

CITY OF MACKINAC ISLAND

MINUTES

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Tuesday, September 09, 2025 at 1:00 PM

City Hall – Council Chambers, 7358 Market St., Mackinac Island, Michigan

I. Call to Order

Chairman Finkel called the meeting to order at 1:00 PM.

II. Roll Call

PRESENT

Lee Finkel

Lorna Straus

Nancy Porter

Peter Olson

Shannon Schueller

Lindsey White

ABSENT

Rick Linn

Staff: David Lipovsky, Erin Evashevski, Richard Neumann

III. Pledge of Allegiance

IV. Approval of Minutes

a. August 12, 2025

Motion to approve as written.

Motion made by Porter, Seconded by White.

Voting Yea: Finkel, Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller, White

V. Adoption of Agenda

Motion to approve as amended. Amendment was to remove "Mackinac Island Bible Church Roof Replacement" and refund their fee.

Motion made by Porter, Seconded by Finkel.

Voting Yea: Finkel, Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller, White

VI. Correspondence

a. Letter of Opposition to eliminate MACC funding

Finkel read the letter aloud. Motion to approve the letter. Straus would like to add that the majority of the members voted yes. Porter doesn't think that would impact the

letter. Motion by Olson, second by Porter to also send the letter to Fairbairn and Damoose. All in favor, Motion carries.

Motion made by Porter, Seconded by White.

Voting Yea: Finkel, Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller, White

VII. Committee Reports

None.

VIII. Staff Report

Motion to approve the Staff Report

Motion made by Olson, Seconded by Porter.

Voting Yea: Finkel, Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller, White

a. Education Segment-Secretary of Interior Standard 1

Richard Neumann reminded us that education segments must be done per SHPO and CLG. The topic is not Standard 1, but the topic of categories of historic resources. Neumann presented information from the National Register Bulletin 16 A. Neumann went through the categories; Building, Site, Structure, Object, District. Based on these, especially "object", art could be an item for review in a district. Evashevski asked if this would be an existing structure and how it would be assessed as a resource within the district. Or is this for new things being place in the district. Neumann stated that is a good question. The "object" age threshold is 50 years old. Exceptions can be made. Relative to the sculpture last month, they are not historic and so maybe they are not something to be included for review. They would be considered a noncontributing resource. Noncontributing resources affect the contributing resources. Evashevski stated this should be discussed. Olson stated you are suggesting the basis for the decision not to consider the statue is because we don't consider art, we need not be bound by that. Olson stated form and content would appear to be historic, even though not created 50 years ago, wouldn't that add to our discussions that it be included. The shape of the form might convey the time it was included. Neumann stated the new historical marker is a good example of that. Porter asked are we asking people to only have art that is reflective of a certain period? That is a slippery slope. We should avoid subjective points with art. It would be hard to create parameters. Evashevski stated we should think about the fact that right now we have an ordinance that has taken those out completely. We need to look at what we do want to take into consideration. Items and sizes should also be considered. Straus stated the word "appropriateness" needs to be considered with anything we consider. Are we expected to approve an item forever? Straus feels timing needs to be included in parameters. Evashevski doesn't think we could ever be in the position to approve something on a time basis.

b. Job Status Report

White asked about the refund of fees. Evashevski stated yes after the vote that is in front of City Council right now. Straus asked the members how useful this report is to them. Pereny clarified some issues on the report for Straus.

c. R325-005-067(H) Chambers Porch Repair

Lipovsky summarized the job as replacing rotted boards on the porch.

d. R325-037-068(H) McIntire Porch and Handrail Replacement

Lipovsky stated the porch was rotted and needed to be replaced.

e. MD25-078-069(H) Chambers Siding Repairs

Lipovsky stated the siding was rotted and needed to be replaced.

f. R125-080-070(H) Lounsbury Fence Replacement

Lipovsky stated the fence was rotted in sections and needed to be replaced.

g. RS25-046-072(H) Gilmer Deck Replacement

Lipovsky stated the deck needed to be replaced due to rot.

h. R325-017-073(H) Mackinac Island Bible Church Roof Replacement

This Agenda item was removed due to the fact that it is located in an area no longer considered an historic district.

i. R325-008-074(H) Small Point B&B Window Replacement

Lipovsky stated the applicant is replacing a window like for like.

j. R125-066-075(H) Callewaert Walkway Replacement

Lipovsky stated the walkway needed to be replaced due to rotted wood. Neumann asked Lipovsky if he goes out to take a look at the house. Lipovsky stated he has looked at most of them to see if it can be repaired instead of replaced. He agreed with Neumann and will go and look at the jobs for possible alternatives.

IX. Old Business

None.

X. New Business

None.

XI. Public Comment

Doud stated that Doud's building HDC permit is about to expire. He will be presenting next month but just wanted to give a heads up. Doud asked if he needs to come each year and renew? After further discussing it was discovered that work had actually started on the project so he does not need to renew the Certificate of Appropriateness. Evashevski will look in to it. She pointed out that for zoning the project must be done in two years. It was agreed he can ask to extend that. Evashevski will let Doud know.

XII. Adjournment

Motion to adjourn at 2:02 PM

Motion made by Porter, Seconded by Finkel.

Voting Yea: Finkel, Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller, White

Lee Finkel, Chair

Katie Pereny, Secretary