

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION HELD TUESDAY, APRIL 11, 2023 AT 10:00 A.M. IN THE COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CITY HALL, MACKINAC ISLAND, MICHIGAN

Chairman Finkel called a regular meeting of the Mackinac Island Historic District Commission to order at 10:16 a.m.

PRESENT: Lee Finkel, Lorna Straus, Andrew Doud

ABSENT: Alan Sehoyan, Nancy Porter

STAFF: Zoning Administrator, Dennis Dombroski, Architect, Richard Neumann (via Zoom), Attorney, Gary Rentrop (via Zoom)

Motion by Doud, seconded by Finkel to approve as amended, and place on file, the minutes of the regular meeting Tuesday, March 14, 2023. Amendment was to add "Doud returned to table" after *Old Business*. All in favor. Motion carries.

Motion by Doud, seconded by Straus to approve as amendment and place on file the Agenda. Amendment is to add "Letter from Jim Azar's Attorney" to *Correspondence*. All in favor. Motion carries.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION EDUCATION SEGMENT

- **Historic Elements Illustrated by the Red House**

Neumann presented two elevations of the Jaquiss house. The elevation on the left was the first version sent to Neumann for input. Neumann focused on the stair tower's roof line being higher than the house and the windows. The version on the right has the stair tower taking a back seat to the resource being preserved, and simpler windows. Neumann also addressed the chimney shown as a major new element in the left elevation. The updated elevation moves the chimney in to the living room, replacing the existing bay window, and places the front façade as the most significant portion of the historic building. Rentrop pointed out that the bay window was not an original element to the house. Doud asked Neumann if there was ever a time you would tear down a historic element and then reconstruct it with a similar look. Neumann stated if a building has been removed, yes. In some cases when you replace all the rotted wood for an expansion 75% of the wood is now new and reconstructing could be an option. Rentrop stated that the law is stabilization of the building. Rentrop pointed out that these education segments fulfill the requirement from the CLG for continuing education.

CORRESPONDENCE

- **Letter from City Clerk re: New Meetings Management Program**

Finkel stated the letter states that the City has engaged a new meeting management program. Corrigan explained how the program will work. Rentrop stated that he is familiar with Municode and he was very much opposed to it, until he saw the results which are very user friendly.

- **Letter from Jim Azar's Attorney**

Rentrop stated the letter was regarding Azar's concern with his property being part of the Mission Historic District. Rentrop sent them a map with the possible boundaries, which does include a portion of Azar's property.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

- **Rentrop Statements – January and February**

Rentrop summarized his statements. Doud pointed out that \$25,000 was charged for the Steiner application. Finkel asked Rentrop if the escrow program had been in place, how much would the City be paying. Rentrop stated very little. Steiner would have paid the professional fees. Doud stated that he doesn't feel he needed a lawyer to tell him that the patio needed to be removed. Rentrop stated that a lions share of the charges were regarding the property.

STAFF REPORTS

- **Municode Meetings – Pereny**

This was discussed earlier in the meeting. Pereny was not present to review the login process.

- **MD23-010-016(H) Police Department Roof Replacement**

Dombroski stated that police department is getting a new cedar shingle roof. Paperwork is still being completed to obtain the funds from the grant. Dombroski stated they hope to start in August. The railings on the fire escape will also be replaced.

OLD BUSINESS

- **CD23-002-013(H) Schueller – New Window**

Schueller stated that the trim is removed and she would like to replace the window per the revised design suggested by Neumann. Motion by Doud, second by Finkel to approve the application. All in favor. Motion carried.

- **Approval of Revised Escrow Resolution**

Rentrop stated this was reviewed last month. The only change is that if an applicant undertakes work without a permit, an escrow would be required as well. The revision was not approved last month. Motion by Doud, second by Finkel, revised by Straus, to recommend to City Council that the escrow resolution, as revised, be adopted. All in favor. Motion carries.

