



Richard
Neumann
Architect

610 Grand Avenue, Petoskey, Michigan 49770, 231.347.0931

3 October 2025

Katie Pereny, Secretary
Historic District Commission
City of Mackinac Island
P.O. Box 455
Mackinac Island, MI 49757

Re: **TWILIGHT FENCE**
Design Review

Dear Ms. Pereny:

I have reviewed the proposed fence project at the Twilight Rooming House at 1391 Hoban Street in the Market and Main Historic District.

Should you have any questions, please contact me.

Sincerely,

RICHARD NEUMANN ARCHITECT

Rick Neumann

Rick Neumann

c. Tamara Burns, Hopkins Burns Design Studio
David Lipovsky, City of Mackinac Island
Erin Evashevski, Evashevski Law Office



Richard
Neumann
Architect

610 Grand Avenue, Petoskey, Michigan 49770, 231.347.0931

3 October 2025

DESIGN REVIEW

TWILIGHT FENCE

1391 Hoban Street

Market and Main Historic District
City of Mackinac Island, Michigan

INTRODUCTION

This design review is for the construction of two sections of new fences at the Twilight Rooming House, at 1391 Hoban Street, in the Market and Main Historic District. The building is a Contributing structure in the historic district. The Applicant, owner The Grand Hotel, proposes to construct two portions of wood picket fences on either side of the front of the building. On the east, new fence would extend across the turreted portion of the building and turn south along the alley. On the west, new fence would screen the open space between the Twilight and the Windsor Rooming House. The new fences would be white painted wood, consisting of square posts supporting horizontal top and bottom rails, holding alternating height square pickets. There would be a double-wide hinged entry gate in the middle of the west portion.

This design review is based on City Code Sec. 10-161 "Design Review Standards and Guidelines", of Article V. "Historic District", of the City of Mackinac Island Ordinance No. 443, adopted October 21, 2009. The review standards are those of the Department of the Interior entitled "The United States Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation" and "Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings", as set forth in 36 CFR, part 67, as well as the factors set forth in City Code Sec. 10-161(b).

Materials submitted for Review consist of existing conditions photographs, a photo of a fence proposed to be matched, and site plan drawings, dated 26 September 2025, by Hopkins Burns Design Studio.

REVIEW

Of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, and the Standards Under Sec. 10-161(b), the applicable Standards for review are the following:

Standard 2 - "The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a building shall be avoided."

The character of the property would be retained and preserved. No historic materials or alteration of features and spaces would occur.

Standard 9 - *"New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment."*

The addition of appropriate new wood fences would not destroy materials that characterize the property, and are compatible with the massing, size and architectural features of the property.

Standards Under Code Sec. 10-161(b)

In reviewing applications, the Commission shall also consider all of the following:

(1) - *"The historic or architectural value and significance of the resource and its relationship to the historic value of the surrounding area."*

The architectural value of the building and yard, and their relationship to the historic value of the surrounding historic district would be maintained.

(2) - *"The relationship of any architectural features of the resource to the rest of the resource and to the surrounding area."*

The new fences would have an appropriate relationship with the historic rooming house and the surrounding historic district.

(3) - *"The general compatibility of the design, arrangement, texture and materials proposed to be used."*

The white-painted wood picket fences would be compatible with the design, arrangement, and materials of the building.

(4) - *"Other factors, such as aesthetic value, that the Commission finds relevant."*

The aesthetic value of the fences would blend with the character of the house and yard.

CONCLUSION

The wood picket fences proposed to be constructed at the Twilight Boarding House at 1391 Hoban Street would meet the Standards for review.

END OF REVIEW