



CITY OF NORMAN, OK STAFF REPORT

MEETING DATE: 04/07/2025

REQUESTER: Edwin Amaya

PRESENTER: Anais Starr, Planner II/ Historic District Preservation Officer

ITEM TITLE: (HD 25-04) CONSIDERATION OF APPROVAL, REJECTION, AMENDMENT, AND/OR POSTPONEMENT OF THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS REQUEST FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 1320 OKLAHOMA AVENUE FOR THE FOLLOWING MODIFICATIONS: A) WINDOWS FOR A PROPOSED NEW HOUSE WITH AN ATTACHED GARAGE; B) WINDOWS FOR A PROPOSED DETACHED ACCESSORY DWELLING UNIT. (POSTPONED FROM THE MARCH 3, 2025 MEETING)

Background

Historical Information

2014 Southridge Historic District Nomination Survey Information:

1320 & 1320 ½ Oklahoma Ave. Circa 1959. No architectural style. Two-story, asbestos-sided, garage apartment has a moderate pitched, asphalt covered, side gabled roof and a concrete foundation. Entire first floor converted to living space with double windows likely replacing garage doors. Large metal shed roofed carport extends over double car concrete drive. Side second floor entry porch is uncovered. Decorative wood shutters on second floor removed and building painted in recent years. (The structure was demolished in October 2024).

Sanborn Insurance Map Information

This section of the Southridge Historic District does not appear on the Sanborn Insurance Maps.

Previous Actions

July 1, 2024 – A COA was granted for the demolition of the carport; demolition and replacement of an existing entry canopy on the first floor; installation of a new entry canopy on the second floor; replacement of the existing siding with alternative siding material; replacement of all existing windows; installation of a new storage shed; installation of a side yard fence; expansion of the existing walkways; addition of new windows and/or dormers to attic space; replacement of a retaining wall in rear yard; installation of a side yard fence; elimination of south entry door; replacement of the rear entry door; and installation of a parking pad off the alleyway.

October 14, 2024 – The Historic Preservation Officer visited the site and found the principal structure had been demolished. A Stop Work Order was issued for violation of the Historic District Ordinance.

November 4, 2024 – A COA request for demolition of the existing structure *ex post facto* was heard by the Commission. The Commission postponed the item to the December 2, 2024, meeting to allow the applicant time to provide evidence of the structure's instability.

December 2, 2024 – A COA request for demolition of the existing structure *ex post facto* was reviewed and approved by the Commission.

February 3, 2025 – A COA request for a) the construction of a new house with an attached garage, b) the construction of a detached accessory dwelling unit, and c) the construction of a concrete patio with a covered pergola was postponed to allow the applicant time to revise the submittal.

March 3, 2025 – A COA request for a) construction of a new house with an attached garage, except the windows; b) construction of a detached accessory dwelling unit; c) construction of a concrete patio with a covered pergola as submitted was approved. The requested window options on the principal structure and the accessory dwelling unit were postponed to the April 7, 2025, Historic District Commission Meeting to allow the applicant time to obtain price quotes.

REQUEST

a) Windows for a proposed new house with an attached garage

Project Description:

The applicant's request to construct a new house with an attached garage was approved at the March 3rd Historic District Commission meeting, except for the proposed metal windows, to allow the applicant time to obtain price quotes for the various window options.

The applicant has obtained quotes for aluminum-clad wood and fiberglass windows, which are submitted with this request. The invoice for the original windows previously purchased for the renovation of the former structure on this lot is also included. Due to the cost, the applicant proposes utilizing the metal windows previously purchased to renovate the former structure on this parcel.

Reference - Historic District Ordinance

36-535.a.2.g: *To safeguard the heritage of the City by preserving and regulating historic district structures in such a way that maintains or restores their historic integrity while allowing modern-day uses and conveniences for their residents. (0-0910-12).*

36.535.g.6. Infill construction. *In the case of new or infill construction in Historic Districts, it is not the intent of this chapter to limit new construction to any one period or architectural style, but to preserve the overall integrity of Historic Districts and architectural resources and to ensure that new construction is compatible with existing historic and architectural resources. In the case of denial of plans by the Historic District Commission, the Commission shall state in writing the reasons for such denial and may include suggestions of the Commission in regard to actions the applicant might take to secure the approval of the Commission.*

Preservation Guidelines

4.5 Guidelines for New Primary Structures

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

.1 Consider Historic Context. Design new structures to be compatible with historic buildings in the district in terms of size, scale, height, form, massing, proportions, finished floor elevation, size of door and window openings, roof shape, and setbacks. Proposals for new construction shall include streetscape elevation drawings that depict the proposed structure as well as elevations of properties on either side to provide a comparison of massing, scale, floor elevations, proportions, setbacks, and design.

