



## CITY OF NORMAN, OK STAFF REPORT

---

**MEETING DATE:** July 6, 2026

**REQUESTER:** Morgan Reinart, Old Home Rescue

**PRESENTER:** Anais Starr, Planner II/Historic Preservation Officer

**ITEM TITLE:** (HD 26-15) CONSIDERATION OF APPROVAL, REJECTION, AMENDMENT, AND/OR POSTPONEMENT OF THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS REQUEST FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 434 CHAUTAUQUA AVENUE FOR THE FOLLOWING MODIFICATIONS: A) DEMOLISH EXISTING HISTORIC 1-CAR GARAGE AND 1-CAR CARPORT; B) CONSTRUCTION OF A NEW 2-CAR GARAGE; C) INSTALLATION OF A NEW CONCRETE DRIVEWAY.

---

### **Background**

#### **Historical Information**

##### **2004 Chautauqua Historic District Nomination Survey Information:**

**434 Chautauqua Avenue.** Ca. 1920. Bungalow/Craftsman. This contributing, two-story Craftsman/Bungalow-style structure has exterior walls that are a combination of weatherboard and wood shingle. The structure has a decorative concrete block foundation. The asphalt-shingle, side gambrel roof is cross-gabled. Wood windows are predominantly vertical, four-over-one, hung. The wood front door is glazed and paneled. The partial porch has been screened. Decorative details include sets of triple windows.

#### **Sanborn Insurance Map Information**

The 1925 and 1944 Sanborn Insurance Maps show a garage located adjacent to the north property line, and in the same location as the existing garage. This indicates that the existing garage is original to the property.

#### **Previous Actions**

**March 3, 2014** – A Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) removal of a two-story, non-original rear addition to the principal structure, the construction of a new rear addition, rebuilding of an existing deck, and relocation of a window on the north elevation to accommodate internal programming. All proposed work was installed.

**May 15, 2014** – A COA request to modify the front facade was denied. The requests to remove the front porch and replace it with a porch of a different design were postponed to allow for additional information to be submitted.

**June 2, 2014** – A COA was granted for modifications to the front porch.

**June 24, 2014** – City Council heard an appeal of the Historic District denial of a COA request for front façade modifications. The Council remanded the request back to the Historic District Commission for review of additional information from the applicant.

**July 7, 2014** – The Historic District Commission reviewed the request for front façade modifications along with the additional information supplied by the applicant. The Commission denied the request, finding that the applicant failed to provide evidence that the existing façade was not original to the historic principal structure.

**July 6, 2015** – A COA was granted to allow modifications to the dormer peaks to prevent future water penetration.

### **Overall Project Description**

The property owners want to preserve the location and appearance of the historic garage while making it functional for parking two vehicles. To achieve this functionality, the applicant representative, Old Home Rescue, proposes demolishing the original historic garage, the non-original addition, and the non-original carport and replacing them with a two-car tandem garage. The applicant proposes restoring the original garage in the same location and design, while adding a second bay on the rear of the structure to create the tandem garage. The proposed garage will use wood siding matching the original structure, wood windows, and a metal-paneled garage door. A new driveway is proposed to provide access to the new garage space on the rear of the structure.

It is noted that the garage is currently located two and half feet from the north property line. The Zoning Ordinance would require new construction to setback five feet from the north property line. The applicant plans to seek a three-foot variance from the required five-foot side setback from the Board of Adjustment.

The applicant plans to repair the existing fencing, which does not require review by the Historic District Commission.

## **REQUEST**

### **a) Demolish existing historic 1-car garage and 1-car carport.**

#### ***Project Description:***

As stated under “Overall Project Description” of this report, the property owners wish to keep the design and location of the existing historic garage. The owners and the contractor, Old Home Rescue, considered rehabilitation of the historic garage; however, due to its deteriorated condition and inability to accommodate a typical modern-day vehicle, demolition was deemed necessary. The applicant proposes to retain the original historic windows and reuse them in the reconstruction of the original portion of the tandem garage structure.

#### **Reference - Historic District Ordinance**

**36-535.a.2.g:** *To safeguard the heritage of the City by preserving and regulating historic district structures in such a way that maintains or restores their historic integrity while allowing modern-day uses and conveniences for their residents. (0-0910-12).*

## **Preservation Guidelines**

### **2.4 Guidelines for Garages**

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

**.1 Preserve Historic Garage Structures.** Retain and preserve garages in their original locations and configurations. Even if the function changes, the exterior appearance shall remain the same.

