

CITY OF MACKINAC ISLAND

MINUTES

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Tuesday, September 10, 2024 at 1:00 PM

City Hall – Council Chambers, 7358 Market St., Mackinac Island, Michigan

I. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 1:04 PM.

II. Roll Call

PRESENT

Andrew Doud

Lee Finkel

Alan Sehoyan

Lorna Straus

Nancy Porter

Shannon Schueller

Staff: Erin Evashevski, Richard Neumann

ABSENT

Peter Olson

III. Pledge of Allegiance

IV. Approval of Minutes

a. August 13, 2024

Motion to approve the minutes as written.

Motion made by Finkel, Seconded by Porter.

Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehoyan, Straus, Porter, Schueller

V. Adoption of Agenda

Motion to approve the Agenda as written.

Motion made by Finkel, Seconded by Doud.

Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehoyan, Straus, Porter, Schueller

VI. Correspondence

- a. Rentrop Statement July 31 2024

Motion to place on file.

Motion made by Doud, Seconded by Finkel.

Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehoyan, Straus, Porter, Schueller

VII. Committee Reports

None

VIII. Staff Report

- a. C24-045-049(H) Pancake House Walk In Cooler

Dombroski stated the applicant would like to replace the walk in cooler in the same location as original.

Motion to approve the Staff Report.

Motion made by Porter, Seconded by Finkel.

Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehoyan, Straus, Porter, Schueller

- b. R124-076-052(H) Musser Rot Repairs

Dombroski stated this is some rot repair work on McGreevy cottage on Mahoney and M-185 that includes trim and hand rails. Motion to approve the Staff Report.

Motion made by Porter, Seconded by Finkel.

Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehoyan, Straus, Porter, Schueller

- c. HB24-016-053(H) Gagnon Roof Shingle Replacement

Dombroski stated this is a roof replacement. Motion to approve the Staff Report.

Motion made by Porter, Seconded by Finkel.

Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehoyan, Straus, Porter, Schueller

d. R124-053-054(H) McCarty Roof Shingle Replacement

Dombroski stated this is a roof replacement. Motion to approve the Staff Report.

Motion made by Porter, Seconded by Finkel.

Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehoyan, Straus, Porter, Schueller

IX. Old Business

a. Light Fixture Guideline Discussion

Sehoyan stated Neumann submitted some draft guidelines as well as a preservation education segment because it was related. The light fixture itself and the quality of the light that the lamp puts out are the two items for the guidelines.

Motion by Finkel to place the education segment on file. Motion died due to lack of support.

Neumann intended his paper to be included in the guidelines. Porter stated she was good with new construction but not existing. Lumens are not necessary to add to HDC realm. Neumann agreed. He didn't intend to make this something to require an application for a new fixture. Porter asked if this would be part of his review. Neumann confirmed. Doud thinks there should be enough to be able to address if someone won't correct lighting. But how do we put something in there to make it manageable. Dombroski thinking what Rick has created can be something to refer applicants to for guidelines. Suggests adopting as a guideline not a requirement. Finkel asked Neumann & Dombroski how comfortable he would be to make a judgment on whether a fixture is appropriate or not. Dombroski stated they are just guidelines. Motion by Finkel to place on file. Motion withdrawn. Motion to thank Neumann and Dombroski and adopt this to add to guidelines.

Motion made by Porter, Seconded by Finkel.

Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehoyan, Straus, Porter, Schueller

Pereny to send letter to Planning Commission stating we adopted the addition to the Guidelines.

b. Demolition Application Discussion

Evashevski stated at the last meeting she was asked to reach out to SHPO. Evashevski reached out to Alan Higgins and Gary Rentrop. Rentrop put together the application based on SHPO and other districts in the state. Higgins confirmed that the general language does come from the statute for the Notice to Proceed, and the requirements are made by each HDC on how the applicant can supply the information. For example, D1, A-H those are determined by HDC. Doud thinks we should have a committee on this that should go over with Evashevski. Doud wondered what the formula is when reviewing the taxes. Is there a legal formula? Evashevski did not know but will look in to a structure for all this. Porter went back to when applications are submitted, who checks to make sure complete? The applicant should be informed if something is missing by the meeting. Sehoyan asked Dombroski what he thought about that. Dombroski stated we look at every application but we won't necessarily catch everything. Every Zoning or HDC application is treated like that. The HDC or Planning Commission may catch a problem. Doud thinks there are a lot of items in the application we can clean up ourselves. Doud would like to create a demolition application committee. Barnwell stated the application states that even removing material is determined demolition. Almost all projects require removing material. Motion to create a committee to look at required application information on the demolition and HDC application, General Directions. The Committee will be created next meeting. Sehoyan will appoint the committee.