NEW BUSINESS

- **C23-044-017(H) Black & Veatch – AT&T Equipment on Roof of Chippewa Hotel**

Rentrop stated that the issue before the Commission is the placement of the antennas. The SHPO letter states an adverse effect was found and the antenna should be moved to the center

of the building. SHPO made the same requirement for Verizon. AT&T has not agreed to the SHPO suggestion. Kara Hansen deferred the comments to the other AT&T people in attendance; Craig Gilmore from AT&T, Kevin Thompson from Black & Veatch, and Jacob Jacquinot from Black & Veatch. Thompson stated that Jacquinot can address the structural issues with the proposed placement. Jacquinot stated that if the equipment was moved to the center of the building structurally new reinforcements would be needed which would include additional joists. In addition, based on the Verizon location, there is limited area for AT&T and would most likely be more visible from the street. Neumann asked how much one of the antennas weights. Jacquinot stated about 60-100 pounds. Neumann asked if tie-in requirements were in place. Jacquinot stated ballasts are being used. Syed, from AT&T, explained the biggest concern with a new location in the center, is all the metals around it, and it would be too close to the Verizon equipment. With the Verizon equipment pointing toward the AT&T equipment it would cause interference affecting voice quality and gaming quality. Christy, from AT&T, further commented that by updating the equipment, it will help with first responders and to move the antennas would greatly degrade the signal. Finkel asked if there is any way to disguise or hide the equipment. Neumann also asked if the actual antenna size is different than the existing antennas. Doud asked if the Commission is opposed to the existing equipment. Straus stated it is there and the Commission is not in a position to ask that it be moved. Straus asked if there is now better technology available. Doud stated that the Commission would like to see the footprint smaller than it is now. Jacquinot stated that the proposed antenna count is going from 2 to 1 and will be less visible. The new equipment is wider but the overall footprint will be smaller since there will only be one. Rentrop noted that the existing equipment was not reviewed by the HDC, but there is now an HDC that has jurisdiction. Dombroski commented that the argument of degraded service is the same as the Verizon argument. Dombroski also noted that many providers are co-located on towers and there is no issue with interference. Thompson stated that Verizon was a new installation and AT&T is existing. On the water tanks/towers the antennas are all pointing out. In the center of the building the antennas would be blocking each other. Doud stated that he would prefer to wait to vote, but wondered if the Commission is opposed to what is existing. Straus stated that they have been asked to approve a modification to what is there. Straus is troubled that there is no view of the Chippewa from the gradual ramp up to the fort. Rentrop stated that the Section 106 standards require a view from .5 miles, which would include the fort. Doud stated that he does not see the change to be much. He does feel it looks better as one, then two. Doud thinks it should be tabled for more pictures and other technical options. Neumann thinks the location of the antenna is the issue. Motion by Doud, second by Straus to table the application. All in favor. Motion carries. Syed commented they are attempting to create less visibility from outside. Christy added they are trying to add additional coverages. Rentrop asked if the Commission would like the input from Telecom regarding the feasibility of the placement. The cost would be covered by the new escrow arrangement. Finkel stated he would like to send to Telecom. Gilmore stated they are not opposed taking it to Telecom.

- **MD23-021-018(H) Grand Hotel – Carousel Mall Alterations**

Tamara Burns stated that KSL would like to convert the Carousel Shops to an arcade. The intention is to create an open space. The exterior would stay as close to the same as possible. The mechanical units would be moved to the back changing the dormers, and an additional door, for egress, would be added to the back. Straus asked about the space inside. Burns stated the existing shops will be changed to an open space. Finkel asked if the dormers were being removed. Burns stated no, they are removing the screens to make them look nicer. Neumann stated the proposed work meets all of the standards of review. Motion by Straus, second by Doud to approve the application. All in favor. Motion carries.

- **C23-083-019(H) Grand Hotel – Gatehouse Alterations**

Burns stated the use will remain the same. KSL would like to open up the dining portion of the restaurant by taking out the fire place. Straus stated she likes the fireplace in the inside, at the beginning and end of the season. Straus asked if the inside could remain. Burns stated the mass blocks the view out and doesn't allow light in. Burns stated the interior will receive new lighting and paint. Neumann stated the proposed project meets all the standards for review. Burns stated the fencing will be cleaned up as well. The white wood guardrail will be replaced with a green metal guardrail. The turtles and plaques will remain. The dining space will be extended out in to the existing office spaces. Motion by Doud, second by Straus to approve the application. All in favor. Motion carries.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Michael Straus commented regarding the AT&T project. If there is any way to improve the AT&T service to the island, it would improve the degrading service. Straus stated that AT&T stated there is no plan to increase their infrastructure on the island. Dombroski stated a good question is why AT&T isn't using their existing tower in Hubbard's Annex.

With no further business there was a Motion by Doud, second by Finkel to adjourn the meeting. All in favor. Motion carries. Meeting was adjourned at 11:41 a.m.

Lee Finkel, Chairman



Katie Pereny, Secretary