



Richard  
Neumann  
Architect

610 Grand Avenue, Petoskey, Michigan 49770, 231.347.0931

6 June 2024

## **DESIGN REVIEW**

### **COAL DOCK FENCE ENCLOSURES**

7325 Main Street

Market and Main Historic District  
Mackinac Island, Michigan

### **INTRODUCTION**

The proposed project is the installation of fence enclosures around the buried fuel tanks at the head of the dock, and the loading / unloading ramp at the center of the dock. The fences would be prefabricated painted metal vertical baluster type. The dock is a Contributing structure in the district.

This design review is based on City Code Sec. 10-161 "Design Review Standards and Guidelines", of Article V. "Historic District", of the City of Mackinac Island Ordinance No. 443, adopted October 21, 2009. The review standards are those of the Department of the Interior entitled "The United States Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation" and "Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings", as set forth in 36 CFR, part 67, as well as the factors set forth in City Code Sec. 10-161(b).

Materials submitted for Review consist of photos of existing conditions, a sketch drawing of the fence locations, and a photo of a section of proposed fence, dated 27 May 2024, as submitted by the Mackinac Island Transportation Authority.

### **REVIEW**

Of the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, and the Standards Under Sec. 10-161(b), the applicable Standards for review are the following:

**Standard 9** - *"New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment."*

The proposed fence installations would not destroy materials that characterize the property, would be visually differentiated as new elements, and would be compatible with the massing, size and architectural features of the property.

**Standard 10** - *"New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired."*

The new fence construction could easily be removed in the future without impairing the essential form and integrity of the historic property.

**Standards Under Code Sec. 10-161(b)**

In reviewing applications, the Commission shall also consider all of the following:

**(1)** - *"The historic or architectural value and significance of the resource and its relationship to the historic value of the surrounding area."*

The proposed work would not be inappropriate to the architectural value of the property, and would maintain the dock's relationship to the surrounding historic district.

**(2)** - *"The relationship of any architectural features of the resource to the rest of the resource and to the surrounding area."*

The proposed painted metal fencing would maintain the historic integrity of the dock, and its importance to the surrounding area.

**(3)** - *"The general compatibility of the design, arrangement, texture and materials proposed to be used."*

The proposed painted metal fencing would be compatible with the visual character of the Coal Dock, in terms of design, arrangement, texture and materials proposed to be used.

**(4)** - *"Other factors, such as aesthetic value, that the Commission finds relevant."*

The proposed fence additions would address safety concerns of the existing circumstances, as well as being appropriate aesthetically.

**CONCLUSION**

The proposed fence enclosures of the buried fuel tanks and the loading / unloading ramp on the Coal Dock would meet the Standards for review.

**END OF REVIEW**