



CITY OF NORMAN, OK STAFF REPORT

MEETING DATE: 10/07/2024

REQUESTER: RSH Holdings, L.L.C.

PRESENTER: Anais Starr, Historic Preservation Officer

ITEM TITLE: (HD 24-19) CONSIDERATION OF APPROVAL, REJECTION, AMENDMENT, AND/OR POSTPONEMENT OF CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS REQUEST FOR PROPERTY LOCATED AT 727 CHAUTAUQUA AVE. FOR THE FOLLOWING MODIFICATIONS: A) REPLACEMENT OF EXTERIOR SIDING, SOFFIT, AND TRIM; B) REPLACEMENT OF EXISTING WINDOWS; C) ELIMINATION OF TWO EXTERIOR DOORS; D) ENCLOSURE OF THE EXISTING SUNROOM; E) EXPANSION OF EXISTING APPROACH AND DRIVEWAY.

<u>Property Location</u>	727 Chautauqua Ave
<u>District</u>	Chautauqua Historic District
<u>Owner/Applicant</u>	Evan Nixon
<u>Request</u>	(HD 24-19) Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of Certificate of Appropriateness request for property located at 727 Chautauqua Ave for the following modifications: <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) Replacement of exterior siding, soffit, and trim;b) Replacement of existing windows;c) Elimination of two exterior doors;d) Enclosure of the existing sunroom;e) Expansion of existing approach and driveway.

Property History

Historical Information

2004 Chautauqua Historic District Nomination Survey Information:

Ca. 1946. Minimal Traditional. This noncontributing, one-story, weatherboard single dwelling has an asphalt-covered, cross-gabled roof and a concrete foundation. The wood windows are casement. The wood door is slab with a decorative wood screen door. The entry porch is sheltered by the principal roof and has a single support. Other exterior features include a large,

brick, exterior chimney on the facade and an integral single car garage with a glazed, paneled, overhead door. The house is set towards the back of the lot and is noncontributing due to insufficient age.

Sanborn Insurance Maps

Since this property was constructed after 1944 it does not appear on the Sanborn Insurance maps.

Previous Actions

January 6, 2014 - A COA was granted for driveway re-alignment. It appears that this work was never installed.

Project Overview

The property owner, Evan Nixon, recently purchased this property and is interested in renovating the exterior to improve the appearance and increase the functionality of the property.

REQUESTS

a) Replacement of exterior siding, soffit, and trim

Project Description:

The applicant is proposing to replace the existing wood with smooth Hardie material to improve the appearance and to allow for easier maintenance.

Reference - Historic District Ordinance

36-535.a.2.g: *To safeguard the heritage of the City by preserving and regulating historic district structures in such a way that maintains or restores their historic integrity while allowing modern day uses and conveniences for their residents.*

36.535.c.3: Reviewing non-contributing structures. *Non-contributing structures should be controlled only to the degree necessary to make them compatible with the general atmosphere of any district with regard to exterior alteration, additions, signs, site work and related activities.*

Reference - Preservation Guidelines

Exterior Walls

3.2 Guidelines

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

.1 Preserve Original Walls. *Retain and preserve exterior walls that contribute to the overall historic form and character of a building, including functional and decorative features and details.*

.2 Retain Original Building Materials. *Retain and preserve exterior wall materials that contribute to the overall historic character of a building.*

.7 Substitute Materials. Cement fiberboard (e.g. Hardiplank® siding) will be considered on a case-by-case basis. Exterior insulating and finish systems (EIFS) will not be considered for use in historic structures.

Issues and Considerations:

This structure is a non-contributing property due to the age of the structure. This structure was built post-1944 which is past the period of significance for the Chautauqua Historic District. However, the structure retains its original exterior materials.

The *Guidelines for Exterior Walls* require the retention of the original exterior materials that contribute to a historic structure's character. However, the *Historic District Ordinance* states alterations to non-contributing houses should only be controlled to the degree necessary to make them compatible with the general atmosphere of the district.

In recent years, the Commission has approved cement fiberboard and wood composite siding as replacement materials for vinyl siding, asbestos shingles, or metal siding on contributing and non-contributing structures. Earlier this year, the Commission reviewed and approved requests at 606 Miller Avenue and 1320 Oklahoma Avenue to replace existing cement shingles on a non-contributing structure with cement fiber lap siding. In both of those cases, the structures did not have any wood siding under the cement-shingles materials.

The *Preservation Guidelines* allow for the use of alternative materials on a non-contributing structure on a case-by-case review. The Commission needs to determine if the request to replace the existing wood on the exterior of this non-contributing house with Hardie material meets the *Preservation Guidelines* and whether or not such proposed work is compatible with the District as a whole.

Commission Action:

Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of Certificate of Appropriateness request for property located at 727 Chautauqua Ave for the following modifications: a) Replacement of exterior siding, soffit, and trim.

b) Replacement of existing windows

Project Description:

The applicant wishes to replace the original casement windows in the house to improve security and energy efficiency. This house still retains the original casement windows in the main portion of the house while the addition has both metal windows and wood windows. The windows located in the addition have one-over-one and eight-over-eight window pane configurations.

