

MINUTES NO. 2024-24-RG REGULAR CITY COUNCIL MEETING OF MADISON, ALABAMA December 30, 2024

The Madison City Council met in regular session on Monday December 30, 2024, at 6:00 p.m. in the Council Chambers of the Madison Municipal Complex, Madison, Alabama. Noting that a quorum was present, the meeting was called to order at 6:00 p.m. by Council President Pro Tem Ranae Bartlett

Pastor Troy Garner of Fellowship of Faith Church provided the invocation followed by the Pledge of Allegiance led by Council President Pro Tem Ranae Bartlett.

ELECTED GOVERNING OFFICIALS IN ATTENDANCE

Mayor Paul Finley	Present
Council District No. 1 Maura Wroblewski	Present
Council District No. 2 Connie Spears	Present
Council District No. 3 Teddy Powell	Absent
Council District No. 4 Greg Shaw	Present
Council District No. 5 Ranae Bartlett	Present
Council District No. 6 Karen Denzine	Present
Council District No. 7 John Seifert	Absent

City Officials in attendance were: City Clerk-Treasurer Lisa D. Thomas, Deputy City Clerk-Treasurer Kerri Sulyma, City Attorney Megan Zingarelli, Information Technology Director Chris White, Information Technology Support Technician Garrett Gillott, Police Chief Johnny Gandy, Deputy Fire Chief Brandy Williams, Deputy Fire Chief Dustin Spires, City Engineer Michael Johnson, Director of Development Services Mary Beth Broeren, Director of Facilities & Grounds Gerald Smith, Human Resources Coordinator Kelly Rolin.

Public Attendance registered: Bebe Oetjen, Margi Daly, Tammy Burgreen, Jeff Burgreen, Jocelyn Broer, Heather Masa, Amy Nowakowski, John A. Oe, Mark Anderson, Kenneth Jackson, Jennifer Coe.

AMENDMENTS TO AGENDA

None

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

MINUTES NO. 2024-12-WS DATED DECEMBER 4, 2024

Minutes No. 2024-24-RG December 30, 2024 Page 1 of 13 <u>Council Member Shaw moved to approve Minutes No. 2024-12-WS</u>. Council Member Spears seconded. The roll call vote taken was recorded as follows:

Council Member Greg ShawAyeCouncil Member Connie SpearsAyeCouncil Member Ranae BartlettAyeCouncil Member Maura WroblewskiAyeCouncil Member Teddy PowellAbsentCouncil Member Karen DenzineAyeCouncil Member John SeifertAbsent

Motion carried.

MINUTES NO. 2024-23-RG DATED DECEMBER 9, 2024

<u>Council Member Shaw moved to approve Minutes No. 2024-23-RG</u>. Council Member Wroblewski seconded. The roll call vote taken was recorded as follows:

Council Member Greg Shaw	Aye
Council Member Maura Wroblewski	Aye
Council Member Ranae Bartlett	Aye
Council Member Connie Spears	Abstain
Council Member Teddy Powell	Absent
Council Member Karen Denzine	Aye
Council Member John Seifert	Absent

Motion carried.

PRESENTATIONS AND AWARDS

MADISON FIRE DEPARTMENT PROMOTION CEREMONY FOR 2024 PROMOTIONS

Deputy Fire Chief Brandy Williams recognized Chris Joye and Cody Nowakowski for being promoted to Driver on March 18, 2024, after competing in a rigorous assessment center process with their peers. This rigorous assessment included an Oral Interview, Street Driving, Pump Scenario, and a Written Test. Chris and Cody each were pinned by their family members. A round of applause was given.

PRESENTATION OF MADISON FIRE DEPARTMENT LIFE SAVING AWARDS BY CHIEF WILLIAMS TO FIREFIGHTER PETER PUCIARELLI, HEMSI AEMT LUKE SOLOVEHICHIK, AND HEMSI EMT ASHLEY PEARSON-CLAY

Deputy Fire Chief Brandy Williams, Mayor Finley, and Deputy Fire Chief Dustin Spires presented the Star of Life Award to Firefighter Peter Puccuarelli and HEMSI AEMT Luke Soloveichik. Peter and Luke administered CPR and medication to a patient in cardiac arrest on the way to the hospital. The patient was released with no deficits. Deputy Fire Chief Brandy Williams, Mayor Finley, and Deputy Fire Chief Dustin Spires presented the Unit of Citation Award to HEMSI EMT Ashley Pearson-Clay. Ashley safely transported the patient and crew to the hospital. A round of applause was given.

