

# MEMORANDUM



---

**Date:** September 26, 2022 Job# E110-57

**To:** Eric Weck  
Engineering Manager  
Mission Springs Water District

**From:** Steven Ledbetter, P.E.  
TKE Engineering, Inc.

**Subject:** Regional Sewer Conveyance Line Bid Review Summary

---

TKE has completed its review of the four proposals submitted for the Regional Sewer Conveyance Line Project, MSWD Project Order No. 11426TM. Below is a summary of each bid submittal and our findings related to responsiveness and a comparison of the engineer's estimate and low bid amount.

**Downing Construction, Inc. (Downing):**

The bidder submitted all required bid documentation, including the Acknowledgement of Addenda form. Downing has 18+ years' experience and provided 12 project references. Their designation of subcontractors list includes two (2) subs equating to approximately 7% of the total work. Downing did not list any DBE contractors but provided the required Good Faith Effort proof of advertisement. In addition, the list of manufacturers includes: Gladding McBean, JM Eagle, US Pipe, Star, National Casting & Southbay Foundry, Pratt/Valmatic, IPEX and Armorlok.

Downing's bid of \$6,508,281.00 is the lowest bid. TKE finds that Downing has generally met the bid requirements and is deemed the lowest responsible bidder.

**Borden Excavating, Inc. (Borden):**

The bidder submitted all required bid documentation, including the Acknowledgement of Addenda form. Borden has 13 years' experience and provided seven (7) project references. Their list designation of subcontractors includes three (3) subs equating to approximately 8% of the total work. Borden did not list any DBE contractors but provided the required Good Faith Effort proof of advertisement. In addition, the list of manufacturers includes: Gladding McBean, JM Eagle, ACIPCO, Tyler, Southbay Foundry, Ferguson, Core & Main, and IPEX.

TKE finds that Borden has generally met the bid requirements and is deemed responsible. Borden's bid of \$6,577,951.00 was approximately \$69,670.00 higher than Downing's; as such, they are not the low bidder.

**Weka, Inc. (Weka):**

The bidder submitted all required bid documentation, including the Acknowledgement of Addenda form. Weka has 20+ years' experience and provided 128 project references. Their list designation of subcontractors includes four (4) subs equating to approximately 8% of the total work. Weka listed CAT Tracking and Hydrotech Electric as DBE certified subcontractors with DBE Subcontractor Performance Forms and the required Good Faith Effort proof of advertisement. In addition, the list of manufacturers includes: Gladding McBean, JM Eagle, US Pipe, Star, National Casting & Southbay Foundry, Pratt/Valmatic, IPEX and Armorlok.

TKE finds that Weka has generally met the bid requirements and is deemed responsible. Borden's bid of \$6,959,455.00 was approximately \$451,174.00 higher than Downing's; as such, they are not the low bidder.

**Empire Equipment Service, Inc. (EES):**

The bidder submitted all required bid documentation, including the Acknowledgement of Addenda form. EES has 19+ years' experience and provided three (3) project references. Their list designation of subcontractors includes two (2) subs equating to approximately 10% of the total work. EES did not list any DBE contractors and did not provide the required Good Faith Effort proof of advertisement. In addition, the list of manufacturers includes: Mission Clay, Vinyltech, McWane, Star, Alhambra Foundry, Core & Main, IPEX and AMERlock.

TKE finds that EES has not met the bid requirements and is deemed non-responsive. More specifically, EES did not provide the required DBE Good Faith Effort documents. EES's bid of \$7,891,084.90 was approximately \$1,382,803.90 higher than Downing's; as such, they are not the low bidder.

**Engineer's Estimate vs. Bid Amounts:**

The lowest bid, by Downing of \$6,508,281.00, is approximately 18% higher than TKE's engineers estimate of \$5,539,638.00. It appears the bid items for 12" PVC pipeline and for 33" and 36" VCP pipeline were the primary drivers for the cost increase. Specifically, the unit cost for PVC pipeline is 40% higher and the VCP pipelines are 25% to 35% higher than the engineer's estimate. In addition, the engineers estimate did not include the Horton Wastewater Treatment Plant sewer diversion that was added to the contract via Addendum 4. The lowest bid, by Downing, priced the sewer diversion structure at \$200,000.00. Finally, while all bids were above the engineer's estimate, the three lowest bids were within 7% of each other. The bid tabulation attached herein shows a wide variability of pricing among

the Bidders for some items, but the bid items were generally not unbalanced for any of the Bidders.