As shown on the submittal, the applicant is proposing aluminum-clad wood windows. The applicant proposes to match the window pane configuration of the windows on the front of the house which are visible from the street. For the remainder of the windows on the rear of the house, the applicant is proposing one-over-one windows.

Reference - Historic District Ordinance

36-535.a.2.g: *To safeguard the heritage of the City by preserving and regulating historic district structures in such a way that maintains or restores their historic integrity while allowing modern day uses and conveniences for their residents.*

36.535.c.3: *Reviewing non-contributing structures. Non-contributing structures should be controlled only to the degree necessary to make them compatible with the general atmosphere of any district with regard to exterior alteration, additions, signs, site work and related activities.*

Reference - Preservation Guidelines

Windows

3.12 Guidelines for Windows

.1 Retain Original Windows. *Retain and preserve original windows, including glass, frames, sash, muntins, sills, heads, moldings, surrounds, and hardware.*

.7 Window Replacement. *An original window that is deteriorated more than 50% and is not repairable may be replaced in-kind if it meets the following:*

a. *Shall have a wood exterior, unless replacing a metal casement window.*

b. *Light patterns same as the original.*

c. *Size and dimension the same as the original.*

d. *Double-pane simulated divided lights with wood muntins on the exterior and interior and a shadow bar between the panes may be allowed for windows on the side or rear that are not visible from the street.*

.10 Materials. *Wood is allowable for in-kind replacement of windows. Aluminum-clad and metal windows can be considered for the replacement of metal casement windows that are deteriorated on a case-by-case basis. Fiberglass and aluminum-clad windows can be considered on non-contributing resources and on rear elevations not visible from the front right-of-way. Vinyl-clad windows are prohibited for both contributing and non-contributing structures in the historic districts.*

Issues and Considerations:

This structure was built post-1944 which is past the period of significance for the Chautauqua Historic District and therefore was designated a non-contributing structure. However, the structure retains much of its original exterior materials.

The *Guidelines for Windows* encourage the preservation and retention of original windows. The *Guidelines* allow original windows to be replaced if the Commission determines the windows have deteriorated more than 50% and are not repairable. The *Guidelines* allow aluminum-clad windows for non-contributing structures on a case-by-case review. The Historic District Ordinance states that non-contributing structures are to be controlled only to the degree necessary to make them compatible with the District.

The proposed front windows meet the *Guidelines* for window pane configuration. The remainder of the windows on the structure have a variety of pane configurations. The proposed one-over-one windows for the rear of the house are a pane configuration found in the Chautauqua Historic District.

The Commission has reviewed four previous requests to replace casement windows on non-contributing structures.

The Commission reviewed a similar request at 415 S Lahoma in February 2015. In that case, the house was a non-contributing 1960s structure with six of the twelve windows missing. The Commission found the replacement windows had to be aluminum and must have a similar window pane configuration to the original casement windows to be compatible with the District

Another request for the replacement of casement windows on a non-contributing structure at 713 Cruce Street was reviewed in August 2020. The applicants wished to replace all of the windows with metal windows to increase energy efficiency and improve the appearance. The Commission postponed the portion of the request for the front windows, finding that their replacement would significantly alter the appearance of the structure. The remaining windows on the side and rear could be replaced with aluminum windows in the same window pane configuration.

Finally, in July 2022 the Commission reviewed a request at 720 S Lahoma Avenue for the replacement of casement windows on a 1950 non-contributing structure. The Commission ultimately approved the request to allow for repair of the existing window frames, hardware, glazing & glass, or replacement with new windows with the same profile and pane configuration as the existing windows.

The Commission will need to determine if the request to replace the original windows on this non-contributing structure with aluminum-clad windows meets the *Preservation Guidelines* and whether or not such proposed work is compatible with the District as a whole.

Commission Action:

Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of Certificate of Appropriateness request for property located at 727 Chautauqua Ave for the following modifications: b) replacement of existing windows.

c) Elimination of two exterior doors

Project Description:

The applicant proposes to eliminate two exterior doors that are not original to the house. The door located on the front porch currently provides access to the garage. The applicant plans to remove this entryway and provide direct access from the interior of the house to the garage.

The applicant also proposes to remove an entryway located on the rear addition. This door faces the interior backyard and is not visible from the front streetscape. Neither entryway are needed for required egress. The applicant proposes replacing the door openings with siding that matches the rest of the house.

Reference - Historic District Ordinance

36-535.a.2.g: *To safeguard the heritage of the City by preserving and regulating historic district structures in such a way that maintains or restores their historic integrity while allowing modern day uses and conveniences for their residents.*

36.535.c.3: *Reviewing non-contributing structures. Non-contributing structures should be controlled only to the degree necessary to make them compatible with the general atmosphere of any district with regard to exterior alteration, additions, signs, site work and related activities.*

Reference - Preservation Guidelines

3.14 Guidelines

.1 Retain and Preserve Original Doors. Retain and preserve original doors and door surrounds including frames, glazing, panels, sidelights, fanlights, surrounds, thresholds, and hardware on front doors and side doors visible from the street.

