



Richard
Neumann
Architect

610 Grand Avenue, Petoskey, Michigan 49770, 231.347.0931

7 July 2025

Katie Pereny, Secretary
Historic District Commission
City of Mackinac Island
P.O. Box 455
Mackinac Island, MI 49757

Re: **SCHUNK COTTAGE ROOF REPLACEMENT**
Design Review

Dear Ms. Pereny:

I have reviewed the proposed roofing replacement project at the Schunk Cottage in the West End Historic District.

Should you have any questions, please contact me.

Sincerely,

RICHARD NEUMANN ARCHITECT

Rick Neumann

- c. Lindsey Schunk, Owner and Applicant
Dennis Dombroski, City of Mackinac Island
David Lipovsky, City of Mackinac Island
Erin Evashevski, Evashevski Law Office



Richard
Neumann
Architect

610 Grand Avenue, Petoskey, Michigan 49770, 231.347.0931

7 July 2025

DESIGN REVIEW

SCHUNK COTTAGE ROOF REPLACEMENT

7714 Main Street

West End Historic District
City of Mackinac Island, Michigan

INTRODUCTION

The project is the replacement of roofing on the Schunk / Corner Cottage, 7714 Main Street, in the West End Historic District. The building is a Contributing structure in the historic district. The project would replace the existing wood shingle roofing on the residence and on the kennel house outbuilding with architectural asphalt shingle roofing.

This design review is based on City Code Sec. 10-161 "Design Review Standards and Guidelines", of Article V. "Historic District", of the City of Mackinac Island Ordinance No. 443, adopted October 21, 2009. The review standards are those of the Department of the Interior entitled "The United States Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation" and "Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings", as set forth in 36 CFR, part 67, as well as the factors set forth in City Code Sec. 10-161(b).

Materials submitted for Review consist of a Scope of Work description and photographs of the existing conditions, dated 23 June 2025.

REVIEW

Of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, and the Standards Under Sec. 10-161(b), the applicable Standards for review are the following:

Standard 2 - *"The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a building shall be avoided."*

The character of the property would be retained and preserved. No historic materials or alteration of features and spaces would occur. While wood shingle roofing is most appropriate historically for a house of this vintage, architectural asphalt shingles reasonably duplicate the appearance of a wood shingle roof, and have been approved previously by the HDC for replacement roofing.

Standard 9 - *"New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment."*

The exterior alteration (replacement) of the existing roofing would not destroy materials that characterize the property, and are compatible with the massing, size and architectural features of the property.

Standards Under Code Sec. 10-161(b)

In reviewing applications, the Commission shall also consider all of the following:

(1) - *"The historic or architectural value and significance of the resource and its relationship to the historic value of the surrounding area."*

The architectural value of the buildings and their relationship to the historic value of the surrounding historic district would be maintained.

(2) - *"The relationship of any architectural features of the resource to the rest of the resource and to the surrounding area."*

New layered asphalt shingle roofing would maintain an appropriate relationship to both the house and the outbuilding.

(3) - *"The general compatibility of the design, arrangement, texture and materials proposed to be used."*

The replacement roofing would be compatible with the design, arrangement, and materials of the buildings.

(4) - *"Other factors, such as aesthetic value, that the Commission finds relevant."*

The existing aesthetic value of the buildings would be maintained

CONCLUSION

The proposed replacement of wood shingle roofing with architectural asphalt shingle roofing at the Schunk Cottage and outbuilding, 7714 Main Street, meets the Standards for review.

END OF REVIEW