

CITY OF MACKINAC ISLAND

MINUTES

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Tuesday, October 13, 2026 at 1:00 PM

City Hall – Council Chambers, 7358 Market St., Mackinac Island, Michigan

I. Call to Order

Chairman Olson called the meeting to order at 1:00 PM.

II. Roll Call

PRESENT

Lorna Straus

Nancy Porter

Peter Olson

Shannon Schueller

Lindsey White

Rick Linn

Staff: David Lipovsky, Erin Evashevski, Rick Neumann

III. Pledge of Allegiance

IV. Approval of Minutes

a. September 8, 2026

Motion to approve as amended. Change "difference" to "distance" on page 4.

Motion made by White, Seconded by Linn.

Voting Yea: Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller, White, Linn

V. Adoption of Agenda

Motion to approve as written.

Motion made by White, Seconded by Linn.

Voting Yea: Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller, White, Linn

VI. Correspondence

None.

VII. Committee Reports

None.

VIII. Staff Report

- a. MD26-021-047(H) BSI Holdings Arcade Exterior Door Replacement

Lipovsky stated the arcade door on bottom panel is completely rotted. The applicant is replacing with the same door and paint.

- b. ROS26-011-053(H) Little Stone Church Repairs

Lipovsky stated when the applicant previously painted, the vents were removed. The applicant wanted to put the vents back.

- c. HDC2026-001 Draught House Window Replacement

Lipovsky stated the bottom sashes were rotted and needed to be replaced.

Motion to approve the staff report.

Motion made by White, Seconded by Linn.

Voting Yea: Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller, White, Linn

- d. Education Segment: Overview of Paint History - Richard Neumann

Neumann was not able to bring up his presentation so it will be pushed to November.

IX. Old Business

- a. HDC2026-002 Doud Hotel Walkway Amendment

Andrew Doud handed out Doug Darga's landscape plan. They would like to move the tree line east, toward Benjamin Hill to give Mrs. May a better view, and to do so he wants to create a walkway from the side door to the back yard and use that as the main entrance. The taxi area has a deck that you can park bikes underneath. The portion on the city ROW has been removed due to insurance reasons. The front entrance has not changed, as Neumann thought it had. Porter stated Neuman gave a favorable review. Motion to approve.

Motion made by Porter, Seconded by White.

Voting Yea: Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller, White, Linn

X. New Business

- a. Discussion on alternate materials being used in Hubbard's Annex

Olson stated the information Neumann sent was very informative. Neumann stated the HDC over the years has used the guidance of the bulletin 16. Neumann does not have any comments specific to Hubbard's Annex. Porter stated she would not be in favor of using substitute materials on existing buildings. Neumann agrees with her comment on using materials on new builds as compared to existing. Linn stated you are supposed to preserve materials whenever you can. So that may be where substitute materials could be used. Neuman stated especially porch flooring

where the same wood is no longer available, substitute materials would be appropriate. Neumann commented on using substitute materials on new builds as compared to maintaining materials on existing historic structures. On an old house he believes a substitute material would be appropriate when the original material is no longer available. Olson thinks we will always be chasing the new materials that come on the market, but one of the strengths of the bulletin is pointing out at what point we not allow the substitute materials. Lipovsky stated it is a case-by-case basis for allowing these materials. Linn stated we may have to change our minds on certain products if they begin to fail long term. Olson stated if we start taking into consideration the viewer, that opens a whole new can of worms. Porter stated maintaining the historical integrity is what matters. Straus stated that when another individual sought approval for new construction, they indicated that they had included “as much gingerbread as possible.” She felt that including “as much as possible” might point the way to a larger number (of potential historic features) and that the HDC needs to be careful when considering numbers or measurements of materials. Porter stated that we do not want to create fake history. Neumann stated there are also regional differences.

b. MD26-030-054(H) Lucky Bean Screen Door

Porter stated Neumann gave a favorable review. Motion to approve.

Motion made by Porter, Seconded by White.

Voting Yea: Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller, White, Linn

c. C26-051-058(H) VB Mackinac New Door 7331 Main

Neumann stated this was a similar situation as Lucky Bean. However, if they were requesting to replace a historical window, he would not have done a favorable review. However, these were not historical. Motion to approve.

Motion made by White, Seconded by Porter.

Voting Yea: Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller, White, Linn

XI. Public Comment

Andrew Doud asked about the lilac tree and the pub garden. Doud wondered if trees are to be reviewed. Schueller stated trees are reviewed in the Annex. Neumann stated in the past it was more about street scape, not individual plants. Doud thinks there should be clarity on whether trees and paint are reviewed or not. Doud believes there is a history of not discussing trees.

Michael Straus stated when the Annex became a district, some areas were added to the manual as historic aspects. Those are the only areas being upheld. For Zoning, applicants have stated they would try to save trees but neither commission has ever held the applicant accountable for keeping the trees.

Olson thanked Linn, Lipovsky and Porter for their work at the GLIA meetings.

Olson passed out a draft letter to thank Lee Finkel for his service. He read the letter aloud. Motion to approve the draft letter. Motion by Porter, second by Linn. All in favor, motion carries.

XII. Adjournment

Motion to adjourn at 1:45 PM.

Motion made by Olson, Seconded by White.

Voting Yea: Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller, White, Linn

Peter Olson, Chair

Katie Pereny, Secretary