

# MEMORANDUM



---

**Date:** February 11, 2024 Job# E110-98

**To:** Eric Weck, P.E.  
Engineering Manager  
Mission Springs Water District

**From:** Steven Ledbetter, P.E.  
TKE Engineering, Inc.

**Subject:** GQPP AD-18 Area D-3 Sewer Construction and Water Line Replacement Project - Bid Review Summary

---

TKE has completed its review of the nine bid proposals submitted for the GQPP AD-18 D-3 Sewer Construction and Water Line Replacement Project (Project), MSWD Project Order Nos. 22-004-S and 25-001-W. TKE finds that Borden Excavating Inc. has generally met the bid requirements and is deemed the lowest responsible and responsive bidder. Below is a summary of each bid submittal and our findings related to responsiveness.

**Borden Excavating, Inc:**

The bidder submitted all required bid documentation. Borden Excavating, Inc. has 15 years of experience and provided three (3) project references for waterline projects. Their list designation of subcontractor includes three (3) subs equating to approximately 21% of the total work. In addition, the list of manufacturers includes: Mission Clay, Old Castle, Pacific Plastic, U.S. Pipe, Mueller, Star Pipe Products, James Jones, Cambridge Lee, Merit Brass, and Stream line.

Borden Excavating, Inc bid of \$5,252,252.00 is the lowest bid. As such, TKE finds that Borden Excavating, Inc has generally met the bid requirements and is deemed the lowest responsible and responsive bidder.

**RE Chaffee Construction (RE Chaffee):**

The bidder submitted all required bid documentation. RE Chaffee has 7 years of experience and provided four (4) project references for sewer construction and three (3) waterline project. Their list designation of subcontractors includes two (2) subs equating to approximately 21% of the total work. In addition, the list of manufacturers include: Mission Clay, Manhole Builders, Charlotte, U.S. Pipe, Mueller, Tyler Union, James Jones, and Cerro.

TKE finds that RE Chaffee has met the bid requirements and is deemed responsible. However, RE Chaffee bid of \$5,437,020.20 was approximately \$184,798.20 higher than Borden Excavating, Inc., as such, they are not the low bidder.

**Dominguez General Engineering Inc.:**

The bidder submitted all required bid documentation. Dominguez General Engineering Inc. 23 years of experience and two (2) project references for sewer construction and five (5) waterline project. Their list designation of subcontractors includes six (6) subs equating to approximately 12% of the total work. In addition, the list of manufacturers include: Mission Clay, Old Castle Infrastructure, Pacific Plastic, U.S. Pipe, Mueller, Star Pipe Products, James Jones, Cambridge Lee, and Merit Brass.

TKE finds that Dominguez General Engineering Inc. has met the bid requirements and is deemed responsible. However, Dominguez General Engineering Inc. bid of \$5,622,664.00 was approximately \$370,412.00 higher than Borden Excavating, Inc., as such, they are not the low bidder.

**Tir-Star Contracting II, Inc:**

The bidder submitted all required bid documentation. Tri-Star Contracting II, Inc. has 17 years of experience and two (2) project references for sewer construction and two (2) waterline project. Their list designation of subcontractors includes four (4) subs equating to approximately 9% of the total work. In addition, the list of manufacturers include: Mission Clay, National Casting, Manhole Builders, Pacific Plastic, U.S. Pipe, Mueller, Star Pipe Products, James Jones, Cambridge Lee, and Merit Brass.

TKE finds that Tri-Star Contracting II, Inc. has met the bid requirements and is deemed responsible. However, Tri-Star Contracting II, Inc. bid of \$5,624,395.36 was approximately \$372,143.36 higher than Borden Excavating, Inc., as such, they are not the low bidder.

**Kirtley Construction Inc.:**

The bidder submitted all required bid documentation. Kirtley Construction Inc. has 22 years of experience and two (2) project references for sewer construction and two (2) waterline project. Their list designation of subcontractors includes four (4) subs equating to approximately 17% of the total work. In addition, the list of manufacturers include: Building Products Co LLC, Mission Clay, Manhole Construction Specialists, South Bay Foundry, NDS, MCWANE, U.S. Pipe, Mueller, Star Pipe Products, Sigma, James Jones, Muller Streamline, and Muller Brass.

TKE finds that Kirtley Construction Inc. has met the bid requirements and is deemed responsible. However, Kirtley Construction Inc. bid of \$6,347,283.60 was approximately \$1,095,031.60 higher than Borden Excavating, Inc., as such, they are not the low bidder.

**E.J. Meyer Company:**

The bidder submitted all required bid documentation. E.J. Meyer Company has 62 years of experience and five (5) project references for sewer construction and twenty-five (25) waterline project. Their list designation of subcontractors includes two (2) subs equating to approximately 30% of the total work. In addition, the list of manufacturers include: Mission Clay, Oldcastle, Southbay Foundry, Pacific Plastic, U.S. Plastic, Mueller, Star Pipe Products, James Jones, Mueller, Cambridge, Merit Brass.

TKE finds that E.J. Meyer Company has met the bid requirements and is deemed responsible. However, E.J. Meyer Company bid of \$6,393,333.00 was approximately \$1,141,081.00 higher than Borden Excavating, Inc., as such, they are not the low bidder.

**J.R. Filanc Construction Company Inc.:**

The bidder submitted all required bid documentation. J.R. Filanc Construction Company Inc. has 72 years of experience and one (1) project reference for sewer construction and ten (10) waterline project. Their list designation of subcontractors includes two (2) subs equating to approximately 9% of the total work. In addition, the list of manufacturers include: Mission Clay, MCS, Southbay Foundry, NDS, U.S. Pipe, Mueller, Star Pipe, James Jones, and Mueller Streamline.

TKE finds that J.R. Filanc Construction Company Inc. has met the bid requirements and is deemed responsible. However, J.R. Filanc Construction Company Inc. bid of \$7,401,299.16 was approximately \$2,149,047.16 higher than Borden Excavating, Inc., as such, they are not the low bidder.

**JPI Development Group Inc:**

The bidder submitted all required bid documentation. JPI Development Group Inc. has 24 years of experience and seven (7) site utilities and plumbing projects. It is unclear if the experience provided is comparable to sewer and water projects. TKE did not call references to verify, as JPI was not the low bidder. Their list designation of subcontractors includes one (1) sub equating to approximately 8% of the total work. In addition, the list of manufacturers include: Mission Clay, Manhole Builders, National Casting Corp., Pacific Plastics, Mc Wane, M+H Valve, Star Pipe Products, James Jones, and Mueller Streamline Co.

TKE finds that JPI Development Group Inc. has generally met the bid requirements and is deemed responsible. However, JPI Development Group Inc. bid of \$8,038,488.00 was approximately \$2,786,236.00 higher than Borden Excavating, Inc., as such, they are not the low bidder.

**Gentry General Engineering, Inc:**

The bidder submitted all required bid documentation. Gentry General Engineering, Inc. has 13 years of experience and two (2) project references for sewer construction and two (2) waterline project. Their list designation of subcontractors includes one (1) sub equating to approximately 3% of the total work. In addition, the list of manufacturers include: Mission Clay, NDS, U.S. Pipe, Mueller, Star Pipe Products, and James Jones.

TKE finds that Gentry General Engineering, Inc. has met the bid requirements and is deemed responsible. However, Chaffee's bid of \$8,209,856.00 was approximately \$2,957,604.00 higher than Borden Excavating, Inc., as such, they are not the low bidder.