

# CITY OF MACKINAC ISLAND

## MINUTES

### PLANNING COMMISSION

Tuesday, October 10, 2023 at 3:00 PM

City Hall – Council Chambers, 7358 Market St., Mackinac Island, Michigan

---

#### I. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 3:00 P.M.

#### II. Roll Call

PRESENT

Trish Martin

Jim Pettit

Michael Straus

Anneke Myers

Ben Mosley

Mary Dufina

Lee Finkel

Staff: Evashevski

#### III. Pledge of Allegiance

#### IV. Approval of Minutes

##### a. September 12, 2023 Minutes

Motion to approve the minutes as written.

Motion made by Myers, Seconded by Mosley.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

#### V. Adoption of Agenda

Motion to adopt the Agenda as amended. The amendments include tabling Rose Gazebo at the applicants request and add HDC Study Committee update.

Motion made by Dufina, Seconded by Finkel.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

#### VI. Correspondence

None

## VII. Staff Report

### a. HDC Meeting Summary

Finkel summarized the October 10th HDC meeting.

### b. REU Update

Burt stated he did not have an update for the REU's. All approved projects are moving forward with REU's. Burt gave an update on the start of the construction on the new water plant. Pictures were shown. Myers confirmed that Burt was aware of the Grand project.

### c. Master Plan Update

Myers reported there was a meeting on oct 9th. Meetings are now going to be Mondays before the Planning Commission meetings. Myers stated the survey has been extended until October 15th. The student survey was done at the school and 17 responded. The next meeting is November 13th.

## VIII. Committee Reports

Dufina gave an update on the HDC Study Committee. The Committee has finished the study and approved a final draft. The final draft was submitted to SHPO as required. The public hearing to receive comments is set for November 2 at 10 am. Anyone can comment or bring evidence showing any mistakes made on the draft. The final report will be presented within a year after the public hearing. The report is available on city website under announcements, then city government, then HDC. Pettit asked about the demolition moratorium. Myers stated it expired but City Council said if any applications come in, in the study area, they have to apply to HDC.

## IX. Old Business

### a. MD23-011-067(H) McGreevy Fence

Straus stated the application was approved in HDC today. Finkel stated he failed to mention that Neumann did a favorable review on this item. Myers asked about a site plan. Dombroski stated it is replacing a portion of the current fence therefore a site plan is not required.

Motion to approve.

Motion made by Myers, Seconded by Mosley.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

b. C23-053-070(H) Trayser Demolition

Straus stated this was denied in HDC. Myers stated there is no action the planning commission can make since it was denied in the HDC. Motion to deny based on there being no grounds to review.

Motion made by Myers, Seconded by Finkel.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

c. C17-055/56-027(H) Benser Mr. B's Basement Amendment

Dombroski stated that this is due to new FEMA requirements. Mr. B's has a major basement layout change to satisfy FEMA requirements. The basement is much smaller than originally proposed. Straus asked Evashevski about this project. Straus thought that it had expired. Under our ordinance there needs to be a request for an extension. Evashevski quoted section 20.09. Myers thought there was foundation work in the last year. Rocky from Bay recommended no basement and to do piles. The applicant agreed to piles. Rocky does not think anything after the seawall was done. Last year the applicant submitted a new site plan. This is an amendment to that application. Dufina asked if the exterior will be modified based on new basement plan. Dombroski stated that is a good question. Evashevski stated a performance bond is an option but would just have to figure out the purpose and how to implement. The Planning Commission would recommend and City Council would approve. To give the applicant time to join the meeting there was a Motion by Mosley, second by Myers to table the item until the end of the meeting. All in favor. Motion carries. When returning to the review of this item, the applicant still had not joined the meeting. The application is going to expire in the next couple of days. Motion to approve amendment. The file will expire in a couple of days so he will have to reapply starting with existing approvals. The applicant was tried to be reached but he was unable to be reached.

Motion made by Myers, Seconded by Pettit.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

d. Hoban Hill Contingencies

Doud stated the project is not yet condominiumized. It will be some time. Doud went through everything they submitted for the contingencies. Evashevski confirmed that the contingencies as submitted are OK. All agreed. Motion to accept contingencies for A, B, C, and D, and the new site plan for unit C.

Motion made by Myers, Seconded by Martin.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

e. R121-004-040 Erbel Propane Tank Amendment

Pettit talked to applicant and determined the placement is good. Dombroski believes the tanks will be placed on paving stones.

Motion to approve.

Motion made by Dufina, Seconded by Mosley.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

f. R423-065-054 Bazinau Shed

Variance was approved. Myers asked if siding was going to be used. Bazinau stated yes, to match the house.

Motion to approve.

Motion made by Finkel, Seconded by Mosley.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

## X. New Business

a. MD23-026-085(H) Benser Porter Change of Use Rose Gazebo Building

The applicant requested to table

b. R123-025-088 Jim Murray Fence

Murray stated he would like to install a 48" or less wood fence with 3" space between pickets. The fence will have a curved 4' wide arch gate that swings in. The fence will run to neighbors' lilac and the neighbor has submitted written approval. There will also be a paved walkway. Murray stated the fence will be white with the better side facing out.

Motion to approve a maximum 48" high fence with a gate no higher than 10', that swings in.

