

# CITY OF MACKINAC ISLAND

## MINUTES

### PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING

Tuesday, September 12, 2023 at 4:00 PM

City Hall – Council Chambers, 7358 Market St., Mackinac Island, Michigan

---

#### I. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 4:00 PM

#### II. Roll Call

PRESENT

Trish Martin

Jim Pettit

Michael Straus

Anneke Myers

Ben Mosley

Mary Dufina

Lee Finkel

Staff: Dombroski, Evashevski

#### III. Pledge of Allegiance

#### IV. Approval of Minutes

- a. Approval of August 8 2023 Minutes

Motion to approve minutes as written.

Motion made by Mosley, Seconded by Finkel.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Finkel

#### V. Adoption of Agenda

Motion to approve the agenda as written.

Motion made by Dufina, Seconded by Martin.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

## VI. Correspondence

None

## VII. Staff Report

### a. HDC Meeting Summary

Finkel summarized the September 12th HDC meeting.

### b. REU Update

Burt stated all outstanding projects have been accommodated with the exception of the Harbourview boardinghouse on 7th. The agreement with Grand Hotel is needed. The Board allowed 1 out of formula REU for the Ledtke residence on east bluff. The projects on the agenda today he believes they will all get their REU's.

## VIII. Committee Reports

Master Plan: Myers stated there was a workshop on August 31st. A survey is currently being conducted. A student survey is also being put together and Laura Eiseler stated she would disseminate to the school. They hope to have a Zoom meeting with Adam Young and the businesses. There will possibly be another workshop later in the fall.

## IX. Old Business

### a. Updated Site Plan Review Checklist

A draft to be consistent with new ordinance was submitted.

Motion to adopt.

Motion made by Myers, Seconded by Mosley.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

### b. R323-007-051 Hoban Hill-Nephew New Building

Contingencies from last month were submitted for approval. Murray and Porter addressed the Commission. They believe they addressed all of the contingencies. Myers asked about the map from Dickenson. The road is on Carriage Tours property. Myers confirmed they had permission from Carriage Tours to use the road. Murray will get the permission in writing. Dufina asked if the route is the traditional route up British Landing. Myers stated it should come up State Road. Spencer stated it is the same route as used for Barnview and will submit the correction for the file. Pettit asked if the existing barns will be demolished. Murray stated he submitted an application to the Building department and it will be on the October agenda. Myers questioned if the equipment for Belonga escort was

included. Spencer stated no. Myers asked in the future for that to be included. Myers asked where the material storage will be. Murray stated that for Building B, it will be on other Hoban Hill property. Dombroski asked about the trash building; he thought there was going to be separate buildings for each building. Porter stated they determined based on the amount of trash generated that the two buildings can share a trash storage area. Myers reminded Murray that the approval was contingent on a temporary trash plan for each building, until condominiumized. Evashevski stated that she agrees with Myers, that until condominiumized there needs to be a separate trash storage for each area. Pettit suggested to submit in writing that the trash for Building B will be stored in the basement until trash day, until the property is condominiumized. Dickenson representative reported their plan for debris. They would prefer to use garbage drays. All debris will be stored by unit D. Dickenson representative is to provide all information on a site plan and in writing. No fencing or barriers are anticipated to be needed. Myers stated the Building inspector will determine if a fence is needed. Motion to place on file.

Motion made by Martin, Seconded by Mosley.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

c. R323-007-052 Hoban Hill-Chippewa New Building

Trash is shown on site. Murray provided all of the information. Dickenson plans will be supplemented. Building D construction is still in planning, but they hope to do it at the same time. All of that will be submitted in writing. Murray stated the foundation will not be built unless they expect to set in May. Dufina suggested designating two staging areas in the event both B and D are built at the same time. Dufina asked when they expect this to become a condominium. Murray stated he will know more after Buildings A and C are reviewed. Motion to place on file and information is to be submitted in writing.

