



Richard
Neumann
Architect

610 Grand Avenue, Petoskey, Michigan 49770, 231.347.0931

30 October 2025

Katie Pereny, Secretary
Planning Commission
City of Mackinac Island
Mackinac Island, MI 49757

Re: **BONZHEIM COTTAGE**
Architectural Review

Dear Ms. Pereny:

Find attached the new / revised Architectural Review for the proposed Bonzheim residence at 4311 Pine Cove Lane, Unit #17, Stonebrook Condominium Association.

Should you have any questions, please let me know.

Sincerely,

RICHARD NEUMANN ARCHITECT

Rick Neumann

c. Ryan Spencer, Dickinson Homes
David Lipovski, City of Mackinac Island
Erin Evashevski, Evashevski Law Office



Richard
Neumann
Architect

610 Grand Avenue, Petoskey, Michigan 49770, 231.347.0931

30 October 2025

ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW

BONZHEIM COTTAGE
Mackinac Island, Michigan

INTRODUCTION

This revised architectural review is of the design for a proposed new residence at 4311 Pine Cove Lane, Unit #17, in the Stone Brook Condominium Association.

This architectural review is based on the stated intent of Section 18.06 "Standards for Review", paragraph A. "Non-commercial structures in all areas except the R-4 District", of Article 18 "Architectural Review", of the City of Mackinac Island Ordinance No. 479, effective November 12, 2013, and as amended through Ordinance No. 547, effective May 16, 2017. Any necessary additional interpretation of these standards is based on the widely used and professionally acknowledged standards developed by the Department of the Interior entitled "The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties".

Materials submitted for Review consist of revised architectural drawings of the four exterior elevations, dated 21 October 2025 (received 28 October 2025), by Dickinson Homes.

REVIEW

The general standards for review in Section 18.06 are the following:

Placement on Lot:

The site plan indicates the proposed building meets yard setback and lot area coverage requirements.

Height:

The height of the house would be 34 feet - 8 inches, just meeting the allowable 35 feet maximum.

Appearance:

The house would have a traditional appearance of no discernible single style, being an eclectic mix of several architectural motifs, including Queen Anne, Colonial Revival, Tudor, and French Period styles. The design is generally rectangular in plan, having a primarily "T" shaped configuration, with the predominant gable roof running side to side, and with a stepped projecting gable end extending to the front. Design elements include Classical square columns set on piers creating a symmetrical front porch, centered under a secondary gable end; and a projecting square turret set on the corner of the second floor is a predominant feature of the front. A previously proposed two-story rear porch was deleted, and a set of French doors was relocated from the Right Elevation to the rear, set behind a Juliet balcony. The remaining set of French doors is now centered in the small gable end on that side, flanked by old stained glass windows. Other design elements are the round-top front door highlighted by a peaked portion of the front porch having a segmental arch opening, numerous historic decorative window sashes salvaged from other old buildings, and several textures of clapboard and shingle siding set in three layers around the house.

A free-standing carriage barn / storage building would be set just north of the right side, with double hinged-appearing doors opening to the drive. It would have a gable-on-hip roof.

The proposed appearance of the house would be generally congruous with the predominately late-Victorian historic character of the Island. While the Queen Anne style, 1870's - 1910, (well represented on Mackinac Island) was an eclectic style drawing inspiration from many previous historic styles, the proposed design of this house does similarly mix style elements, if not in complete harmony with the historic architectural character of the Island. However, the site location, in a newer subdivision development at some distance from primary historic resources of Mackinac Island, would afford separation.

The detailed standards for review in Section 18.06 are the following:

Exterior Features:

Foundations - *"Foundation materials shall in some way be treated (painted, parged, stuccoed or otherwise detailed) to provide a finished appearance. Natural and synthetic stone native to, or characteristic of, the Great Lakes basin are excepted."*

The finish material covering the exposed portions of the foundation walls is not noted on the drawings.