**.2 Preserve Original Materials.** Retain and preserve character-defining materials, features, and details of historic garages, including foundations, siding, masonry, windows, garage doors, and architectural trim. When necessary, repair character-defining materials, features, and details of historic garages in-kind according to pertinent guidelines.

**.3 Replace Only Deteriorated Portions.** If replacement of a deteriorated element or detail of a historic garage is necessary, replace only the deteriorated portion in-kind rather than replacing the entire feature. Match the original in design, dimension, texture, and material. Consider compatible substitute materials only if the original materials are no longer available.

**.4 Request for Garage Demolitions.** A request to demolish a historic garage will utilize the following in determining the eligibility for demolition:

- a. An existing structure of architectural or historical significance shall be retained if repairs are reasonably possible.
- b. An existing structure is dilapidated, leaning, lacking a solid foundation, or of substandard construction, it may be eligible for demolition
- c. An existing structure is 240 square feet or less, it may be eligible for demolition.
- d. An existing structure was built after the period of significance; it may be eligible for demolition.
- e. The removal of existing historic structure will enable access to the rear yard where no access currently exists; it may be eligible for demolition.

### **Considerations/Issues**

The *Guidelines for Garages* encourage the preservation and repair of significant historic garages. As noted under “Background Information” of this report, the current garage is the original historic garage built in the 1920s. After 1944, two additions were made to the rear of the structure: a storage area and a carport. The original historic structure has a footprint of 254 square feet, with additions totaling 276 square feet, for a total under-roof area of approximately 530 square feet.

The *Guidelines* have five criteria for the Commission to consider when determining if a historic garage is eligible for demolition, as listed above in the Preservation Guideline section of this report. This structure meets criteria a and b in Section 2.4.4 for demolition as follows.

*Preservation Guideline 2.4.4.a and b. state:*

- a. An existing structure of architectural or historical significance shall be retained if repairs are reasonably possible.
- b. An existing structure is dilapidated, leaning, lacking a solid foundation, or of substandard construction, it may be eligible for demolition.

The original historic garage is leaning, causing it to be “racked”. The racking of the garage frame prevents the overhead and entry doors from functioning properly. Additionally, as shown in the submitted pictures of the existing garage, it lacks an adequate foundation and has significant rot

along the bottom of the structure walls. Required repairs to this historic structure would include constructing a new framework to correct the leaning structure and a new foundation to provide adequate support for the garage. The construction of new walls would trigger the Zoning Ordinance's five-foot side setback requirement from the north property line. This required side setback would place the garage in a location where daily vehicle access would be difficult and impractical. Therefore, the applicant plans to construct the proposed tandem garage at the site of the original historic structure and will seek a three-foot variance from the Board of Adjustment to maintain the five-foot side setback requirement.

While the original historic garage at 254 square feet exceeds the 240 square feet listed in demolition criterion "c" of the *Preservation Guidelines for Garages*, it will not accommodate most modern vehicles on the market today.

The existing additions to the historic garage are not historic; therefore, their removal would meet criteria "a" and "d" in section 2.4.4 of the *Preservation Guidelines for Garages*.

The Commission needs to determine whether the demolition of the existing historic garage and carport meets the *Guidelines* criteria for garage demolition and whether such removal would impact the historic principal structure or the Chautauqua Historic District.

***Commission Action:***

Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of the Certificate of Appropriateness request (HD 25-15) for the property located at 434 Chautauqua Avenue for the following modifications: a) demolish existing historic 1-car garage and 1-car carport.

**REQUEST**

**b) Construction of a new 2-car garage.**

***Project Description:***

The applicant proposes to construct a garage in the same location and design as the existing historic garage with an addition on the rear of the structure to create a two-car tandem garage. The garage is proposed to be built with double-tear-drop wood siding to match the original historic garage and will reuse the existing wood windows in approximately the same locations as found in the historic structure. The applicant proposes a metal-paneled door to match the existing metal overhead garage door currently present on the historic garage. The proposed entry door on the south side of the structure is proposed to be a steel door with no window lites.