PRESENTATION OF 2025 FIREFIGHTER OF THE YEAR

Minutes No. 2024-24-RG December 30, 2024 Page 2 of 13 Deputy Fire Chief Brandy Williams, Mayor Finley, and Deputy Fire Chief Dustin Spires presented the 2025 Firefighter of the Year to Driver/Paramedic Ryan Ledford. Ryan has served with the City of Madison for 9 years and was promoted to Driver 2 years ago. Ryan was nominated by his Battalion Chief and many of his peers. A round of applause was given.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Public Comments were limited to three minutes per speaker. Anyone who wanted to sign up prior to the Council meeting were able to contact the City Clerk at <u>cityclerk@madisonal.gov</u> or text the word "**Comment**" to 938-200-8560. Anyone who wanted to submit a presentation to the City Council were able to email it to the City Clerk by noon last Friday. Those who could not attend the meeting in person and wanted to email their written comments were advised to do so no later than noon this date via email to <u>citycouncil@madisonal.gov</u>.

BEBE OETJEN (DISTRICT 5)

Ms. Oetjen appeared before Council and Mayor Finley to voice her concerns on the following items:

- Plug outlet issues at the Community Center
- Ceramic issues at the Community Center
- The Everstead at Madison zoning
- Trees replaced

TAMMY BURGREEN

Ms. Burgreen appeared before Council and Mayor Finley to voice her concerns on the following items:

• Resolution Number 2024-430-R

JOCELYN BROER (DISTRICT 4)

Ms. Broer appeared before Council and Mayor Finley to voice her concerns on the following items:

- Resolution Number 2024-430-R
- Thanked Council for the Comprehensive Plan, Madison on Track 2045

JACQUELINE PETERS (DISTRICT 6)

Ms. Peters appeared before Council and Mayor Finley to voice her concerns on the following items:

• Main Street America

MARK ANDERSON (DISTRICT 6)

Mr. Anderson appeared before Council and Mayor Finley to voice his concerns on the following items:

Minutes No. 2024-24-RG December 30, 2024 Page 3 of 13 • Resolution Number 2024-430-R

MARGI DALY (DISTRICT 6)

Ms. Daly appeared before Council and Mayor Finley to voice her concerns on the following items:

- Inflated prices
- Debt
- Streetlights
- Sidewalks
- Non-Governmental Organizations

CONSENT AGENDA AND FINANCE COMMITTEE REPORT

<u>Council Member Shaw moved to approve the Consent Agenda and Finance Committee</u> <u>report as follows</u>:

General Operating account	\$2,665,317.29
Special General Operating Accounts	\$143.42
ADEM Storm Drainage	\$5,510.00
Gasoline Tax and Petroleum Inspection Fees	\$274,890.77
Street Repair and Maintenance	\$1,556.87
CIP Bond Accounts	\$920,568.90
Library Building Fund	\$104,674.93
Venue Maintenance	\$74,850.00

Regular and periodic bills to be paid

<u>Resolution No. 2024-381-R</u>: Approving an annual appropriation agreement with the Community Free Dental Clinic for FY 25 (\$2,500 to be paid from General Operating account)

<u>Resolution No. 2024-382-R</u>: Approving an annual appropriation agreement with Getting Real About Mental Illness for FY 25 (\$2,500 to be paid from General Operating account)

<u>Resolution No. 2024-383-R</u>: Approving an annual appropriation agreement with the Health Establishments at Local Schools for FY 25 (\$5,000 to be paid from General Operating account)

Minutes No. 2024-24-RG December 30, 2024 Page 4 of 13 **<u>Resolution No. 2024-384-R</u>**: Approving an annual appropriation agreement with the Madison County Health Department for FY 25 (\$30,000 to be paid from General Operating account)

<u>Resolution No. 2024-385-R</u>: Approving an annual appropriation agreement with Liberty Learning Foundation for FY 25 (\$7,500 to be paid from General Operating account)

Resolution No. 2024-432-R: Acceptance of settlement from Alabama Municipal Insurance Corporation on Claim No. 062976 for damage to a 2021 Ford Explorer Police vehicle (\$3,440.90 after \$1,000.00 deductible, to be deposited into General Operating account)

Resolution No. 2024-434-R: Acceptance of settlement from Alabama Municipal Insurance Corporation on Claim No. 062917 for damage caused by a deer. The vehicle (2014 Dodge Charger Police vehicle) is considered a complete loss and the settlement will be \$6,650.47 after \$1,000.00 deductible, \$5.650.47 to be deposited into General Operating account. This payment represents the full and final settlement of the claim, which is now considered closed.