Motion made by Doud, Seconded by Porter.

Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehoyan, Straus, Porter, Schueller

c. HB24-026-046(H) Harbour View Inn Enclosed Fire Escape and Like for Like Repairs

Barnwell stated the architect has worked to slide the setback 18" and changed the enclosure area where the A/C units are. In addition the roof line dropped 1.5' to be under the existing roof. Neumann stated the major improvement of moving the east wall is a good improvement. The addition wall doesn't upstage the historic building. Neumann stated the height lowered and the siding and color of addition should be different from the original building. The all white additions stand in contrast and new stair addition should be white. Neumann also suggested maybe consider vertical board and batten, but that is less important than the color itself. Sehoyan stated the HDC doesn't address color. Barnwell stated they want to keep the blue. They want it to look like a nice building to majority of people. We do understand the historic preservation side of it but we do want it to have a nice cohesive look. Porter and Doud agree with Barnwell. Porter thinks the continuity of the building is important. Motion to approve.

Motion made by Porter, Seconded by Doud.

Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehoyan, Straus, Porter, Schueller

d. R324-008-047(H) Doud Mission House Relocation

Sehoyan and Doud stepped down from the table.

Doud stated last month there was a question on the applications. This was taken care of. We are asking for approval for the Doud duplex. Porter asked if the change of use is to single family from employee housing. Doud confirmed and stated they would like to remove the special land use. Dombroski stated as long as the end result is as Doud is describing the next step would be the special land use being set aside. The applications will be contingent on the lot split. Porter asked if we would be approving contingent on City Councils approval. Zoning will also have to be contingent on City Council approval. Neumann stated the project does meet the applicable standards for review. Doud asked if he gets approved and Benser did not, could this project start after the lot split? Dombroski thinks yes it can. Evashevski thinks he could and would have to work that out with Benser. Motion to approve contingent on the other entities approving it.

Motion made by Porter, Seconded by Schueller.
Voting Yea: Finkel, Straus, Porter, Schueller

Doud and Sehoyan returned to the table.

X. New Business

a. HDC Legal Counsel Discussion

Porter thinks it would be in the best interest to have own legal counsel for HDC. Porter believes it is good to have a separate legal counsel. Porter does not have any suggestions for a replacement. Straus stated we do sometimes have discussions that make clear the cities definition between commercial and residential and there is one we have to follow. She looked at the history and we have federal and state laws we need to follow. Straus thinks we need to have our own legal advice on those subjects. Doud thinks it will be very challenging to find a lawyer. Doud stated he has personally worked with Evashevski and thinks Evashevski should not take this on but if she has thick enough skin and willing to do this Doud suggested a 6 month trial period. We can continue to look for a specialty lawyer but it is up to HDC if we want to go down the road with Evashevski. Porter would like to see the HDC to start process to look for a specialty lawyer. Doud asked to what capacity does Porter mean. Full time? Porter said for someone to address the questions we have and be responsive to us and what we are doing. Doud thinks Evashevski knows us and is very transparent and would acknowledge her lack of knowledge. Doud thinks another lawyer for guidance only. Porter stated applicants like Verizon and AT&T would need legal guidance. Doud thinks they should try Evashevski for six months and look for an advisor to help Evashevski. Sehoyan stated looking forward this will be a good fit, however if we do want to search for council to assist her, present that person to Evashevski and City Council. Sehoyan asked if Evashevski goes to Rentrop for consultations. Evashevski stated she does. She does not take this as an insult and whatever works best for HDC and City Council, who makes the final

