



April 8, 2025

Frank Sullivan, Jr. – Trustee Sullivan HCP Trust C/O Frank Sullivan, III 1100 E. Taylor Dr. Sallisaw, OK 74955

RE: <u>Notice of Denial Decision for Certificate of Appropriateness application request at 733</u> Chautauqua Ave

Dear Mr. Sullivan:

On April 7, 2025, the Historic District Commission heard the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness (HD 24-20) for the following modifications: a) replacement of exterior siding, soffit, and trim; b) replacement of windows; c) painting of the exterior brick walls for the property located at 733 Chautauqua Avenue.

Commission Decision

After discussion, the Commission voted unanimously to deny the Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) request for the a) replacement of exterior siding, soffit, and trim; b) replacement of windows; c) painting of the exterior brick walls. The Commission found that the requests did not comply with the *Preservation Guidelines*. The COA request (HD 24-20) was denied with a vote of six to zero. The Commissioners referenced the *Preservation Guidelines* when issuing their denial, in particular:

Preservation Guidelines

3.12. Guidelines for Windows

.10 Materials. Wood is allowable for in-kind replacement of windows. Aluminum-clad and metal windows can be considered for the replacement of metal casement windows that are deteriorated on a case-by-case basis. Fiberglass and aluminum—clad windows can be considered on non-contributing resources and on rear elevations not visible from the front right-of-way. Vinyl-clad windows are prohibited for both contributing and non-contributing structures in the historic districts.

3.4 Guidelines for Masonry and Brick Features

.6 Preserve Unpainted Surfaces. It is not appropriate to paint unpainted masonry and brick surfaces that were not painted historically. Repaint previously painted masonry surfaces in colors appropriate to the historic building material, the building, and the district.

3.2 Guidelines for Exterior Walls

.7 **Substitute Materials.** Cement fiberboard (e.g., Hardiplank® siding) will be considered on a case-by-case basis. Exterior insulating and finish systems (EIFS) will not be considered for use in historic structures.

3.7 Guidelines for Synthetic Materials / Stucco

.6 Cement Fiberboard. Cement fiberboard (Hardieplank®) and synthetic wood materials are prohibited except for new construction. These are not comparable substitutes for wood siding except in certain applications. A good use of cement board siding is where it is in contact with the ground, such as the skirt of a pier-and-beam house. Be sure to retain ventilation of the crawl space. If using cement board, use smooth only. Wood used in historic houses was sanded smooth with no obvious grain.

The Commission found that the request for vinyl replacement windows did not meet the *Preservation Guidelines* for material or window pane configuration. The Commission also found the request for painted brick was not permitted by *Preservation Guidelines*. Finally, the Commission found the installed cement fiberboard siding did not meet the requirement for a smooth finish on the material. The Commission noted in discussions of this request that non-contributing structures were to be compatible with the general atmosphere of the District.

Appeals Process

You have the right to appeal the Commission's decision to the Board of Adjustment. The procedure to file an appeal as stated in the Zoning Ordinance is described below:

If the Historic District Commission denies a Certificate of Appropriateness, no permit shall be issued and the applicant shall not proceed with the proposed work. The Commission must place in its record the reasons for the denial and the applicant shall be notified of such determination. Owners, agents and residents may appeal within 10 days from the decision of the Commission by filing an appeal with the Board of Adjustment.

Board of Adjustment application must be filed through the City of Norman Portal System: https://devnorman.normanok.gov/Portal/. In this case, the deadline to file an appeal of the Historic District Commission's decision to the Board of Adjustment is by the end of the business day on April 17, 2025.

Please let me know if would like to proceed with an appeal of the Historic District Commission decision to the Board of Adjustment. Staff is available to discuss any questions and to assist you with the appeal process.

Sincerely,

Anaïs Starr, AICP

Quair Stare

Historic Preservation Officer