Since 2020, it's been well documented that unprecedented and broad-based supply chain issues are occurring, brought on by the pandemic and other global events. More specifically, constrained labor availabilities, global shortages of raw materials, and unreliable transportation have continued to provide challenges for manufacturers and continued to drive the cost of goods and services higher both locally and globally. Based on recent bid results for MSWD and neighboring agency projects, and discussion with contractors on various public works project, TKE believes this is the primary driver regarding the increase in construction costs. This is reflected in the pipeline manufacturing costs noted above.

# MISSION SPRINGS WATER DISTRICT

Regional Sewer Conveyance Line Project (11426TM) Bid Summary

Issued on 07/20/2022

Bid Due on September 16, 2022 2:00 PM (PDT)

Item Num	Item Code	Description	Unit of Measure	Quantity	Engineer's Estimate	Downing Construction, Inc.	Borden Excavating, Inc.	Weka, Inc.	Empire Equipment Service, Inc.
1	101	Mobilization and Demobilization	LS	1	\$270,000.00	\$100,000.00	\$215,060.00	\$229,527.00	\$202,741.70
2	102	Clearing and Grubbing	LS	1	\$25,000.00	\$10,000.00	\$10,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$17,791.60
3	103	SWPPP / PM-10 / BMPs	LS	1	\$15,000.00	\$12,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$52,214.50
4	104	Traffic Control	LS	1	\$140,000.00	\$32,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$80,000.00	\$67,060.70
5	105	Sheeting Shoring & Bracing	LS	1	\$180,000.00	\$32,230.00	\$10,000.00	\$30,000.00	\$6,793.30
6	106	Pre-construction Video Inspection and Video Inspection for Interior of Pipeline	LS	1	\$5,000.00	\$6,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$21,474.50
7	107	Project signage	LS	1	\$2,500.00	\$4,500.00	\$1,500.00	\$4,000.00	\$4,538.90
8	108	Potholing	LS	1	\$14,000.00	\$40,000.00	\$10,000.00	\$25,000.00	\$43,865.90
9	109	Remove and Replace Existing AV/AR and Guard Posts as required to Construct	EA	3	\$12,000.00	\$9,000.00	\$2,400.00	\$21,000.00	\$6,793.50
10	110	Connect to Existing Force Main and/or Sewer, including Removing Interfering Portions Existing 10" Force Main As Needed to Complete Construction	EA	4	\$28,000.00	\$28,000.00	\$42,000.00	\$64,000.00	\$15,519.60
11	111	10" DIP Force Main Pipe and Fittings, including Detector Tape, Thrust Protection and/or Restrained Joints	LF	75	\$11,250.00	\$32,625.00	\$30,000.00	\$38,925.00	\$44,565.00
12	112	12" DIP Force Main Pipe and Fittings, including Detector Tape, Thrust Protection and/or Restrained Joints	LF	90	\$15,750.00	\$18,450.00	\$36,000.00	\$33,030.00	\$41,058.00
13	113	12" PVC DR-14 Force Main Pipe and Fittings, including Detector Tape, Thrust Protection and/or Restrained Joints	LF	10110	\$1,415,400.00	\$1,981,560.00	\$1,516,500.00	\$1,910,790.00	\$1,552,896.00
14	114	12" Extra Strength VCP Sewer with Special Bedding	LF	945	\$141,750.00	\$158,760.00	\$85,995.00	\$139,860.00	\$255,339.00
15	115	33" Extra Strength VCP Sewer with Special Bedding	LF	5200	\$1,560,000.00	\$1,924,000.00	\$2,308,800.00	\$1,887,600.00	\$2,619,240.00
16	116	36" Extra Strength VCP Sewer with Special Bedding	LF	985	\$320,125.00	\$427,490.00	\$492,500.00	\$394,000.00	\$415,965.50
17	117	48" Diameter Sewer Manhole	EA	2	\$20,000.00	\$13,600.00	\$16,500.00	\$17,800.00	\$42,601.00
18	118	Reconstruct 48" Diameter Sewer Manhole Base	EA	2	\$8,000.00	\$7,700.00	\$13,400.00	\$9,000.00	\$20,460.20
19	119	60" Diameter Sewer Manhole	EA	13	\$195,000.00	\$149,500.00	\$175,500.00	\$182,000.00	\$275,557.10
20	120	60" Diameter Sewer Manhole with Armorlock Flexible PVC Liner	EA	10	\$200,000.00	\$183,000.00	\$220,000.00	\$205,000.00	\$377,742.00
21	121	IPEX Vortex Flow Insert Drop Structure or Approved Equal.	EA	1	\$10,000.00	\$68,000.00	\$67,000.00	\$69,000.00	\$73,722.70
22	122	12" Extra Strength VCP Sewer Stub-Out with Watertight Bulkhead	EA	1	\$2,500.00	\$1,000.00	\$4,000.00	\$1,000.00	\$23,168.50
23	123	21" Extra Strength VCP Sewer Stub-Out with Watertight Bulkhead	EA	1	\$3,000.00	\$2,300.00	\$4,800.00	\$2,400.00	\$14,087.60
24	124	33" Extra Strength VCP Sewer Stub-Out with Watertight Bulkhead	EA	1	\$3,000.00	\$3,300.00	\$5,400.00	\$3,800.00	\$26,697.90