<u>Resolution No. 2024-435-R</u>: Providing for the disposition of personal property of negligible value (washers and dryers formerly used by the Fire Department) via online auction through Govdeals pursuant to Section 16-108 of the City of Madison Code of Ordinances

<u>Resolution No. 2024-437-R</u>: Authorizing a Microsoft licensing agreement renewal with SHI (\$69,127.25 for one year, to be paid from IT Department budget)

<u>**Resolution No. 2024-443-R</u>**: Authorizing a Property Use Agreement with Sumitomo Rubber USA, LLC, d/b/a Dunlop Tire for police emergency driver training (no cost to the City)</u>

Authorization for the Parks and Recreation Department to solicit bids for repairs to the kiddie pool at Dublin Park.

Authorization for the Engineering Department to solicit bids for installation of the Palmer Park Pedestrian Bridges.

Acceptance of donation of 43" Element 4K XUMO television from Walmart valued at \$150.42 to be placed in the dayshift sergeant's office of the Madison Police Department.

Acceptance of donation in the amount of \$150 to The Safe Haven Baby Box - Madison Fire Department

Acceptance of donation from L. Tucker in the amount of \$30.00 (to be deposited into Madison Senior Center donation account)

Acceptance of donation from Madison, Alabama Police Foundation in the amount of \$150.00 (to be deposited into the Madison Fire Department Donation account)

Minutes No. 2024-24-RG December 30, 2024 Page 5 of 13 Council Member Wroblewski seconded. The roll call vote to approve the Consent Agenda was taken and recorded as follows:

Council Member Connie SpearsAyeCouncil Member Maura WroblewskiAyeCouncil Member Ranae BartlettAyeCouncil Member Teddy PowellAbsentCouncil Member Greg ShawRecuseCouncil Member Karen DenzineAyeCouncil Member John SeifertAbsent

Motion carried.

PRESENTATION OF REPORTS

MAYOR PAUL FINLEY:

Mayor Finley reported on the following activities, events, and newsworthy items:

- Thanked Everyone for all the help during the Christmas season and Christmas activities. It was a great Season!
- Looking forward to a great 2025!

COUNCIL DISTRICT NO. 1 MAURA WROBLEWSKI

Council Member Wroblewski reported on the following activities, events, and newsworthy items:

• Happy New Year to Everyone!

COUNCIL DISTRICT NO. 2 CONNIE SPEARS

Council Member Spears reported on the following activities, events, and newsworthy items:

- Happy New Year to All!
- Thanked all Citizens for a Wonderful year!
- Thanked all Employees for going above and beyond!

COUNCIL DISTRICT NO. 3 TEDDY POWELL

No new business

COUNCIL DISTRICT NO. 4 GREG SHAW

No new business

COUNCIL DISTRICT NO. 5 RANAE BARTLETT

No new business

COUNCIL DISTRICT NO. 6 KAREN DENZINE

Minutes No. 2024-24-RG December 30, 2024 Page 6 of 13 Council Member Denzine reported on the following activities, events, and newsworthy items:

- Thank you to Everyone who helped make such a Great Holiday season!
- Thank you to All who participated in the Holiday Festivities
- Happy New Year to Everyone!

COUNCIL DISTRICT NO. 7 JOHN SEIFERT

No new business

BOARD/COMMITTEE APPOINTMENTS

None

PUBLIC HEARINGS

Speakers and public hearing applicants who wanted to address agenda items listed under this section of the agenda were instructed to reserve their comments for the public hearing. Before or during the Council Meeting they were asked to sign up for the public hearing at which they wanted to address Council by texting the word "COMMENT" to the City's automated SMS system at 938-200-8560 or by filling out a card available in the vestibule or from the City Clerk. The project initiator, applicant, owner or agent of the business or property that is the subject of the hearing was allowed to speak for 15 minutes. Residents within the noticed area of the subject property, as well as all other members of the public, were allowed to speak for 5 minutes.