.2 Select Windows and Doors Carefully. Select windows and doors for new buildings that are compatible in material, proportion, pattern, and detail with the windows and doors of historic buildings in the district. See Chapters 3.11 through 3.14.n.

.10 Materials. Wood is allowable for in-kind replacement of windows. Aluminum-clad and metal windows can be considered for the replacement of metal casement windows that are deteriorated on a case-by-case basis. Fiberglass and aluminum-clad windows can be considered on non-contributing resources and on rear elevations not visible from the front right-of-way. Vinyl-clad windows are prohibited for both contributing and non-contributing structures in the historic districts.

.11 New Primary and Secondary Accessory Structures. Windows in new construction are to be compatible with in adjacent historic structures in terms of size, profile, design, proportions, and material. Wood and aluminum clad windows are acceptable for use in new construction.

Issues and Considerations

Most Southridge District homes have double-hung, true divided light wood windows in various pane configurations, including one-over-one, four-over-one, and six-over-one panes. The two adjacent properties contain non-contributing structures; the house at 635 E Boyd Street has wood windows, while the house at 550 Macy Street has vinyl windows.

The *Preservation Guidelines* allow wood, aluminum-clad wood windows, or fiberglass windows on non-contributing structures. The *Guidelines* allow metal windows to replace metal casement windows that are deteriorated and the Commission has approved such requests several times over the past year. Additionally, the Commission approved the use of metal windows in the proposed renovation of the former structure for this parcel, which previously had mix of window materials including metal windows. Given the cost of windows in the current marketplace, it may be reasonable to allow the applicant to use the metal windows already purchased.

The Commission would need to determine if the proposed windows meet the *Preservation Guidelines* and are compatible with the Southridge Historic District as a whole.

Commission Action: (HD 25-04) Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of a Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 1320 Oklahoma Avenue for the following: a) Windows for a proposed new house with attached garage.

REQUEST

b) Windows for a proposed detached accessory dwelling unit;

Project Description:

The applicant's request to construct an accessory dwelling unit for this parcel was approved at the March 3rd Historic District Commission meeting, except for the windows. The Commission postponed windows for the structure to the April 7th meeting to allow the applicant time to gather price quotes.

The applicant has obtained quotes for aluminum-clad wood windows and fiberglass windows. The applicant proposes to match the metal windows previously purchased. The cost for metal windows to match is provided as well.

Reference - Historic District Ordinance

36-535.a.2.g: *To safeguard the heritage of the City by preserving and regulating historic district structures in such a way that maintains or restores their historic integrity while allowing modern-day uses and conveniences for their residents. (0-0910-12).*

36.535.g.6. Infill construction. *In the case of new or infill construction in Historic Districts, it is not the intent of this chapter to limit new construction to any one period or architectural style, but to preserve the overall integrity of Historic Districts and architectural resources and to ensure that new construction is compatible with existing historic and architectural resources. In the case of denial of plans by the Historic District Commission, the Commission shall state in writing the reasons for such denial and may include suggestions of the Commission in regard to actions the applicant might take to secure the approval of the Commission.*

Preservation Guidelines

4.5 Guidelines for Accessory Structures less than 400 square feet

A review by the Historic District Commission will use the following criteria for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA):

.5 Make New Construction Compatible. *Accessory structures greater than 120 square feet but less than 400 square feet shall be compatible in form, scale, size, materials, features, and finish with the principal structure. New construction must meet the following:*

- a. Located in the rear yard, and not visible from front right-of-way.*
- b. Compatible in design, style, material to the principal historic structure and the surrounding historic neighborhood.*
- c. Select materials and finishes for proposed new accessory buildings that found in historic structures in the district in terms of composition, scale, pattern, detail, texture, and finish. Acceptable materials include brick and stone masonry, stucco and wood. Cement fiberboard will be considered on a case-by-case basis when there is limited visibility from the front right-of-way. Structures with no visibility from the front may utilize cement fiberboard. No metal or vinyl structures allowed.*
- d. New accessory structures shall be one-story in height and less than 10 feet in wall height.*

Issues and Considerations

The applicant is requesting to match the aluminum windows proposed for the principal structure for this 296 square foot accessory dwelling unit. At the March 3rd Historic District Meeting the Commission requested the applicant obtain price quotes for the window options, which have been submitted for Commission's reference.

The *Preservation Guidelines* allow accessory structures under 400 square feet to match the principal structure.

The Commission would need to determine if the proposed windows meet the *Preservation Guidelines* and are compatible with the Southridge Historic District.

Commission Action: (HD 25-04) Consideration of approval, rejection, amendment, and/or postponement of a Certificate of Appropriateness request for the property located at 1320 Oklahoma Avenue for the following: b) Windows for the proposed detached accessory dwelling unit.