with metal screens. The wood door is plank with a glazed slab storm. The entry porch is uncovered with wrought iron railings. Other exterior features include two brick interior chimneys and a hipped dormer. Decorative details include minimal eave overhang and double and triple windows.*

**Sanborn Insurance Maps**

The Sanborn Insurance Map indicates a 2-story dwelling with wood siding in the same configuration as seen today.

**Previous Action**

February 6, 2023 – COA for the replacement of wood siding with either smooth cement board or smooth LP Smart Siding was approved.

**Project Description**

The property owner, Mr. Busick, received damage to the existing metal siding in the October 2021 hailstorm and received approval at the February 6, 2023, Historic District Commission Meeting to replace that siding with either smooth cement fiberboard or smooth LP Smart Siding.

Along with the removal of the metal siding, the applicant also requested to remove the original wood siding located underneath the metal siding. The Commission was unsure of the condition of the wood shake shingles. A motion and vote were taken for three Commissioners to review the condition of the wood shingles on-site before a final decision was voted upon.

Commissioners met on site and were due to report back at the Special Meeting scheduled for February 13, 2023. The applicant/property owners requested a postponement to the March 6, 2023 Historic District Meeting.

**Request - a. Removal of wood siding**

**Description**

The applicant wishes to remove the original wood siding underneath the metal siding before installing the proposed alternative siding. The property owner and the contractor had expressed concern about the deterioration of the wood underneath the metal siding.

**Reference - Preservation Guidelines**

***Exterior Walls***

**3.1 Standards for Administrative Bypass**

*The following items can receive a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) through the Administrative Bypass process if they meet the criteria listed. If they do not meet the criteria, the application will be forwarded to the Historic District Commission for a full review.*

**.1 Removal of wall materials.** *Removal of non-original or contemporary synthetic materials to reveal existing historic materials is permitted. If existing historic siding material underneath the non-original or contemporary synthetic materials has been removed, the reinstallation of appropriate/compatible material requires review by the Historic District Commission.*

**3.2 Guidelines**

*A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):*

**.1 Preserve Original Walls.** *Retain and preserve exterior walls that contribute to the overall historic form and character of a building, including functional and decorative features and details.*

**.2 Retain Original Building Materials.** *Retain and preserve exterior wall materials that contribute to the overall historic character of a building.*

**.3 Replace Only Deteriorated Portions.** *If replacement of a deteriorated wall or feature is necessary, replace only the deteriorated portion in-kind rather than the entire feature. Match the original in material, design, dimension, detail, texture, and pattern. Compatible substitute materials can be considered if in-kind replacement material are not available or feasible.*

**.4 Avoid Covering Original Materials.** *Building materials and decorative elements are important character-defining components of historic buildings. It is not appropriate to remove or cover any wall material or detail with coatings or contemporary substitute materials. Vinyl and aluminum siding is not appropriate for use in historic districts.*

**.5 Replace Missing Features.** *When replacing an exterior wall or feature, replace it with a new wall or feature based on accurate documentation of the original or a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Compatible substitute materials can be considered if in-kind replacement material are not available or feasible.*

**.6 Avoid False Historical Appearances.** *Features or details of walls and fences that are introduced to a property shall reflect its style, period, and design. Fences and walls features shall not create a false historical appearance by reflecting other time periods, styles, or geographic regions of the country.*

**.7 Substitute Materials.** *Cement fiberboard (e.g. Hardiplank® siding) will be considered on a case-by-case basis. Exterior insulating and finish systems (EIFS) will not be considered for use in historic structures.*

### **Staff Comments**

The structure at 716 Chautauqua is a contributing structure to the Chautauqua Historic District. The *Preservation Guidelines for Exterior Walls* state that the original wall materials should be preserved if possible. In many cases like this, the wood siding is still viable for scraping and repainting. The removal of wood siding could potentially make this structure a non-contributing structure due to loss of historic integrity. While the addition of alternative siding does impact the structure, it is removable and some future owner could repaint and repair the original wood siding underneath if allowed to remain.

Three Commissioners met on-site on February 13, 2023 to review the condition of the existing wood shake shingles. Staff was at this on-site meeting and took pictures, which are included in the agenda packet. Commissioner Zorba, Commissioner Williamson and Commissioner Halford can report their findings to the rest of the Commission at the meeting.


The Commission would need to determine if the removal of the wood siding meets the Preservation Guidelines and whether the removal would impact this historic structure.

The applicants wish to postpone this request again to the April 3, 2023 as health issues with a family member has slowed their progress on this project.

### **Commission Action**

Approve, deny, postpone or amend the Certificate of Appropriateness request at 716 Chautauqua Avenue for the following proposed work:

- a. Removal of original wood siding.



INTRODUCTION

HardieShingle® Siding  
Straight Edge Panel  
Arctic White

## Is it possible to make your dream home a reality?

With all the stunning design possibilities you have to choose from for the exterior of your home, count on Hardie® fiber cement products to perform beautifully while protecting what you cherish.



It's Possible™

It's easy to get swept away by James Hardie's collection of profiles and products. The closer you look, the more you'll understand why James Hardie is North America's #1 brand of siding; chosen for **over 8 million homes.\***

**HardiePlank® Lap Siding Select Cedarmill® Stone Gray**  
**HardiePanel® Vertical Siding Select Cedarmill®**  
**& HardieTrim® Battens Smooth Stone Gray**  
**HardieTrim® Boards Smooth Cobble Stone**

\*Estimate is based on annual Hardie® siding sales from 1991 through 2016 and average housing unit size for each year.



Discover why James Hardie is the recognized leader at [jameshardie.com/leader](http://jameshardie.com/leader)



