DEPARTMENTAL REPORTS

ENGINEERING

RESOLUTION NO. 2024-413-R: AUTHORIZING CHANGE ORDER NO. 2 TO AGREEMENT WITH MILLER & MILLER, INC., TO CONSTRUCT TEMPORARY ROAD FOR PUBLIC USE DURING CONSTRUCTION OF PROJECT 22-024 | MILL ROAD WALL CONSTRUCTION (ROAD STABILIZATION) (\$345,711.00 TO BE PAID FROM FUND 38)

<u>Council Member Wroblewski moved to approve Resolution No. 2024-413-R</u>. Council Member Spears seconded. The roll call vote taken was recorded as follows:

Council Member Maura Wroblewski	Aye
Council Member Connie Spears	Aye
Council Member Ranae Bartlett	Aye
Council Member Teddy Powell	Absent
Council Member Greg Shaw	Aye
Council Member Karen Denzine	Aye
Council Member John Seifert	Absent

Motion carried.

Minutes No. 2024-24-RG December 30, 2024 Page 7 of 13

RESOLUTION NO. 2024-433-R: AUTHORIZING A PROFESSIONAL SERVICES AGREEMENT WITH S&ME, INC. FOR ENVIRONMENTAL CONSULTING SERVICES FOR FY 2025 WET-WEATHER MONITORING (NOT TO EXCEED \$18,040.00, TO BE PAID FROM ENGINEERING STORMWATER BUDGET - FUND 11)

<u>Council Member Spears moved to approve Resolution No. 2024-433-R</u>. Council Member Shaw seconded. The roll call vote taken was recorded as follows:

Council Member Connie Spears	Aye
Council Member Greg Shaw	Aye
Council Member Ranae Bartlett	Aye
Council Member Maura Wroblewski	Aye
Council Member Teddy Powell	Absent
Council Member Karen Denzine	Aye
Council Member John Seifert	Absent

Motion carried.

RESOLUTION NO. 2024-439-R: AUTHORIZING A MAINTENANCE SERVICES AGREEMENT WITH SWEEPING CORPORATION OF AMERICA FOR ANNUAL STREET SWEEPING (NOT TO EXCEED \$76,675.74, TO BE PAID FROM STORMWATER FUND)

<u>Council Member Shaw moved to approve Resolution No. 2024-439-R</u>. Council Member Spears seconded. The roll call vote taken was recorded as follows:

Council Member Greg Shaw Council Member Connie Spears Council Member Ranae Bartlett Council Member Maura Wroblewski Council Member Teddy Powell Council Member Karen Denzine Council Member John Seifert Aye Aye Aye Absent Aye Absent

Motion carried.

FACILITIES AND GROUNDS

RESOLUTION NO. 2024-438-R: APPROVING A CONTRACTOR AGREEMENT WITH STRUCTURE REMODELING, LLC, FOR EXTERIOR REPAIRS AND ROOF REPLACEMENT AT THE FARLEY-WANN HOUSE (\$75,000 TO BE PAID AS FOLLOWS: \$73,000 FROM CAPITAL OUTLAY - WANN HOUSE AND \$2,000 FROM PLANNING DEPARTMENT - SPECIAL PROJECTS ACCOUNT)

<u>Council Member Wroblewski moved to approve Resolution No. 2024-438-R</u>. Council Member Shaw seconded. The roll call vote taken was recorded as follows:

Council Member Maura Wroblewski	Aye
Council Member Greg Shaw	Aye
Council Member Ranae Bartlett	Aye
Council Member Connie Spears	Aye

Minutes No. 2024-24-RG December 30, 2024 Page 8 of 13 Council Member Teddy Powell Council Member Karen Denzine Council Member John Seifert Absent Nay Absent

Motion carried.