25	125	36" Watertight Bulkhead	EA	1	\$2,500.00	\$1,750.00	\$5,700.00	\$3,900.00	\$25,230.40
26	126	10" Plug Valve	EA	4	\$20,000.00	\$31,200.00	\$28,000.00	\$32,000.00	\$49,010.00
27	127	12" Plug Valve	EA	2	\$48,000.00	\$19,600.00	\$17,400.00	\$20,400.00	\$46,848.80
28	128	2" AV/AR Valve Assembly, Vent-O-Matic RGX or Equal, with 36" Manhole and Guard Posts per Detail 3, Sheet 24	LS	2	\$30,000.00	\$90,000.00	\$70,000.00	\$74,000.00	\$39,382.80
29	129	10" Restrained Coupling (Smith-Blair Pipe-Lock 473 or EBAA-Iron Series 3800)	EA	4	\$8,000.00	\$1,680.00	\$4,800.00	\$4,000.00	\$21,525.20
30	130	12" Restrained Coupling (Smith-Blair Pipe-Lock 473 or EBAA-Iron Series 3800)	EA	2	\$4,000.00	\$1,200.00	\$2,700.00	\$2,400.00	\$14,862.60
31	131	Repair and Replace Disturbed Signal Loops and/or Conduits	LS	1	\$5,000.00	\$550.00	\$10,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$27,624.00
32	132	6" Class II Aggregate Base	CY	2090	\$152,950.00	\$209,000.00	\$198,550.00	\$175,560.00	\$239,723.00
33	133	6" Asphalt Concrete Base Pavement	TONS	4091	\$470,485.00	\$474,556.00	\$450,010.00	\$576,831.00	\$826,382.00
34	134	2" Asphalt Concrete Overlay	TONS	1366	\$171,428.00	\$211,730.00	\$199,436.00	\$207,632.00	\$240,142.80
35	135	Signage and Striping	LS	1	\$30,000.00	\$22,000.00	\$22,000.00	\$21,000.00	\$35,552.20
36	136	Sewer Diversion Structure	LS	1	\$0.00	\$200,000.00	\$277,000.00	\$419,000.00	\$52,906.40
				Subtotal	\$5,539,638.00	\$6,508,281.00	\$6,577,951.00	\$6,959,455.00	\$7,841,084.90
				Total	\$5,539,638.00	\$6,508,281.00	\$6,577,951.00	\$6,959,455.00	\$7,841,084.90