The applicant is proposing to create a two-car tandem garage with the front facing bay matching the size of the existing historic garage, which is 20' 2 ½" in length and 12'7" in width, resulting in the same square footage found in the historic garage of 254 square feet. An additional bay is proposed at the rear of the structure, with access via a new concrete driveway off the alleyway. A wider width in the amount of 16'7" along with a slightly longer length of 21'1" is proposed for this second bay, resulting in 363 square feet for this portion of the garage. A total of 617 square feet is proposed for this tandem garage.

The Zoning Ordinance requires the height of an accessory structure to be less than that of the principal structure. The garage has a proposed roof height of 12'9". This meets the Zoning Ordinance requirement since the principal structure is two stories tall. Additionally, as noted previously the Zoning Ordinance requires a five-foot setback from the side as shown on the

proposed site plan. The applicant will request a three-foot variance from the side setback at the Board of Adjustment's July meeting. The Zoning Ordinance also limits impervious surface coverage to 65% of the parcel. The proposed structure will cover the same approximate percentage of impervious surface as currently found on this parcel, which is below the 65% coverage allowance.

### **Reference - Historic District Ordinance**

**36-535.a.2.g:** *To safeguard the heritage of the City by preserving and regulating historic district structures in such a way that maintains or restores their historic integrity while allowing modern-day uses and conveniences for their residents. (0-0910-12).*

### **Preservation Guidelines**

#### **2.4 Guidelines for Garages**

*A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):*

**.5 New Garage Construction.** *A new garage shall be compatible in form, scale, size, materials, features, and finish with the principal structure. The following criteria will be considered for a new garage constructed where there is currently no historic structure:*

- a. The new structure will utilize alley access if available.*
- b. The new footprint will be 575 square feet or 50% of the footprint of the principal structure, whichever is smaller.*
- c. The cumulative of square footages for all garage structures on the lot, shall be no greater than the footprint of the principal structure.*
- d. New garage are to be subservient to the principal structure and in no case will the garage structure be taller, wider or deeper than the principal structure.*
- e. The proposed construction will preserve existing trees.*
- f. Maximum of two garages are allowed per site.*

**.6 New Garage Height.** *New garage structures shall be the traditional height and proportion of garages in the district. New garages in blocks that contain only one-story garages shall be one-story. One and a half-story and two-story garages may be built if located on a block where one and a half-story and two-story garages are dominant or if adjacent properties contain similar height garages. The wall height and height of the roof ridge are to be no greater than the principal structure.*

**.7 New Garage Location.** *New garage structures that are not replacing a historic garage are to be located behind the principal structure in the rear yard with limited or no visibility from the front right-of-way. Garages replacing historic garages shall maintain the location and configuration of a historic garage, typically at the end of a front driveway. Such garages shall be located behind the back elevation of the principal structure.*

**.8 New Garage Materials.** *The following may be considered on a case-by-case basis for new garages:*

- a. Acceptable materials include wood, brick and stone masonry, and stucco. Fiber cement products for new garage construction located off an alleyway or if setback behind the rear of the house will be considered on a case-by-case basis. It should be noted that wood siding does not have "wood grain." Only smooth cement board is permitted. The use of vinyl, Masonite, aluminum or other metal sidings is prohibited.*

*b. Aluminum clad doors and windows are allowed for garages located of an alleyway or behind the rear elevation of the house, with no or limited visibility from the from the front right-of-way.*

*c. Wood, wood composite or metal overhead garage doors with wood/wood composite trim are allowed.*

*d. Garage doors shall be a single width. Double width garage doors will be considered on a case-by-case basis.*

**.9 Additions to Garage Structures.** *Additions to existing garages may be appropriate if not visible from the front right-of-way. Additions shall not be greater than the footprint of the existing garage. Additions must match the materials and design of exiting garage structure.*

**.10 Reconstruction of Historic Garage.** *The reconstruction of out buildings shall be based on historic evidence, such as photographs, Sanborn maps or other documentation. If no such evidence exists, the design should be derived from the architectural style of the principal building and historic patterns and characteristics of the historic district. Wood, brick and stucco are appropriate materials for reconstruction of a historic garage. Overhead garage doors with the appearance of double doors will be considered on a case-by-case basis. Historic garages shall be located at the end of a driveway along the side property line and face the front street right-of way.*