PLANNING

RESOLUTION NO. 2024-423-R: SETTING A PUBLIC HEARING ON PROPOSED ORDINANCE NO. 2024-424; ZONING CERTAIN PROPERTY OWNED BY BERNICE WOODS CONSISTING OF 0.46 ACRES LOCATED AT 131 FORREST DRIVE, NORTH OF FORREST DRIVE AND WEST OF NANCE ROAD, TO R-1A (LOW DENSITY RESIDENTIAL) UPON ANNEXATION (FIRST PUBLICATION 1/8/2025, SYNOPSIS 1/15/2025, PUBLIC HEARING 2/10/2025)

<u>Council Member Shaw moved to approve Resolution No. 2024-423-R</u>. Council Member Spears seconded. The roll call vote taken was recorded as follows:

Council Member Greg Shaw	Aye
Council Member Connie Spears	Aye
Council Member Ranae Bartlett	Aye
Council Member Maura Wroblewski	Aye
Council Member Teddy Powell	Absent
Council Member Karen Denzine	Aye
Council Member John Seifert	Absent

Motion carried.

PROPOSED ORDINANCE NO. 2024-422: ASSENTING TO THE ANNEXATION OF CERTAIN PROPERTY OWNED BY BERNICE WOODS LOCATED AT 131 FORREST DRIVE (FIRST READING)

This is a first reading only

RESOLUTION NO. 2024-426-R: SETTING A PUBLIC HEARING ON PROPOSED ORDINANCE NO. 202427; ZONING CERTAIN PROPERTY OWNED BY ENGLISH RE, LLC, CONSISTING OF 1.4 ACRES LOCATED AT 7301 HWY 72, SOUTH OF HWY 72 AND EAST OF RAINBOW DRIVE, TO B3 (GENERAL BUSINESS) UPON ANNEXATION (FIRST PUBLICATION 1/8/2025, SYNOPSIS 1/15/2025, PUBLIC HEARING 2/10/2025)

<u>Council Member Wroblewski moved to approve Resolution No. 2024-426-R</u>. Council Member Shaw seconded. The roll call vote taken was recorded as follows:

Council Member Maura Wroblewski	Aye
Council Member Greg Shaw	Aye
Council Member Ranae Bartlett	Aye
Council Member Connie Spears	Aye
Council Member Teddy Powell	Absent
Council Member Karen Denzine	Aye
Council Member John Seifert	Absent

Minutes No. 2024-24-RG December 30, 2024 Page 9 of 13 Motion carried.

PROPOSED ORDINANCE NO. 2024-425: ASSENTING TO THE ANNEXATION OF CERTAIN PROPERTY OWNED BY ENGLISH RE, LLC, LOCATED AT 7301 HWY 72 (FIRST READING)

This is a first reading only

RESOLUTION NO. 2024-428-R: SETTING A PUBLIC HEARING ON PROPOSED ORDINANCE NO. 2024-429; REZONING CERTAIN PROPERTY OWNED BY JOHN W. BURGREEN ESTATE CONSISTING OF 37.72 ACRES LOCATED NORTH OF HUNTSVILLE-BROWNS FERRY ROAD, EAST OF OAKLAND CHURCH FROM AG (AGRICULTURE) TO RC-2 (RESIDENTIAL CLUSTER DISTRICT NO. 2) (FIRST PUBLICATION 1/8/2025, SYNOPSIS 1/15/2025, PUBLIC HEARING 2/10/2025)

<u>Council Member Shaw moved to approve Resolution No. 2024-428-R</u>. Council Member Spears seconded. The roll call vote taken was recorded as follows:

Council Member Greg Shaw	Aye
Council Member Connie Spears	Aye
Council Member Ranae Bartlett	Aye
Council Member Maura Wroblewski	Aye
Council Member Teddy Powell	Absent
Council Member Karen Denzine	Aye
Council Member John Seifert	Absent

Motion carried.

RESOLUTION NO. 2024-430-R: SETTING A PUBLIC HEARING ON PROPOSED ORDINANCE NO. 2024-431; ZONING CERTAIN PROPERTY OWNED BY LILY LANDHOLDINGS, INC. CONSISTING OF 89.27 ACRES LOCATED SOUTH OF HUNTSVILLE-BROWNS FERRY ROAD AND WEST OF BOWERS ROAD FROM AG (AGRICULTURE) TO RC-2 (RESIDENTIAL CLUSTER DISTRICT NO. 2) (FIRST PUBLICATION 1/8/2025, SYNOPSIS 1/15/2025, PUBLIC HEARING 2/10/2025)

<u>Council Member Spears moved to approve Resolution No. 2024-430-R</u>. Council Member Shaw seconded. The roll call vote taken was recorded as follows:

Council Member Connie Spears	Aye
Council Member Greg Shaw	Aye
Council Member Ranae Bartlett	Aye
Council Member Maura Wroblewski	Aye
Council Member Teddy Powell	Absent
Council Member Karen Denzine	Aye
Council Member John Seifert	Absent

Motion carried.