Motion made by Myers, Seconded by Martin.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

d. R322-016-028 Benser Triplex Siding Amendment

The applicant would like to use the Everlast composite siding instead of the approved cedar. Straus asked if Neumann had weighed in on the change. Benser stated he had not. Motion to approve the change in siding to Everlast, with a favorable review from Neumann.

Motion made by Dufina, Seconded by Mosley.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

e. HB23-007-055 Inn at Stonecliffe Mercantile Building Contingencies & Propane Tank Amendment

Doyle stated the contingencies were submitted. Doyle stated when asked about board and batten siding, he had stated no, but Neumann stated board and batten was more appropriate for the period. Pettit asked that a hitching post be placed on the site. Motion to approve

Motion made by Finkel, Seconded by Martin.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

f. HB21-001-061 Stonecliffe Rooftop Equipment Fence Amendment

Dombroski stated this is being mandated by the state mechanical inspector. The code requires that you are able to open the doors on the equipment. The original fence would not work. Motion to approve.

Motion made by Mosley, Seconded by Finkel.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

g. HB21-001-099 Stonecliffe Wellness Center Bilco Door Amendment

Doyle stated there was not access to the basement. The bilco door will be hidden by hydrangeas and lilacs. Motion to approve.

Motion made by Dufina, Seconded by Myers.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

h. HB21-001-099 Stonecliffe Cottage 1 Basement Door Amendment

Doyle stated this was a door to access the basement for storage. If a retaining wall is needed, that would need to come back to the Commission. Motion to approve.

Motion made by Myers, Seconded by Dufina.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

## X. New Business

a. R323-008-061 MICT New Boardinghouse

McGreevy stated they have been able to hook on to the Grand force main. The applicant would like to reposition the two buildings down in the area the septic was previously shown. The two buildings will have stairs pointing to the uphill so the grading will not have to change. These buildings will be connected to the city water as soon as REU's become available. The new questions were not yet online so he will submit the information. They will be staged the same way as the first two. This is planned for next fall. Myers asked the timing be placed in writing too. Myers asked if they would install an ebike charging station. McGreevy stated they will. Mosley confirmed that no pets will be allowed. McGreevy stated the buildings are modular

construction and they are looking at possible routes to get the units to the site. McGreevy confirmed that the building and fire escape will be sprinkled. Motion to approve contingent on written answers to zoning questions 14-16, an ebike charging station shown on the site plan and map for route.

Motion made by Mosley, Seconded by Myers.

Voting Yea: Martin, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

Voting Abstaining: Pettit

b. MD23-011-067(H) McGreevy Fence

McGreevy stated that he agreed at HDC to change to wood with a little different design so he asked to please table until next month. When asked, he stated there is no gate. Motion to table

Motion made by Myers, Seconded by Mosley.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

c. C23-021-068(H) Bicycle Street Inn Door Change

Megan Hornbogen described the plan. There will be four new windows on the back, and a door on the north side of building that will lead right into the hotel. Staging will keep as much in the building as possible. Straus asked about signage. Polzin stated the signs will be submitted separately. Mosley confirmed with Dombroski that the change will be OK for egress. Straus asked if a traffic plan should be required. Myers agreed that they should see a traffic plan and luggage should be addressed. Jurcak stated the luggage and traffic will go through the new entrance. Straus asked for a diagram showing the traffic flow. Motion to approve based on a traffic pattern being submitted.

Motion made by Myers, Seconded by Mosley.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

d. R323-007-069 Hoban Hill Benser Building A

Benser, unit A, is 14 units with 12 studios and two 1 bedroom apartments. The staging area is the 75' between building A and the triplex. Benser believes this will be plenty of room for staging. Benser hopes to build next fall. Myers asked that the construction plan be submitted in writing. Murray addressed the question about condominiumizing. Murray wants to make sure the Commission is comfortable with the plan and then will begin the condominiumizing process. Density was confirmed. Murray stated they can come back with the staging plan. Mosley confirmed that they are requesting contingent approval today. Dombroski stated he is looking for the road surface in the ordinance because he thought it had to be hard surface, and the plans call for gravel. Dufina stated that Section 24.03 states the road requirement is "...a paved driving surface of asphalt or other approved material". This

will be addressed once the area is condominiumized. Motion to approve building A contingent on written and site plan designations for questions 14-16 in section 20.04.