Walls - *"The majority of all exterior wall surfaces shall be covered with materials that provide the appearance of wood shingles, horizontal lap siding, vertical board and batten siding, or natural stone native to the Great Lakes basin. Accent panels and window or door trim may be of any material. Log exteriors may be allowed where consistent or congruous with the character of the surrounding neighborhood."*

The exterior wall materials are shown on the drawings to be horizontal lap siding on the main and lower walk-out floors, while the second floor would be shingle siding, and the upper gable ends and rear dormer would be clad with decorative shingle siding. The fascia, soffit, and trim boards, along with rake trim and band boards, would provide exterior walls consistent with the character of the surrounding neighborhood.

Windows - *"The maximum glass area for any of the exterior wall surfaces (excluding approved attached or detached greenhouse type structures and fully enclosed porches) is 50%. A minimum of 70% of the individual window units shall be either the single hung or double hung type, or single hung or double hung in appearance. Mirrored or dark tinted glass with visible light transmittance of less than 60% shall not be allowed. The replacement of windows identical in appearance to existing windows does not require architectural review. The installation of new windows or replacement of existing windows with a new window type shall be required, as determined appropriate by the Planning Commission, to match the type (ie., single hung, double hung) and appearance (ie., with muntins) of the original windows or what would have been typical historically."*

All four exterior wall surfaces would have a maximum glass area of less than 50% of the wall area. Windows are proposed to be a mix of double hung, double hung appearing, and casement types, with three of the four exterior elevations with window units having more than the minimum 70% of units being or appearing single or double hung type. The Right Side elevation would have only 40.0% being or appearing so, but taken together, the four exterior elevations would have an average of 80.5% of individual window units meeting the standard. Although while the window type standard would not be wholly met, the many historic windows the Applicant proposes to use would provide the traditional exterior appearance this standard strives to achieve.

Doors - *"Doors shall be the hinged type, or at a minimum shall look like hinged doors. On residential or residential accessory buildings horizontal tracked doors shall be allowed, but roll-up or tilt-up style garage doors shall not be allowed."*

Doors are proposed to be hinged-type, or hinged-type in appearance, both on the house and the carriage house.

Roofs - *"All roofs shall be in keeping with the roofs of surrounding buildings and the historic nature of Mackinac Island. The minimum pitch for the main portion of the roof shall be 6 vertical and 12 horizontal. Roof coverings for the main portion of the roof shall have an individual unit shingled appearance and be of materials such as wood, asphalt, fiberglass, or metal. Ribbed or standing seam metal roofs may also be allowed, as determined appropriate by the Planning Commission."*

The proposed roof would be in keeping with those of surrounding buildings and of the Island. All of the primary roof pitches would be greater than a 6/12 slope, and would be covered with asphalt shingles providing an individual unit appearance.

Porches - *"Front porches or stoops, when provided, shall be covered with a roof that is compatible with, but does not necessarily match, the structure's main roof."*

Projecting porch roofs would appear compatible with the house's main roofs, both in slope and in coverings.

Colors - *"When architectural review is required by this ordinance, colors shall be reviewed and shall be in keeping with surrounding buildings and the historic nature of Mackinac Island. Neon, fluorescent or iridescent colors are prohibited. Changing the color of a building or structure (repaint) does not require architectural review but any such repaint is subject to the prohibition against neon, fluorescent or iridescent colors and shall be in keeping with the colors of surrounding buildings and the historic nature of Mackinac Island."*

The only indication of exterior material colors are some soffits and trim elements called out to be "Black". No other colors are noted.

Monotony of Design - *"For new construction or additions involving multiple units, monotony of design shall be avoided. Variation of detail, form and siting shall be used to provide visual interest."*

This standard is not applicable to this project, it being a single custom home.

Chimneys - *"All chimneys shall be stylistically consistent with the appearance of the building. Existing chimneys that are stylistically significant shall be preserved."*

No chimney is proposed, as the fireplace is direct-vent type through the wall.

Color and Texture of Materials:

Based on the elevation drawings, and the above discussion, this standard would be met.

Conclusion:

Based on the findings above, and assuming the foundation treatment and the colors comply, the proposed house design meets the Standards for review. As such, the new residence at 4311 Pine Cove Lane, Stone Brook Condominium Association, should be approved.

END OF REVIEW