Minutes No. 2024-24-RG December 30, 2024 Page 10 of 13

PROPOSED ORDINANCE NO. 2024-442: VACATION OF A UTILITY AND DRAINAGE EASEMENT LOCATEDWITHI116 FOREST GLADE DRIVE, LOT 9 OF OLD IVY SUBDIVISION (FIRST READING)

This is a first reading only

PROPOSED ORDINANCE NO. 2024-441: VACATION OF A DRAINAGE EASEMENT LOCATED WITHIN LOT 3B OF FIRST COMMERCIAL PARK, PHASE 2 SUBDIVISION ON HUGHES ROAD (FIRST READING)

This is a first reading only

<u>RESOLUTION NO. 2024-436-R: APPROVING A SIDEWALK EASEMENT AND</u> <u>MAINTENANCE AGREEMENTWITH TENNESSEE VALLEY COMMUNITIES, LLC, AND</u> <u>THE HERITAGE HILLS OWNERS ASSOCIATION, INC.</u>

<u>Council Member Shaw moved to approve Resolution No. 2024-436-R</u>. Council Member Spears seconded. The roll call vote taken was recorded as follows:

Council Member Greg Shaw	Aye
Council Member Connie Spears	Aye
Council Member Ranae Bartlett	Aye
Council Member Maura Wroblewski	Aye
Council Member Teddy Powell	Absent
Council Member Karen Denzine	Aye
Council Member John Seifert	Absent

Motion carried.

PROPOSED ORDINANCE NO. 2024-440: VACATION OF A UTILITY AND DRAINAGE EASEMENT LOCATED WITHIN 102 STILLMEADOW DRIVE, LOT 20 OF HILLTOP RIDGE SUBDIVISION, PHASE 2 (FIRST READING)

This is a first reading only

POLICE

RESOLUTION NO. 2024-421-R: ACCEPTANCE OF THE BJA FY 24 EDWARD BYRNE MEMORIAL JUSTICE ASSISTANCE GRANT (JAG) PROGRAM, AWARD NUMBER 15PBJA-24-GG-04583-JAGX IN THE AMOUNT OF \$17,457 FROM THE DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE TO ACQUIRE ANOTHER POLICE CANINE

<u>Council Member Wroblewski moved to approve Resolution No. 2024-421-R</u>. Council Member Spears seconded. The roll call vote taken was recorded as follows:

Council Member Maura Wroblewski	Aye
Council Member Connie Spears	Aye
Council Member Ranae Bartlett	Aye
Council Member Greg Shaw	Aye
Council Member Teddy Powell	Absent
Council Member Karen Denzine	Aye

Minutes No. 2024-24-RG December 30, 2024 Page 11 of 13

Absent

Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS BUSINESS AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

None

ADJOURNMENT

Having no further business to discuss Council Member Wroblewski moved to adjourn. The roll call vote was taken and recorded as follows:

Council Member Maura Wroblewski	Aye
Council Member Connie Spears	Aye
Council Member Teddy Powell	Absent
Council Member Greg Shaw	Aye
Council Member Ranae Bartlett	Aye
Council Member Karen Denzine	Aye
Council Member John Seifert	Absent

Motion carried.

The meeting was adjourned at 6:45 p.m.

Minutes No. 2024-24-RG December 30, 2024 Page 12 of 13 Minutes No. 2024-24-RG, dated December 30th, 2024, read, approved and adopted this 13th day of January 2025.

Council Member Maura Wroblewski District One Council Member Connie Spears District Two Council Member Teddy Powell District Three Council Member Greg Shaw District Four Council Member Ranae Bartlett District Five Council Member Karen Denzine District Six Council Member John Seifert District Seven Concur: Paul Finley, Mayor Attest:

Lisa D. Thomas City Clerk-Treasurer Lori Spaulding Recording Secretary

Minutes No. 2024-24-RG December 30, 2024 Page 13 of 13