



Richard  
Neumann  
Architect

610 Grand Avenue, Petoskey, Michigan 49770, 231.347.0931

7 October 2024

Katie Pereny, Secretary  
Historic District Commission  
City of Mackinac Island  
P.O. Box 455  
Mackinac Island, MI 49757

Re: **DOUD'S MARKET AND INN RENOVATION**  
Design Review

Dear Ms. Pereny:

I have reviewed the proposal to renovate the Doud's Market building in the Market and Main Historic District.

Find attached the Design Review for the above referenced proposed project.

Should you have any questions, please contact me.

Sincerely,

RICHARD NEUMANN ARCHITECT

Rick Neumann

- c. Andrew Doud, Doud's Market  
Richard Clements, Richard Clements Architect  
Dennis Dombroski, City of Mackinac Island  
David Lipovski, City of Mackinac Island  
Erin Evashevski, Evashevski Law Office



Richard  
Neumann  
Architect

610 Grand Avenue, Petoskey, Michigan 49770, 231.347.0931

7 October 2024

## **DESIGN REVIEW**

### **DOUD'S MARKET & INN RENOVATION**

7200 Main Street

Market and Main Historic District  
Mackinac Island, Michigan

## **INTRODUCTION**

The proposed project is renovation of the existing historic Doud's Market building, maintaining it as a mixed use commercial / residential building, at 7200 Main Street, in the Market and Main Historic District. Doud's Market would remain on the first floor, but the Nadia's retail space facing Fort Street would become a new inn entry and lobby, with hotel rooms in place of the rooming house rooms on the second and third floors. The front Main Street elevation would remain the same, but the east side, north rear, and west side would have extensive renovation. The building is listed as a Contributing structure in the historic district.

This design review is based on City Code Sec. 10-161 "Design Review Standards and Guidelines", of Article V. "Historic District", of the City of Mackinac Island Ordinance No. 443, adopted October 21, 2009. The review standards are those of the Department of the Interior entitled "The United States Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation" and "Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings", as set forth in 36 CFR, part 67, as well as the factors set forth in City Code Sec. 10-161(b).

Materials submitted for Review consist of photographs of the existing building, with site plan, floor plans, and elevation drawings, both existing and proposed, dated 19 September 2024, by Richard Clements Architect.

## **REVIEW**

The Standards for review are the following:

**Standard 1** - *"A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment."*

The building would continue in its current use as retail on the first floor and residential on the second and third floors, as has been its historic purpose.

**Standard 2** - *"The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a building shall be avoided."*

The historic character of the property would be retained and preserved. While an existing exterior feature, Nadia's retail storefront, would be extensively altered, those materials and features are not historic, appropriate to the property's historic character.

**Standard 3** - *"Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Changes that create a false sense of historic development such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken."*

While the renovation would add new features to the east Fort Street side, they would not be conjectural as no attempt is being made to "restore" to some earlier period. The new elements such as the Inn entrance and second floor balcony would be new elements, but appropriate to the era of significance of the building.

**Standard 4** - *"Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved."*

The Doud's Market building has changed over time, including the creation of the Nadia's retail storefront, but it is not such that it has acquired historic significance in its own right, and should be preserved. Certainly many smaller changes like alteration of windows, addition of a west side balcony, and addition of metal fire escapes at the rear, do not warrant preservation in their own right.

**Standard 5** - *"Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved."*

Distinctive features, finishes, and craftsmanship that characterize the property would be preserved, such as the front upper and lower cornices, and the two-story bay windows.

**Standard 6** - *"Deteriorated historical features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence, or structures."*

This standard does not apply to the proposed project.

**Standard 7** - *"Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible."*

This standard does not apply to the proposed project.

**Standard 8** - *"Significant archaeological resources shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken."*

This standard does not apply to the proposed project.

**Standard 9** - *"New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment."*

The proposed renovations would not destroy historic materials that characterize the property, and new architectural elements it would be differentiated from the old. Several proposed exterior changes would enhance the building's historic integrity by removing and replacing inappropriate existing non-original features, such as the picture windows on the second story Fort Street side, and the modern curved-top awnings there also. New work, such as a new covered entry porch with decorative columns, spindles, and railings, would be compatible with the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

Although mostly not visible to the public, the north rear and west side renovations would improve the building's historic appearance also, by removing inappropriate metal fire escapes and making window improvements.

**Standard 10** - *"New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired."*

The proposed renovations could be removed in the future without impairing the essential form and integrity of the property.

#### **Standards Under Code Sec. 10-161(b)**

In reviewing applications, the Commission shall also consider all of the following:

**(1)** - *The historic or architectural value and significance of the resource and its relationship to the historic value of the surrounding area.*

The proposed exterior renovations would not detract from historic and architectural value of the resource, or its relationship to the Main and Market streets neighborhood.

**(2)** - *"The relationship of any architectural features of the resource to the rest of the resource and to the surrounding area."*

The newly renovated Nadia's storefront portion of the Doud's Market building would add appropriate new architectural features to the resource and to the surrounding area.

**(3)** - *"The general compatibility of the design, arrangement, texture and materials proposed to be used."*

The proposed renovations would be compatible with the design, arrangement, texture and materials of the building.

**(4)** - *"Other factors, such as aesthetic value, that the Commission finds relevant."*

The aesthetic value of the Doud's Market building would be enhanced by the major renovation at the new Inn storefront, as well as along the Fort Street side of the building.

### CONCLUSION

Based on the findings above, the proposed renovation of the Doud's Market building at 7200 Main Street would meet the Standards for review.

END OF REVIEW