

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION HELD TUESDAY, MAY 9, 2023 AT 1:00 P.M. IN THE COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CITY HALL, MACKINAC ISLAND, MICHIGAN

Chairman Finkel called a regular meeting of the Mackinac Island Historic District Commission to order at 1:02 p.m.

PRESENT: Lee Finkel, Alan Sehoyan, Andrew Doud, Nancy Porter

ABSENT: Lorna Straus

STAFF: Architect, Richard Neumann (via Zoom), Attorney, Gary Rentrop (via Zoom)

Motion by Doud, seconded by Finkel to approve as amended, and place on file, the minutes of the regular meeting Tuesday, April 11, 2023. Amendment was to add “Doud stated he thinks we should stick to the focus in front of us, which is the towers on the Chippewa.” After Michael Straus’ comment, under *Public Comment*. All in favor. Motion carries. Porter stated that she feels placing a fireplace inside of a house is not as safe as having the fireplace on the outside, as shown in the education segment.

Motion by Doud, seconded by Sehoyan to approve as written and place on file the Agenda. All in favor. Motion carries.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION EDUCATION SEGMENT

- **Single Structure Historic District; What is required. The Drapop v Ann Arbor decision**

Rentrop went over the criteria for the creation of a new historic district. The definition of a historic district was read and Rentrop discussed the creation of a stand-alone district such as Small Point B&B. Rentrop referred to Drapop v City of Ann Arbor, and based on his findings he is confident that it is appropriate to create a stand-alone district for Small Point B&B. Finkel asked if some plaintiff is unhappy being included in a new historic district has the court ever found that arbitration could disable that claim? Rentrop stated any attempts at this has been unsuccessful.

CORRESPONDENCE

- **Letter from City Clerk re: Escrow Assurance Resolution**

Rentrop stated the changes made have been adopted by the City Council.

- **Rentrop Statement – February 10, 2023**

Rentrop explained the \$2680 credit as coming from the charges from the Steiner discussion in January.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

- **None**

STAFF REPORTS

- **Municode Meetings – Pereny**

Pereny stated that she is trying to get all Commission members logged in to the new meetings program. There will be a training in June and then hopes to launch the new process in July.

- **C23-048-021(H) Schunk – Roof on Thunderbird Building**

There was a flat roof that needed to be redone due to leaking. This was a like-for-like application. Motion by Sehoyan, second by Doud to approve the application. All in favor. Motion carries.

OLD BUSINESS

- **MD23-010-016(H) Police Department Roof Replacement Approval**

This application was discussed and approved last month but a Motion was never made to approve. Motion by Doud, second by Sehoyan to approve the application. All in favor. Motion carries.

NEW BUSINESS

- **MD23-067-023(H) GHMI – Corner Cottage Change of Use**

Tamara Burns stated the home is going to become a hotel for Grand Hotel. Burns stated it will be rented as one suite to one family or group, similar to Masco Cottage. The changes are to make it ADA accessible by adjusting the back screen porch for ADA access. Landscaping changes include a path to the back porch, also for ADA access. Finkel asked Rentrop how the building can now be rented nightly. The Commission agreed that is the concern for the Planning Commission. Doud commented that there are very few changes to the exterior. Porter stated that all of the proposed changes are acceptable. Sehoyan stated that Neumann gave a favorable review. Motion by Sehoyan, second by Porter to approve the application. Roll call vote: Ayes: Doud, Finkel, Sehoyan, Porter. Nays: None. All in favor. Motion carries.

- **RS23-046-025(H) Gilmer Fence and Hedge Replacement**

Neumann stated this is exterior site work and meets the Standards for Review. The chain link fence is being replaced by a black aluminum fence and the hedge is being replaced on the sides of the house. Darga stated that there are no changes to the front. Motion by Sehoyan, second by Porter to approve the application. Roll call vote: Ayes: Doud, Finkel, Sehoyan, Porter. Nays: None. All in favor. Motion carries.

Doud stepped down from the table.

- **C23-042-026(H) T-Mobile – Cell Equipment on top of Doud’s Market**

Chris Madigan, from LLC Telecom, stated they would like to upgrade the equipment on the top of Doud’s Market. Madigan stated that three of the antennas will be replaced like-for-like and three additional antennas will be smaller than the current antenna. He stated it is not an expansion of the equipment, but just an upgrade to the equipment to keep up with new technology and demand for service in the area. The applicant provided construction drawings and photo simulations. Madigan believes the project satisfies the requirements of our standards for review for cellular equipment. The cables are proposed to be painted white to match the roof. Rentrop commented that this project dates back to 2021 and was originally just for 3 antennas. The application has changed to six. Finkel asked if the antennas would ever become considered a historical element. Neumann stated no because they are utility features that we need to accommodate such as gas or electric service. The representatives present stated they were not aware of any plan with just three antennas and feel the 6 are necessary for adequate service. The Commissioners agreed that Neumann gave a favorable review for the 6 antennas and the fact that the applicant feels that 6 are necessary for adequate service, they are OK with the application as presented. Doud stated he got involved to make sure that the footprint was being reduced. Doud feels the proposed location is the best it could be. Neumann agrees with Doud’s statement on the proposed location. Neumann stated if they intend to paint he would recommend a gray, rather than white. Madigan clarified that they would not be painting the antennas, but just the cabling. The white will match the roof. Sehoan believes the proposed application is the minimum negative affect. Motion by Sehoan, second by Porter to approve the application. Madigan recommended not painting the galvanized areas, but rather leave them as is. This tends to be less noticeable. Rentrop stated that the motion should be to recommend approval to SHPO. Motion by Sehoan, second by Porter to recommend approval to SHPO. Roll call vote: Ayes: Doud, Finkel, Sehoan, Porter. Nays: None. All in favor. Motion carries.

Doud returned to the table.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There was no public comment. Rentrop reported that Starline has been cited for doing dock work without any permits. Dombroski will report on this in the June meeting.

With no further business there was a Motion by Sehoan, second by Finkel to adjourn the meeting. All in favor. Motion carries. Meeting was adjourned at 1:51 p.m.

Lee Finkel, Chairman

Katie Pereny, Secretary