Motion made by Mosley, Seconded by Finkel.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

c. Grand Hotel Retaining Wall Discussion

Straus stated there is a problem with the road at the curve by the Grand Hotel. They are awaiting final engineering report, but will have to install a retaining wall. Michael McHale with Davidson stated they have contracted with Patrick Machin, Architect, and Power Construction. Machin presented the proposed plans so far. Machin

stated that soil borings are being done to identify what is going on. The slope is failing and taking the road with it. Retaining wall is being proposed to be made of Ready-Rock blocks that weigh 2500 to 6000 lbs per piece. Photographs were shown of the proposed stone. Minor stormwater improvements will also have to be done. Planter blocks that have a 16" gap between the wall and blocks that allows for plantings will be placed in strategic locations. A 15' berm will be placed in front of the wall. A new sidewalk and asphalt paving will be built. There will be a slight change to the width of the road. They considered running the sidewalk the whole length but Straus informed them that will further narrow the road, that is already narrow. Straus asked what the backfill will be. Machin stated crushed stone. The wall will be 15' tall and run about 150'. There will be a 15' ledge that runs the whole length. The ledge will be soil, and plantings can be planted. Dufina asked about the concrete rail posts. Machin stated they will be painted white. Rocky addressed how they will get all the material to the site. An area at British Landing will be used for the storage. Rocky will put together all the plans for construction. Pettit asked how many yards of gravel they will need. Machin stated they have not figured that out yet. Rocky stated they can bring 6 or 7 trucks on the barge at a time. Rocky recommended putting the color pigment inside the concrete so they will not need to paint all the time. In addition the plantings will cover some of the block as well. Straus asked how this project will coordinate with the facade project. Rocky stated he is already talking with Spence Brothers to work together. They will video tape the route prior to starting so we can see any damages. Myers asked about the color of the stone. Neumann suggested a texture and color that mimics the natural limestone. The block will have air in the block that will allow for expansion and contraction. Straus asked if they could remove the existing invasive planting. Rocky will work with Trish Martin in selecting the plantings to be used. Myers asked when they will have final plans. Machin stated 2 to 3 weeks. Motion to schedule a special meeting for Tuesday October 31st 9:00 am. to discuss a formal application. Jurcak asked if they could go to council for vehicles. They told him yes. Dufina asked about the posts and railings. Rocky said it is iron and painted black. Jurcak confirmed that they don't need a street cut. Evashevski will confirm.

Motion made by Straus, Seconded by Mosley.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

d. R423-011-089 MIHC Lot 11 Shed

The applicant would like to build a shed that falls on the lot line between two lots, as show on the site plan. Motion to approve the shed sitting on the lot line.

Voting Yea: Martin, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

Voting Abstaining: Pettit

e. R423-012-090 MIHC Storage Shed Lot 12

The applicant would like to build a shed that falls on the lot line between two lots, as show on the site plan. Motion to approve the shed sitting on the lot line.

Motion made by Mosley, Seconded by Finkel.

Voting Yea: Martin, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

Voting Abstaining: Pettit

f. R423-015-091 MIHC Shed Lot 15

The applicant would like to build a shed that falls on the lot line between two lots, as show on the site plan. Motion to approve the shed sitting on the lot line.

Motion made by Dufina, Seconded by Martin.

Voting Yea: Martin, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

Voting Abstaining: Pettit

g. R423-016-092 MIHC Shed Lot 16

The applicant would like to build a shed that falls on the lot line between two lots, as show on the site plan. Motion to approve the shed sitting on the lot line.

Motion made by Dufina, Seconded by Martin.

Voting Yea: Martin, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

Voting Abstaining: Pettit

h. R323-007-082 Hoban Hill Demolition

Doud stated all has been submitted. He also has an equipment plan. Myers read aloud section 20.06 regarding posting notice for seven days. The Building Department will provide the sign to post. All three of the buildings are on one of the parcels. Doud stated the sewer line needs to be moved. They would like to start the other work before doing the demolition and confirmed that is OK. One of the buildings is being relocated off island. This is still considered demolition. Myers confirmed that all utilities will be disconnected. Myers went over required steps in the ordinance and confirmed with the applicant that he has a plan for all. Myers confirmed no asbestos. Applicant acknowledged that work will stop if archeological remains are found. Motion to approve.

Motion made by Pettit, Seconded by Dufina.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Dufina, Finkel

Voting Abstaining: Mosley

i. 2024 Meeting Dates for Approval

Motion to approve dates as presented.

Motion made by Martin, Seconded by Dufina.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

j. Rosemary Lounsbury Lot Split/Combination

Evashevski stated there is currently no procedure for lot splits. It needs to be approved by Council. This will be signed by the school board. Jason St Onge has reviewed all and is ok with the agreement. This is for a split off school property that is within Lounsbury's fenced yard. Very narrow strip of land that is requesting to be split off the schools Burrough lot and combined with Lounsbury's lot so she does not have any issues selling the property. When Straus asked about the site plan Dombroski stated Pereny was rushed to put the package together and he does not see the site plan, but one was submitted by Neil Hill. Dombroski was able to review it. The lot line was established one foot on the back side of her house. She has been using this for years. Mosley confirmed the school board is good with the plan. Motion to send to council with a positive recommendation and to waive the application fee.

Motion made by Mosley, Seconded by Martin.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

## XI. Public Comment

Straus asked Evashevski if the application can be changed to 8.5 x 11. Evashevski confirmed that would be OK and all Commissioners were fine with the change.

## XII. Adjournment

Motion to adjourn.5:19

Motion made by Martin, Seconded by Myers.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

---

Michael Straus, Chair

---

Katie Pereny, Secretary