



Richard
Neumann
Architect

610 Grand Avenue, Petoskey, Michigan 49770, 231.347.0951



7 September 2023

Katie Pereny, Secretary
Historic District Commission
City of Mackinac Island
P.O. Box 455
Mackinac Island, MI 49757

File No. MD23-011-067(4)

Exhibit I

Date 9.7.23

Initials KP

Re: **McGREEVY RESIDENCE FENCE ADDITION**
Design Review

Dear Ms. Pereny:

I have reviewed the application materials (dated 28 August 2023) showing a section of fence proposed to be replaced in the front yard of the McGreevy Residence at 7567 Market Street, in the Market and Main Historic District. The house is a Contributing structure in the district.

As proposed, the new 72 inch tall fence would replace an existing section of 42 inch tall fence along 32 feet of the northeast side property line in the front yard of the house, to provide privacy from the neighbor to the north. The existing is a painted wood fence, square picket style, with spaces between wider than the pickets. The proposed fence would be polyvinyl chloride (PVC) material, the bottom vertical boards solid, with no spaces between (ie. a privacy fence), and the top lattice style, with openings. The proportional height of solid to partly open would be about 2/3 to 1/3.

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for review that apply to this alteration request are:

Standard 2 - Alteration of features that characterize a property shall be avoided; and

Standard 9 - New construction shall be compatible with existing features to protect historic integrity.

The Section 10-161(b) Standards that apply are:

(2) - The relationship of the feature to the rest of the resource and to the surrounding area; and

(3) - The general compatibility of the design and materials proposed to be used.

Certainly the white picket fence at the front yard of the McGreevy Residence is a feature that characterizes the property, and contributes to the historic ambiance of the house. While it would largely remain after a portion of it would be replaced with a taller fence, the new part would be out of synch with the remaining existing fence, being taller, of a different design, and of a different material and finish. From an appearance standpoint, the new section of fence, replacing a middle portion of the existing very different style fence, would create an incongruous juxtaposition. In addition to the style difference, the new vinyl material (which cannot be painted), would create a contrasting finish difference with the existing painted wood.

The surrounding area would also be affected; the very pleasant view from French Lane across the neighboring rear yard garden would be negatively impacted, as the new fence would be too different in several ways from the existing fence.

For these reasons, the proposed fence alteration would not be compatible with the historic McGreevy house and yard, and not appropriate for the Market and Main Historic District, and thus not meet the Standards for review.

However, if the proposed new section of the same 72 inch height was modified in design to be a full-height picket of some simple profile, with the pickets spaced closer together than the existing for better privacy, and constructed of a composite material that could be painted, so as to be more similar to the adjacent existing painted wood fence, the replacement section would be appropriate to the character of the property, and would meet the Standards for review.

Sincerely,

RICHARD NEUMANN ARCHITECT



Rick Neumann

- c. Andy McGreevy, Applicant
 Dennis Dombroski, City of Mackinac Island
 Gary Rentrop, Rentrop and Morrison