



CITY OF NORMAN, OK STAFF REPORT

MEETING DATE: July 7, 2025

REQUESTER: Caleb Finch/Nolan Kelly

PRESENTER: Anais Starr, Planner II/Historic Preservation Officer

ITEM TITLE: (HD 25-13) CONSIDERATION OF APPROVAL, REJECTION, AMENDMENT, AND/OR POSTPONEMENT OF THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS REQUEST FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 538 CHAUTAUQUA AVENUE FOR THE FOLLOWING MODIFICATIONS: B) REPLACEMENT OF OVERHEAD GARAGE DOORS. (*This item was postponed from the June 2, 2025 meeting*)

BACKGROUND

Historical Information

2004 Chautauqua Historic District Nomination Survey Information:

538 Chautauqua Ave. Ca. 1915. Bungalow/Craftsman. *This contributing, two-story, aluminum-sided single dwelling has an asphalt-covered, cross-gabled roof and a concrete foundation. The wood windows are one-over-one hung with metal storms. The wood door is slab. The partial porch has a one-story, front-gabled roof supported by short wood columns on tall painted brick piers. There is a red brick exterior chimney on the north side. Decorative details include exposed rafters, exposed roof beams, open woodwork on the gable end, double windows, and decorative wood shutters. To the rear is a single car, wood shingle garage with a front-gabled, asphalt-covered roof and an overhead garage door.*

Sanborn Insurance Map Information

The 1944 Sanborn Insurance Map shows the principal structure in its current location. The 1944 Sanborn Insurance Map does not show the garage, indicating that it was constructed post-1944.

Previous Actions

There have been no Certificate of Appropriateness requests for this property.

OVERALL PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The garage suffered damage from a fire, which occurred after a power line fell during a windstorm this spring. Both the exterior wood shingles on the garage and the fiberglass garage doors received damage. The request to replace the wood shingles with Hardie lap siding was approved. The request to replace both the rear-facing and front-facing overhead garage doors with a raised metal panel overhead garage doors was postponed.

At the June 2, 2025, meeting, the Commissioners requested that the applicant consider a postponement to allow sufficient time for research and proposal of an alternative door. In

particular, the Commission suggested that a metal door with wood or composite trim that creates recessed panels, would be more appropriate for this garage and the District. The applicant agreed to a postponement and now returns to the Commission proposing a different metal garage door featuring composite trim.

REQUEST

b) Replacement of overhead garage doors.

Project Description:

The applicant determined that the existing overhead fiberglass doors were manufactured in the 1970s and are no longer available. The applicant proposes to replace the fire-damaged overhead garage doors with raised metal panel overhead garage doors. The applicant has submitted photos of the fire-damaged doors. The proposed metal door with composite trim and is attached for Commissioner's consideration.

Reference - Historic District Ordinance

36-535.a.2.g: Purpose. *To safeguard the heritage of the City by preserving and regulating historic district structures in such a way that maintains or restores their historic integrity while allowing modern-day uses and conveniences for their residents. (0-0910-12).*

36.535.c.3: Reviewing non-contributing structures. *Non-contributing structures should be controlled only to the degree necessary to make them compatible with the general atmosphere of any district with regard to exterior alteration, additions, signs, site work, and related activities.*

Preservation Guidelines

Guidelines for Garages

2.3 Standards for Administrative Bypass

The following items can receive a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) through the Administrative Bypass process if they meet the criteria listed. If they do not meet the criteria, the application will be forwarded to the Historic District Commission for a full review.

.1 Garage Door Replacement.

For non-historic garages that face the alleyway or that are not visible from the right-of-way, the following is allowed:

- a. Wood, wood composite, or a raised metal panel garage door.*
- b. The original size, height, and width of doors must be maintained.*
- c. Designs must match the style of the original garage door and/or garage.*

2.4 Guidelines for Garages

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

.11 Replacement Garage Doors. *Retain and preserve wood overhead garage doors on historic garages. Retain double doors if possible. Replacement overhead garage doors with the appearance of double doors will be considered on a case-by-case basis. For historic garages, and garages that face the front or are visible from the right-of-way the following replacement door is allowed:*

- a. Wood is preferred. However, wood composite or metal with composite trim can be considered on a case-by-case basis. Vinyl is prohibited.*
- b. The original size, height and width of doors must be maintained.*

c. *Designs must match the style of the original historic garage door.*

Considerations/Issues:

The *Guidelines* allow the Commission to consider wood doors or metal doors with composite trim for a front-facing garage door with visibility from the right-of-way. The proposed metal overhead garage doors with composite trim meet the *Guidelines* for non-historic garages and are compatible with the District.

The Commission would need to determine whether the replacement of the existing fiberglass garage doors with metal garage doors with composite trim meet the *Preservation Guidelines* and are compatible with the principal structure and the Chautauqua Historic District.

Commission Action: (HD 25-13) Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of a Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 538 Chautauqua Avenue for the following modification: b) replacement of overhead garage doors.