.8 Preserve Original Openings. Do not create new openings in the front or side façades of historic structures. Do not enlarge or diminish existing openings to fit stock door sizes. If new openings are necessary to meet code requirements, they shall be compatible with historic doors for that structure in proportion, shape, location, pattern, size, materials, and details.

Issues and Considerations:

The *Guidelines for Doors* require the retention of original doors and entryways. Both entryways proposed for removal appear to not be original to the house. The proposal for siding that matches the rest of the house would meet the *Guidelines*.

The Commission will need to determine if the request to remove two exterior doors and replace the openings with lap siding that matches the rest of the house on this non-contributing structure meets the *Preservation Guidelines* and whether or not such proposed work is compatible with the District as a whole.

Commission Action:

Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of Certificate of Appropriateness request for property located at 727 Chautauqua Ave for the following modifications: c) elimination of two exterior doors.

d) Enclosure of the existing sunroom

Project Description:

The existing sunroom on the rear of the house is comprised of storm windows and a storm door. The applicant proposes to replace the existing storm window walls with walls containing two windows and a door as shown on the elevation drawing submitted.

Reference - Historic District Ordinance

36-535.a.2.g: *To safeguard the heritage of the City by preserving and regulating historic district structures in such a way that maintains or restores their historic integrity while allowing modern day uses and conveniences for their residents.*

36.535.c.3: *Reviewing non-contributing structures. Non-contributing structures should be controlled only to the degree necessary to make them compatible with the general atmosphere of any district with regard to exterior alteration, additions, signs, site work and related activities.*

Reference - Preservation Guidelines

Guidelines for Additions to Historic Buildings

4.4 Guidelines for Additions

.1 Make Additions Compatible. *Additions shall be compatible with the historic building in size, scale, mass, materials, proportions and the pattern of windows and doors to solid walls.*

Guidelines for Windows

.12 Additions. *For construction of additions, choose windows that match the original structure. While single-pane, true divided light, wood frame windows are the most desirable choice for new construction in historic districts, double-pane glass wood windows with interior and exterior applied muntins and shadow bars between the panes are permitted. Aluminum cladding of wooden windows is permissible for use in additions. Vinyl or vinyl-clad windows are prohibited.*

Guidelines for Doors

.11 Additions. *For construction of additions, choose doors that match the original structure. Aluminum-clad wood doors are permissible for use in additions that are not visible from the front right-of-way. Fiberglass doors can be considered on a case-by-case basis.*

Issues and Considerations:

The *Preservation Guidelines* do not directly address the reconstruction of a non-original addition. However, the *Guidelines* in general require the construction of additions to match the remainder of the house for design, proportions, and materials. Additionally, the *Guidelines* allow aluminum-clad windows and doors for additions.

The Commission would need to determine if the proposed enclosure of the existing sunroom on this non-contributing structure would meet the *Guidelines* and be compatible with this house and the District as a whole.

Commission Action:

Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of Certificate of Appropriateness request for property located at 727 Chautauqua Ave for the following modifications: d) enclosure of the existing sunroom.

e) Expansion of existing approach and driveway

Project Description:

The applicant is proposing to widen the approach and driveway to match the width of the existing driveway width that is located in front of the garage. The existing driveway at the sidewalk is 10' which expands to approximately 19' in width at the garage door. The additional concrete area will be approximately 120 square feet.

Reference - Historic District Ordinance

36-535.a.2.g: *To safeguard the heritage of the City by preserving and regulating historic district structures in such a way that maintains or restores their historic integrity while allowing modern day uses and conveniences for their residents.*

36.535.c.3: *Reviewing non-contributing structures. Non-contributing structures should be controlled only to the degree necessary to make them compatible with the general atmosphere of any district with regard to exterior alteration, additions, signs, site work and related activities.*

Reference - Preservation Guidelines

Guidelines for Sidewalks, Driveways, and Off-Street Parking

.2 Driveway Width. Driveways shall be one car width, not to exceed 10 feet wide, unless there is historic documentation of an alternate configuration. Driveway width may vary as it approaches a garage in order to correspond to the width of the door opening.

.3 New Driveway Composition. Driveways shall be constructed from material allowed by the City Code. Existing gravel driveways may remain in place subject to other provisions in the City Code.

.5 Driveway Approaches. Maintain the rhythm of existing approaches when introducing new driveways. Driveway approaches may be a maximum of 16 feet wide at the curb, narrowing to 10 feet at the sidewalk or property line.

Issues and Considerations:

The *Guidelines for Driveways* limit the expansion of front driveways to 10' maximum. In this case, the applicant is requesting to expand only a small portion of the driveway in order to match the driveway width that exists at the garage door. The City of Norman aerial indicates that the existing driveway has been in this configuration since 1997. The proposed expansion

of the driveway and approach would resolve vehicle maneuvering issues associated with the existing driveway configuration.

The Commission would need to determine if the proposed widening of the approach and driveway for this non-contributing structure would be compatible with this house and the District as a whole.

Commission Action:

Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of Certificate of Appropriateness request for property located at 727 Chautauqua Ave for the following modifications: e) expansion of existing approach and driveway.