

CITY OF MACKINAC ISLAND

MINUTES

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Tuesday, July 09, 2024 at 1:00 PM

City Hall – Council Chambers, 7358 Market St., Mackinac Island, Michigan

I. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 1:02 PM.

II. Roll Call

PRESENT

Andrew Doud

Lee Finkel

Alan Sehoyan

Lorna Straus

Nancy Porter

Peter Olson

Shannon Schueller

Staff: Gary Rentrop, Richard Neumann, Erin Evashevski, Dennis Dombroski

III. Pledge of Allegiance

IV. Approval of Minutes

a. May 14, 2024

Motion to approve as written.

Motion made by Sehoyan, Seconded by Finkel.

Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehoyan, Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller

b. June 11, 2024

Motion to approve as amended. Amendment was to add "...rezoning and applicant stated no.", on page 2.

Motion made by Sehoyan, Seconded by Doud.

Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehoyan, Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller

V. Adoption of Agenda

Attorney Rentrop announced his resignation but stated he would still be working as a consultant with Erin Evashevski. Finkel announced that Sehoyan has been appointed the temporary Chair. Doud apologized for being out of line at last meeting.

Motion to adopt the Agenda as presented.

Motion made by Finkel, Seconded by Olson.

Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehoyan, Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller

VI. Correspondence

None

VII. Committee Reports

None

VIII. Staff Report

Motion to place the Staff Report on file.

Motion made by Doud, Seconded by Straus.

Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehoyan, Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller

a. Job Status Report

A revised report dated July 9 was presented at the meeting. Sehoyan asked if anyone has updates to let us know. Straus asked about the expired date. Sehoyan explained that if it has started it is not expired. Motion to approve

Motion made by Finkel, Seconded by Doud.

Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehoyan, Porter, Olson, Schueller

Voting Abstaining: Straus

Sehoyan addressed the commission and asked that all members be respectful and don't talk over others. When a Motion is made, it is to be supported, then any discussion, then the vote. Doud stated he thinks we need to say going forward we need to make motions more clear. Olson stated that meetings following some kind of Roberts Rules keeps it clearer.

b. C24-066-033(H) Mary's Bistro Rot Repair at Window Stops

Dombroski stated this is typical Mackinac island trim that has rotted and is being repaired like for like.

c. MD24-078-035(H) Chambers Trim Board Replacement

Dombroski stated that rotted trim is to be replaced like for like.

d. R124-080-038(H) Lounsbury Log Repairs

Dombroski stated there are not many log structures on the island but the rotted logs on this house need to be repaired.

e. MD22-069-022(H) May Repair Update

Dombroski stated this was not a repair but a follow up to the demolition by neglect. Dombroski stated that the porch was nicely shored up and they also did shoring on the inside of the porch. The contractor did his best to add a temporary fix to the leak on the roof.

f. C24-012-040(H) MIFC Main Dock Lateral Support Repairs

Dombroski stated this is ongoing work on main dock. Dombroski stated he is in discussions with Starline and getting the main dock improved and there is work going on now with lateral bracing that started two weeks ago. This repair will add serious structural stability to the dock. Doud asked if HDC is hindering them at all. Dombroski said no not with this. Dombroski is treating it as like for like because it was what the dock had for stability originally and we need that back. Doud stated he was all for it and if the contractor needs to come after the fact that is ok with him.

Finkel asked about the lighting. Dombroski said he has talked to Fetty and has been told the hours the lights are on have been reduced, and pointed out the zoning ordinance for type of lighting to be in keeping with the neighborhood. Dombroski stated warm lighting is about 2700 kelvin. Lumens are identical in white and warm lighting. Dombroski doesn't think the island should go with bright lights. Cloverland agreed and is putting in the warm lights.