appointment, is fine with her. Evashevski stated she was not able to find anyone with historic experience. Evashevski reached out to Alan Higgins for a recommendation but hasn't heard back yet. Neumann stated a directory is printed every year with preservation experts and only one name is listed, Steven Fox, in Traverse City. He can share that name with Evashevski. Schueller asked Evashevski if she was looking for someone to help her or for HDC. Evashevski stated, for the HDC. Doud stated it is important to say the lawyers job in this is to tell us what is right one way and how it is wrong. We have the opportunity to describe what we want from a lawyer. They are here to tell us what road to take, but not how to vote. Dombroski reminded HDC that even Rentrop with all expertise, reached out to specialty communication lawyers on the west coast for guidance. Evashevski can also reach out to them. Doud asked if anyone was against giving Evashevski 6 months and also reach out to Steve Fox. Evashevski was fine with that. Sehoyan wanted to add Evashevski would stay on until we find someone suitable. Sehoyan thinks Evashevski is more qualified to find a lawyer. Doud was ok with finding a consultant to help Evashevski and Evashevski be the full time lawyer. Add to October agenda and Evashevski will reach out to Steve Fox.

b. SHPO Discussion

Sehoyan reached out to Alan Higgins. Hailey Schriber is our contact now. They sent some resource guides that he will forward to Pereny to share with the HDC. Doud thinks it is important that someone on HDC and the lawyer be our SHPO contacts. Sehoyan and Evashevski to be the SHPO contacts.

c. C24-057-055(H) GHMI Merchants of Mackinac Building Renovation

Barry Polzin stated we have small project doing repair work to the front porch on retail space. The applicant would like to bring Grand Hotel merchandise to downtown, as well as a little Sadies ice cream shop. They had originally wanted to replace the posts but Neumann did not find them appropriate. So they will be repairing the existing and then cover the pipes to match the existing. They are going to change the top railing with a Chippendale railing, add bead board on the ceiling and bring in Grand Hotel porch color. Porter confirmed the top and bottom will be trimmed out. Jurcak stated Neumann would like them square, but Jurcak would like the HDC to consider the circular post like the Grand Hotel. Neumann stated the building is very simple and has existed as it is for a long time but historically storefronts along Main had simple square posts because turning posts was hard to do. He recommended leaving it simple. Sehoyan asked about the railing. Neumann stated he is comfortable with that if the posts remain simple below. We are trying to minimize departures from the trim from when the district was created. Porter asked about square posts on top and circular on the bottom. Neumann stated consistency is important. Schueller asked about the size of the columns. Polzin stated about 8" and columns taper a little bit. Porter likes the round columns and they were a common feature of that era. Doud pointed out that two are already round because they are just poles. Finkel is not offended by making them all round, or all square. Doud asked if the applicant is agreeing to round top and bottom. Polzin said

the top would be square. Motion to approve round columns on bottom and square columns with flat tops on top.

Motion made by Porter, Seconded by Finkel.

Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehoyan, Straus, Porter, Schueller

d. C24-055/56-056(H) Benser Mr. B's & Murdicks

Neumann stated this application seems to be a matter of breaking a larger project in to two phases. The harbor side behind Murdick's now has a double hung windows. This is the only architectural change he can see and he is comfortable with it and phase I meets the standards for review. Dombroski had no comment. Doud thinks it will be an improvement. Motion to approve.

Motion made by Porter, Seconded by Doud.

Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehoyan, Straus, Porter, Schueller

e. R324-008-057(H) Benser New Home

Doud and Sehoyan stepped down.

Doud stated he didn't know of any issues on the HDC level. Neumann stated it meets the HDC standards for review. Finkel stated it seems pretty straight forward. Dombroski confirmed it meets setbacks. Motion to approve.

Motion made by Porter, Seconded by Finkel.

Voting Yea: Finkel, Straus, Porter, Schueller

Voting Abstaining: Doud, Sehoyan

Doud and Sehoyan returned to the table.

XI. Public Comment

None


XII. Adjournment

Motion to adjourn at 2:28 PM.

Motion made by Doud, Seconded by Finkel.

Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehoyan, Straus, Porter, Schueller

Alan Sehoyan, Chair


Katie Pereny, Secretary