**.11 Replacement Garage Doors.** *Retain and preserve wood overhead garage doors on historic garages. Retain double doors if possible. Replacement overhead garage doors with the appearance of double doors will be considered on a case-by-case basis. For historic garages, and garages that face the front or are visible from the right-of-way the following replacement door is allowed:*

*a. Wood is preferred. However, wood composite or metal with composite trim can be considered on a case-by-case basis. Vinyl is prohibited.*

*b. The original size, height and width of doors must be maintained.*

*c. Designs must match the style of the original historic garage door.*

### **Considerations/Issues**

The garage proposal will restore the historic structure to its original location and design while providing a second vehicle bay with a tandem addition. As required by the *Guidelines for Garages*, the proposed garage will be located at the end of the front driveway behind the rear elevation of the principal structure. The garage will be visible from the front streetscape, as it is now, with the existing historic garage. The rear addition of the proposed garage will not be visible from the front streetscape, as the house will block the view.

The proposed double-teardrop wood siding meets the *Preservation Guidelines* for exterior materials. The *Guidelines for Garages* states doors and windows are to be wood or aluminum clad. *Guidelines*. The proposed reuse of the wood windows from the original historic garage meets the *Guideline* while the proposed steel entry door does not. The Commission has approved steel entry doors on accessory structures when safety has been a concern. The proposed metal overhead garage door does not meet the *Guidelines* for materials as listed in 2.4.11; however, it is the same door material as that found on the existing historic garage.

The proposed garage at 617 square feet will be 87 square feet, over the *575 square feet* stated in the Preservation Guideline for Garages. However, the Commission has approved a larger tandem garage, as seen at 540 S Lahoma Avenue. The Commission found that additional length did not have the same impact as found with a typical two-car garage with side-by-side bays.

The *Guidelines* state that new garages are to be of a traditional height found in the neighborhood. The *Guidelines* further state that the wall height and roof ridge height of a new garage will be no greater than those of the principal structure. The proposed garage meets this requirement as it has a height of 12'7" feet, while the principal structure's height is over 20 feet.

The *Guidelines* state "*new structures are to be of their own time and differentiated from the historic structure while maintaining compatibility with the principal structure and the character of the neighborhood*". In this case, the applicant would like to restore the existing historic garage to its original location and design to maintain the property's historic appearance.

The Commission needs to determine whether the proposed garage, as submitted, meets the *Preservation Guidelines* for design, size, location, placement, and materials, and is compatible with the historic principal structure and the Chautauqua Historic District.

**Commission Action:**

Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of the Certificate of Appropriateness request (HD 25-15) for the property located at 434 Chautauqua Avenue for the following modifications: b) construction of a new 2-car garage.

**REQUEST**

**c) Installation of a new concrete driveway.**

***Project Description:***

The applicant proposes replacing the existing rear gravel driveway leading to the carport portion of the structure with a ten-foot concrete driveway to provide access to the new tandem garage.

**Reference - Historic District Ordinance**

**36-535.a.2.g:** *To safeguard the heritage of the City by preserving and regulating historic district structures in such a way that maintains or restores their historic integrity while allowing modern-day uses and conveniences for their residents. (0-0910-12).*

**Preservation Guidelines**

**2.9 Guidelines for Sidewalks and Driveways**

*A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):*

**.3 New Driveway Composition.** *Driveways shall be constructed from material allowed by the City Code. Existing gravel driveways may remain in place subject to other provisions in the City Code.*

**.11 Rear Yard Area.** *New parking areas are permitted off alleyway with no visibility or limited visibility from the front right-of-way(s). Corner lots are considered to have two front elevations. Rear yard parking must meet Norman City Codes.*

**Considerations/Issues**

The proposed concrete driveway will extend from the alleyway and be invisible from the front streetscape. This meets the *Guidelines for Sidewalks and Driveways* regarding materials and location.

The Commission needs to determine whether the proposed driveway, as submitted, meets the *Preservation Guidelines* and is compatible with the historic principal structure and the Chautauqua Historic District.

**Commission Action:**

Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of the Certificate of Appropriateness request (HD 25-15) for the property located at 434 Chautauqua Avenue for the following modifications: c) installation of a new concrete driveway.