Motion made by Myers, Seconded by Dufina.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

e. R323-007-071 Hoban Hill Building C Doud

Doud was asked about staging area. Doud stated they will be using the Carriage Tours property, and Hill House property owned by Callawaert. Doud will submit letters. The staging plan will be submitted along with the zoning questions 14--16 answered in writing. The Commission is OK with the trash plan and ebike charging station. Myers asked if they can be on the property line. Dombroski stated the trash buildings should be at least 5' off the property line since they are considered an accessory building. Myers stated Doud may want to consider moving the charging station inward some. Evashevski noted that nothing can be in the 10' landscape buffer. Doud addressed the demolition permit. This will be on the October Agenda. The screening fence on the north side is existing and will remain. Motion to approve contingent on written answers to questions 14-16 in Section 20 of the Ordinance, move bikes and trash out of the landscape buffer zone, permission from neighbors, and the staging area provided.

Motion made by Myers, Seconded by Dufina.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

f. C23-053-070(H) Trayser Demolition of Building

Straus stated it was tabled in the HDC. Trayser asked to table until October. Myers instructed Trayser to review the new section of the ordinance. Motion to table.

Motion made by Myers, Seconded by Martin.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

g. MD23-011-072(H) MICT Lennox Front Porch Variance

McGreevy stated they would like to enclose the open part of the porch for office space. The existing enclosed space will remain. A new door will be installed to the front where it used to be. The new enclosed space will have heat. The porch encroaches in the setback so a variance is needed. The new section will be slightly different to show that it is different from the existing. Neumann did a favorable review. Dombroski explained the variance is because the edge will be at the lot line. Brad Chambers stated the building was there before the street existed. Dombroski stated he understood but the variance is for the new construction, not the existing. Motion to send to ZBA with a recommendation of approval because it is not changing the footprint and it is filling in the non-conformity.

Motion made by Myers, Seconded by Martin.

Voting Yea: Martin, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

Voting Abstaining: Pettit

h. HB23-015-073 Inn at Stonecliffe Apple Orchard

Doyle shared his screen to show a site plan. They would like to convert the apple orchard to an agricultural space including apple trees, bee hives, and a community garden for herbs and vegetables. A fence needs to go around the orchard along the pathway with two 12' gates that open in to the orchard. Doyle stated they have the ability to be locked. A storage building is proposed in the corner. The fence is 6' tall and will match fence on adjacent property. The fence will not block access to Sunset Rock. Dombroski asked if there needs to be emergency access. There will be no electricity in the shed. Mosley is OK with the access. A large fire truck wouldn't be able to access anyways. Motion to approve.

Motion made by Dufina, Seconded by Martin.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

i. HB23-017-074 Stonecliffe's Love Shack Change of Use

Doyle stated they would like to use as hotel use. A railing will be added on the porch, they will widen the entrance and trim trees for access, and gate off steps at the fence and build a hedge around it. The will not be changing the footprint. Straus stated he wanted to make sure the widening of the turn around does not impact the neighbors. Doyle stated it should be quick. The road is proposed to be mulch. Mosley stated if there is gravel under the mulch it would be adequate for the fire truck. Dufina asked for the length of the path to the house from the 16' road. Horn guessed about 35'. It will be one key, one bedroom. Motion to approve the change of use from residential to Hotel.

Motion made by Dufina, Seconded by Martin.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

## XI. Public Comment

Pettit expressed his displeasure on the look of the new cell pole in the village.

## XII. Adjournment

Motion to adjourn at 6:22 PM

Motion made by Myers, Seconded by Martin.

Voting Yea: Martin, Pettit, Straus, Myers, Mosley, Dufina, Finkel

---

Michael Straus, Chair

---

Katie Pereny, Secretary