IX. Old Business

a. C23-083-019(H) Gatehouse Amendment

Gene Hopkins stated after discussions with the Grand the plan has changed. They are minimizing the exterior changes. The applicant would like to upgrade the metal railing, deck, and add lighting. The egress door and fireplace will remain. A new awning will be going over the doors. Schueller asked if the railing is being moved back and patio extended. Hopkins stated no. They intend to extend the railing along the side by bike parking. Finkel asked if lighting will be down lighting. Hopkins stated yes. Sehoyan stated Neumann approved the amendment. Neumann stated the other

side of building is going to be a new trash enclosure and that meets the standards as well. Dombroski asked about the water access lines. Hopkins wasn't aware but said they would move the shed location if needed. Neumann was ok with that. Motion to approve.

Motion made by Finkel, Seconded by Olson.

Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehoan, Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller

b. Jaquiss Resolution

Rentrop confirmed the committee had the correct version in the packet. Finkel wanted to remind everyone that the resolution in whole as well as the specific aspects of it are the sole discretion of the HDC, meaning we can do whatever we want. There is no appeal or redo. Finkel further stated this resolution is a deviation of our usual process but because of concern of precedence we did a resolution. Rentrop stated Sehoan's original motion is reflected in the current resolution. Doud pointed out the point that the 4 month point making it unique was not included and Rentrop reminded him that is what he wanted. Doud confirmed Rentrop was correct and was OK with the resolution as presented. Motion to approve the Resolution.

Motion made by Doud, Seconded by Finkel.

Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehoan, Straus

Voting Abstaining: Porter, Olson, Schueller

c. Demolition Application Discussion

Sehoan asked for refresher on why this was on the Agenda. Doud said it was something the Commission had talked about and it is a broad application and it needs to be discussed. Pereny did not put the application in the packet. Rentrop stated the general directions is what the hdc wanted to review. Doud stated the checklist and the process need to be reviewed. Doud stated he doesn't think the application should come to HDC until complete. Motion to table until next month to have a chance to review the application and the ordinance.

Motion made by Doud, Seconded by Sehoan.

Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehoan, Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller

d. Discussion Regarding Minutes Being Reviewed by Attorney

Doud stated he brought this up a couple of months ago. Doud asked what the process is for review. Pereny said chair, lawyer and Neumann review the minutes. Porter stated the Motions need to be clear. Sehoan further stated if there is something that a Commissioner would like included in the minutes, they must state that at the time it is said. Pereny made it clear that going forward all Motions must be slowly stated so Pereny can type it correctly, and Pereny will not restate

Motions. Any restatements must be made by the person making the Motion. Olson asked if they can present an amendment at time of review in the meeting. Doud said we would like to call Pereny with changes before the meeting. Fortino stated that all deliberations including minute changes, have to happen in an open meeting. All corrections must be made at the meeting.

X. New Business

Rentrop stated he is tendering his resignation. He has had discussions with Evashevski and Mayor Doud. Evashevski will represent the HDC and Rentrop will continue as a consultant. Rentrop thanked the Commission for the opportunity to work with all of them and for the friendships formed.

a. MD24-069-034(H) Twilight Building Doors and Stoop

Hopkins passed out updated plans for review. Jurcak wanted to say rebuilding after fire we wanted to make as safe as possible. Everything today is a safety measure. Hopkins stated there are three things which are the front doors and panic hardware update, doors and a stoop. The doors are historic and significant so they are having doors made to match. This takes time so panic hardware will be installed on the old doors until the new doors arrive. The stoop on the back of building to allow for people to come out of the door, which will have panic hardware, will have a guardrail so people will have to follow the steps. Sehoyan asked Neumann if he was comfortable with the changes. Neumann stated he hasn't seen it but trusts Hopkins to select the correct guardrail, and everything else meets our standards for review. Finkel asked if the new doors will be fire rated. Hopkins stated yes. Motion to approve

Motion made by Doud, Seconded by Olson.

Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehoyan, Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller

b. MD24-074-036(H) Beeck Lift

Pereny gave an update on Beeck not using the product. Dombroski recommended to the applicant to review the concept of the lift. Neumann did not give a favorable review. Neumann stated that he feels even though in the back yard and seems pretty screened, overall the concept of adding exterior lift to a historic building in a historic setting is not appropriate. The critical standards of fitting in with historic environment are not met. Finkel asked Rentrop because of ADA would there be an issue. It was confirmed it is for freight not people. Neumann asked Dombroski about the purpose of the lift. Dombroski thought it is to move furniture and appliances in to the unit due to the narrow steps. Porter asked how often you have to move furniture or appliances. Porter suggested he rent something temporary when needed. Finkel agrees owners convenience is irrelevant to the HDC. Motion to deny

Motion made by Doud, Seconded by Finkel.

Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehoyan, Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller

c. R324-003-041(H) Chambers Porch Replacements

McGreevy stated the front porch has a few rotten boards which will be replaced like for like. The two porches on the newer addition on the side and back are rotting and will be replaced with Azek with same 3.5" tongue and groove and same color. Neumann stated Azek is a good substitute and has the same appearance and meets the standards. Motion to approve.

Motion made by Finkel, Seconded by Doud.

Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehoyan, Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller

d. R324-030-037(H) Rearick Chimney Repair

Dombroski stated it is a necessary repair and along with the repair of the alternate liner the exterior portion of the chimney needs to be rebuilt and brought up to be above the ridge of the roof to meet current code. The contractor also wants to put a top and Dombroski agrees that is a good idea. Neumann has not been able to see the application due to email issues and confers to Dombroski's judgement. Based on codes Neumann believes he would approve it. Sehoyan asked how much height was to be added but Dombroski wasn't sure. Motion to approve.

Motion made by Porter, Seconded by Finkel.

Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehoyan, Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller

e. Lighting Discussion

Doud stated normally if the Chippewa called and said the lights are too bright, he would turn them down. Doud doesn't think lighting is something we need to review. Doud asked Michael Straus. Straus stated it was brought to Planning Commission a couple months ago with the complaint of brightness and fixture change. Straus stated Initially the Planning Commission thought what was installed was not in keeping with our ordinance. Porter confirmed that lighting falls under the Planning Commission. Straus stated it is his understanding the fixtures are different so that would be HDC. The ordinance could always be changed if needed. Olson appreciates the comment from Dombroski and lumens. The color of the light might play in as much as the fixture. Dombroski agrees and that is why he thinks the HDC should comment on lighting. Straus stated that anything in the ordinance is city wide and not specific to historic districts. Dombroski referred to section 18 and the statement that it refers to HDC for review. Porter asked for guidelines to what lighting should be allowed. Olson stated if we had a number we needed to follow it might take out the "feel" of what looking for. Neumann stated that since whole island is considered historic, there would be nothing wrong with requiring 2700 kelvin for all lights on the island. Doud asked if Neumann could study this and give us a suggestion? Neumann thinks parameters have already been stated and that the

warmer light is more appropriate. M Straus stated if there is something they want planning to do better, send them a letter. Porter's conclusion is that the HDC reviews fixtures and Zoning reviews lighting.

XI. Public Comment

Jurcak confirmed that with Rentrop retiring Evashevski will represent both Commissions. Jurcak stated he finds it odd that the City would have a single legal representative for everything. With potential new historic districts he finds it odd that there would be cooperation between the Planning Commission and HDC to create an ordinance because that is bypassing the work being done on a historic district if your already doing it amongst the two boards, and it is dangerous. Jurcak recommended that Pereny not record any more meetings. Jurcak thanked Rentrop for all his work.

Dombroski introduced Dave Lipovsky who will eventually be replacing Dombroski.

Mayor Doud thanked Rentrop for all of his work and he will continue as a consultant because his expertise is needed. Also Pete has looked in to workshop for Michigan Municipal League open to all city committee's . No date set yet but will keep you posted.

XII. Adjournment

Motion to adjourn at 2:22 PM.

Motion made by Porter, Seconded by Doud.

Voting Yea: Doud, Finkel, Sehoyan, Straus, Porter, Olson, Schueller

Alan Sehoyan, Chair

Katie Pereny, Secretary